Antecedents of the Gothic Mode in Early Modern Poetry

Colin Yeo

BA (Communication Studies)
BA (Honours)

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor Of Philosophy of The University of Western Australia
Faculty of Arts, School of Humanities.
English and Cultural Studies

2017
THESIS DECLARATION

I, Colin Yeo, certify that:

This thesis has been substantially accomplished during enrolment in the degree.

This thesis does not contain material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution.

No part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of The University of Western Australia and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

This thesis does not contain any material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

The work(s) are not in any way a violation or infringement of any copyright, trademark, patent, or other rights whatsoever of any person.

This thesis contains only sole-authored work, some of which has been published and/or prepared for publication under sole authorship.

Signature: [Blurred Signature]

Date: 28 June 2017
This study evaluates the significance and deployment of 'Gothic' themes across a range of Renaissance love poems, arguing that a Gothic sensibility actively functions within the textual mode of early modern English poetry. This study adds an important dimension to existing critical scholarship which focuses on the plays of Shakespeare and dramatic works as the primary textual modes of Renaissance Gothic.

The methodological approach of this study is to use close readings combined with historical analysis to compare elements of the eighteenth-century literary Gothic with late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century English poetry. This study focuses on four salient themes: melancholy, the grotesque, the supernatural, and darkness. The analysis of these themes in both Gothic and early modern literature reveals many similarities as well as differences, bringing new meaning to the study of both textual modes. The analyses of Renaissance poetry reveal a preoccupation with characteristic Gothic themes that depict and evoke powerful emotional effects. Influenced by earlier literary traditions and centred on the trope of desire, these texts prompt a view of the world which draws attention to the terrifying, horrifying, unnerving and ambiguous.

The first chapter of this study comprises a reading of the subject of melancholy across the Gothic and early modern love poetry, examining similarities and differences between the melancholy Petrarchan lover and melancholy characters in Gothic novels. The second chapter contrasts eighteenth-century Gothic representations of the supernatural with those in early modern verse, where poets envisage themselves as ghosts and practitioners of magic to evoke reactions of fear in their poetic addressees. The third chapter investigates representations of the grotesque in Renaissance poetry, with a particular focal point of comparison with Matthew G. Lewis's seminal Gothic novel *The Monk*. This reading of 'Gothic bodies' in early modern poetic texts argues for the importance of corporeality in the Petrarchan poetic tradition. The fourth examines the subject of darkness in Renaissance poetry and Gothic novels. I suggest that in both textual modes, writers challenged ideas of stability of meaning by treating darkness as an ambiguous phenomenon. Finally, the fifth chapter considers a number of themes in a single poem, Samuel Daniel's 'The Complaint of Rosamond'. Narrated by a ghost, Daniel's poem combines a number of themes—the supernatural, melancholy and ambiguity—in a narrative that is a fusion of the 'ancient and the modern' and reads as a poetic antecedent to the Gothic.

By undertaking an analysis of Renaissance poetry, a textual mode that has received scant critical attention in early modern Gothic studies, this study provides an important contribution to the field. The thesis is positioned alongside a critical tradition that in recent years has grown to encompass areas such as 'Global Gothic' and, more importantly, 'Renaissance Gothic'. It is hoped that the critical trajectory undertaken in this study will serve as an expansion of the compelling scholarly conversations that surround the burgeoning field of 'Renaissance' or 'Early Modern' Gothic studies.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction: Antecedents of the Gothic Mode in Early Modern Poetry ........................................ 1
  Literary Scholarship: Early Modern Gothic Studies ................................................................. 4
  Gothic Sensibilities, Poetry and Emotional Affect ................................................................. 10
  Literary Nostalgia from the Renaissance to the Gothic ......................................................... 23
  Poetic Antecedents of the Gothic Mode .................................................................................... 35
  Chapter Overview .................................................................................................................... 40

Chapter 1: 'The grief of mine afflicted ghost': Melancholy from the Renaissance to the Gothic .................................................. 44
  Hypochondriac and Love Melancholy ...................................................................................... 51
  Melancholy, the Imagination and Alternating Registers in the Gothic .................................. 59
  Love Melancholy and Alternating Registers of Emotion ....................................................... 66
  Love Melancholy in the Gothic Mode ...................................................................................... 77
  Conclusion .............................................................................................................................. 83

Chapter 2: 'Damned ghosts called up with mighty spells': Early Modern Poetic Supernaturalism and the Gothic .......................................................................................... 85
  Literary Supernaturalism from the Renaissance to the Gothic ............................................. 87
  Supernatural Forms and Repetition in the Gothic and Early Modern Poetry ....................... 96
  Witchcraft and Fear in Early Modern Love Poetry and the Gothic .................................. 115
  Conclusion .............................................................................................................................. 133

Chapter 3: Rack't Carcasses and Ripp'd Hearts: The Grotesque from Gothic to Early Modern .................................................................................................................. 136
  Grotesque Female Characters in The Monk and Early Modern Love Poetry ......................... 146
  Male Gothic Bodies and the Self ............................................................................................ 158
  'From my breast the cold heart taking': Grotesque Realism and Hearts ......................... 171
  Conclusion .............................................................................................................................. 185

Chapter 4: 'Black horrors of the silent night': Darkness, Ambiguity and the Gothic .................. 189
  Darkness and Illumination in the Gothic Mode ....................................................................... 198
  Colonising the Night and Subverting Darkness in Early Modern Verse ............................. 206
  Conclusion .............................................................................................................................. 228

Chapter 5: 'From the horror of infernal depths': Early Modern Gothic and Daniel's The Complaint of Rosamond ........................................................................................................ 231
  Literary Nostalgia: Medievalist Poetics in The Complaint of Rosamond ............................ 232
  Gothic Sensibilities and Daniel's Rosamond ......................................................................... 236

  Conclusion: Towards an Early Modern Gothic Sensibility .................................................. 253
  Bibliography ............................................................................................................................ 261
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are a few people that have been an important part of the process of completing this project and I would like to begin by acknowledging them here.

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisors Kieran Dolin and Bob White for their guidance and mentorship. I am especially thankful to Kieran for his generosity, patience and professionalism in guiding me through various critical stages in the development of this project. Kieran’s insight, feedback and contribution to this thesis have been crucial and I have become a better scholar and writer thanks to his efforts.

I would like to thank my family—my father Joseph and mother Chwee Eng, for giving me the opportunity to study in Australia as well as providing me with support through the course of this PhD. This thesis is dedicated to you two. I am grateful in particular to my mother Chwee Eng, whose infectious enthusiasm for the humanities has shaped my own views toward higher learning and literary scholarship.

To my wife Jane-Héloïse, I have the utmost thanks for your being an absolute source of unconditional love, patience and emotional support. You have been a wonderful colleague, my most constructive critic and a tremendous source of inspiration. I thank you for always believing in me, especially through the hardest times.

Thanks are also due to my friends and colleagues whose support, good cheer and company has kept me going over the years. To James, Bec, Kaz, Amy, Jo, Dave, Ash, Nic and Michie, I thank you for your friendship. A special thanks to Chris for his support, unwavering faith in me and company as both a friend and colleague. Thanks also to Bruce McClintock for his astute feedback and suggestions.

I also want to thank members of my extended family and in-laws for their constant support living in Perth. To Lawrence, Angie and their wonderful family, thanks. I am especially thankful to my cousin Kenny and his wonderful wife Minh for their companionship, which will be sorely missed in the years to come. To the Nancarrows and O’Callaghas, I have much thanks for the encouragement and support I have received as a part of your families.

Thanks also to the University of Western Australia for a generous IPRS/SIRF stipend that has allowed me to complete this project. I also offer my thanks to staff and researchers at the ARC Centre for the History of Emotions, English and Cultural Studies and the Faculty of Arts—especially Katrina, Pam, Ines and Jenny—for assisting me with research and administrative matters. Last but not least, thanks to Professors Andrew Lynch and the late Philippa Maddern for giving me the support and opportunities that I have had as the beneficiary of a CHE affiliation.
AUTHORSHIP DECLARATION: SOLE AUTHOR PUBLICATIONS

This thesis contains the following sole-authored work that has been prepared for publication. A revised version of this paper appears in Chapter 3 of this thesis.

Details of the work:

Location in thesis:
Chapter 3

Signature: 

Date: 28 June 2017
This thing of darkness, I acknowledge mine.

— Prospero, Shakespeare’s *The Tempest* (v.1)

Just as all fiction first found extensive embodiment in poetry, so is it in poetry that we first encounter the permanent entry of the weird into standard literature.

— H.P Lovecraft, *Supernatural Horror in Literature*
Introduction: Antecedents of the Gothic Mode in Early Modern Poetry

Poore victories; but if you dare be brave,
And pleasure in your conquest have,
First kill th'enormous Gyant, your Disdaine,
And let th'enchantresse Honor, next be slaine,
And like a Goth and Vandall rize,
Deface Records, and Histories
Of your owne arts and triumphs over men,
And without such advantage kill me then.¹

(Donne, 'The Dampe': 9–16)

The second stanza of John Donne's poem 'The Dampe' (1633) features a poetic speaker engaging in what might be termed as a form of 'Gothic' discourse. The term 'Goth', as used in this poem, has both a historical as well as an emotive significance. Firstly, Donne's 'Goth' is a descriptor for the historical Goths, invaders of Europe who hailed from the northern parts of the continent. Secondly, the speaker's application of the term to his addressee, stating that she is 'like a Goth', is an attempt to produce an emotional response from a reader. Donne strives to evoke such a response by repudiating his addressee. He denigrates her by saying that she possesses the negative qualities of an uncivilised and barbaric Goth.

The way Donne uses this reference to the Goths in 'The Dampe' is similar to two features of the literary Gothic mode. The first is that Gothic writers have a keen

interest in the real, or imagined past. Donne’s references to giants, enchantresses and Goths, along with his use of these tropes as figures of speech, suggest an engagement with symbols of the past. The poet demonstrates an attempt to combine the ‘ancient with the modern’, borrowing symbols and motifs across a temporal span of several centuries in the creation of a ‘modern’ work of Renaissance verse. A second feature of the literary Gothic is that of emotional affect. In literary studies, the Gothic is an affective textual mode, a form of representation that seeks to elicit strong emotive responses from readers. In ‘The Damp’, Donne’s speaker subverts his readers’ expectations by adopting the persona of one who is, on the one hand, submissive to his mistress’s power, but on the other hand, stresses that she is uncivilised and barbaric.

Despite the similarities between the features of Donne’s poem and the features of the Gothic, Donne’s poem was published in 1633, more than a century before the first Gothic novel, Horace Walpole’s The Castle of Otranto, was published in 1764. This interpretation of Donne’s poem leads to the research questions that lie at the heart of this study: are there authors writing in the pre-eighteenth century period who use similar affective techniques in their work? What might we discover when we view poetic texts of a period incongruous with the temporal boundaries of the Gothic through the mode’s critical framework?

Donne’s appropriation of symbols of the past and his use of affect as a textual strategy provides a springboard for this study’s core argument. This thesis proposes that a Gothic sensibility, a set of specific intellectual and affective responses to the world, can be located in the genre of early modern love poetry.² Through the course of this thesis, I will examine how Donne, and a host of other early modern poets, demonstrated a Gothic sensibility in their poetical works. My inquiry is situated in early modern poetic texts from Renaissance England, offering a new analysis of how

these texts are structured to generate emotional affect. The study provides fresh insights in the field of early modern Gothic studies by delving into a textual genre that has traditionally been eschewed in favour of the study of early modern plays.

The methodology undertaken here uses close readings of literary texts across both periods, supplemented by a careful historicisation of the cultural factors that predicate Gothic sensibilities in the historical periods of early modern and eighteenth century England. Through this methodology, the scholarship undertaken in this thesis pursues several interconnected aims. The first is the examination of early modern poetic texts through the critical lens of the Gothic. This involves the location of what might be termed as 'Gothic' themes in works of early modern poetry and a critical analysis of these themes. Achieving this leads to a second linked aim, which is an evaluation of how the affective strategies of the Gothic have a precedent in early modern literature. A critical consensus raised by critics is that the Gothic is regarded as a mode of literature that affects readers/viewers at an emotional level. It is this dynamic of emotional affect in texts from both the early modern period and Gothic that will be further explored across the chapters in this study. Thirdly, this study aims to illuminate the parallels in the intellectual underpinnings of the textual genres of Renaissance poetry and Gothic novels. What are the similarities and differences between broader cultural ideals such as superstition and supernaturalism in eighteenth century and Renaissance England? How do these cultural forms and ideas create meaning in literary texts? These are questions that this study will address.

As a discipline, Gothic studies survey a range of texts across time, a temporal span that is inclusive of Shakespearean plays and the contemporary medium of film. Through an evaluation of four core themes, this thesis situates itself as an endeavour that projects critical interest into a disciplinary sub-division of Gothic studies that focuses on early modern poetry. Against a critical framework that has traditionally privileged the study of Renaissance plays, this study's primary hypothesis to be
explored argues for the importance of early modern poetic works in a study of the Gothic. The goal of this study is thus the further development of scholarship in Renaissance Gothic that shifts away from the well developed field of Shakespearean criticism.

This thesis offers several original observations that are generated through the comparative analyses undertaken through the latter four chapters. Its primary observation is a recognition of the techniques of affect that relate to early modern love poetry, techniques that are also used in Gothic texts. The spotlighting of these techniques in the genre of Renaissance love poetry leads to an important secondary observation. This is the recognition of variances in the emotional registers generated in both textual genres. Differences in the use of literary techniques and textual form (poetry versus novel) result in varying modalities of emotional expression that are endemic to each literary mode. Taking a step back from the construction of literary texts themselves, a final observation relates to the core theme of the early modern courtly love genre—love melancholy. Love melancholy, I argue, offers a compelling catalyst for the generation of heightened emotional affect. Through first-person poetic voices, the early modern Petrarchan lover exhibits emotional registers that are at times heightened, paralleling the displays of emotion made by Gothic villains. With a focus on negative and ambivalent themes, the early modern poetic texts surveyed in this study also reveal a distinctly 'Gothic' flavour to them. It is the goal of this study to highlight and analyse these aspects.

**Literary Scholarship: Early Modern Gothic Studies**

Scholarship of early modern England’s literary culture and its connections with the Gothic represents a broad disciplinary shift in Gothic studies that is fairly recent.
Early twentieth-century critics such as Devendra Varma and Montague Summers asserted, albeit tenuously, broad connections between the Renaissance and the Gothic. These early studies mark attempts at broad critical surveys of the Gothic that include cursory mentions of early modern literature, without going into much detail. Varma and Summers' efforts were followed by others in the latter half of the twentieth century like David Punter's in his seminal *The Literature of Terror* (1980) and Anne Williams's in *Art of Darkness* (1995). Punter and Williams share the view that the Gothic, a literary tradition associated with the rise of the Gothic novel in the eighteenth century, has elements that can be traced in texts from earlier periods in English history. Punter regards the genre of Graveyard Poetry as a foundational element of the Gothic. Williams suggests that what one might describe as 'Gothic' might also be regarded as 'poetic'. The poetic element of the Gothic, for Williams, is linked with a form of literary nostalgia that places value on English textual cultures of the past, including Jacobean drama, Shakespearean works, and Milton’s poetry. These studies offer a view of the Gothic as one that has connections with the literary culture of preceding ages. Williams's designation of the Gothic as a poetic tradition in particular raises a question surrounding the use of the term as a descriptor for texts published after Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto* in 1764. If there are 'poetic' elements to the Gothic that can be located in older texts, what might one discover through an analysis of these texts themselves? Building on Punter and Williams’s critical observations, this is the core research question that is a key driver of this study.

