

1 **Context-dependency of agricultural legacies in temperate forest**

2 **soils**

3 **Short title:** Gradients steer agricultural legacy in forest

4 **Authors:** Haben Blondeel¹, Michael P. Perring^{1,2}, Laurent Bergès³, Jörg Brunet⁴, Guillaume Decocq⁵, Leen
5 Depauw¹, Martin Diekmann⁶, Dries Landuyt¹, Jaan Liira⁷, Sybryn L. Maes¹, Margot Vanhellemont¹,
6 Monika Wulf⁸, Kris Verheyen¹

7 Corresponding author: haben.blondeel@ugent.be

8 **Statement of Authorship:** HB, MPP and KV conceived and designed the study with significant
9 contributions from DL, SM and LD. HB, LB, JB, GD, MD, JL and MW assessed historical land use
10 information by investigating sources on historical maps of the focal regions. HB, MPP, JB, GD and JL
11 participated in soil collection in the field. HB, with input from MPP, DL and KV performed subsequent
12 statistical analyses on the data. HB wrote the first draft of the paper. Suggestions were made by KV, MPP,
13 DL and MV, and all authors provided revisions and comments.

14 **Addresses:**

15 ¹: Forest & Nature Lab, Campus Gontrode, Faculty of Bioscience Engineering, Ghent University,
16 Geraardsbergsesteenweg 267, 9090 Melle-Gontrode, BELGIUM (mailing address for correspondence)

17 ²: Ecosystem Restoration and Intervention Ecology Research Group, School of Biological Sciences, The
18 University of Western Australia, 35 Stirling Highway, Crawley WA 6009 AUSTRALIA

19 ³ Université Grenoble Alpes, Irstea, UR EMGR, 2 rue de la Papeterie BP 76, F-38402 St-Martin-d'Hères,
20 FRANCE

21 ⁴ Southern Swedish Forest Research Centre, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, Box 49, 230 53
22 Alnarp, SWEDEN

23 ⁵ Ecologie et Dynamique des Systèmes Anthropisés (EDYSAN, UMR 7058 CNRS), Jules Verne University
24 of Picardie, 1 rue des Louvels, F-80037 Amiens Cedex 1, FRANCE

25 ⁶ Vegetation Ecology and Conservation Biology, Institute of Ecology, FB 2, University of Bremen,
26 Leobener Str. 5, DE-28359 Bremen, GERMANY

27 ⁷ Institute of Ecology and Earth Science, University of Tartu, Lai 40, Tartu, 51005, ESTONIA

28 ⁸ ZALF, Institute of Land Use Systems, Eberswalder Straße 84, D-15374 Müncheberg, GERMANY

29

30 **Abstract**

31 Anthropogenic activities have affected forests for centuries, leading to persistent legacies. Observations
32 of agricultural legacies on forest soil properties have been site-specific and contrasting. Sites and regions
33 vary along gradients in intrinsic soil characteristics, phosphorus (P) management and nitrogen (N)
34 deposition which could affect the magnitude of soil property responses to past cultivation. A single
35 investigation along these gradients could reconcile contradictions and elucidate context-dependency in
36 agricultural legacies. We analysed soil from 24 paired post-agricultural (established after approx. 1950)
37 and ancient (in existence before 1850) forests in eight European regions. Post-agricultural forest soil
38 had higher pH, higher P concentration and lower carbon (C) to N ratio compared to ancient forest.
39 Importantly, gradients of soil characteristics, regional P surplus and N deposition affected the
40 magnitude of these legacies. First, we found that three soil groups, characterising inherent soil fertility,
41 determined extractable base cations, pH and concentrations of total N, organic C and total P. Second,
42 regions with greater current P surplus from agriculture correlated with the highest P legacy in post-
43 agricultural forests. Finally, we found that N deposition lowered pH across forests and increased total N
44 and organic C concentrations in post-agricultural forest. These results suggest that 1) legacies from
45 cultivation consistently determine soil properties in post-agricultural forest and 2) these legacies
46 depend on regional and environmental context, including soil characteristics, regional P surplus and N
47 deposition. Identifying gradients that influence the magnitude of agricultural legacies is key to informing
48 how, where and why forest ecosystems respond to contemporary environmental change.

49

50 Key words: ancient forest, land-use history, nitrogen deposition, phosphorus, post-agricultural forest,
51 soil carbon

52 **MANUSCRIPT HIGHLIGHTS**

- 53 • Regional variables affect soil property responses to prior agriculture in forests
- 54 • Accounting for regional context clarifies contrasting agricultural legacies in soils
- 55 • Knowing the regional context of forest soils will help project ecosystem responses

56 **Introduction**

57 Human activities have profoundly affected ecosystems and biodiversity on the long term (Waters and
58 others 2016; Vellend and others 2017). Legacies of past anthropogenic disturbances can obscure
59 ecosystem responses to current disturbance regimes due to time-lags (Bürgi and others 2017) and
60 potentially interact with other global change drivers to steer ecosystem patterns and processes (Perring
61 and others 2016). It is possible for numerous accounts of agricultural legacies in forest soil properties
62 to be contrasting, and site specific when compared to each other (Baeten 2010). Combining observations
63 of agricultural legacies in temperate forest within a single study across regions that vary in gradients of
64 soil characteristics, intensity of agricultural use (phosphorus management) and nitrogen deposition
65 offers the chance to reconcile contrasting findings (Verheyen and others 2017) and elucidate context-
66 dependency in soil responses to agricultural legacy.

67 *Key soil properties for plant growth show contrasting agricultural legacies*

68 Legacy of agriculture is highly variable and depends on specific management practices that are followed
69 during the agricultural period (McLauchlan 2006; Brudvig and others 2013). Agricultural practices can
70 leave imprints in forest soil properties for centuries (Verheyen and others 1999) and even millennia
71 (Dupouey and others 2002). We focus on five chemical soil properties that are of high importance for
72 plant growth and where previous research has shown differences in the magnitude, or even in the
73 direction, of their responses to prior agriculture in temperate forest: soil organic carbon (C), total
74 nitrogen (N), base cations (calcium (Ca), magnesium (Mg), sodium (Na) and potassium (K)), pH and total
75 and bio-available phosphorus (P).