It was during the late 2000s that scholarship of the early modern period started to inform a more developed scholarly sub-genre of Gothic studies. Drakakis and Townshend's *Gothic Shakespeares* (2008) marked one of the first scholarly

---


attempts at illustrating the importance of Shakespeare's writing to eighteenth century Gothic novelists. This was followed by Desmet and Williams's *Shakespearean Gothic* in 2009. As can be discerned from the titles of these foundational collections, an indelible emphasis on the relationship between the works of Shakespeare and the Gothic has emerged as a core part of these investigations.

*Gothic Shakespeares* considers the relationship between Shakespeare's work and popular eighteenth-century Gothic texts. It also addresses the various intertextual links between Shakespeare's work and Gothic novels, as well as extrapolating these connections in analyses of more recently published Gothic texts such as Stephanie Meyer's *Twilight* (2005). The volume's emphasis is on the Bard's plays, with one notable exception. An essay from Jerrold Hogle in this book mentions one of Shakespeare's non-dramatic works, albeit briefly. Drawing on the work of Shakespearean critic Joel Fineman, Hogle raises a point about the representation of the self in Shakespeare's *Macbeth* and *Hamlet*, and compares this with the speaker of Shakespeare's Sonnets and characters from Gothic fiction such as Walpole's Manfred and Lewis's Ambrosio. Hogle's point about the speaker of Shakespeare's Sonnets raises the tantalising possibility of evaluating, through the lens of the Gothic, early modern poetic texts rather than plays. Hogle subsequently directs his focus on the notion of otherness and the self to his proposition of Gothic 'counterfeiting', a process where symbols and ideas are evoked through a form of 'backward-looking' signification. I suggest that one notion of 'counterfeiting' that has yet to be explored is the recurrence, from early modern to Gothic, of a quintessential condition that affects characters in these texts—melancholy. Chapter 1 is aimed at investigating the importance of melancholy for writers in both periods.

---


Desmet and Williams’ s collection *Shakespearean Gothic* analyses Shakespeare’s appeal for eighteenth-century writers of Gothic fiction such as Horace Walpole, Ann Radcliffe and Matthew Lewis. One section of the volume presents an evaluation of Shakespeare as a ‘Gothic writer’, a categorical formulation that carries with it the risk of inflating the term ‘Gothic’ and diminishing the meaning of the term. As Alexandra Warwick has recently cautioned, the identification of a text as ‘Gothic’ is less meaningful than an analysis of how a text works. To this end, it is necessary to state that I am not arguing for a reading of early modern poets as ‘Gothic writers’ or for the designation of my source texts as ‘Gothic poems’. I am interested instead in identifying, through the critical lens of the Gothic, how mechanisms of emotional affect function in texts from two literary modes. My approach is also cognisant of the differences between eighteenth-century and Renaissance literature, differences that in themselves set the literary traditions of both periods apart.

An essay from *Shakespearean Gothic* that is especially pertinent to the intellectual foundation of this thesis is Jessica Walker’s essay on connections between Shakespeare’s *Richard III* and the Gothic. Walker highlights Shakespeare’s medievalist inclinations, proposing that his literary medievalism reverberates in the Gothic. Walker’s observation of cross-temporal exchanges in Shakespeare’s play demarcates the playwright’s ‘Gothic sensibility’ in combining the ‘ancient with the modern’, an impulse that I propose is shared with other early modern authors. In the latter half of this chapter, I will provide an insight into the intellectual impulses that underpin the eighteenth-century Gothic novel and early modern poetry by addressing the subject of cross-temporality in both Renaissance and Gothic literature.

In focusing on the Shakespearean plays as a ‘source’ for the Gothic, a question surrounding the mode’s connections with the early modern period arises. If the

---


plays of Shakespeare contain 'Gothic elements', might other early modern texts contain similar themes and tropes? A genre of Renaissance literature that has received critical interpretation as a 'proto-Gothic' textual mode is that of early seventeenth century Jacobean plays. William Hughes, for example, in *Historical Dictionary of Gothic Literature* (2013), writes that Jacobean tragedy is replete with 'proto-Gothic preoccupations'.

'Proto-Gothic' is a term that is charged with meaning, carrying with it the implication that texts published prior to the advent of the Gothic novel have some form of diminished value. Indeed, if we were to reverse the term, in place of 'post-Gothic', Gothic studies accords specific categorical markers such as 'Australian Gothic' or 'Science Fiction Gothic' to other sub-genres of Gothic criticism. The preferred terms that I will adopt across this thesis, then are 'Early Modern Gothic', or 'Renaissance Gothic'. The use of these terms is an effort to recognise and situate my texts as products of an early modern cultural milieu, one that has parallels to, as well as points of departure from, the cultural background of eighteenth-century Gothic texts.

Other critics such as Douglass Thomson, Jack Voller and Frederick Frank approach the work of Jacobean playwrights as 'Gothic writers'. In *Gothic Writers* (2002), they address the persistence of devices such as 'gloomy scenery', 'frenzied characters' and 'sanguinary events' in revenge tragedies such as Kyd’s *The Spanish Tragedy* (1592), and Tourneur’s *Revenger’s Tragedy* (1607), suggesting that these plays are 'crowded with gothic incidents and atmosphere'. While *Gothic Writers* offers a good reference point for primary sources, the text is very much structured more as an introductory resource and less as a critical appraisal. The risk here is, as Warwick has astutely noted, for critics and students alike to lapse toward a 'slippage of

---


description' rather than proper literary analysis. The outlining of 'Gothic elements' is useful to a point, but beyond that, it is necessary to question the function of these elements—the reasons that underpin their use, what they are used for, how they are used and, most importantly, what their relation is to the broad concept we know as 'Gothic'. These points are integral drivers of the critical work that is undertaken in this study.

For other critics, such as Maggie Kilgour in *The Rise of the Gothic Novel* (1995) and Jeffrey Cox in his essay 'English Gothic Theatre', Jacobean tragedy is proposed as a literary source that influenced the development of the Gothic mode. With Hogle and Kilgour's points in mind, it is crucial to signal from here that this study does not intend to detract from the importance of Shakespearean and Jacobean Gothic studies or to provide counterclaims to the Gothic mode's origins. The intellectual milieus surrounding Gothic writers and early modern poets in their respective periods were vastly different. Indeed, one of the purposes of this study is to acknowledge both the similarities as well the differences between the intellectual traditions in both periods that precipitated the creation of texts aimed at generating responses from readers.

In the same year that *Shakespearean Gothic* was published, the conference 'Gothic Renaissance' was organised by Neumeier and Bronfen at the University of Cologne. 'Gothic Renaissance' marked one of the first scholarly endeavours in a conference format, aimed at evaluating the Renaissance as a cultural phenomenon in relation to the Gothic and more importantly shifting away from the established paradigms of the 'Bard's Gothic afterlife'. Papers from the conference were published in *Gothic Renaissance* (2014), a collection that has proven invaluable in this study's

---

11 Alexandra Warwick, 'Feeling Gothicky,' 7.

challenging scope of evaluating textual material across two different time periods. As a continuation of the critical conversations established in *Gothic Renaissance*, this thesis initiates a discussion of a textual mode that was briefly addressed in Zimmermann's essay 'Gothic Affinities in Metaphysical Poetry' in *Gothic Renaissance*—early modern poetry. Zimmermann draws comparisons between the genre of metaphysical poetry and the Gothic, suggesting that there are 'affinities' between both textual modes. The work undertaken in this thesis expands on Zimmermann's claims by adopting a critical approach toward the early modern genre of *love* poetry rather than metaphysical poetry.

**Gothic Sensibilities, Poetry and Emotional Affect**

As a study of the similarities and differences between early modern poetry and Gothic novels, it is necessary to begin by unpacking the importance of poetic form for the first wave of Gothic *novelists*. To begin, the relationship between the Gothic and the early eighteenth-century genre of Graveyard Poetry is one that also warrants foregrounding. The term 'Graveyard Poet' is an unofficial designation given to a number of English poets from the early 1700s. These poets authored poems that addressed themes such as death, the afterlife and religion. The often macabre tone of these poems and their fixation on death have contributed to an interpretation of this textual genre as a precursor to the Gothic novel.

---

13 Other studies addressing the Shakespeare-Gothic connection include David Salter's '“This demon in the garb of a monk”: Shakespeare, the Gothic and the Discourse of Anti-Catholicism', *Shakespeare* 5, no.1 (2009); and Natalie Hewitt's Ph.D. thesis 'Shakespeare's Influence in the Gothic Literary Tradition' (Claremont Graduate University, 2013).

Connections between the Gothic and Graveyard Poetry are important to the discussions undertaken in this thesis because they outline lines of influence across two disparate literary forms—poetry and prose. The association of Graveyard Poetry as a precedent to the Gothic novel has its roots in the work of critics from the 1980s such as Devendra Varma and David Punter. This view has persisted in the work of other contemporary scholars such as Fred Botting, William Hughes, and Andrew Smith. Andrew Smith’s recently published monograph on death and the Gothic, for example, regards Graveyard Poetry as a poetic mode focused on the subject of death that forms a crucial part of a literary history of the theme in the Gothic mode. That Graveyard Poetry is regarded as a precursor to the Gothic is not a point I intend to contend in this study. Rather, the work that will be undertaken in this thesis is an analysis of an older poetic mode to investigate, as Zimmermann states, ‘affinities’ or parallels with the Gothic mode.

Given that this thesis evaluates the functioning of emotional affect in Renaissance poetry, the study of Graveyard Poetry is important to the concerns of this thesis as the latter genre has been identified as one that is highly affective. Written as first-person meditations on death and the afterlife, a host of emotional responses to the transience of life are evoked in the work of the Graveyard Poets. The poems of Graveyard Poets Edward Young, Robert Blair and Thomas Gray, Eric Parisot observes, demonstrate attempts at forging a connection between their


16 See Fred Botting, Gothic (London: Routledge, 2014); Hughes, Historical Dictionary, 6; and Andrew Smith, Gothic Literature (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), 4.

17 Andrew Smith, Gothic Death, 1740–1914: A Literary History (Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2016).

readers and their textual selves that precedes the Gothic mode’s investment in emotional involvement:

In Blair, we can detect the emergence of a Gothic sensibility; in Young and Gray, we see a sentimental poetic emerge based on sympathetic contagion, where the act of reading recreates emotional experience. All three poets, however, aspire to stimulate the affective imagination, to command and elicit sentimentality as a form of pseudo-religious morality.¹⁹

Parisot writes of the emotive function of the Gothic mode, an aspect of the Gothic that he proposes can also be located in the work of the Graveyard Poets. This proposition raises the possibility of evaluating an older poetic mode along these lines. As this thesis will show, the techniques of reader involvement that engage a reader on an emotional level are not unique to the textual modes of Graveyard Poetry and the Gothic. With a focus on key themes and an analysis of literary techniques, this study explores how poets of the early modern period constructed texts that were slanted toward generating emotional effects. This study engages with Robert Aubin’s claim that texts from the early eighteenth century, and even the late seventeenth century, are ‘anticipatory’ of Graveyard Poetry.²⁰ More importantly, it adopts the view that the dynamics of emotional affect, or as Parisot writes, the ‘recreation of emotional experience’, deployed by Gothic novelists and Graveyard Poets have antecedents in early modern poetry.

The dynamics of emotional affect were one of the primary concerns of the first eighteenth century Gothic novelists. For Horace Walpole, author of the first ‘Gothick’ novel, the emotion of terror was described as a ‘principal engine’ of his text, a means of maintaining a reader’s interest in his text through shifts in emotional responses, or,

---


as he wrote, a 'vicissitude of interesting passions'. In a similar vein, Ann Radcliffe's *The Mysteries of Udolpho* (1794) concludes with an authorial interjection about the effects of her text on a reader. Emotional affect is also referenced in Radcliffe's essay 'On The Supernatural in Poetry' (1826). Here, she draws on descriptions of atmosphere and emotions of Shakespeare's characters as textual elements that allow a reader to 'indulge' in emotions such as horror, pity and indignation.

From eighteenth-century writers to modern-day critics, the Gothic has long been regarded as an affective mode of literature. This has informed the affect-based approach undertaken in this study. For Robert Hume, drawing emotional responses from readers is a significant characteristic of Gothic fiction. In Hume's appraisal of Gothic and Romantic fiction, he writes:

> Another distinctive feature of the early Gothic novel is its attempt to involve the reader in a new way. In the sentimental literature of the age one is invited to admire fine feelings; in Gothic writing the reader is held in suspense with the characters, and increasingly there is an effort to shock, alarm, and otherwise rouse him. Inducing a powerful emotional response in the reader (rather than a moral or intellectual one) was the prime object of these novelists. In this endeavour they prepared the way for the romantic poets who followed them.

Here, Hume outlines the capacity of Gothic fiction to engage readers on an emotional level. Hume identifies a concordance between the literary representation of a character's fictional experiences and a reader. Other critics such as Carol Margaret Davidson, Carol Ann Howells and Ellen Ledoux have addressed the

---


salience of affective functions in the Gothic.® Barbara M. Benedict and Susanne Becker see the reader response dimension of Gothic works as part of a manifestation of literary sensibility, where the emotional sensitivity of typically female characters in Gothic fiction is showcased. From a social sciences disciplinary perspective, literary affect can be described as an effect that is similar to that of 'emotional contagion'—a form of psychosocial and behavioural synchrony. The purpose of this study is firstly to isolate and analyse elements of the Gothic that are structured toward generating emotional effects. Secondly, it compares these elements with how they are represented in early modern literature, establishing a critical dialogue between the two different textual modes.

The designation of the Gothic as an affective literary mode forms one of the key drivers of this study. With the notion of affect in mind, I want to propose a term 'emotional transaction' to describe the functioning of emotional affect in Gothic and early modern texts. Emotional transaction implies a recognition of a text's content and its deliberate function as a catalyst for emotional affect. In other words, an


27 Daneen Wardrop utilises the term 'emotional transaction' to read Emily Dickinson's citation of Radcliffean terror in her poetry. See Daneen Wardrop, Emily Dickinson’s Gothic: Goblin with a Gauge (Iowa City: University of Iowa Press, 1996), 75.
emotional transaction is generated when those who peruse a text are aware of the explicit structures of emotional affect that will be utilised in it. Here I borrow from Hartwell’s description of emotional transaction:

[horror] points to a transaction between a reader and a text that is the essence of reading horror fiction, and not anything contained within that text (such as a ghost, literal or implied).28

Hartwell writes that the effects of emotional transaction are recognised even if it 'does not work as it is supposed to'. These dynamics account for the vogue for love poetry in the late sixteenth century and for eighteenth-century Gothic texts. Readers of these genres were well aware of texts' typical conceits, themes and ideas, but consumed them anyway. For example, despite a recognition of Petrarchan love poetry being the literary offspring of Petrarch’s 'long-deceased woes', the genre was immensely popular in the late 1500s. Despite the criticisms levelled at the first wave of Gothic novelists, Walpole, Radcliffe and Lewis's novels were well received. A schema of emotional transaction underpins Gothic sensibilities from early modern poetry to Gothic novels, pointing to both a recognition of these texts' affective potential and a willingness to peruse these texts with foreknowledge of their underlying themes and tropes. As Emily from The Mysteries of Udolpho remarks:

But a terror of this nature, as it occupies and expands the mind, and elevates it to high expectation, is purely sublime, and leads us, by a kind of fascination, to seek even the object, from which we appear to shrink.29

Emily’s thoughts in this scene read as a metatextual comment on the act of reading Gothic novels. Readers are fully aware of the 'tricks' and techniques used by writers,
but an awareness of these techniques does not serve to detract in any way from the reception of these texts.

One of the most salient 'tricks' used by eighteenth century Gothic novelists in their work was the introduction of poetic techniques in their writing. A distinguishing feature of the eighteenth-century Gothic novel is that it is a hybrid text comprised of a prose narrative 'interspersed' with works of poetry. Unsurprisingly, medieval and early modern verse forms are scattered throughout the novels of Walpole, Radcliffe and Lewis. In addition to these, citations from Graveyard Poetry are used by these novelists. Citations from Graveyard Poet Thomas Gray's lyrical compositions 'Ode On a Distant Prospect of Eton College' (1747) and 'Ode For Music' (1769) are used to headline Chapter 12 of Volume 3, and Chapters 11 and 15 of Volume 4 of The Mysteries of Udolpho. A passage from The Grave, a poem by Robert Blair (another Graveyard Poet) is used by Matthew Lewis to preface two chapters of The Monk—Chapter 4 of Volume 2, and Chapter 2 of Volume 3. What were the qualities inherent in poetry that made the verse form so appealing to writers of Gothic fiction? Poetry, I suggest, allowed writers to introduce a dimension of emotional affect to their works. It is this poetic quality of eighteenth-century Gothic texts that allows for a comparison between the texts in this period and early modern poetry.

In her seminal essay 'On the Supernatural in Poetry', Ann Radcliffe wrote that the work of early modern writers such as Shakespeare and John Milton had the ability to 'strike and interest' a reader. Poetic form offered writers such as Radcliffe, Walpole and Lewis a means of generating responses to their works. This was observed by Nathan Drake, who in the 1790s praised the role of poetry and its associated affective function. He cited examples of emotional states such as terror

---

and horror, proposing that poets who demonstrate an ability to evoke these states should be regarded highly:

No efforts of genius on the other hand are as truly great as those which approaching the brink of horror, have yet, by the art of the poet or the painter, by adjunctive and picturesque embellishment, by pathetic, or sublime emotion, been rendered powerful in creating the most delightful and fascinating emotions.\(^{31}\)

Two important points raised by Drake are pertinent to this study. Firstly, Drake's remarks offer a critical perspective that praises the affective function of poetry. Secondly, Drake also acknowledges that these 'efforts' are not a uniquely eighteenth-century phenomenon. Drake subsequently proposes that Dante Alighieri’s \textit{Inferno} is one of the first poetic 'specimens' that showcase this preoccupation with engaging a reader on an emotional level.\(^{32}\) Drake's observations, when paired with Radcliffe's own remarks in her essay, suggest that eighteenth-century writers were cognisant of the dynamics of emotional affect that they regarded as a salient feature of poetic texts of the past.

To better understand the importance of poetic form as a means of generating emotional affect, we can look briefly at Russian Formalist Roman Jakobson's theory of poeticity. Poetic language, Jakobson proposes, often overlaps with emotive language. This is particularly salient in lyrical poetry, where links between emotives and first-person lyrics are proposed by Jakobson to be intimately linked.\(^{33}\) The term 'emotive', for Jakobson, denotes a direct expression of a speaker's attitude towards his or her addressee, an expression that creates an impression of an emotional

\(^{31}\) Nathan Drake, \textit{Literary Hours: Volume One} (Sudbury: J. Burkitt, 1800), 356.

\(^{32}\) Drake, \textit{Literary Hours}, 357.

reaction. Jakobson uses the term ‘poeticity’ to denote the difference between language as it is used in descriptive forms versus poetic forms:

Poeticity is present when the word is felt as a word and not a mere representation of the object being named or as an outburst of emotion, when words and their composition, their meaning, their external and internal form, acquire a weight and value of their own instead of referring indifferently to reality. Jakobson describes the synthesis of form (how words/sentences are organised) and meaning (what words refer to) and how this combination has the potential to generate responses. The structure of language in poetic forms, Jakobson proposes, can be differentiated from descriptions, or ‘references to reality’, in their distinctive arrangements. His reference to ‘felt’ points to a mode of emotional engagement through language that extends beyond ‘emotional outbursts’; in essence, how poetic language and texture relates to emotional affect. Anne Williams proposes that the Gothic is a ‘poetic’ literary mode, and it is the goal of this study to highlight these poetic elements in eighteenth-century Gothic texts. This study analyses the differences and similarities between the ‘poetic’ elements of eighteenth-century Gothic with early modern poetry.

Critical texts written in the Renaissance reveal that early modern English writers, like those of the eighteenth century, were aware of the affective potential afforded by verse literary forms. As Craik and Pollard have recently proposed, the consumption of poetry and plays in early modern England was imagined to affect those who encountered them in ways that ranged from the threatening and

---

inflammatory to the comforting and therapeutic.\textsuperscript{37} In \textit{An Apology for Poetry} (1595), Sir Philip Sidney comments on how literature has the capacity to affect the passions. In a section of his treatise on historical accounts, he writes that 'feigned examples' of stories have as much capacity to affect individuals as 'true examples', as 'feigned examples' demand the 'highest keys' of passion.\textsuperscript{38} Sidney also writes of how lyrical poetry prompts readers to feel the 'forcibleness' of passions articulated by a text's writer.\textsuperscript{39} Sidney’s remarks, when placed alongside the writings of Walpole and Radcliffe, suggests that poets of the Renaissance were well aware of the capacity for literary works to generate responses in their readers.

Alongside Sidney's \textit{Apology}, another key early modern work of literary criticism that touched on the nuances of emotional affect in poetic works was George Puttenham’s \textit{Arte of English Poetry} (1589). A treatise addressing various aspects of rhetoric, style and the state of English verse in the period, Puttenham’s \textit{Arte} provides modern day scholars with historical insights into the subject of literary criticism in the Renaissance. Both Puttenham and Sidney provided the view of poetry as a compelling literary form that had the potential to affect an individual reader's emotions.

For both Sidney and Puttenham, emotional affect that arises from the reading of poetry results from effects on a person’s body as well as a person’s mind. Puttenham comments:

This ornament then is of two sorts, one to satisfy and delight the ear only by a goodly outward show set upon the matter with words, and speeches


\textsuperscript{39} Sidney, \textit{Apology for Poetry}, 113.
smoothly and tunably running: another by certain intendments or sense of such words and speeches inwardly working a stir to the mind.40

Puttenham’s comments present a picture of an early modern theory of reader response. Elsewhere in Arte, he denotes the ear as the receiver of lyrical, ’auricular’ figures alongside the affectation of the mind:

Therefore since we have already allowed to our maker his auricular figures, and also his sensible, by which all the words and clauses of his meters are made as well tunable to the ear, as stirring to the mind, we are now by order to bestow upon him those other figures which may execute both offices, and all at once to beautify and give sense and sententiousness to the whole language at large.41

Puttenham also proposes that the function of emotional affect works best when it operates at a subconscious level:

And one notable mean to affect the mind, is to enforce the sense of anything by a word of more than ordinary efficacy, and nevertheless is not apparent, but as it were, secretly implied.42

These observations pertain to one of the core aims of this study, an appraisal of emotional affect in Gothic and early modern texts. Puttenham’s observations provide an account that may be applicable to the function of Gothic writing, as the Gothic is a textual mode that relies on the dynamic of emotional affect. Puttenham’s comments are also raised by Sidney in Apology:

By these, therefore, examples and reasons, I think it may be manifest that the Poet, with that same hand of delight, doth draw the mind more effectually than any other art doth.43


42 Puttenham, Art of English Poesy, 268.
But if anything be already said in the defence of sweet Poetry, all concurreth to the maintaining the Heroical, which is not only a kind, but the best and most accomplished kind of Poetry. For as the image of each action stirreth and instructeth the mind, so the lofty image of such worthies most inflameth the mind with desire to be worthy.\textsuperscript{44}

Sidney’s writings in his \textit{Apology} are important as they constitute a set of critical writings of an individual who was both a literary critic and a poet: Sidney’s \textit{Astrophil and Stella} (1591) was the first sonnet sequence published in Elizabethan England. His comment of poetry as taking on the role of ‘instructing’ and ‘inflaming’ the mind speaks of a critical view of poetry and its affective potential. Tracing this dynamic of emotional affect in the work of early modern poets, this thesis will subsequently explore the affective techniques used by Sidney in his poetic works, as well as by his fellow Renaissance contemporaries.

This thesis reads early modern poets’ efforts at generating emotional affect in their work as demonstrative of an early modern Gothic sensibility. As a preamble to my discussion, the term ‘Gothic sensibility’ is one that warrants unpacking. The word ‘sensibility’ refers to the power of sensation or emotional response.\textsuperscript{45} An author’s ‘Gothic sensibility’ denotes how he or she constructs a text in a given way such as to elicit a specific emotional response from a reader. As an extension of the word ‘sense’, ‘sensibility’ denotes the quality of being affected by emotional or artistic influences or experiences.\textsuperscript{46} The term was associated with strong emotional reactions to individuals’ emotions, the natural world, objects and events.\textsuperscript{47}

\textsuperscript{43} Sidney, \textit{Apology for Poetry}, 96.
\textsuperscript{44} Sidney, \textit{Apology for Poetry}, 99.
context of eighteenth century literature, the term 'sensibility' is one that is also charged with an element of specificity. The eighteenth century saw the advent of the 'Cult of Sensibility', a phenomenon that praised the efforts of creative individuals who strove to evoke emotionally affecting works. Women writers, in particular, favoured writing in the sensible mode. The aims of writing in the sensible mode exemplified a form of positive moral guidance, allowing writers to extol the benefits of values such as virtue, sympathy and pity through their works.

A 'Gothic' sensibility, however, can be defined as having the opposite aim to the ideas of morality and ethics presented by writers in the sensible mode. Intellectually, a Gothic sensibility subverts identity categories, dominant knowledge systems and hegemonic power structures. With these intellectual ideas as a background, as a form of sensibility, the Gothic strives to evoke reactions from readers in the opposite manner to those writing in the sensible tradition. A Gothic sensibility draws its effects from notions of boundary blurring—embracing the irrational rather than the rational, extraordinary rather than ordinary, monstrous rather than human, and the subversion of order. In addition to generating effects of pity and sympathy, the Gothic is primarily concerned with generating 'negative' emotional effects such as fear, horror, terror, disgust and uncertainty. Across the course of this thesis, I use the term 'sensibility' in the singular to denote a single, engendered effect (e.g. John Donne's early modern Gothic sensibility).

From an intellectual perspective, Gothic sensibilities (differing sensibilities engendered by differing authors) exemplify the destabilisation of categories, subversion, transgression and a divergence from the idea of the 'normal'. The bizarre,

---


49 Bronfen and Neumeier, 'Introduction', in Gothic Renaissance, 2.

50 Bronfen and Neumeier, 'Introduction', in Gothic Renaissance, 2.
wild, supernatural, and nostalgia for the past, form part of this impulse.\textsuperscript{51} It speaks to the incursion of the irrational onto the rational, the extraordinary into the ordinary, and the monstrous into the human.\textsuperscript{52} With this in mind, the chapters in this study are each aimed at addressing a specific Gothic sensibility—the grotesque, supernaturalism, melancholy and states of darkness. Through the articulation of these ideas, authors' Gothic sensibilities affect readers both intellectually and viscerally, performing the destabilisation of categories by prompting emotional responses.\textsuperscript{53}

\textbf{Literary Nostalgia from the Renaissance to the Gothic}

Another preoccupation of this study is a cross-temporal approach, one that involves reading texts that were published chronologically through the lens of a textual corpus that was published centuries later. In other words, how might one begin to construct an interpretive framework that appraises texts of the past through the critical apparatus of the future? This is the central concern of early modern Gothic studies, a field that analyses texts in a reverse-chronological order. The critical approach that is most pertinent to the inter-textual analysis undertaken in this thesis is undoubtedly New Historicism. The starting point for the criticism undertaken in this thesis—the choice of texts analysed—is one that is cognisant of the benefits yielded by a New Historicist approach. Greenblatt and Gallagher write that one of the benefits of New Historicism is a broadening of existing fields of study by considering both ‘canonical’ texts and lesser known works in a given historical


\textsuperscript{52} Bronfen and Neumeier, 'Introduction', in \textit{Gothic Renaissance}, 2.

\textsuperscript{53} Bronfen and Neumeier, 'Introduction', in \textit{Gothic Renaissance}, 12.
period.\textsuperscript{54} This facet of New Historicism is important when framed against existing scholarship on Renaissance Gothic and early modern Gothic studies, as these fields have a strong focus on the works of Shakespeare. As Greenblatt and Gallagher write:

It is to imagine that the writers we love did not spring up from nowhere and that their achievements must draw upon a whole life-world and that this life-world has undoubtedly left other traces of itself.\textsuperscript{55}

Given the considerable focus of early modern Gothic studies on the works of Shakespeare, this study diverges from this existing critical trajectory in two ways. Firstly, it considers the intellectual factors that underpin literary creation and production in the early modern period. Secondly, this study adopts a shift away from the rich area of Shakespearean Gothic studies by taking into consideration the work of other early modern authors to the field of Renaissance Gothic criticism.

Along with welcoming 'non-canonical' texts to be studied, the benefits of a New Historical approach to eighteenth-century Gothic and early modern literature is a dialogue that generates new meaning through a study of texts from both periods. It allows for the interrogation of the creative impulses that shape literary works both inside the boundaries where these texts are located as well as outside of these boundaries.\textsuperscript{56} To quote Jerrold E. Hogle, New Historicism notes the ways in which the past and present effect one another through a consciousness of both periods.\textsuperscript{57} Through a nexus of textual analysis and historicisation, this study attempts to create a two-way dialogue between the differing literary modes analysed.


\textsuperscript{56} Gallagher and Greenblatt, 'Introduction,' in \textit{Practicing New Historicism}, 12.

\textsuperscript{57} Jerrold E. Hogle, 'Theorizing the Gothic,' in \textit{Teaching the Gothic}, edited by Anna Powell and Andrew Smith (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2006), 40.
Mieke Bal’s concept of ‘preposterous history’, outlined by Bronfen and Neumeier in *Renaissance Gothic*, is a compelling take on the methods used by New Historicists that provides a means of viewing works of poetry from the Renaissance through the critical lens afforded by the Gothic.\(^{58}\) Preposterous history provides a starting point for addressing issues relating to presentism in this study. To illustrate, what are the implications that surround the retroactive application of the term ‘Gothic writer’, ideologically charged as it is, to an early modern writer such as Shakespeare? Bal writes that ‘preposterous history’ puts what comes chronologically first, (‘pre’), as an after-effect behind a concept’s latter (‘post’) recycling.\(^{59}\) As Bronfen and Neumeier propose:

> To look preposterously at the literature of the past through later reconfigurations that have coloured our conception of it means drawing attention to what remains hidden when one limits oneself to more conventional intertextual influences.\(^{60}\)

A ‘preposterous’ reading of the Gothic, Bronfen and Neumeier suggest, illumines the parallels between the broader intellectual movements in eighteenth century and early modern England. Both periods are ‘constitutively troubled’ by ‘cultural energies’ of the past. Viewing early modern poetry through a preposterous history of the Gothic, I suggest, sheds light on the early modern cultural movements that informed the construction of poetic texts in the period. What I offer in this study then is contextualising the relevance of an early modern cultural imaginary to the creations of textual material aimed at evoking reactions from readers. Beginning with the ‘Gothic’ themes of melancholy, the grotesque, supernaturalism and

---


\(^{60}\) Bronfen and Neumeier, ‘Introduction,’ in *Gothic Renaissance*, 4.
ambiguity as a springboard, this thesis proceeds with an investigation of them in an early modern context, with attention paid to literary texts as well as cultural factors.