76 Comparisons of concentrations of soil organic C and total N between post-agricultural and continuously
77 forested land (ancient forest) are variable. A lower C concentration and C:N has been observed in post-
78 agricultural forest (Verheyen and others 1999; Foote and Grogan 2010; Yesilonis and others 2016), as
79 well as solely a lower C in post-agricultural forest (Falkengren-Grerup and others 2006; Leuschner and
80 others 2014) and even no difference in C and C:N between post-agricultural forest and ancient forest
81 (Koerner and others 1997; Compton and Boone 2000). Comparisons of base cation stocks are even more

82 variable as they can differ within post-agricultural forest sites of single studies (Verheyen and others
83 1999; Flinn and others 2005), likely due to variations in spatial distribution of nutrients (Fraterrigo and
84 others 2005) and bulk density (Bizzari and others 2015). Despite variable base cation concentrations,
85 a consistently higher pH in post-agricultural forest occurs due to past fertilisation and liming in post-
86 agricultural forests (Wall and Hytönen 2005), but the magnitude of the difference varies (Koerner and
87 others 1997; Verheyen and others 1999; Falkengren-Grerup and others 2006; Grossmann and
88 Mladenoff 2008; Yesilonis and others 2016). Aside from raising pH, past fertilisation also leads to a
89 better retention of total phosphorus (P) in forest soils after tillage (Macdonald and others 2012) in
90 contrast to other disturbance-types such as fires or clearcutting (Grossmann and Mladenoff 2008;
91 Bizzari and others 2015) and extensive pasture (Compton and Boone 2000).

92 *Soil characteristics, phosphorus (P) nutrient management and nitrogen (N) deposition*
93 *could alter soil responses to agricultural legacy*

94 We identify three gradients that could influence comparisons between soils in post-agricultural and
95 continuously forested sites across multiple regions and thus help explain contrasting site-specific
96 responses.

97 Firstly, differences in soil characteristics between post-agricultural and continuously forested land
98 (ancient forest) might occur as land for cultivation commonly occurs on the richer soils within a given
99 region (Flinn and others 2005). Factors that would determine the suitability for agriculture are soil
100 texture, wetness, slope, aspect, soil depth and underlying bedrock or parent material. Key topsoil
101 processes are additionally affected by biotic components such as identity of tree species and litter
102 quality in forest stands (Vesterdal and others 2008; De Schrijver and others 2012a; Cools and others
103 2014; Nitsch and others 2018). Both the abiotic suitability of the site for agriculture and soil-forming
104 biotic processes are local-scale drivers that can cause variability among sites within regions unless
105 explicitly controlled for in a study design, preferably with a paired approach. Furthermore, variations in
106 soil characteristics between regions arise along large spatial gradients as nutrient availability generally
107 decreases in temperate regions at higher latitudes and altitudes (De Frenne and others 2013).

108 Second, the intensity of past fertilisation and associated nutrient management will determine the
109 magnitude of legacies' persistence in the forest ecosystem. Region-specific nutrient management
110 practices can influence the magnitude of response in soil properties more than the actual agricultural
111 land-use type. Macdonald and others (2012) illustrated this by showing that soil P legacies arose more
112 prominently across regions than between types of agricultural land use practiced prior to abandonment
113 within each region. The regional phosphorus balance could reflect how nutrient management of
114 phosphorus occurs within sites at a regional level. This is because the region is a collection of local farms,
115 where each farm reports its total amount of P applied on fields, as well as its total outflow from harvest
116 and grazing (see the report to the European Commission by Bomans and others 2005). Farm practices
117 in regions with a surplus of P have often included excessive manuring of fields and meadows (Ringeval
118 and others 2017) leading to long-term accumulation of P with major consequences for the environment
119 and global nutrient management (Sattari and others 2012; Rowe and others 2016; Bouwman and others
120 2017).

121 Finally, N deposition is a global change driver that varies regionally and originates from intensive
122 agriculture (fertilisation and animal husbandry) and burning of fossil fuels (Bobbink and others 2010).
123 Acidification and eutrophication are effects of reactive N that influence ecosystem composition and
124 function (De Schrijver and others 2011) at an ecosystem-specific critical load (Bobbink and others
125 2015). Critical loads for different deciduous forest types range from 10 to 20 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ (Bobbink and
126 others 2010, 2015; Simkin and others 2016). Exceedance of critical loads potentially leads to leaching
127 of compounds following acidification (Bobbink and others 2010). Eutrophication of the soil occurs by
128 an enrichment of N (Bobbink and others 2010), which can lead to nutrient imbalances in plants e.g.
129 chronic shortages of P (Tao and Hunter 2012) unless supply of P is enhanced through other mechanisms
130 such as increased phosphatase activity (Perring and others 2008). Nitrogen enrichment is therefore
131 expected to alter P dynamics and legacies of prior fertilization in post-agricultural soils.

132 *Hypothesis: legacies of prior agriculture in temperate forest are context-dependent*

133 Based on the published literature, we expect legacies of prior agriculture for five chemical soil
134 properties important for plant growth when combining measurements from paired sites of post-

135 agricultural and continuously forested land (ancient forest). More precisely, we expect higher
136 concentrations of P and base cations, higher pH, lower concentrations of C and lower C:N in post-
137 agricultural forest. The magnitude of these legacies are expected to be affected by gradients of soil
138 characteristics, agricultural intensity and N deposition thus exhibiting a context-dependency:

- 139 1. Inherent soil characteristics relate to texture and underlying parent material of soil deposits, but
140 equally to other edaphic factors such as wetness, relief and exposure. We expect that several
141 variable observations of soil legacies (such as responses of base cations) between pairs of sites
142 and multiple regions are attributable to differences in soil characteristics.
- 143 2. The magnitude of the cultivation legacy in post-agricultural forest soil will for one be relative to
144 prior fertilisation intensity and nutrient management on the regional level. Such intensity could
145 be reflected in concentrations of P due to its biogeochemical properties and potential of
146 prolonged adsorption in the soil. In the absence of historical data, we test whether contemporary
147 regional P surplus is associated with a higher legacy in soil P concentrations in post-agricultural
148 forests compared to the regions' ancient forests.
- 149 3. N deposition varies widely on the regional level, where we expect that higher rates of deposition
150 increase responses of acidification (pH) and eutrophication (N), with possible side effects on P
151 availability dependent on the land-use history of the site.

152 **Materials and Methods**

153 *Selection of regions along gradients of soil characteristics, regional P balance and N* 154 *deposition*

155 We selected eight regions across gradients of soil characteristics, regional P balance (surplus of P) and
156 N deposition within temperate Europe (Figure 1). These regions span from Pärnu county in the Lääne-
157 Eesti department in Estonia (N 58° 8' 45.1") to the Loiret department (N 47° 50' 10.05") in France (Table
158 1). We define a region as a large-scaled area with homogeneous macro-climatic conditions (mean annual
159 temperature and precipitation) and topography (Table 1). For this purpose, we adopt the third level of
160 the *Nomenclature of Territorial Units for Statistics* (NUTS) by the European Union (2015) for our regional

161 boundaries (Table 1). We aggregated multiple NUTS-III entities to one region where the administrative
162 boundaries were too detailed or where forest patches were on the border of two neighbouring entities
163 (Table 1).