The literary nostalgia that readers are privy to in Gothic novels has been described as a form of fakery, or 'counterfeiting'. Hogle's proposition of literary counterfeiting as a feature of the Gothic mode is relevant to this study, as it acknowledges that counterfeiting is not a uniquely eighteenth-century phenomenon but is one that has persisted in previous time periods. Hogle points out that while the beginnings of the Gothic mode are associated with the eighteenth-century 'medieval revival', adapting ideas of the past have long been a part of literary culture:

The Gothic is founded on a quasi-antiquarian use of symbols that are quite obviously signs of older signs; by the time of the Gothic revival in the eighteenth century, there had already been 'Gothic' revivals, even in the Middle Ages. The earlier signs had themselves been broken off from many of their past connections and now existed more as mere signifiers than as substantial points of reference or human bodies.61

For Hogle, Horace Walpole's literary medievalism and its fragmented form mark a system of adaptation and interpretation that is far older than the Gothic mode itself. A constant process of literary reinterpretation and reinvention is not unique to Gothic literature. Walpole, Radcliffe and Lewis are but three examples of authors who have looked to the past for inspiration. The process of fusing the 'ancient' and 'modern' is not a uniquely eighteenth-century phenomenon but, as Hogle observes, is one that has persisted across various periods in English literary history.

Early modern critics and poets alike utilised the term 'counterfeiting' to describe their approaches to creative works, a term that echoes Hogle's notion of Gothic counterfeiting. While Italian humanism regarded the Middle Ages as a period of 'Gothic' barbarity, humanist thought favoured the work of classical authors.

---

Poets regarded the reinterpretation and adaptation of these literary traditions as an interpretation of the classical concept of *mimesis*. An intellectual idea originating from the work of Aristotle, *mimesis* is, as Aristotle explicates in the *Poetics*, at the heart of the poetic arts. This, Aristotle proposes, is because human beings have a natural instinct to imitate, and that people derive enjoyment from objects that are imitated.\(^62\)

Mimesis formed an important part of the Renaissance poet's view on the creative arts. Sir Philip Sidney, in *An Apology for Poetry*, describes the concept of Aristotelian mimesis as applicable to the art of writing verses:

> Poesy, therefore, is an art of imitation; for so Aristotle termeth it in the word *mimesis*, that is to say, a representing, *counterfeiting*, or figuring forth: to speak metaphorically, a speaking picture, with this end, to teach and delight.\(^63\)

In addition to being a literary critic, Sidney was a poet himself. His use of the term 'counterfeiting' in this treatise illuminates an early modern view of appropriating from various 'ancient' sources. This view is also shared by George Puttenham, who also uses the term 'counterfeit' in his *Art of English Poetry*:

> And nevertheless without any repugnancy at all, a Poet may in some sort be said a follower or imitator, because he can express the true and lively of everything is set before him, and which he takes in hand to describe: and so in that respect is both a maker and a *counterfeiter*: and Poesy an art not only of making, but also of imitation.\(^64\)

For Puttenham and Sidney, imitation is merely one facet of poetic creativity. Both critics extol a fine balance between adaptation and originality. Their awareness of


\(^{63}\) Sidney, *Apology for Poetry*, 86.

\(^{64}\) Puttenham, *Art of English Poesy*, 93–94.
the process of counterfeiting aptly describes an assessment of literary hybridity that parallels the counterfeiting that would become a salient aspect of the Gothic mode’s first iteration in the latter half of the eighteenth century. Early modern Petrarchan counterdiscourses illustrate a constant process of cross-temporal literary counterfeiting that would resurge in eighteenth-century England. Looking to the past for inspiration might have been a modus operandi of Gothic novelists, but as these treatises show, early modern writers and critics were fully cognisant of how poetic inspiration could be drawn from older modes of literature.

The concept of literary nostalgia was one of the ideas presented by Horace Walpole in the second preface of The Castle of Otranto, described in his words as the reconciliation of ‘the ancient and the modern’. In her essay on medieval presentism, Nancy Partner writes that the pervasive self-consciousness of all work in the humanities prompts scholars to be cognisant of how the present has the capacity to shape scholarly approaches to the past. Partner’s remarks inform the scope of Cultural Studies of the Modern Middle Ages, a volume that interrogates varying approaches to the study of the Middle Ages through the lens of contemporary culture. The volume raises awareness of localised ideas pertaining to both the present and the medieval past and how meaning can be evinced from the interlocution of these ideas. The reflexive viewing of the past through the lens of the present forms the central concern of the scholarship undertaken in this thesis. The genres of early modern love poetry and the Gothic, I propose, are shaped by a confluence of the past and the present in cross-temporal bricolages. The oft cited rubric of the Gothic as a nostalgic literary mode that fuses ‘the ancient with the


modern’, is one that can also be used to describe the genre of Renaissance love poetry.

A useful starting point for outlining the parallels between the nostalgic impulses of early modern poets and eighteenth-century Gothic novelists is reflecting on texts that introduced the literary culture of the past to authors in both periods. They are *Tottel’s Miscellany* (1557), a sixteenth-century anthology of poetry, and two anthologies published several hundred years later. These were Richard Hurd’s *Letters on Chivalry and Romance* (1762) and Thomas Warton’s *History of English Poetry* (1774). Hurd’s *Letters* and Warton’s *History* were especially important to Gothic novelists of the eighteenth century, as they revived an interest in the poetic forms of the medieval and early modern past.

Hurd’s *Letters* and Warton’s *History* ignited a fascination with poetry and fictions of the past in the eighteenth century that shaped the burgeoning Gothic mode. For Hurd, ‘Gothic’ or medieval art was no less important than the legacy of the classical tradition. An important text for Hurd was Spenser’s *Fairie Queene*, which he regarded to be an exemplary medievalist text. Hurd observes that interest in the ideas of the Middle Ages persists throughout various historical periods. In this essay, Hurd draws attention to the appropriation of the medieval by early modern poets such as Spenser and Milton:

> The greatest geniuses of our own and foreign countries, such as Ariosto and Tasso in Italy, and Spenser and Milton in England, were seduced by the barbarities of their forefathers; were even charmed by the Gothic Romances.

Hurd’s veneration of the medieval drew on examples from prominent early modern poets such as Shakespeare and Spenser. Their medievalist inclinations, he proposes,

---


contributed to the success of these poets’ works. Hurd praised these poets’ literary medievalism and argued for their positive qualities. Hurd’s outlining of medieval influences on early modern poets highlights that prior to the eighteenth century, the Middle Ages had long been used by poets as a source of inspiration. In his appraisal of Spenser, he remarks that medieval themes, or ‘Gothic manners’, were preferred by the early moderns. Hurd’s praise of Spenser’s literary medievalism suggests a cognisance of not just the literary culture of the Middle Ages, but the cross-temporal interrelations between various textual traditions.

Following this, in the 1770s, Warton’s History resuscitated similar ideas about literature of the past. For Warton, the benefits of resuscitating the past lay in charting the progress of English verse as a means of differentiating the ‘barbaric’ past from the ‘modern’ present. Warton lamented the loss of the imagination and wonder that had been present in the poetry of the past, in the wake of the more realistic form of prose. Regardless of their views, Hurd and Warton’s texts ultimately brought to an eighteenth-century audience a veneration of pre-eighteenth century literary culture.

Hurd’s Letters, in particular, formed part of an eighteenth-century ‘medieval revival’ that contributed to the authoring of The Castle of Otranto in 1764. Walpole’s account of the dream which inspired him to author Otranto indicates that the medieval was, quite literally, on his mind when he set out to write his novel. This would translate into both the text’s physical as well as temporal setting—the narrative is supposedly set in the Middle Ages, during the period between 1095 and 1243, as Walpole’s fictional translator ‘William Marshal’ purports. But Walpole’s interest in the past was inclusive of other pre-eighteenth century cultural forms, including the literature of both the English and Italian Renaissance. The work of

70 Hurd, Letters, 76.

Shakespeare is explicitly referred to in his second preface. Numerous collections of critical articles in the field of early modern Gothic studies, such as *Gothic Shakespeares, Shakespearean Gothic* and *Gothic Renaissance*, all contain works that highlight the details of the Bard’s influence on Walpole. From Shakespearean plays to ideas of the Middle Ages introduced by Hurd’s *Letters*, Walpole’s novel exemplified a form of literary nostalgia that combined numerous literary sources and tropes from the past in the 'modern' literary form of the novel.

While the literary culture of the past was venerated in Hurd’s *Letters* and Warton’s *History*, an interesting parallel with these two texts emerged in the mid-sixteenth century. Just as Hurd’s *Letters* and Warton’s *History* introduced medieval and early modern texts to a broader eighteenth-century audience, similarly, the poetic collection *Tottel’s Miscellany* introduced to English audiences the work of late medieval poets. Published in 1557, Tottel’s Miscellany featured the first English translators of Petrarch’s work, Thomas Wyatt and the Earl of Surrey. The effect of *Tottel’s Miscellany* on English literary culture was commented on by Elizabethan literary critic George Puttenham in 1589, who commented on the poets who having travelled into Italy, and there tasted the sweet and stately measures and style of the Italian Poesy as novices newly crept out of the school of Dante, Ariosto and Petrarch, they greatly polished our rude and homely manner of vulgar poesy, from that it had been before, and for that cause may justly be said that the first reformers of our English meter and style.\(^{72}\)

The English, Puttenham asserts, learnt much from the verses of late medieval Italian poets. The influence of *Tottel’s Miscellany* on poetry of the early modern period mirrors the effects Hurd’s *Letters* and Warton’s *History* had several centuries later. In the case of *Tottel’s Miscellany*, it was the introduction of a late medieval literary form to an early modern audience that would become one of the most well known in the

Renaissance. More importantly, *Tottel’s Miscellany* created an awareness amongst early modern poets of the value of literary cultures of the distant past.

*Tottel’s Miscellany* introduced the work of Petrarch to a broader English audience. Subsequently, poets of the late sixteenth century began engaging with the ideas presented in the Italian poet’s work. The influence of Petrarch’s ideas as a form of literary nostalgia in the Renaissance was immense, as poets experimented with various aspects of his work. The term Petrarchan, or 'Petrarchist', as used by some critics, denotes a process of literary adaptation where Petrarch's discernible influence led to poetic creations that drew from elements of the tropes and themes present in Petrarch's seminal *Il Canzoniere* (1374). The concept of Petrarchism is defined by Ernest Wilkins in 'A General Survey of Renaissance Petrarchism'. In this essay, Wilkins defines Petrarchism as:

Productive activity in literature, art, or music under the direct or indirect influence of the writings of Petrarch, the expression of admiration for him, and the study of his works and of their influence.\(^{73}\)

This definition, however, warrants further elaboration. Leonard Foster’s seminal text *The Icy Fire* offers a concise definition of the literary form and content of a Petrarchan poem. For Foster, the 'essence' of Petrarchan poetics involves the exploitation of antitheses and oxymora in poetry. Phrases such as 'freezing while burning' or 'seeing while blind' are examples of typical Petrarchan verse forms. Foster regards this poetic conceit as an 'idiom of great flexibility' that lent itself to multifarious explorations by poets all across Europe.\(^{74}\) Petrarchan conceits outlined by Foster that relate to thematic content fall under three primary categories:

---


1 – External: Praising a lady, meeting a beloved
2 – Internal: addressing the nature of love or death
3 – Love as a cosmic phenomenon: where a lady is likened to the sun.

Petrarchan poems utilise any variation of these three conceits, often reversing or challenging these ideas in varied ways. Adapting these ideas to suit their purposes, poets treated Petrarchan verses as a poetic staple in early modern England. Christine Hutchins writes that the core of Petrarchan poetics was a demonstration of writers’ abilities to assimilate ‘ancient and modern’ literary forms into a uniquely local and vernacular early modern form of poetics. Like Gothic novelists borrowing the themes and forms of medieval and early modern literature, Renaissance poets’ preoccupation with Petrarch’s work marks a similar enthusiasm for literary cultures of the past.

The proliferation of Petrarchan poetics in early modern literature symbolises a form of literary nostalgia not unlike the impulses of eighteenth-century Gothic novelists. By taking inspiration from Petrarch’s work, early modern Petrarchan poets shaped their texts in ways that represented ‘localised’ early modern concerns. As Anthony Mortimer notes:


The anti-Petrarchan poems and parodies are, of course, so many tributes to the continuing influence of the Canzoniere, and, in any case, the iconoclastic vein is seldom dominant. 78

In her study of early modern English Petrarchan poets, Heather Dubrow proposes the term 'counterdiscourse' as one that is more fitting with Petrarchan poetics' numerous iterations and differences. She outlines the difficulties of ascribing a singular strand of anti-Petrarchism to various early modern poets' adaptations of the sonnet form. Each poet, she proposes, creates different and alternative Petrarchan responses by their varied approaches. 79 The nuances of this dynamic approach to Petrarchism in the period demonstrate an unprecedented interest in a poetic tradition that originates from the late medieval period, made popular through the publication Tottel’s Miscellany.

Early modern Petrarchan poetics illustrate a constant process of cross-temporal literary nostalgia that would resurge in eighteenth-century England. Negotiated through parodies, reversals and counterdiscourses, early modern imitators of Petrarch showcase a host of early modern iterations of a poetic mode that was, in the late sixteenth century, already several hundred years old. This is suggestive of a broader form of literary nostalgia adopted by early modern authors. Michael Jones’s work on early modern medievalism, for example, views literary nostalgia in the Renaissance as a generative process that reinvents the past in strikingly productive ways. 80 Looking to the past for inspiration might have been a modus operandi of Gothic novelists, but early modern writers and critics were just as

fully cognisant of how poetic inspiration could be drawn from older forms of literature.

In fact, evidence suggests that Horace Walpole was cognisant of Petrarchan forms. In a letter to John Pinkerton in 1785, Walpole demonstrates an awareness of Petrarchan conventions.\textsuperscript{81} Anecdotal evidence also suggests that Walpole read \textit{Tottel’s Miscellany}. In a letter to Sir Horace Mann in 1744, Walpole mentions reading the poems of the Earl of Surrey, a poet who was published in \textit{Tottel’s Miscellany}.\textsuperscript{82} Apart from these correspondences, the second edition of Walpole’s novel was prefaced by the fourteen line Petrarchan influenced ‘Sonnet to the Lady Mary Coke’, which betrays a somewhat superficial attempt at constructing a Petrarchan poem. Typical Petrarchan tropes of woe, melancholy and emotional affect are referenced in this poem by Walpole, but not explicated in any detail or with any complexity. Walpole’s efforts can be described as a form of literary nostalgia, one that draws from various sources from the Middle Ages and the Renaissance. More importantly, the attachment of this poem to his novel points to an interest in the ‘ancient’ literary form of poetry.

\textbf{Poetic Antecedents of the Gothic Mode}

Several brief points need to be raised regarding the scope of this study. Firstly, my use of the term ‘Gothic mode’ in this study is one that pertains to the mode’s eighteenth-century ‘first wave’. The dynamism of Gothic studies can prove to be one


of its biggest disciplinary challenges and given that this study encompasses two varying historical periods, it is necessary to demarcate the parameters of this study’s interpretation of the term ‘Gothic’. For example, recent trends in Gothic studies have included textual material from a host of ‘non-canonical’ source material. *The Gothic and the Everyday* (2014) presents a reading of the Gothic as unrestricted to its foundational element of narrativity by evaluating the aesthetics of ‘Gothic’ as a lived experience. In the hopes of preventing an ‘inflationary’ use of Gothic critique, I have opted to focus my attention on three foundational eighteenth-century Gothic novels as a basis for extrapolating the dimensions of what constitutes ‘Gothic sensibilities’ in the early modern period. They are Horace Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto* (1764), Ann Radcliffe’s *The Mysteries of Udolpho* (1794) and Matthew Lewis’s *The Monk* (1796). The Gothic mode, as interpreted by this study, relates to a mode of textual representation that finds common ground in these three texts.