164 Invariable soil characteristics such as texture and underlying parent material of soil deposits can differ
165 between post-agricultural and ancient forest within and across regions. To isolate legacy effects of prior
166 agriculture in our comparison of ancient and post-agricultural forest soils, rather than detecting that
167 sites with agricultural history occur on richer soils, we utilised a paired-plot approach within regions
168 (Foote and Grogan 2010; Brudvig and others 2013; Bizzari and others 2015). Thus, we attempted to
169 ensure that local inherent soil characteristics varied minimally within a given pair (Table 1, WRB
170 classifications) while simultaneously controlling for overstorey composition (de la Peña and others
171 2016, see Supplementary Table S1.3). Differences in inherent soil characteristics between pairs
172 (landscape scale) and the regional scale allows analysing responses to agriculture's legacy in relation to
173 gradients in inherent soil characteristics.

174 Agricultural intensity on the regional level is estimated by the nutrient balance for P from a report of
175 the Soil Service of Belgium for the year 2003 to the European commission (Bomans and others 2005).
176 This is calculated per region on NUTS-II and III-levels as the total inflow of P that farmers report to their
177 local governments (fertilisation and manure production) subtracted with the total outflow (harvest and
178 grazing), formulating a regional nutrient balance when expressed per area of agricultural land (kg P ha⁻¹).
179 A positive balance (surplus) indicates an excess of P with potential risk of accumulation and
180 eutrophication by leaching. A negative or zero balance indicates a potential depletion of nutrients. In
181 absence of historical data for P nutrient balances in European regions, we resort to the use of the
182 contemporary values for the P nutrient management in these areas (Bomans and others 2005). We
183 expect that the relative differences of the P balance between the regions would still hold when using
184 contemporary values for a historical context, i.e. we assume that regions with the highest current
185 surplus likely also had the highest P surplus during the mid-20th century. This assumption would be
186 worthy of further investigation.

187 The magnitude of N deposition between 1990 and 2010 has proven to be an important determinant of
188 the adverse effects of reactive N in forest ecosystems (Dirnböck and others 2017). Interpolated values
189 of model results from the EMEP database (version 2013, <http://www.emep.int/>) for the year 2000 were
190 therefore used as the annual nitrogen deposition variable. The critical load concept highlights that we
191 have robustly covered ecologically important variation in our choice of sites. For instance, two regions
192 (OR, EST) are found below typical critical load exceedances while, at the other extreme, two regions (VL,
193 BR) have N deposition well in excess of a temperate forest understorey threshold of 18 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹
194 (Bobbink and others 2015; Simkin and others 2016).

195 *Selection of forest patches and determining their land-use history*

196 We searched for three pairs of ancient and post-agricultural broadleaved forests in each of the eight
197 regions, leading to 48 forest patches included in the study. These pairs consisted of forest patches that
198 are nearby in a landscape context, with the median distance between two pairs being 760 m
199 (supplementary information, Table S1.1). This paired approach allows for minimising differences in site
200 characteristics such as texture, aspect and wetness and allows for isolating the legacies of previous land
201 management rather than inherent differences of post-agricultural and ancient forest sites (Flinn and
202 others 2005; Brudvig and others 2013). Forest types were mainly mesophytic with fresh deep soils and
203 sandy to loamy soil textures (see Soil World Reference Base in Table 1).

204 The land-use history of these forest patches was determined by use of historical land-use maps (see
205 Supplementary information Table S1.2), which pre-dated 1850 for most regions. Forests that have been
206 continuously present on land-use maps since the earliest reliable recording are considered as ancient
207 while reforestations on abandoned fields during mid-20th century are considered post-agricultural
208 (Peterken 1996). This “binary” approach (Bürgi and others 2017) for classifying land-use history types
209 (or land-cover types) has the drawback that subtleties in land management transitions might be missed,
210 potentially leading to contrasting legacies of past agriculture. We minimised this issue by confining the
211 period of cultivation abandonment to around 1950 (Cramer and others 2008) and by gathering data
212 from multiple regions (Macdonald and others 2012; Verheyen and others 2017).

213 Canopy composition within paired forest patches was ideally as similar as possible and sharing multiple
214 tree species (supplementary information, Table S1.3). The forest canopy often consisted of *Quercus*
215 *robur/petraea*, *Fraxinus excelsior*, *Acer pseudoplatanus* and *Fagus sylvatica*. Patches with presence of
216 *Alnus* sp. were avoided due to unwanted confounding of N fixation effects, as well as being an indicator
217 for high soil moisture content (idem with *Salix*). Presence of coniferous species was kept at a minimum,
218 but a higher incidence in the northernmost region (EST) was unavoidable.

219 *Soil collection and physicochemical analyses*

220 We collected a large volume of soil (ca 0.1 m³) in each forest patch from a pit with a depth of 15 cm and
221 surface of 70 x 100 cm. Roots, drainage lines and wet depressions were avoided as a location for
222 sampling in the forest stands. The field campaign ran from October 2015 until February 2016 and its
223 primary purpose was to provide material for a large mesocosm experiment, necessitating the collection
224 strategy used even though composited samples could have been more representative for the entire
225 forest patch. All 48 bulk soil samples were separately sieved (4 mm mesh, 5 mm for heavy soils) for
226 homogenization and removing of coarse organic material. We subsampled 500 ml from the 0.1 m³ of
227 homogenized soil and processed this through a 1 mm sieve for chemical analysis. Prior to chemical
228 analysis, soil was dried to constant weight at 40°C for 48h.

229 We analysed samples for pH-H₂O by shaking a 1:5 ratio soil/H₂O mixture for 5 min at 300 rpm and
230 measuring with a pH meter Orion 920A with a pH electrode model Ross sure-flow 8172 BNWP, Thermo
231 Scientific Orion, USA (Norm: ISO 10390:199). Total C (%) and N (%) concentrations were quantified by
232 combusting samples at 1200°C which releases all C and N and then measuring the combustion gases for
233 thermal conductivity in a CNS elemental analyser (vario Macro Cube, Elementar, Germany). Inorganic
234 C content was measured after 1 g of dry soil was ashed for 4 hours at 450°C by gradually increasing
235 temperature. This procedure drives off organic C leaving only mineral carbon in the ashes, which were
236 measured using a CNS elemental analyser. Subtracting inorganic C from total C gives the organic C (%).
237 This organic C metric was used to calculate the C:N ratio by taking the ratio of organic C to total N.