Secondly, this study regards the Gothic as a distinctly English literary phenomenon, one that is exemplified by the novels of Walpole, Radcliffe and Lewis. As it follows, the poetic texts from the early modern period surveyed in this thesis are from English poets as well. As such, this approach situates the scope of Gothic criticism undertaken across both periods within an English cultural milieu. This assertion is made with the awareness that Gothic studies today have moved in an increasingly global direction. Glennis Byron’s work on Global Gothic (2013), Andrew Ng’s study on Asian Gothic (2008), essays on Australian, New Zealand and Canadian Gothic traditions in David Punter’s *A New Companion to The Gothic* (2012) and Timothy Baker’s recent study *Contemporary Scottish Gothic* (2014) demonstrate marked shifts towards moving critical discourse beyond the bedrock of the mode’s

---

well established English paradigms.\textsuperscript{84} It is hoped that the work undertaken here will generate a fruitful site of debate that will perhaps prompt further scholarly inquiry into intersections between other early modern textual traditions such as religious poetry, pamphlet writing and the Gothic.

Lastly, it is also important to signal my cognisance of the scholarship surrounding Gothic verse, a genre that is tangential to my inquiry across the course of this thesis. I take the term 'Gothic verse' to denote poetic works published after Horace Walpole's \textit{The Castle Of Otranto} in 1764, such as Charlotte Smith's \textit{Elegiac Sonnets} (1784) and S. T. Coleridge's 'The Rime of the Ancient Mariner' (1798). This demarcation serves as a means of avoiding a conflation of textual modes for my primary comparisons by focusing my critical attention on comparing Gothic novels with early modern poetry. I do, however, analyse a number of Gothic verse fragments—poems in Gothic novels—as part of this study. This is because these Gothic verse fragments are crucial elements of these novels, and form parts of the texts' narratives. Equally importantly, as opposed to the themes in eighteenth-century Gothic novels, the poetic fragments in these texts themselves have not been studied in great detail. One of the goals of this thesis is to focus on these fragments as not only important facets of the Gothic mode's first wave, but as markers of Gothic novelists' recognition of poetry as a literary form that had the capacity to evoke emotions in their readers.

My demarcation of 'Gothic verse' as texts written post-Otranto marks a departure from critics' view of the genre as a broader textual category that includes poetic works from the early 1700s. Caroline Franklin's excellent anthology of Gothic verse, for example, considers texts from Graveyard Poetry and Gothic verse

fragments as examples of Gothic verse. A similar, but cautious view is adopted by David Punter in his essay on Gothic poetry, where he regards the designation of Gothic verse as a genre that includes poetic works from 1700 onwards as 'dubious'. My choice of excluding poetry from the 1700s from the analyses undertaken in this thesis shares the same reasoning as my choice to focus solely on Gothic novels. While I acknowledge the role played by eighteenth-century poetry in the development of the Gothic mode, as a means of maintaining consistency in the scope of my study, I am interested in the textual genre of the Gothic novel as a primary locus of my critical attention.

The central findings of this thesis can be summarised in three points. Firstly, this thesis argues that similar techniques of emotional affect, or 'emotional transaction', can be located in Gothic novels and early modern love poetry. Secondly, despite the persistence of similar themes across both Gothic and early modern texts, the emotional registers that operate in both textual modes have varying valences. Lastly, this thesis suggests that the condition of melancholy is a profound catalyst for displays of emotion in literature across both the eighteenth century and the early modern period. It reads the Petrarchan lover as an early modern 'character archetype' that demonstrates emotional characteristics that resurface in the figure of the Gothic villain.

As a collective, it is hoped that the chapters in this study will contribute towards an appreciation of Gothic elements in early modern poetry. Through the course of the next few chapters in this thesis, I will focus on aspects of the Renaissance poetic tradition that reveal poets’ underlying interest in the disturbing, the terrifying and the uncertain. It is hoped that this focus will offer a view of early


modern poets as writers who exploited the dynamics of affect in a similar manner to Gothic novelists. What is spotlighted in my critique of Renaissance poetry across these chapters is a vibrant mode of poetic expression that recycles and reinterprets courtly love conventions in unexpected ways.

Most importantly, this study reclaims the importance of one of the most overlooked aspects of the Gothic mode—the role of lyric poetry and poetic form in the mode’s eighteenth-century first wave. It spotlights a literary form that was favoured by Walpole, Radcliffe and Lewis for its affective potential, a textual mode that inspired these writers to create hybrid texts of their own that fused the novel with poetical fragments.

Beyond the appreciation of these Gothic elements, this thesis also incorporates a recognition of the cultural factors that contribute to the representation of these themes in Renaissance poetry. Early modern ideas of melancholy, anatomical sciences, supernaturalism and views of darkness were facets of the Renaissance cultural imaginary that underpinned the creation of texts, aspects that resurfaced again in eighteenth-century Gothic texts. Literary nostalgia, an eighteenth-century modus operandi of the Gothic, also had a parallel in the Renaissance. Early modern England saw the ready adoption of older Petrarchan poetic tropes in the 'modern' form of English verse.

The poems surveyed in this thesis are selected from a number of early modern English poets published in the late sixteenth to the early seventeenth century. Chronologically, the earliest text that is analysed in this study is George Gascoigne’s 'Anatomy of a Lover' (1573). Other texts include the work of Elizabethan sonneteers Samuel Daniel, Michael Drayton, Edmund Spenser, Barnabe Barnes and William Shakespeare. The poems of John Donne from the early 1600s form the tail end of this study's early modern focus.
In his seminal text ‘We Have Never Been Modern’, Bruno Latour writes that there has never been a modern world and that modernity has never begun.\textsuperscript{87} Latour’s argument is especially salient when framed against the recurring debates—ancient versus modern, passion versus reason—that surfaced in the intellectual thought of late sixteenth-century and eighteenth-century England. The intellectual dimensions of the Gothic suggest that modernity is a fluid, subjective concept, as the spectre of the past has always haunted the ‘modern’. In shifting the lens of the Gothic onto the early modern, what is brought to light is that such an act of cultural nostalgia and fondness for the past has always been a part of literary culture across the ages. Prevailing in the Renaissance, these cultural energies become subsumed by the Enlightenment, only to emerge again in the late eighteenth century. The Gothic speaks to individuals of a need to be frightened and a need for embracing the superstitious, the uncertain and the ambiguous in life. By looking at the Renaissance, this study acknowledges that ‘we have never been modern’ and that the ghosts (metaphorical or otherwise) that became such an arresting part of Gothic literary form after the Enlightenment have always been a seminal part of English culture. The chapters that follow will expand on the key ideas discussed in this introduction by analysing Gothic sensibilities that pertain to four key themes.

\textbf{Chapter Overview}

The first chapter in this study analyses the subject of melancholy, a common theme that unites the modes of Gothic novel and Renaissance poetry. Melancholy is a condition from which characters in Gothic fiction, as well as speaking characters in

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{87} Bruno Latour, \textit{We Have Never Been Modern}, translated by Catherine Porter (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993), 47.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
early modern poetry, suffer. As such, the character archetype of the melancholy Petrarchan lover that emerges in early modern English literature offers a compelling line of connection between the Renaissance and the Gothic. In Chapter 1, I compare the characterisation of melancholy Gothic ‘villains’ with speaking characters in early modern poetry who suffer from love melancholy. In both the Renaissance and the Gothic, melancholy is regarded as an emotional condition that is synonymous with ambiguity, aligned with both positive and negative responses. The elevated registers of emotion demonstrated by Petrarchan lovers, I suggest, have similarities with the heightened emotions displayed by melancholy Gothic villains such as Ambrosio from *The Monk* and Morano from *The Mysteries of Udolpho*. One of the characteristics of the melancholy Petrarchan lover is that his desire is often unrequited. As a means of subverting this Petrarchan trope, early modern poets used the rhetoric of supernaturalism in their verses.

Speakers who imagine themselves as ghosts and who use witchcraft were a common theme used by early modern poets. Chapter 2 interrogates how Renaissance poets and Gothic novelists alike utilised the mechanics of emotional transaction through representations of the supernatural. Early modern poets demonstrated a keen awareness of the dynamics of the supernatural’s association with states of fear that parallels the Gothic mode’s ‘principal engine’. Of the multifarious representations of the supernatural in Renaissance poetry, what is significant is the rhetoric of fear used by early modern poets in the characterisation of their first-person speaking characters. These poetic characters, I suggest can be read as early modern Gothic ‘villains’.

Of the myriad cultural paradigms that materialised in the Renaissance, the concept of the grotesque originated in the period and subsequently evolved to be a descriptor for the incongruous and the disturbing, and is as such a crucial element of a Gothic sensibility. Chapter 3, an appraisal of the grotesque in early modern poetry, directs its attention to the distortion and fragmentation of the human body in
Renaissance verse. The early modern period witnessed the advent of scientific study of the body, predicing a fascination with corporeality that echoes in later Gothic texts. Clashes between metaphors and realistic poetic renditions of the body take place in the poetic creations of the period, raising alarming and disturbing emotional transactions between texts and their readers. Poems that regard the 'flesh as canvas' not only precede the Gothic mode, but speak of a constant cultural fascination with corporeality that exists even in contemporary culture.  

The study's penultimate chapter continues the discussion of ambiguity initiated in Chapter 1. Chapter 4 addresses the subject of darkness and its associations with ambiguity. Ideas of darkness as space charged with ambiguity recur in both early modern poetry as well as the Gothic mode. Despite the state of darkness's connotations with negativity, I contend that ambiguity and obscurity lead to a profound treatment of darkness that challenges its associations with binaries of negativity. Renaissance poets' interpretation of dark spaces precede the Gothic mode's preoccupation with states of darkness.

Through the course of its first four chapters, this study has a specific trajectory. Each of the chapters has illuminated a separate theme in Renaissance poetry that is connected with the Gothic. Each chapter has also focused on the male Petrarchan lover as a focal point of analysis. The final chapter in this study addresses the limitations of this methodology through a reading of a long poem that firstly, contains multiple themes of interest, and secondly, is narrated by a female rather than a male voice. This chapter analyses Samuel Daniel's complaint poem The Complaint of Rosamond as a compelling early modern Gothic text.

While Horace Walpole might have been the first in literary history to use the term 'Gothick' as an explicit descriptor for his text, he was creating a bricolage made of components that were already used long before his time. This study reassesses the

---

concept of 'Gothic sensibility' by engaging with texts that have yet to be analysed through the paradigms of Gothic and early modern studies. Shakespeare might have influenced a generation of eighteenth-century authors who would come to be known as 'Gothic novelists', but the conventions that the Bard utilised in his plays and poetry also exist in the works of other early modern writers. By dissecting a thematic element across the span of four chapters, this study positions itself alongside a critical tradition that sees the eighteenth-century Gothic as a 'return' of cultural ideas and impulses that were informing poets long before the publishing of Walpole's *Castle of Otranto*. 
Chapter 1: 'The grief of mine afflicted ghost': Melancholy from the Renaissance to the Gothic

Across both eighteenth-century and early modern England, the condition of melancholy was one that attracted considerable attention in the creation of literary texts. In Thomas Love Peacock’s Gothic parody *Nightmare Abbey* (1818), Peacock satirises the typically melancholic disposition of characters in Gothic fiction. As Peacock’s character Mr Hilary exclaims:

> Persons of feeble, nervous, melancholy temperament, exhausted by fever, by labour, or by spare diet, will readily conjure up in their magic ring of their own phantasy, spectres, gorgons, chimaeras, and all the objects of their hatred and their love.\(^9\)

The passage is a satire of the archetype of the melancholy Gothic protagonist in late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century English literary culture. Peacock’s listing of the various behavioural patterns exhibited by ‘persons of melancholy temperament’ point to a wearied familiarity with a clichéd Gothic trope. Prior to the advent of the Gothic novel, in the sixteenth century, the writings of Sir Philip Sidney would demonstrate a similar weariness with the literary trope of the melancholy Petrarchan lover. In Sonnet 15 of *Astrophil and Stella*, Sidney wrote of Petrarch’s ‘long deceased’ woes, a snipe at the ubiquity of Petrarchan poetics in early modern England.\(^{90}\) In his poem ‘To the Tune of *The Smokes of Melancholy*’, Sidney also commented on the

---


predictable nature of love melancholy’s symptoms, stating the knowledge of his suffering was enough for another to ‘paint [his] face’.91

Given that the subject was pervasive enough that writers in both periods regarded it as something of a cliché, this chapter analyses the similarities and differences between the literary representations of melancholy across texts in the genres of Petrarchan love poetry and eighteenth-century Gothic. Two areas of scholarship—the study of melancholy in conjunction with the Gothic mode, as well as its importance in Petrarchan love poetry, are well developed areas of study. The central goal of this chapter is the examination of these two areas of critical interest alongside one another, creating fresh insights into the variances between literary melancholy in the literary creations of both periods. As Lawrence Babb proposes:

Elizabethan melancholy began as a fashionable affectation, as an imitation of an Italian attitude. Unlike most fads, however, it did not flourish briefly and die. It established itself so firmly in English thought and literature during the Renaissance period that it persisted for generations.92

Babb’s observation is important because, as this chapter will show, centuries before the advent of the Gothic mode, representations of melancholy were already a mainstay of English literary culture. From Petrarchan love poetry to the Gothic novel, the subject of melancholy in these various textual traditions endured as an important facet of English cultural history. Through the course of this chapter, we come to a closer understanding of the complexities that made the condition of melancholy such a compelling point of interest for English authors from the early modern period to the eighteenth century.

The analysis undertaken in this chapter offers three interconnected observations. The first is that similar techniques for generating affect can be located

---

91 Sidney, Poems, 153.
in Petrarchan love poetry and Gothic texts. In this chapter, I analyse the representation of melancholy as a 'mixed passion' across the genres of early modern poetry and the Gothic. Characters in Gothic fiction and Petrarchan poetic speakers alike are frequently depicted as suffering from melancholy and love melancholy respectively, conditions that are associated with a host of diametrically opposing emotional effects. I suggest that across both textual modes, this juxtaposition of opposing emotional reactions that result from melancholy generates affective responses from readers. Representations of love melancholy in early modern poems, I suggest, contribute to what might be termed as an early modern Gothic sensibility.

What also emerges from a comparison of literary representations of melancholy in these differing genres are, however, differences in registers of emotion. When compared alongside 'contemplative' representations of melancholy in the Gothic, the use of exaggeration and repetition in literary representations of love melancholy in early modern poetry, I propose, serves to generate elevated registers of emotion.

The differences in registers of emotion between the representations of melancholy in Gothic and early modern literature have, in turn, implications for the study of melancholy in the Gothic mode. This point is especially important in a consideration of continuities between early modern and eighteenth-century representations of melancholy in literature. Existing studies of melancholy, for example, compare the introspective, 'hypochondriac' aspect of Gothic protagonists with the early modern figure of Shakespeare's Hamlet. My analysis of heightened emotional registers in early modern love poetry evaluates a connection that has yet to be explored in scholarly works—connections between Petrarchan speakers and Gothic villains.

---

93 Deborah Lutz, The Dangerous Lover: Gothic Villains, Byronism, and the Nineteenth Century Seduction Narrative (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2006), 30. Also see Hogle's Afterword in Gothic Shakespeares, 208.
Across both eighteenth-century and early modern literature, the dialectic of melancholy is one that has been identified as a technique for generating emotional affect. Brady and Haapala propose that the aesthetic function of melancholy arises from its nature as a condition that has alternating positive and negative contrasts, generating a refinement of the emotional state that creates affective responses. Critics have described the variances between positive and negative effects across the literature of melancholy as a form of ambivalence. Van Elferen writes that one aspect of the Gothic is the mode’s inhabitation of a 'radicalised liminality' characterised by the destabilising forces of pervasive ambivalence. The displays of emotion that shift between positivity and negativity in Gothic texts can be interpreted as an eighteenth-century expression of a rhetorical technique that was already used by authors in the early modern period. Frederic Jones uses the term 'affective ambivalence' to describe how contrasting emotions in Petrarch’s _Il Canzoniere_ generate responses from readers, a term that is useful in describing not only the textual form of Renaissance Petrarchan texts, but Gothic texts as well.