238 Extraction of mobile soil cations (Ca, K, Mg, Na, and Al) was performed by extracting soil samples with
239 a 1:5 soil:extractant ratio with ammonium lactate which consisted of lactic acid (88%), acetic acid

240 (99%) and ammonium acetate (25%) at pH 3.74. The cations were measured using atomic absorption
241 spectrophotometry. The proportion of exchangeable base cations was calculated by converting the
242 values from mg/kg to meq/kg so that charge of the cations is included, and then taking the ratio of the
243 sum K^+ , Ca^{2+} , Mg^{2+} and Na^+ over the sum of K^+ , Ca^{2+} , Mg^{2+} , Na^+ and Al^{3+} . Total Ca and Fe-concentration was
244 measured by atomic absorption spectrophotometry (AA240FS, Fast Sequential AAS) after complete
245 digestion of the soil samples with $HClO_4$ (65%), HNO_3 (70%) and H_2SO_4 (98%) in teflon bombs for 4 h at
246 150°C. All P-concentrations were measured colorimetrically according to the malachite green procedure
247 (Lajtha and others 1999). Total P was extracted after complete digestion of the soil samples with $HClO_4$
248 (65%), HNO_3 (70%) and H_2SO_4 (98%) in teflon bombs for 4 h at 150°C. Soluble and readily soluble P was
249 extracted in $CaCl_2$ (P_{CaCl_2} ; Simonis and Setatou 1996). Bioavailable P, which is available for plants within
250 one growing season (Gilbert and others 2009), was extracted in $NaHCO_3$ (P_{Olsen} ; according to ISO
251 11263:1994(E)).

252 Soil texture (% Clay, % Sand % Silt,) was analysed with laser diffraction (Coulter Laser LS 13 320 (SIP-
253 050D2) with auto-sampler) after removal of organic material with H_2O_2 (28.5%) and dispersing the
254 sample with Sodium polyphosphate (6%).

255 *Data analysis*

256 All data analyses and handling was performed in R (R Core Team 2017). Firstly, we clustered data on
257 invariable soil properties related to soil texture and properties of calcareous bedrock (Clay, Silt, Sand
258 and concentrations of total Ca, total Fe and inorganic C, Supplementary information Figure S2.1) using
259 the *hclust* function in R (R Core Team 2017). The three resulting clusters from this analysis were used
260 as a categorical variable “*Soil group*” in the statistical analyses. The results from the cluster analysis
261 were subsequently analysed for principal components to check how the soil groups from the cluster
262 analysis align with all centered and scaled continuous variables to aid in interpretation (Supplementary
263 information Figure S2.2). In addition, we calculated correlations between all soil variables with
264 Spearman’s rank correlation coefficients (Supplementary information Figure S2.3) to aid the
265 interpretation of the soil clustering procedure, the principal component analysis and our a priori
266 selection of response variables. We apply the relative terms ‘Eutrophic’, ‘Mesotrophic’ and ‘Oligotrophic’

267 to our soil groups as they reflect major differences in soil fertility between our study forests (as in Hirst
268 and others 2005; Balkovič and others 2012). Principal component analysis (Supplementary information
269 Figure S2.2) shows that alignment of Eutrophic soil groups with concentrations of inorganic C and total
270 Ca indicate the calcareous properties of these soil groups, resulting in higher pH and proportion of
271 extractable base cations (BC). Mesotrophic soils adopt an overall intermediate position in soil
272 properties, which is visualised in their position around the origin of the principal component analysis.
273 Oligotrophic soils align with high Sand and a high C:N which both correlate with high acidity and lower
274 nutrient concentration (Supplementary information Figure S2.3).

275 We then tested whether land-use history's (*LUH*) effect on *pH*, organic carbon (*org C*), total nitrogen (*tot*
276 *N*), *C:N*, proportion of extractable base cations (*BC*), total phosphorus (*P_{total}*) and bio-available
277 phosphorus (*P_{Olsen}*) was context dependent by considering the gradients of invariable soil characteristics
278 (*Soil group*), nitrogen deposition (*Ndep*), and P nutrient management (*P-balance*). The land use-history
279 of the forest is a categorical variable with two levels indicating whether a forest is continuously forested
280 since at least 1850 (*Ancient*) or whether a forest has been established around 1950 on abandoned arable
281 land (*Post-agricultural*). *Soil group* is a categorical variable with three levels that reflects the inherent
282 soil fertility, as the variable is a product of the cluster analysis on soil properties that relate to texture
283 and calcareous bedrock. To test whether legacies of prior agriculture depend on the soil group, an
284 interaction of *LUH*Soil group* was added in the explanatory models along with the constituent main
285 effects (hypothesis 1). Testing the dependence of agricultural legacies in soil properties along the
286 nitrogen deposition gradient was conducted by adding an interaction term of *LUH*Ndep* (hypothesis 3).
287 These two interaction terms and their main effects formed the fixed factors of the base model (Equation
288 1). The interaction of *Ndep* and *Soil group* was not included in this model due to a limited spread of one
289 soil group (eutrophic) along the N deposition gradient. To test whether total and bio-available
290 phosphorus concentrations in post-agricultural forest are higher in regions with greater P surplus
291 (hypothesis 2), we add in an extra interaction term between *LUH*P-balance* to model responses of total
292 phosphorus (*P_{total}*) and bio-available phosphorus (*P_{Olsen}*). The phosphorus balance could also interact
293 with nitrogen deposition to determine responses of *P_{total}* and *P_{Olsen}* (hypothesis 3) so a final term of
294 *Ndep*P-balance* was added to the model structure of these properties (Equation 2). We adopted the use

295 of hierarchical mixed-effects models to test these effects, using the *lme4* package and the function *lmer*
296 (Bates and others 2014) with *Pair* within *Region* incorporated as a nested random effect. We used
297 maximum likelihood estimation to allow the calculation of a likelihood ratio test when comparing
298 between models.

$$\begin{aligned} 299 \quad & \text{Response variable} \sim \text{LUH} + \text{Soil group} + \text{Ndep} + \text{LUH} * \text{Soil group} + \text{LUH} * \text{Ndep} \\ 300 \quad & + (1 | \text{Region}/\text{Pair}) \end{aligned}$$

301 **Equation 1: base model**

$$302 \quad P \sim \text{base model} + P\text{-balance} + \text{LUH} * P\text{-balance} + \text{Ndep} * P\text{-balance} + (1 | \text{Region}/\text{Pair})$$

303 **Equation 2: Expanded base model with P balance as an additional interactive term to test responses of soil P**