Indeed, Horace Walpole’s efforts in _The Castle of Otranto_ signal an awareness of the function of the dialectic of melancholy. In his first preface to _The Castle of Otranto_, Walpole writes that keeping a reader interested in a text through a 'vicissitude of interesting passions' was one of the objectives of his novel. For Walpole, his focus was on capitalising the contrasts between the emotional states of pity and terror to generate responses. Walpole was cognisant of the affective function of contrasting displays of emotions. In the second preface to _The Castle of Otranto_,

---


Otranto, he once again highlighted the importance of contrasts in generating emotional effects in readers. Walpole cited the example of contrasting humour with the 'dignified tone' of 'heroes and princes':

> In my humble opinion, the contrast between the sublime of the one and the naïveté of the other, sets the pathetic of the former in a stronger light. The very impatience which a reader feels [...] perhaps heightens, certainly proves that he has been artfully interested in the depending event.  

Walpole's comments here and his comments in the first preface suggest that he was aware of how contrasts could be exploited to generate reader responses. In addition to the various contrasts highlighted in both of Walpole's prefaces, I want to propose that the condition of melancholy also contributed to the dynamic of contrasting responses outlined by Walpole. The importance of melancholy to Walpole is evident in the second edition of Walpole's text, a version prefaced by the poem 'Sonnet to the Lady Mary Coke'. In this poem, Walpole describes his novel as a set of 'melancholy pages'. This indicates that Walpole was aware of the centrality of melancholy to the novel's overall schema. Walpole's Gothic novel then inspired others in the latter half of the century, turning the subject of melancholy, with its alternating, ambivalent dynamics of affect, into a staple of the Gothic tradition.

In early modern Gothic studies that evaluate links between melancholy characters in Gothic fiction alongside texts from the Renaissance, the connections between Shakespeare's Hamlet and the Gothic is one that has been explored at length. Maggie Kilgour has written of 'Renaissance melancholy' as forming one of the core elements of the Gothic and that Shakespeare's Hamlet is a prototypical character that informed the creation of melancholy Gothic protagonists. The characteristics demonstrated by Hamlet are a form of 'hypochondriac' melancholy, a category that is distinct from love melancholy. If Hamlet displays a characteristically

---


'Renaissance' form of melancholy, what is the significance of love melancholy in discussions of early modern links with the Gothic? Given the ubiquity of the Petrarchan poetic genre in early modern England, what sort of connections might be elucidated between this textual mode and the Gothic? By illustrating similarities between representations of love melancholy in early modern love poetry and Gothic texts, this chapter asserts the importance of love melancholy in the Gothic.

Kilgour's focus is similarly shared by other critics such as Robert Hamm Jr, Dale Townshend and Linda Charnes, who have argued for the importance of Shakespeare's melancholy Hamlet in the genesis of the Gothic.100 Hamlet–Gothic connections, through these studies, are a well-developed field of inquiry. In turn, these studies prompt other important considerations. Are there other early modern writers who, like Shakespeare, use the condition of melancholy as a technique for generating emotional affect? By shifting the focus of my inquiry in this chapter to poetic speakers rather than Shakespeare's Hamlet, I aim to explore the connections between 'Renaissance melancholy' and the Gothic in greater detail by evaluating the representation of melancholy in works of poetry rather than plays. The overarching focus on Hamlet as an exemplar for 'Renaissance melancholic' overlooks the prolific presence of the melancholy Petrarchan lover in early modern literature. Apart from Hamlet, the Petrarchan lover is perhaps the most prominent literary character 'archetype' in early modern textual culture. By initiating a discussion of the melancholy Petrarchan lover in relation to the Gothic, the goal of this chapter is to highlight how early modern writers, like Gothic novelists of the eighteenth century, exploited the condition of melancholy as a tool for emotional affect in their verses.

Beyond studies that focus on Shakespeare's Hamlet, some have also addressed connections between other melancholic characters in early modern

---

literature and characters in Gothic fiction. Deborah Lutz’s study on Gothic villains contains a brief historical account that addresses the characters of melancholy ‘villains’ from early modern English literature. These characters include Shakespeare’s Richard III and Hamlet, the latter of which is proposed to have a streak of ‘impotent melancholy’. ¹⁰¹ She establishes connections between these characters and Gothic villains such as Matthew Lewis’s Ambrosio, Schedoni from Radcliffe’s The Italian and Maturin’s Melmoth. For Lutz, melancholy is a distinct marker of villainy, exemplified by characters she regards as ‘dangerous lovers’. My effort in this chapter is a reading of a different early modern ‘character’ as a ‘dangerous lover’—the Petrarchan poetic speaker. I suggest that alongside Richard III and Hamlet, the melancholy Petrarchan lover can also be interpreted as an early modern parallel for the melancholy Gothic villain.

A rich field of existing study evaluates representations of literary melancholy in the Gothic with earlier poetic genres such as Miltonic verse and Graveyard Poetry, genres that are centred on a form of ‘hypochondriac’ melancholy. Alison Milbank reads the subject of melancholy in Ann Radcliffe’s work as borrowing heavily from Milton’s poetry.¹⁰² She proposes that the ‘emotional centre’ of female Gothic texts (Gothic texts written by women) is that of melancholy, and that its primary source is Milton’s ‘Il Penseroso’.¹⁰³ For example, ‘To Melancholy’, the poem composed by Emily in Radcliffe’s The Mysteries of Udolpho exemplifies this aspect of ‘Miltonian melancholy’.¹⁰⁴ My goal in this chapter is exploring the connections between the Gothic and love poetry, a genre that differs from the highly contemplative tone of Miltonian verse. Other scholars such as John Draper, David Punter and Gilbert

¹⁰¹ Lutz, The Dangerous Lover, 30.


¹⁰³ Alison Milbank, ‘Milton, Melancholy and the Sublime in the “Female” Gothic from Radcliffe to Le Fanu,’ in Women’s Writing 1, no. 2 (1994): 143.

Phelps have contributed toward a well-developed area of scholarship on the connections between melancholic Graveyard Poetry and the Gothic.  

Building on these studies' efforts at linking earlier poetic genres with critique of the Gothic, my goal in this chapter is the establishment of links that connect Gothic texts with an early modern poetic genre rather than the late seventeenth-century and eighteenth-century poetic genres. By orienting my focus towards the genre of Petrarchan verse, I also seek to advance critical scholarship by moving beyond the study of hypochondriac melancholy in poetry to forge original links between love melancholy and the Gothic. In the next section I establish these correlations through a historical analysis of the discourse of love melancholy.

**Hypochondriac and Love Melancholy**

To assist with an understanding of the differences and similarities between literary representations of hypochondriac melancholy in Gothic texts and love melancholy in early modern poetry, it is useful to first outline the pathological definitions of both conditions. The term 'melancholy' is one that originated in the Middle Ages as a descriptor for black bile, a substance thought to be one of the human body's four key humours. The term could also be used interchangeably as a descriptor for the condition of having an excess of black bile. In addition to these terms, melancholy could also be taken to denote a state of gloominess combined with sadness and

---


introspection. Klibansky, Panofsky and Saxl propose that melancholy’s shift from a descriptor of physiological affect to emotional affect took place in the late medieval period. The term ‘melancholy’, they suggest, was eagerly adopted by writers of the late medieval period to ‘lend colour’ to mental tendencies and conditions, transferring the pathological meaning of the term to a descriptor of ‘mood’. An imbalance of humours was thought to have repercussions for not just an individual’s body, but also his or her soul and mind.

Across the genre of Gothic novels and Renaissance love poetry, the distinctions between these two variants of melancholy—hypochondriac and love—offer a means of identifying how both textual modes treat the addressees/characters. Literary representations of melancholy in Gothic texts can be regarded as preoccupied with the symptomatology of hypochondriac melancholy, while love melancholy forms the central subject of Petrarchan poets’ creations. In his seminal text The Anatomy of Melancholy, Robert Burton wrote of melancholy as a complex condition that had symptoms as varying as the tower of Babel had languages. Burton outlined two distinct subsets of melancholy in his treatise—the first being a form of melancholy centred on physiological causes and the second being love melancholy, a variant of the condition that had a wide range of causes.

The term 'hypochondriac' is a term that is a composite of 'hypo' (below) and 'chondria' (cartilage of the ribs). Hypochondriac melancholy marks a move away from the idea of humoural imbalance as a cause of melancholy and a shift towards

---


an emphasis on the role of the organs. Hypochondriasis was regarded as a psychosomatic disease through the eighteenth century, where psychological factors were regarded as causes for this condition, in the form of ideas and imaginations. Nicholas Robinson, in his work on hypochondriac melancholy from 1729, adopted a negative view of the condition:

> Melancholy madness is a Complication of continuous and unremitting Horrors, that spares neither Body nor Mind. When this Affection is far advanced into the Habit, the Patient appears to all that see him a moving Piece of Ruin, and wears his Soul in his Countenance, which is mark'd with all the Characters of Woe, Gloom and Desperation.

Robinson's remarks on hypochondriac melancholy in this text warn of the physiological and emotional effects of melancholy. The phrases used by Robinson, 'piece of ruin' and 'unremitting horrors', serve to characterise the condition as one that comes with severe emotional and physical repercussions. Similarly, George Cheyne cited melancholy as one facet of a distinctly English pattern of mental illness. In his treatise *The English Malady* (1733), he cited himself as a case study of sorts, describing the effects of melancholy on his physical and emotional wellbeing:

> I was seized with such a perpetual Sickness, Reaching, Lowness, Watchfullness, Eructation and Melancholy, continuing six or eight Months:

---


that Life was no longer supportable to me, and my Misery was most extreme.\footnote{George Cheyne, ‘The English Malady,’ cited in Patterns of Madness in the Eighteenth Century: A Reader, edited by Allan Ingram (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1998), 90.}

Cheyne and Robinson’s writings on the subject of melancholy in this period present ideas of hypochondriac melancholy as a condition to be eschewed, one associated with negative passions and responses.

Eighteenth-century ideas of hypochondriac melancholy and its association with negative emotions were similar to early modern notions of hypochondriac melancholy. In Dr Timothy Bright’s \textit{A Treatise of Melancholie} (1586), Bright proposed that melancholy had a propensity to evoke fearful passions, and affect the human mind.\footnote{Timothy Bright, \textit{A Treatise of Melancholie} (London: Thomas Vautrollier, 1586), 38.} A melancholic disposition, Bright stated, created the danger of impeding the melancholic individual from salvation from God.\footnote{Bright, \textit{Melancholie}, 198.} For Bright, the concept of melancholy was that of a negative state, one that had to be shunned or cured. The idea of melancholy as a state aligned with ‘fearful passions’ is expanded upon in Robert Burton’s \textit{Anatomy of Melancholy}. In Burton's text fear and sorrow are regarded as the most prominent emotional markers that are both causes and symptoms of melancholy.\footnote{Burton, \textit{Anatomy of Melancholy}, 1:163.} These two emotions appear in various sections of Burton's treatise. Sorrow is denoted as an ‘unseparable companion’ of melancholy.\footnote{Burton, \textit{Anatomy of Melancholy}, 1:62.}

Love melancholy, a subset of melancholy, was regarded as a condition that shared emotional symptoms with hypochondriac melancholy. For Burton, ‘fear and sorrow’ were regarded as the chief symptoms of both hypochondriac melancholy and love melancholy.\footnote{Burton, \textit{Anatomy of Melancholy}, 3:149.} Similarly, in \textit{A Treatise on Lovesickness} (1610), Jacques Ferrand
wrote of fear and sorrow as two of the key emotional symptoms that accompanied love melancholy. In his text *Discourse of the Preservation of Sight* (1597), Andre du Laurens wrote of the 'signs and tokens' of what he described as amorous melancholy:

> Then is all spoiled, the man is quite undone and cast away, the senses are wandering to and fro, up and down, reason is confounded, the imagination corrupted, the talk sound and senseless; the silly loving worm cannot anymore look upon anything but his idol: all the functions of the body are likewise perverted; [...] You shall find him weeping, sobbing, sighing, redoubling his sighs, and in continual restlessness, avoiding company, loving solitariness.

Du Laurens wrote of love melancholy as one of the greatest miseries, likening the condition to a tortuous experience, one that should not be regarded as a 'divine or sacred' passion. Love melancholy affected man’s body as well as his mind, as evident by du Laurens’s citing of the various emotional and physiological symptoms of the condition. Across both the Renaissance and eighteenth-century England, texts addressing the conditions of hypochondriac and love melancholy shared the common view of melancholy as a condition that should be eschewed.

Given these consistent attitudes to melancholy, how might one account for a proliferation of literary treatments of melancholy in texts across both the Renaissance and the eighteenth century? Critics have regarded both periods alike as replete with literary treatments of the condition. For example, in his essay ‘The Poetry of Melancholy from Finch to Keats’, John Sitter observes that the term ‘melancholy’ appears more frequently in the poetry of the eighteenth century than in

---


other periods in English literary history. Jean Starobinski proposes that literary representations of melancholy in Renaissance literature could be read as evidence for a 'golden age' of melancholy. How could a condition that was regarded by physicians as a disease be so readily adopted by writers from the Renaissance to the eighteenth century?

The key to understanding writers’ interest in the subject stems from the idea of melancholy as a 'creative' disease. In a letter to Sir Philip Sidney dated from 1547, Hubert Languet suggests to the poet that Sidney should strive to dispel his melancholy:

I hope it will be easier [there] to find comrades in whose honest company you can take pleasure and sometimes dispel that sometimes excessive melancholy of yours.

Languet’s suggestion is consistent with a clinical view of melancholy as a condition that should be avoided if possible. But for Sidney, the condition offered a means of unlocking a latent form of inspiration and creativity. Melancholy, Sidney surmised, went hand in hand with intellectual stimulation—in Sidney's words, applying the 'feeble powers of his mind' to 'high and difficult' objects.

The notion of melancholy as a condition aligned with creativity can be traced to an Aristotelian view of the condition that has persisted through the ages. One of

---


the earliest texts that addressed the synergies between intelligence and melancholy was Aristotle's *Problems*:

Why is it that all those men who have become extraordinary in philosophy, politics, poetry or the arts are obviously melancholic, and some to an extent that they are seized by the illness that comes from black bile, as the story of Heracles among the heroes tells?127

This notion of intelligence and creativity that is associated with melancholy was subsequently developed by Renaissance philosopher Marsilio Ficino in *De vita* (1489) where Ficino contemplates Aristotle's argument and proposes that there are two different sources of melancholy in the human body: natural melancholy and 'adusted' melancholy. For Ficino, the latter component is what leads an individual to frenzy, mania and madness. 128 Wisdom and creativity, he states, are correlated with natural melancholy, a state that needs to be in balance with the body's other humours. Ficino concludes that the melancholic's astrological alignment with the sign of Saturn, the 'highest of planets', marks an association of the melancholy man with intelligence.