304 We then found the most parsimonious models for explaining variation in each response variable using
305 stepwise backwards model selection and a *Chi-squared* test in the *drop1* function (R Core Team 2017)
306 for calculation of p-values on the likelihood ratio statistic. We consider $p < 0.05$ as significant and $p < 0.1$
307 as supporting minor evidence for an effect. Non-significant interactions with the highest p-values were
308 left out of the models first, prior to testing the constituent main effects. Main effects were retained, even
309 if non-significant, if they appeared in interaction terms. Normality of the residuals in the final model was
310 controlled by performing a Shapiro-Wilk test with the *shapiro.test* function (R Core Team 2017). If
311 normality in the residuals could not be assumed, a log transformation of the response variable was
312 performed for right-tailed response variables and a squared transformation with left-tailed response
313 variables. Goodness-of-fit (R^2 values) for linear mixed effects models were calculated using the
314 *r.squaredGLMM* function from the *MuMIn* package (Barton 2017), which lists both the marginal R^2
315 (variance explained by fixed factors only) and the conditional R^2 (variance explained by both fixed and
316 random effects, Nakagawa and Schielzeth 2013))

317 **Results**

318 Post-agricultural forest had significantly ($p < 0.05$) higher pH, higher phosphorus concentration (P_{Olsen}
319 and P_{total}) and lower C:N compared to ancient forest (Figure 2 and Table 2). Soil group affected responses
320 of pH, proportion of extractable base cations and total P concentration ($p < 0.05$) as main effects, with
321 the highest values of these three variables in rich “eutrophic” soils and the lowest values in the poor

322 “oligotrophic” soils, with “mesotrophic” soil having intermediate means. Higher N deposition is
323 associated with lower pH ($p < 0.05$) across all forest sites as a main effect. Crucially, we found that
324 gradients of soil characteristics, P nutrient management and N deposition affected the magnitudes of
325 organic C, total N, bio-available Olsen P and total P concentrations in interaction with the forests’ land-
326 use history (Figure 2, Table 2).

327 Firstly, we found minor evidence for a dependence of total N concentration on the land-use history
328 between soil groups ($p < 0.1$), as lower total N concentrations in post-agricultural forest only occurred in
329 mesotrophic and oligotrophic soils (Table 2).

330 Secondly, we found that the magnitude of phosphorus (P) legacy in post-agricultural forest is dependent
331 on the regions’ phosphorus balance, with higher P concentrations in regions with greater surplus of P.
332 The interaction term for land-use history and P balance (which we assume is a proxy for nutrient
333 management intensity of past agriculture) is significant for modelling responses of P_{total} ($p < 0.05$) but
334 only with minor evidence for P_{Olsen} ($p < 0.1$).

335 Finally, we found interactions of N deposition and land-use history on concentrations of organic C
336 ($p < 0.05$) but with minor evidence on total N ($p < 0.1$). We found higher total N and organic C
337 concentrations in post-agricultural forest with increasing N deposition while total N and organic C
338 concentrations in ancient forest remained unchanged (Table 2 and Figure 2).

339 **Discussion**

340 Combining soil data from 24 paired sites of ancient and post-agricultural forests across eight European
341 regions successfully elucidated consistent legacies of past land use. As expected, we observed an overall
342 higher P concentration, higher pH, and lower C:N ratio in post-agricultural forest compared to ancient
343 forest. The magnitude of these legacies was affected by gradients of soil characteristics, P nutrient
344 management on the regional level, and N deposition thus exhibiting a context-dependency. First, we
345 found that three soil groups characterised the inherent fertility of the soils and determined the
346 proportion of extractable base cations, pH and concentrations of total N, organic C and total P. Second,
347 regions with greater current surplus of P from agriculture experienced the highest P legacy in post-

348 agricultural forests. Finally, we found that increasing N deposition coincided with a lower pH across
349 forests and increasing total N and organic C concentrations in post-agricultural forest. These results
350 suggest that 1) land-use legacies from cultivation consistently determine soil property responses in
351 post-agricultural forest and 2) differences in the magnitude of response to land-use history can relate
352 to the regional and environmental context, including soil characteristics, regional surplus of P and
353 nitrogen deposition.

354 Inherent soil characteristics are important when comparing legacies of prior agriculture between
355 regions and sites as portrayed in the difference in the proportion of extractable base cations, pH and
356 agricultural phosphorus legacies that we observed between the three soil groups (hypothesis 1). Forests
357 on abandoned fields with carbonate and clay-rich soils exhibited the highest total P concentrations (694
358 mg P/kg), likely due to strong retention of P after cultivation (von Wandruszka 2006). This result was
359 in contrast to ancient forest on sandy oligotrophic soil (292 mg/kg), as these soils are capable of
360 retaining P only by adsorption with Fe/Al oxides which is generally lower than sorption by clay minerals
361 (Gérard 2016). The large regional differences in soil characteristics consequently determined the P
362 legacy effect.

363 The magnitude of phosphorus legacy in post-agricultural forest was furthermore affected by the P
364 balance in the regions (hypothesis 2). Post-agricultural forests had higher total P concentrations (P_{total} ,
365 $p < 0.05$) and bio-available P (P_{Olsen} , $p < 0.1$) concentrations in regions with greater surplus of P, where
366 fields and meadows are prone to intensive fertilisation (Ringeval and others 2017). Since P is
367 particularly persistent in soils (Fisher and Binkley 2000), concentrations of P_{total} are excellent indicators
368 of prior cumulative fertilisation. P_{Olsen} reflects the labile P pool, which is thought to be available for
369 immediate biological uptake (Gilbert and others 2009), and consists of phosphate in the soil solution or
370 phosphate that can rapidly desorb or mineralise from inorganic or organic soil compounds (De Schrijver
371 and others 2012b). In Flanders (Belgium), a region with a 20 kg surplus of P per ha of agricultural land,
372 P_{Olsen} in post agricultural forest was on average 56.3 mg/kg, which was more than triple the 15.5 mg/kg
373 in paired ancient forests. A biological consequence of this dependence of P legacy on regional P balance
374 is that typical forest plants recruit poorly in post-agricultural forest under high nutrient stocks (Honney

375 and others 2002; Baeten and others 2010) and are therefore likely less inhibited in areas with a lower
376 P balance (Brunet and others 2012).

377 Study regions with higher N deposition exhibited responses of acidification and eutrophication in
378 respectively pH and concentration of total N as hypothesized (hypothesis 3). The pH was 0.56 units
379 lower across soil groups for each 10 kg N ha⁻¹y⁻¹ of deposition. This acidifying response magnifies the
380 risk that Fe/Al oxides leach in poorly buffered oligotrophic soils (Lukac and Godbold 2011), underlining
381 that these systems are most susceptible to acidification (Bobbink and others 2015). Aside from
382 acidification, greater N deposition is associated with increased organic C and total N concentration but
383 only in post-agricultural forest. We identify two possible explanations why we found signals of an
384 accumulation of soil organic matter in post-agricultural forest under high N deposition. First,
385 decomposer communities of post-agricultural forests may be less adapted to decomposition in high
386 acidity than decomposer communities of ancient forest (Fichtner and others 2014; Tardy and others
387 2015). Second, it is likely that N deposition has stimulated an acceleration in forest growth and C storage
388 in young temperate deciduous forests (Pretzsch and others 2014; Fowler and others 2015). This
389 dependence of N deposition on forest land-use history on responses of organic C and total N could reveal
390 why responses of eutrophication by N deposition were found to be less clear in temperate forests as
391 opposed to other ecosystems such as grassland and heathland (Bobbink and others 2010; De Schrijver
392 and others 2011; Verheyen and others 2012, but see Dirnböck and others 2014) .

393 Legacies of prior agriculture can be important drivers of global change (Foster and others 2003) in
394 temperate forest in interaction with other environmental changes (Perring and others 2016). With our
395 results, we show that agricultural legacies across temperate forest sites are elucidated when considering
396 differing soil characteristics, regional phosphorus nutrient management and nitrogen deposition on a
397 regional level. Identifying gradients that have influenced the magnitude of agricultural legacies is key to
398 informing how, where and why forest ecosystems respond to contemporary environmental change.

399 **Acknowledgements**

400 We thank the European Research Council for funding this research through the PASTFORWARD project
401 [ERC Consolidator Grant 614839, attributed to KV]. We thank the Research Foundation – Flanders
402 (FWO) for funding the scientific research network FLEUR (<http://www.fleur.ugent.be>) as this network
403 proved to be a helpful platform for finding study regions and supporting DL. Many colleagues from the
404 Forest & Nature Lab provided valuable input in completion of this work. Robbe De Beelde, Filip Ceunen
405 and Kris Ceunen helped considerably in the soil collection campaign. Luc Willems and Greet de Bruyn
406 performed soil chemical analyses. Stephanie Schelfhout and An De Schrijver provided references for soil
407 chemical analyses and P related literature. We thank Gerrit Genouw from the Research Institute Nature
408 and Forest (INBO) for arranging soil texture analyses. Multiple persons helped in relocating forest patch
409 locations or reconstructing their history and granting access. Our gratitude goes out to Pieter De Becker,
410 Peter Van de Kerckhove, Kris Vandekerckhove, Marc Esprit, Hilaire Martin, Frédéric Archaux, Emilie
411 Gallet-Moron, Henri de Witasse de Thézy, Thierry Kervin and Mme. Laudelot.

412 **References**

- 413
- 414 Baeten L. 2010. Recruitment and performance of forest understorey plants in post-agricultural forests.
415 PhD Thesis, Ghent University.
- 416 Baeten L, Vanhellefont M, Frenne PDE, Hermy M, Verheyen K. 2010. The phosphorus legacy of former
417 agricultural land use can affect the production of germinable seeds. *Ecoscience* 17:365–71.
- 418 Balkovič J, Kollár J, Šimonovič V. 2012. Experience with using Ellenberg's R indicator values in
419 Slovakia: Oligotrophic and mesotrophic submontane broad-leaved forests. *Biologia* 67:474–82.
- 420 Barton K. 2017. MuMIn: Multi-model Inference. URL: <https://CRANR-project.org/package=MuMIn>.
- 421 Bates D, Mächler M, Bolker B, Walker S. 2014. Fitting Linear Mixed-Effects Models using lme4. *Journal*
422 *of Statistical Software* 67:1–48.
- 423 Bizzari LE, Collins CD, Brudvig LA, Damschen EI. 2015. Historical agriculture and contemporary fire
424 frequency alter soil properties in longleaf pine woodlands. *Forest Ecology and Management*
425 349:45–54.
- 426 Bobbink R, Hicks K, Galloway J, Spranger T, Alkemade R, Ashmore M, Bustamante M, Cinderby S,
427 Davidson E, Dentener F, Emmett B, Erisman JW, Fenn M, Gilliam F, Nordin A, Pardo L, De Vries W.
428 2010. Global assessment of nitrogen deposition effects on terrestrial plant diversity: A synthesis.
429 *Ecological Applications* 20:30–59.

- 430 Bobbink R, Tomassen H, Weijters M, van den Berg L, Braun S, Nordin A, Schütz K, Hettelingh JP. 2015.
 431 Chapter 4: Effects and Empirical Critical Loads of Nitrogen for Europe. In: Critical Loads and
 432 Dynamic Risk Assessments. Vol. 25. pp 297–326.
- 433 Bomans E, Fransen K, Mertens J, Michiels P, Vandendriessche H, Vogels N. 2005. Addressing
 434 phosphorus related problems in farm practice. Soil Service of Belgium, Leuven-Heverlee 32.
- 435 Bouwman AF, Beusen AHW, Lassaletta L, van Apeldoorn DF, van Grinsven HJM, Zhang J, Ittersum van
 436 MK. 2017. Lessons from temporal and spatial patterns in global use of N and P fertilizer on
 437 cropland. *Scientific Reports* 7:1–11.
- 438 Brudvig LA, Grman E, Habeck CW, Orrock JL, Ledvina JA. 2013. Strong legacy of agricultural land use
 439 on soils and understory plant communities in longleaf pine woodlands. *Forest Ecology and*
 440 *Management* 310:944–55.
- 441 Brunet J, Frenne P De, Holmström E, Lajos M. 2012. Life-history traits explain rapid colonization of
 442 young post-agricultural forests by understory herbs. *Forest Ecology and Management* 278:55–62.
- 443 Bürgi M, Östlund L, Mladenoff DJ. 2017. Legacy Effects of Human Land Use: Ecosystems as Time-
 444 Lagged Systems. *Ecosystems* 20:94–103.
- 445 Compton JE, Boone RD. 2000. Long-term impacts of agriculture on soil carbon and nitrogen in New
 446 England forests. *Ecology* 81:2314–30.
- 447 Cools N, Vesterdal L, De Vos B, Vanguelova E, Hansen K. 2014. Tree species is the major factor
 448 explaining C: N ratios in European forest soils. *Forest Ecology and Management* 311:3–16.
- 449 Cramer VA, Hobbs RJ, Standish RJ. 2008. What's new about old fields? Land abandonment and
 450 ecosystem assembly. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* 23:104–12.
- 451 De Frenne P, Graae BJ, Rodríguez-Sánchez F, Kolb A, Chabrierie O, Decocq G, De Kort H, De Schrijver A,
 452 Diekmann M, Eriksson O, Gruwez R, Hermy M, Lenoir J, Plue J, Coomes DA, Verheyen K. 2013.
 453 Latitudinal gradients as natural laboratories to infer species' responses to temperature. *Journal of*
 454 *Ecology* 101:784–95.
- 455 de la Peña E, Baeten L, Steel H, Viaene N, De Sutter N, De Schrijver A, Verheyen K. 2016. Beyond plant –
 456 soil feedbacks : mechanisms driving plant community shifts due to land-use legacies in post-
 457 agricultural forests. *Functional Ecology* 30:1073–85.
- 458 De Schrijver A, De Frenne P, Ampoorter E, van Nevel L, Demey A, Wuyts K, Verheyen K. 2011.
 459 Cumulative nitrogen input drives species loss in terrestrial ecosystems. *Global Ecology and*
 460 *Biogeography* 20:803–16.
- 461 De Schrijver A, De Frenne P, Staelens J, Verstraeten G, Muys B, Vesterdal L, Wuyts K, van Nevel L,
 462 Schelfhout S, De Neve S, Verheyen K. 2012a. Tree species traits cause divergence in soil
 463 acidification during four decades of postagricultural forest development. *Global Change Biology*
 464 18:1127–40.
- 465 De Schrijver A, Vesterdal L, Hansen K, De Frenne P, Augusto L, Achat DL, Staelens J, Baeten L, De
 466 Keersmaecker L, De Neve S, Verheyen K. 2012b. Four decades of post-agricultural forest
 467 development have caused major redistributions of soil phosphorus fractions. *Oecologia* 169:221–
 468 34.
- 469 Dirnböck T, Foldal C, Djukic I, Kobler J, Haas E, Kiese R, Kitzler B. 2017. Historic nitrogen deposition