From the early modern period to the eighteenth century, the condition retained its importance as one that was essential to creative expression and inspiration. As Burton wrote in the *Anatomy*:

A most incomparable delight it is so to melancholise, and build castles in the air, to goe smiling to themselves, acting an infinite variety of parts, which they suppose and strongly imagine they represent, or that they see acted or done.129


What Burton outlines is a dialectic of hypochondriac melancholy that encompasses both a positive register as well as a negative one. While it is a source of fear and sorrow, melancholy also is a source of pleasure and ‘incomparable delight’, providing the sufferer with positive emotional responses through the exercise of their imaginative faculties. Following Burton’s view eighteenth-century literary treatments of melancholy regarded the condition as a paradox; one that, Clark Lawlor writes, was a form of fashionable melancholy. Melancholy, for eighteenth-century writers, was regarded as less of an illness and more of a 'blessing' for creative individuals.\textsuperscript{130} Lawlor proposes that one of the salient aspects of the condition that contributed towards its status as a fashionable disease was a continuity, from Aristotelian to early modern and eighteenth-century views of melancholy, of ideas surrounding the correlation of melancholy with imaginative faculties.\textsuperscript{131}

The role of the imagination was one of the most identifiable characteristics of hypochondriac melancholy. Despite the similarities in symptomatology, the key difference between literary representations of hypochondriac and love melancholy pertains to an emphasis on imagination as distinct from an emphasis on emotion. For one suffering from hypochondriac melancholy, a focus on the imagination meant the contemplation of a wide range of subjects such as the ‘non-human entities’ of landscapes, surroundings and scenery.\textsuperscript{132} Ingram and Sim describe this function of


\textsuperscript{131} Lawlor, ‘Fashionable Melancholy,’ 37.

hypochondriac melancholy in a description of Hamlet's preoccupation with a 'series of faces' of melancholy:

He is above all preoccupied, and his preoccupations define a very clear cycle of issues to be melancholy about: the self, especially the adolescent self, family, sex and love, death, the nature of the universe and universal justice, friendship, betrayal, religion and suicide.\(^\text{133}\)

The diverse subjects that drive the imagination of one who suffers from hypochondriac melancholy point to a 'plurality of melancholies'.\(^\text{134}\) As I will subsequently show, the difference between imagination and emotion across both textual modes of Gothic and early modern poetry outlines the prevalence of higher registers of emotional expression in the latter textual genre. These observations, in turn, have ramifications for the study of characterisation of villains in the Gothic tradition.

**Melancholy, the Imagination and Alternating Registers in the Gothic**

In Edward Young's Graveyard poem 'The Last Day' (1713), Young writes that both joy and horror are part of the melancholic's experience. Young writes of viewing with 'joy what did once horror move'.\(^\text{135}\) What might have been construed as terrifying in the past, Young writes, might now be considered pleasurable, a dynamic that can be applied to the concept of melancholy as one that embodies both

---


positive and negative characteristics. While the condition was aligned with emotional symptoms such as terror and fear, it was paradoxically favoured by eighteenth-century authors as a condition that was synonymous with creativity and contemplation, resulting in positive responses.

A useful starting point for this examination is a reading of Thomas Warton’s poem ‘The Pleasures of Melancholy’ (1746). In this poem, melancholy is aligned with both positive and negative binaries. The title of the poem itself speaks of the paradox that is hypochondriac melancholy. Despite its being regarded as a condition that should be eschewed according to physicians of the period, it is, to Warton’s speaker, a pleasure. At certain points in the poem, the speaker is gripped with fear:

As on I tread, religious horror wraps
My soul in dread repose. (‘Pleasures’: 45–46)

O then how fearful is it to reflect,
That thro’ the solitude of the still globe
No Being wakes but me! (59–61)

Despite these reflections that evoke fear in the speaker, his melancholy reflections have a predominantly positive dimension. This is reflected in the joy that Warton’s speaker obtains from the act of contemplation.

For Warton’s speaker, the positive aspects of melancholy lie in its association with a contemplative function, as attested in the opening line of the poem:

Mother of Musings, Contemplation sage,
Whose mansion is upon the topmost cliff
Of cloud-capt Teneriff, in secret bow’r;
Where ever wrapt in meditation high […] (1–4)


137 Warton, ‘The Pleasures of Melancholy,’ 211.
Throughout the poem, Warton’s speaker writes of how the condition of melancholy constantly inspires him to imaginative and contemplative fancies. Warton’s poem personifies and glamorises melancholy. For Warton, the musing melancholy poet takes his/her behaviour from melancholy, the ‘Mother of Musings’. Here, Warton favours ‘melancholy scenes’ to partaking in excesses:

Whose soft sensation feels a quicker joy
From Melancholy’s scenes, than the dull pride
Of tasteless splendor and magnificence.\(^{138}\) (95–97)

The act of contemplation itself is praised by the speaker at several points in the poem. As the ‘Queen of Thought’, Warton’s speaker revels in the contemplative function of melancholy. The poem itself reads as a projection of the poet/speaker's imagination, replete with images of gloomy surroundings and motifs from classical sources. The title of the poem itself is perhaps the best indicator of Warton's overarching view of melancholy as a condition associated with pleasure, notwithstanding several negative responses.

Despite partaking in a series of reflections that evoke fear in the speaker, Warton’s melancholy reflections have a predominantly positive dimension. In Amy Reed’s *The Background of Gray’s Elegy*, Reed writes that contemplation is invoked regularly as an aspect of literary melancholy, translated through descriptions of surroundings.\(^ {139}\) She locates the notion of contemplativeness as a legacy of Milton’s influence on eighteenth-century poets. This contemplative dimension directs its attention outward towards external stimuli, as attested to by Warton’s description of being privy to ‘melancholy’s scenes’. Representations of melancholy in eighteenth-century literature have an imaginative quality, where melancholic individuals meditate on scenery, surroundings and various external subjects. Melancholic

\(^{138}\) Warton, 'The Pleasures of Melancholy,’ 214.

individuals display emotional characteristics that are projected onto landscapes and surroundings.

In Horace Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto*, the character Theodore exhibits the symptoms of an introspective melancholic. At the mid-point of the novel, Theodore is left alone in a dark cavern where he indulges his condition:

Arriving there, he sought the gloomiest shades, as best suited to the pleasing melancholy that reigned in his mind. In this mood he roved insensibly to the caves which had formerly served as a retreat to hermits, and were now reported round the country to be haunted by evil spirits.\(^{140}\)

Dark, gloomy environments are regarded by Theodore as essential for indulging his melancholic state. In this sequence, he experiences a state of ‘pleasing’ melancholy from external stimuli, using these surroundings as a conduit for the derivation of pleasure from his condition.

But while the effects of melancholy on Theodore are associated with a positive binary, elsewhere in the text, his melancholy causes him an immeasurable amount of suffering. His suffering is centred on the loss of his beloved Matilda. Marshall Brown suggests that Theodore’s ‘eternal melancholy’ is part of a ‘disease’ that spreads from the doomed Conrad, to Matilda, to finally affect Theodore himself.\(^{141}\) The chronic nature of Theodore’s condition is evidenced at the text’s conclusion, where it remains unabated. Walpole demonstrates an awareness of melancholy’s complex nature, likening it to a debilitating condition which cannot be assuaged with ease. As a consequence of this loss, his melancholy has ‘taken possession’ of his soul.\(^{142}\) He is only able to find solace in the company of Isabella, a person with whom he can share his grief. Isabella’s presence serves as a conduit for Theodore’s fixation with his dead loved one.

---


beloved, as evidenced by Walpole’s description of Theodore’s ‘frequent discourses’ with her.

Similarly in Radcliffe’s *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, her protagonist Emily experiences both positive as well as negative symptoms of hypochondriac melancholy that have an imaginative quality. Echoing Theodore’s fixation with Matilda in Walpole’s text, Emily constantly resuscitates her father in recollections that blur the lines between the living and the dead, sadness and pleasure. Referencing the characterisation of Radcliffe’s Emily, Clive Bloom notes that the ‘prevailing feeling’ of Gothic heroines is their melancholy.\(^{143}\) Indeed, across the course of Radcliffe’s novel, Emily demonstrates variations in positive and negative emotional rhythms. Emily’s recurring visions of her dead father form a recurring trope. Demonstrating a compulsion to relive her trauma, she absorbs readers into her sorrowful memories, memories that are often horrific in their subversion of death, yet are also pleasing to her.

The first incident that serves as a cause for Emily’s melancholic reveries is one of loss. The death of Emily’s father leads to episodes where she hallucinates, imagining that she sees her dead father’s ghost. In one particularly affecting scene, Emily reminisces about the site of her father’s interred body, an act that leads to envisioning her father’s ghost:

> Retired to her lonely cabin, her melancholy thoughts still hovered round the body of her deceased parent; and, when she sunk into a kind of slumber, the images of her waking mind still haunted her fancy. She thought she saw her father approaching her with a benign countenance; then, smiling mournfully and pointing upwards, his lips moved, but, instead of words, she heard sweet music borne on the distant air, and presently saw his features glow with the mild rapture of a superior being.\(^{144}\)

---

\(^{143}\) Clive Bloom, *Gothic Histories*, 69.

\(^{144}\) Radcliffe, *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, 83.
Emily’s hallucination leads her to contemplating the visage of her dead father. Her reaction to these visions is not made explicitly clear by Radcliffe, but readers are led to believe that she derives a positive emotional effect from the vision of her father. The phrases ‘benign countenance’, her father’s smile, and the aural stimuli of ‘sweet music’ contribute to the construction of a positive reaction to what might be construed as a horrifying vision of the supernatural. The depiction of St Aubert’s ghost might prompt a reader’s response of fear, but this is tempered by Emily’s unmoved reaction. The recollection of her father’s death brings to Emily pleasure and comfort rather than pain or fear.

Emily’s recollections of Monsieur St Aubert become a recurring trope in The Mysteries of Udolpho, episodes that she derives pleasure from on several occasions. After her father’s death, Emily derives a melancholy pleasure from ‘repeating’ to herself a poem written by her father, an act that occurs frequently in Radcliffe’s narrative. Towards the end, the recollection of Emily’s father brings her happiness:

> With the melancholy she experienced on the review of a place which had been the residence of her parents [...]. One of the first apartments she visited, was that, which had been her father’s library, and here she seated herself in his arm-chair, and, while she contemplated, with tempered resignation, the picture of past times, which her memory gave, the tears she shed could scarcely be called those of grief.

Melancholy, for Emily, is a source of comfort that is correlated with a positive response. The dead serves as a comfort to her, and constant indulgence in the thought of her dead father provides a solace for Emily. Despite suffering the loss of her father, the constant visions she has of him reassure her and bring to her mind a series of positive emotional reactions.

---


146 Radcliffe, The Mysteries of Udolpho, 591.
But elsewhere in the novel, the thought of her father is also aligned with negative emotions of sadness, sorrow and physiological enervation. Her melancholy proclivity to envisioning the dead inundates her with sorrow and grief. She is overwhelmed with 'hopeless grief' when burying her father. The memory of her father threatens to overwhelm her with tears that she cannot endure. As her condition deteriorates, she demonstrates, once again, an ability to recall the most minute details surrounding her father’s death:

Instances of this temporary failure of mind had more than once occurred since her return home; particularly when, wandering through this lonely mansion in the evening twilight, she had been alarmed by appearances, which would have been unseen in her more cheerful days. To this infirm state of her nerves may be attributed what she imagined, when, her eyes glancing a second time on the arm-chair, which stood in an obscure part of the closet, the countenance of her dead father appeared there.

In this episode, Emily is described as seeing, quite specifically, the 'countenance of her dead father'. The death of her father haunts Emily constantly, and Radcliffe presents these visions as part of a normalised pattern of repetition compulsion for the melancholic. Once again towards the end of the novel, as Emily contemplates her return to her family home, her melancholy leads her to mourn the death of her father 'as if it were an event of yesterday'. Subsequently, in a conversation with a nun, Emily envisions visiting the grave of her father and weeping 'over the spot'. These repeated episodes bring both happiness and sadness to Radcliffe’s protagonist, exemplifying the ambivalent and repetitive symptoms of Emily’s melancholy. Her detailed recollections are indicative of a deep attachment to her dead father that she

is unable to overcome. Emily constantly resurrects images of her father throughout the novel. She is both troubled and pleased by these repetitive episodes that blur the lines between life and death.¹⁵²

Love Melancholy and Alternating Registers of Emotion

What unites the representations of melancholy in Walpole and Radcliffe’s texts is that they are centred on the symptoms of hypochondriac melancholy, a facet of the condition where an individual’s imaginative and contemplative faculties are paramount. Moving from this eighteenth-century representation of literary melancholy, alternating positive and negative symptoms are also characteristics of the Petrarchan lover. The crucial difference between representations of melancholy in these two traditions is an emphasis on emotions in love melancholy. Specifically, portrayals of love melancholy in early modern poetry are characterised by their heightened registers of emotion. The variances in severity of melancholic symptoms offer a perspective from which to understand the idea of melancholy as a ‘paradoxical’ disease. As Lawlor proposes:

> Melancholy’s core characteristics of sadness and fear were not inimical to its popularity because these emotions varied in severity, and, as part of the characteristic of the disease, could go into remission, thus allowing some lucid intervals necessary for creative activity.¹⁵³

¹⁵² These episodes also exemplify a nostalgic impulse that underpins Emily’s recurring recollections. Adela Pinch, in Strange Fits of Passion, proposes that ‘objects of nostalgia’ and reverting to the past are key aspects of Radcliffe’s treatment of melancholy in her novel. See Adela Pinch, Strange Fits of Passion: Epistemologies of Passion, Hume to Austen (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 118.

¹⁵³ Lawlor, ‘Fashionable Melancholy,’ 39.
I suggest that such key differences in the 'severity' of melancholic symptoms pointed out by Lawlor here can be read as indicative of the differences between hypochondriac and love melancholy. The 'remission' Lawlor writes of points to the difference between a diminished set of registers that are a key aspect of introspective hypochondriac melancholy and the elevated emotional states that characterise literary representations of love melancholy.

Julia Kristeva’s psychoanalytic approach to the subject of melancholia in *Black Sun: Depression and Melancholia* offers a means of contextualising the emphasis on emotion through varying and heightened registers in early modern representations of love melancholy. Two points that she raises in her essay are pertinent to my reading of love melancholy—the first, that the melancholic experiences a form of simultaneous attraction and repulsion to his object of affection. Kristeva uses the analogy of a 'black sun' to describe what she calls the 'Thing', the source of a melancholic's attention that is both the centre of attraction and of repulsion.154 The melancholic's 'Thing', in her words, is both necessary and is an enemy to the individual, forming the 'delightful focus' of his or her hatred.155

More importantly, Kristeva’s work highlights the difference between the exaggerated tone of representations of love melancholy in the Petrarchan tradition and of hypochondriac melancholy in Gothic novels. In Petrarchan love poetry, representations of melancholy have an overarching focus on the emotional symptoms of melancholy. Kristeva proposes that in the absence of an object, the melancholic forms a fixation with *emotions themselves* rather than an object of desire:

> Such a person considers himself to be not injured but stricken by a fundamental lack, a congenital deficiency. [...] For this type of narcissistic depressive, sorrow is, in reality, his only object. More exactly, it constitutes a

---


substitute object to which he clings, cultivating and cherishing it, for lack of any other.¹⁵⁶

This theory helps with an analysis of early modern poets’ representation of love melancholy and the emotions associated with the condition. The melancholy lover holds on to these emotions as a substitute, in order to cope with the consequence of being tormented with an elusive beloved who is always out of reach. This results in a focus on emotions that relate to melancholy—fear, sorrow, despair, woe and sadness. Focusing on the emotions associated with melancholy, repetition and exaggeration are used extensively in Petrarchan love poetry.