- 470 determines future climate change effects on nitrogen retention in temperate forests. *Climatic*
471 *Change* 144:221–35.
- 472 Dirnböck T, Grandin U, Bernhardt-Römermann M, Beudert B, Canullo R, Forsius M, Grabner M,
473 Holmberg M, Kleemola S, Lundin L, Mirtl M, Neumann M, Pompei E, Salemaa M, Starlinger F,
474 Staszewski T, Uzieblo K. 2014. Forest floor vegetation response to nitrogen deposition in Europe.
475 *Global change biology* 20:429–40.
- 476 Dupouey AJL, Dambrine E, Laffite JD, Moares C. 2002. Irreversible Impact of past Land Use on Forest
477 Soils and Biodiversity. *Ecology* 83:2978–84.
- 478 European Union. 2015. Regions in the European Union: Nomenclature of territorial units for statistics
479 NUTS 2013/EU-28. Eurostat, Luxembourg
- 480 Falkengren-Grerup U, ten Brink D-J, Brunet J. 2006. Land use effects on soil N , P , C and pH persist over
481 40 – 80 years of forest growth on agricultural soils. *Forest Ecology and Management* 225:74–81.
- 482 Fichtner A, von Oheimb G, Härdtle W, Wilken C, Gutknecht JLM. 2014. Effects of anthropogenic
483 disturbances on soil microbial communities in oak forests persist for more than 100 years. *Soil*
484 *Biology and Biochemistry* 70:79–87.
- 485 Fisher RF, Binkley D. 2000. Soil chemistry and nutrient uptake - Phosphate and sulfate concentrations
486 depend on specific adsorption. In: *Ecology and Management of Forest Soils*. pp 106–7.
- 487 Flinn KM, Vellend M, Marks PL. 2005. Environmental causes and consequences of forest clearance and
488 agricultural abandonment in central New York, USA. *Journal of Biogeography* 32:439–52.
- 489 Foote RL, Grogan P. 2010. Soil carbon accumulation during temperate forest succession on abandoned
490 low productivity agricultural lands. *Ecosystems* 13:795–812.
- 491 Foster D, Swanson F, Aber J, Burke I, Brokaw N, Tilman D, Knapp A. 2003. The Importance of Land-Use
492 Legacies to Ecology and Conservation. *BioScience* 53:77–88.
- 493 Fowler ZK, Adams MB, Peterjohn WT. 2015. Will more nitrogen enhance carbon storage in young
494 forest stands in central Appalachia? *Forest Ecology and Management* 337:144–52.
- 495 Fraterrigo J, Turner M, Pearson SM, Dixon P. 2005. Effects of past land use on spatial heterogeneity of
496 soil nutrients in southern Appalachian forests. *Ecological Monographs* 75:215–30.
- 497 Gérard F. 2016. Clay minerals, iron/aluminum oxides, and their contribution to phosphate sorption in
498 soils - A myth revisited. *Geoderma* 262:213–26.
- 499 Gilbert J, Gwonig D, Wallace H. 2009. Available soil phosphorus in semi-natural grasslands:
500 Assessment methods and community tolerances. *Biological Conservation* 142:1074–83.
- 501 Grossmann EB, Mladenoff DJ. 2008. Farms, fires, and forestry: Disturbance legacies in the soils of the
502 Northwest Wisconsin (USA) Sand Plain. *Forest Ecology and Management* 256:827–36.
- 503 Hirst RA, Pywell RF, Marrs RH, Putwain PD. 2005. The resilience of calcareous and mesotrophic
504 grasslands following disturbance. *Journal of Applied Ecology* 42:498–506.
- 505 Honnay O, Bossuyt B, Verheyen K, Butaye J, Jacquemyn H, Hermy M. 2002. Ecological perspectives for
506 the restoration of plant community in European temperate forests. *Biodiversity and Conservation*
507 11:213–42.

- 508 Koerner W, Dupouey JL, Dambrine E, Benoit M. 1997. Influence of Past Land Use on the Vegetation and
509 Soils of Present Day Forest in the Vosges Mountains, France. *Journal of Ecology* 85:351–8.
- 510 Lajtha K, Driscoll CT, Jarrell WM, Elliott ET. 1999. Soil phosphorus: characterization and total element
511 analysis. In: Robertson David C., Bledsoe, Caroline S., Sollins, Phillip GP, editor. *Standard soil*
512 *methods for long-term ecological research*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press
- 513 Leuschner C, Wulf M, Bäuchler P, Hertel D. 2014. Forest Continuity as a Key Determinant of Soil
514 Carbon and Nutrient Storage in Beech Forests on Sandy Soils in Northern Germany. *Ecosystems*
515 17:497–511.
- 516 Lukac M, Godbold DL. 2011. *Soil Ecology in Northern Forests: A Belowground View of a Changing*
517 *World*. Cambridge University Press
- 518 Macdonald GK, Bennett EM, Taranu ZE. 2012. The influence of time, soil characteristics, and land-use
519 history on soil phosphorus legacies: a global meta-analysis. *Global Change Biology* 18:1904–17.
- 520 McLauchlan K. 2006. The nature and longevity of agricultural impacts on soil carbon and nutrients: A
521 review. *Ecosystems* 9:1364–82.
- 522 Nakagawa S, Schielzeth H. 2013. A general and simple method for obtaining R^2 from generalized linear
523 mixed-effects models. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* 4:133–42.
- 524 Nitsch P, Kaupenjohann M, Wulf M. 2018. Forest continuity, soil depth and tree species are important
525 parameters for SOC stocks in an old forest (Templiner Buchheide, northeast Germany). *Geoderma*
526 310:65–76.
- 527 Perring MP, De Frenne P, Baeten L, Maes SL, Depauw L, Blondeel H, Carón MM, Verheyen K. 2016.
528 Global environmental change effects on ecosystems: The importance of land-use legacies. *Global*
529 *Change Biology* 22:1361–71.
- 530 Perring MP, Hedin LO, Levin SA, McGroddy M, de Mazancourt C. 2008. Increased plant growth from
531 nitrogen addition should conserve phosphorus in terrestrial ecosystems. *Proceedings of the*
532 *National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 105:1971–6.
- 533 Peterken G. 1996. *Natural Woodland: Ecology and Conservation in Northern Temperate Regions*.
534 Cambridge University Press
- 535 Pretzsch H, Biber P, Schütze G, Uhl E, Rötzer T. 2014. Forest stand growth dynamics in Central Europe
536 have accelerated since 1870. *Nature Communications* 5:1–10.
- 537 R Core Team. 2017. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. URL: [https://www.r-](https://www.r-project.org/)
538 [project.org/](https://www.r-project.org/).
- 539 Ringeval B, Augusto L, Monod H, van Apeldoorn D, Bouwman L, Yang X, Achat DL, Chini LP, Van Oost K,
540 Guenet B, Wang R, Decharme B, Nesme T, Pellerin S. 2017. Phosphorus in agricultural soils:
541 drivers of its distribution at the global scale. *Global Change Biology* 23:3418–32.
- 542 Rowe H, Withers PJA, Baas P, Chan NI, Doody D, Holiman J, Jacobs B, Li H, MacDonald GK, McDowell R,
543 Sharpley AN, Shen J, Taheri W, Wallenstein M, Weintraub MN. 2016. Integrating legacy soil
544 phosphorus into sustainable nutrient management strategies for future food, bioenergy and
545 water security. *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems* 104:393–412.
- 546 Sattari SZ, Bouwman AF, Giller KE, van Ittersum MK. 2012. Residual soil phosphorus as the missing

- 547 piece in the global phosphorus crisis puzzle. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*
548 109:6348–53.
- 549 Simkin SM, Allen EB, Bowman WD, Clark CM, Belnap J, Brooks ML, Cade BS, Collins SL, Geiser LH,
550 Gilliam FS, Jovan SE, Pardo LH, Schulz BK, Stevens CJ, Suding KN, Throop HL, Waller DM. 2016.
551 Conditional vulnerability of plant diversity to atmospheric nitrogen deposition across the USA.
552 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 113:4086–91.
- 553 Simonis AD, Setatou HB. 1996. Assessment of available phosphorus and potassium in soils by the
554 calcium chloride extraction method. *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis* 27:685–
555 94.
- 556 Tao L, Hunter MD. 2012. Does anthropogenic nitrogen deposition induce phosphorus limitation in
557 herbivorous insects? *Global Change Biology* 18:1843–53.
- 558 Tardy V, Spor A, Mathieu O, Lévèque J, Terrat S, Plassart P, Regnier T, Bardgett RD, van der Putten WH,
559 Roggero PP, Seddaiu G, Bagella S, Lemanceau P, Ranjard L, Maron PA. 2015. Shifts in microbial
560 diversity through land use intensity as drivers of carbon mineralization in soil. *Soil Biology and*
561 *Biochemistry* 90:204–13.
- 562 Vellend M, Baeten L, Becker-scarpitta A, Mccune JL, Messier J, Myers-smith IH, Sax DF. 2017. Plant
563 Biodiversity Change Across Scales During the Anthropocene. *Annual Review of Plant Biology*:1–
564 24.
- 565 Verheyen K, Baeten L, De Frenne P, Bernhardt-Römermann M, Brunet J, Cornelis J, Decocq G, Dierschke
566 H, Eriksson O, Hédrl R, Heinken T, Hermy M, Hommel P, Kirby K, Naaf T, Peterken G, Petřík P,
567 Pfadenhauer J, Van Calster H, Walther G-R, Wulf M, Verstraeten G. 2012. Driving factors behind
568 the eutrophication signal in understorey plant communities of deciduous temperate forests.
569 *Journal of Ecology* 100:352–65.
- 570 Verheyen K, Bossuyt B, Hermy M. 1999. The land use history (1278 – 1990) of a mixed hardwood
571 forest in western Belgium and its relationship with chemical soil characteristics. *Journal of*
572 *Biogeography* 26:1115–28.
- 573 Verheyen K, De Frenne P, Baeten L, Waller DM, Hédrl R, Perring MP, Blondeel H, Brunet J, Chudomelová
574 M, Decocq G, De Lombaerde E, Depauw L, Dirnböck T, Durak T, Eriksson O, Gilliam FS, Heinken T,
575 Heinrichs S, Hermy M, Jaroszewicz B, Jenkins MA, Johnson SE, Kirby KJ, Kopecký M, Landuyt D,
576 Lenoir J, Li D, Macek M, Maes SL, Máliš F, Mitchell FJG, Naaf T, Peterken G, Petřík P, Reczyńska K,
577 Rogers DA, Schei FHØ, Schmidt W, Standovár T, Świerkosz K, Ujházy K, Van Calster H, Vellend M,
578 Vild O, Woods K, Wulf M, Bernhardt-Römermann M. 2017. Combining Biodiversity Resurveys
579 across Regions to Advance Global Change Research. *BioScience* 67:73–83.
- 580 Vesterdal L, Schmidt IK, Callesen I, Nilsson LO, Gundersen P. 2008. Carbon and nitrogen in forest floor
581 and mineral soil under six common European tree species. *Forest Ecology and Management*
582 255:35–48.
- 583 von Wandruszka R. 2006. Phosphorus retention in calcareous soils and the effect of organic matter on
584 its mobility. *Geochemical Transactions* 7:1–8.
- 585 Wall A, Hytönen J. 2005. Soil fertility of afforested arable land compared to continuously forested sites.
586 *Plant and Soil* 275:247–60.
- 587 Waters CN, Zalasiewicz J, Summerhayes C, Barnosky AD, Poirier C, Ga uszka A, Cearreta A, Edgeworth

588 M, Ellis EC, Ellis M, Jeandel C, Leinfelder R, McNeill JR, Richter D d., Steffen W, Syvitski J, Vidas D,
589 Wagreich M, Williams M, Zhisheng A, Grinevald J, Odada E, Oreskes N, Wolfe AP. 2016. The
590 Anthropocene is functionally and stratigraphically distinct from the Holocene. *Science* 351.

591 Yesilonis I, Szlavecz K, Pouyat R, Whigham D, Xia L. 2016. Historical land use and stand age effects on
592 forest soil properties in the Mid-Atlantic US. *Forest Ecology and Management* 370:83–92.

593