An understanding of the differences between the introspective quality of eighteenth-century melancholy and love melancholy can perhaps be gleaned by a brief look at Sir Philip Sidney’s ‘To the Tune of The Smokes of Melancholy’, a poem that signposts the emotional nuances of love melancholy:

Who hath ever felt the change of love,
And knowne those pangs that the losers prove,
May paint my face, without seeing mee;
And write the state of how my fancies bee:
The lothsome buds growne on sorrowe's Tree.¹⁵⁷ ('Smokes': 1–5)

The poet/speaker’s description of ‘sorrowe's tree’ in line five is indicative of a preoccupation with an emotional symptom of melancholy. Sidney writes that the symptoms of love melancholy are predictable and ubiquitous enough for one to empathise with his emotional turmoil. What is equally as important as the poet's fixation with sorrow is his conveyance of the emotion. Described through the image of 'lothsome buds', Sidney describes the persistence of this emotional symptom by using exaggerated language. The emotionally charged language used by the speaker persists throughout the poem when he references the 'bitter juice of forsaken woes'...


¹⁵⁷ Sidney, Poems, 153.
and the act of being 'engulfed' with despair in the second stanza, and burning with desire in the last.\textsuperscript{158}

Despite the speaker’s emphasis on the symptoms of his suffering, he ultimately exhibits a willingness for this suffering to remain unabated. Sidney’s speaker demonstrates a form of ‘radicalised liminality’ where he simultaneously embraces and renounces his suffering.\textsuperscript{159} In the fifth stanza of this poem, Sidney’s speaker presents the reader with an alternating emotional register in which, despite previously depicting love melancholy as a form of suffering, he exhibits a preference to remain in a state of torment. This is articulated in the third stanza of the poem, where the speaker displays a concealed tone of pleasure at remaining in a state of suffering, through a set of oxymora and contradictions:

\begin{quote}
\textit{For me alas I am full resolv’d,}
\textit{These bands alas shall not be dissolv’d,}
\textit{Nor breake my word though reward come late,}
\textit{Nor faile my faith in my failing fate,}
\textit{Nor change in change, though change change my state.}\textsuperscript{160} (20–24)
\end{quote}

The speaker’s resolution to remain in a state of torment in line 20 is emphasised by the contradictory figures of speech used by him in lines 23 and 24. The alliterated ‘f’ sound and repeated uses of the word ‘change’ symbolise the speaker’s fixation with the symptoms of melancholy. While recognising that to be affected by love melancholy is to suffer, the speaker relishes his suffering and is unwilling to be alleviated from his pain. The poem’s final line reinforces this, as Sidney’s speaker then uses the imagery of a phoenix to symbolise burning in his desire.\textsuperscript{161}

\begin{footnotes}
\footnotetext[158]{Sidney, \textit{Poems}, 153.}
\footnotetext[159]{Van Elferen, \textit{Gothic Music}, 18.}
\footnotetext[160]{Sidney, \textit{Poems}, 153.}
\footnotetext[161]{Sidney, \textit{Poems}, 153.}
\end{footnotes}
implication here is that he is more than willing to repeat his suffering again and again.

Exaggeration and a focus on emotions form the most significant characteristics of melancholy lovers in the early modern verse tradition. In Sonnet 9 of Samuel Daniel's sequence *Delia*, the speaker contemplates the symptoms of love melancholy:

If this be loue, to drawe a weary breath,
Painte on flowdes, till the shore, crye to th'ayre:
With downward looks, still reading on the earth;
These sad memorials of my loues despaire.

If this be loue, to warre against my soule,
Lye downe to waile, rise vp to sigh and grieue me:
The newer-resting stone of care to roule,
Still to complaine my greifes, and none releiue me.

If this be loue, to cloath me with darke thoughts,
Haunting vntroden pathes to waile apart;
My pleasures horror, Musique tragick notes,
Tears in my eyes, and sorrowe at my hart.

If this be loue, to liue a liuing death;
O then loue I, and drawe this weary breath,162 (*Delia*, 9: 1–14)

Repeating the phrase 'if this be love' multiple times in this poem provides a mark of regularity in the sonnet, serving as signposts to three separate quatrains and a concluding couplet. Daniel's speaker signposts being affected by three facets of his being in the poem's three main quatrains—the body, soul and mind. Each quatrain references a symptom of love melancholy—sadness and despair in the first quatrain, sighing and grieving in the second, horror and sorrow in the third, and longing for death in the sonnet's concluding couplet. Daniel's fixation with the symptoms of

---

melancholy is symbolised through imagery drawn from the myth of Sisyphus. These symptoms are likened to a 'never resting', rolling stone that plagues the speaker to no end.

Repeating a phrase again and again, he is locked in a state of flux between the positive and negative symptoms of melancholy that result in an uncertain subject position. Daniel’s speaker experiences ambivalent shifts between wanting to live and wanting to die. He references haunting in line ten, a proposition that reinforces a tone of uncertainty as he envisions a state where he is both ‘dead’ yet is amongst the living. The poem concludes with the speaker resigned to the fact that to love is to adopt a liminal, ambivalent state between life and death.

Daniel’s description of love melancholy as an experience that is in contravention to the natural state of his soul also forms part of Astrophil’s experience in Sir Philip Sidney’s Sonnet 100. Sidney’s speaker exaggerates the effect of love melancholy by presenting to a reader the disturbing image of his soul frying in hell in line eight:

O teares, no teares, but raine from beautie's skies,
Making those Lillies and those Roses grow,
Which ay most faire, now more then most faire show,
While gracefull pytty beauty beautifies.
O honeied sighs, which from that breast do rise,
Whose pants do make unspilling creame to flow,
Wing'd with whose breath, so pleasing Zephires blow,
As can refresh the hell where my soule fries.
O plaints conserv'd in such a sugred phrase,
That eloquence it selfe envies your praise,
While sobd-out words a perfect Musike give.
Such tears, sighs, plaints, no sorrow is but joy:
Or if such heavenly signes must prove annoy,
All mirth farewell, let me in sorrow live.\textsuperscript{163} \textit{(Astrophil, 100: 1–14)}

Sidney's poem shares several similarities with Daniel's \textit{Delia}, Sonnet 9. Sidney's poem is also broken into multiple sections by the repetition of the word 'O' in lines one, five and nine. Each section also addresses one aspect of being afflicted by love melancholy such as tears and sighs, sorrow and joy, as well as the effect of melancholy on the soul.

Sidney's poem draws attention to outward manifestations of melancholic symptomatology. Kristeva writes that one distinctive feature of the melancholic's preoccupation with the symptoms of love melancholy is an outward projection of discernible actions:

\begin{quote}
I cannot inscribe my violence in 'no' nor in any other sign. I can expel it only by means of gestures, spasms or shouts. I impel it, I project it. My necessary Thing is also an absolutely my enemy, my foil, the delightful focus of my hatred.\textsuperscript{164}
\end{quote}

The 'gestures' made by Sidney's speaker in this poem take the form of tears in line one, sighs in line five and sobbing in line eleven, actions that are subsequently summarised in line twelve. Line nine features a slightly different form of an outward projection from Sidney's speaker. His reference to 'plaints' in line nine refers to an act of writing, one that differs from the discernible actions of tears and sighing referenced in the previous sections. Nevertheless, while referring to an act of writing, the speaker's use of the word 'plaints' is one that is charged with a double meaning—an audible expression of sorrow as opposed to a complaint-poem.\textsuperscript{165} As the poem concludes, Sidney's speaker exhibits a 'delightful focus' on the divergent emotions of sorrow and joy simultaneously. Transfixed in a state where these

\begin{flushright}
\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{163} Sidney, \textit{Poems}, 231.

\textsuperscript{164} Kristeva, \textit{Black Sun}, 15.

\end{flushright}
symptoms are both 'heavenly signes' as well as annoyances, the poem's speaker entraps himself in a state where he is tormented to an impasse by his emotions.

Like Sidney's Sonnet 100, an outward projection of actions is a salient aspect of Sonnet 54 of Michael Drayton's sequence *Idea*. Drayton's focus in this poem is on the symptoms of love melancholy, albeit in a different form. Kristeva writes that poetic form is one aspect of acquiring some semblance of control over a melancholic's fixation with emotions:

> The so-called poetic form, which decomposes and recomposes signs, is the sole 'container' seemingly able to secure an uncertain but adequate hold over the Thing.\(^{166}\)

The notion of poetic form as a means of control is addressed by Drayton directly in this poem. In *Idea*, Sonnet 54, Drayton envisions the act of writing as one way of compressing the various aspects of melancholy symptomatology into a tangible structure:

> Yet reade at last the storie of my Woe,  
> The drerie abstracts of my endlesse Cares,  
> With my Life's Sorrow interlined so,  
> Smoak'd with my Sighes, and blotted with my Teares;  
> The sad Memorialls of my Miseries,  
> Pen'd in the griefe of mine afflicted Ghost,  
> My Lives complaint in dolefull Elegies,  
> With so pure Love as Time could never boast [...].\(^{167}\) (*Idea*, 54: 1–8)

In this poem, the speaker focuses on the associations between creativity and love melancholy, introducing a physiological dimension to the act of literary creation. Through a metatextual interjection, Drayton's speaker presents his sonnet as a

---


tangible product of his love melancholy. The poem itself is framed as a repository for the various symptoms of melancholy experienced by the speaker—sorrow, sighs, tears and grief are experienced by the speaker and translated into the form of a poem. The speaker also demonstrates a characteristic compulsion to repetition. The word 'my' is referenced in seven out of the first eight lines of the sonnet. This section of the poem is replete with negative symptoms of love melancholy, characterising its speaker as one who has undergone a process of suffering.

A rapid shift in tone subsequently occurs in the second half of the poem when the speaker promotes his verse as having the potential to elevate his beloved. Drayton's speaker turns his suffering into a display of poetic power:

My zeale, my Hope, my Vowes, my Prayse, my Pray'r,
My Soule's Oblations to thy sacred name:
Which Name my Muse to highest Heav'ns shall rayse
By chaste Desire, true Love, and vertuous Prayse.  

Repeating the word 'my' once again in this section of the poem, Drayton engulfs his speaker with an excessive display that betrays his compulsion to repeat. His tone here, however, opposes the overwhelmingly negative tone adopted in the former section of the poem. The speaker derives pleasure in valorising his words as a means of elevating his beloved's status. Turning his suffering into an assertion of poetic power, what has formerly been symptomatic of the speaker's love melancholy now gives him pleasure. Despite his 'endless cares', the speaker has, by the conclusion of the poem, lavished praise on the very object of his suffering, turning it into a form of enjoyment. Indeed, the exuberant tone adopted in line eleven serve as a counterpoint to the suffering depicted in the first section of the poem.

The repetitive and exaggerated tone of Drayton's poem is similar to Idea, Sonnet 41, also titled 'Love's Lunacie'. This poem likens love melancholy to a form of

---

insanity, where the speaker vacillates between the extremes of happiness and sadness.  

The title of the poem foregrounds a view of love melancholy as a form of illness. Through the course of the poem, readers are provided with the repetitive rambling of a man who acknowledges the source of his torment and pain, yet is helpless to do anything about it:

Why doe I speake of Joy, or write of Love,  
When my Heart is the very Den of Horror,  
And in my Soule the paines of Hell I prove,  
With all his Torments and Infernall terror?  
What should I say? what yet remaines to doe?  
My Braine is drie with weeping all too long,  
My Sighs be spent in utt’ring of my Woe,  
And I want words, wherewith to tell my Wrong:  
But still distracted in Loves Lunacie  
And Bedlam-like, thus raving in my Griefe [...].

Drayton uses the imagery of hell to highlight the extent of his speaker's suffering. He then shifts to the palpable physiological effects of his melancholy, a dried-out brain. But at the midpoint in the sonnet, Drayton's speaker reverts to embracing the source of his suffering despite the acknowledgement of its ill effects on him. From decrying the act of writing in the first line of the poem, he shifts to 'wanting words' in line eight. He sees the act of writing as a means of catharsis, to alleviate his woes by conveying them to the world. But this act itself proves to be a dangerous endeavour as writing reminds him of his suffering. Writing reinforces and redoubles the effects of his pain.

The poem's final section makes this evident as Drayton's speaker launches into a repetitive vacillation between praise and disparagement that betrays the

---


170 Drayton, Works, 2:331.
extent to which he is affected by his love melancholy. The use of the repeated word 'now' in the opening of each line symbolises Drayton’s speaker’s repetition compulsion as he experiences a series of rapid actions that echo his vacillating emotional state:

Now raile upon her Haire, then on her Eye;
Now call her Goddesse, then I call her Thiefe;
Now I deny Her, then I doe confesse Her,
Now doe I curse Her, then again I blesse Her.  (11–14)

Alternating between praise and blame, the speaker cannot help but be trapped in an ambivalent position that sees him simultaneously embracing and eschewing the source of his suffering. The words 'her' and 'I' are also repeated incessantly in this section of Drayton's poem, contributing to a briskness that characterises as well as exaggerates the experience of the Petrarchan lover.

An analysis of these poets' use of exaggeration and repetition reveals key differences between representations of love melancholy in early modern poetry and melancholy in Gothic novels. In the Gothic, imaginative faculties form the most important facet of the melancholic's experience. Walpole's Theodore fancies himself engaging in imaginative reveries that are pleasurable. Radcliffe's Emily constantly suffers from hallucinations of her dead father, episodes that evoke both positive and negative responses alike. Melancholy characters in the Gothic have their attention drawn to external stimuli, while melancholy lovers in the Petrarchan tradition focus their attentions 'inward', dwelling on the symptoms of love melancholy. The registers of emotional displays across both textual modes also differ greatly. Drayton’s Sonnet 54 and 'Love's Lunacie' in Idea; Sidney’s Sonnet 100 in Astrophil and Stella; and Daniel's Sonnet 9 in Delia feature melancholic poetic speakers who convey their emotions through exaggerated figures of speech and 'obsessive litanies'.

---

171 Kristeva, Black Sun, 33.
Love Melancholy in the Gothic Mode

An analysis of the differences between the representation of melancholy in Gothic texts and love melancholy in Renaissance verse prompts the question—what are the similarities and differences between representations of love melancholy across both modes? What are the implications of highlighting Gothic novelists' depiction of love melancholy in dialogue with earlier depictions of the condition in Renaissance texts? Literary representations of melancholy in the Gothic focus on the condition's introspective qualities, but an appraisal of love melancholy in Gothic texts reveals consistencies in the way the condition is treated in texts across both the early modern period and eighteenth-century texts.

To examine the similarities between the literary representation of love melancholy in early modern poetry and the Gothic, a character who is worth examining is Count Morano from Radcliffe's *The Mysteries of Udolpho*. Morano displays an interest in Radcliffe's protagonist, but his affections remain unrequited by Emily as she is in love with someone else. In one sequence, Morano confesses to Emily his affection:

'It is impossible, Madam, that I can thus easily resign the object of a passion, which is the delight and torment of my life.—I must still love—still pursue you with unremitting ardour;—when you shall be convinced of the strength and constancy of my passion, your heart must soften into pity and repentance'.

Morano's speech offers a glimpse into the characterisation of one who suffers from love melancholy in a Gothic text. His declarations of love show strong similarities with one who is afflicted with love melancholy. This parallels depictions of love

---

melancholy in the Petrarchan tradition. Compared to the imaginative, introspective qualities of melancholy, love melancholy is associated with both a preoccupation with its own symptoms and an intensified portrayal of these emotions.

Firstly, through Morano’s reference to Emily as both a torment as well as a source of delight to him, Radcliffe characterises him as one who suffers from love melancholy. Melancholy speaking characters often refer to their experiences as a simultaneous torment and delight, as evidenced from speaking characters from poems such as Edmund Spenser’s Sonnet 42 from *Amoretti*, Barnabe Barnes’s Sonnet 53 from *Parthenophil and Parthenophe*, and Thomas Watson’s Sonnet 37 from *Tears of Fancie*:

The love which me so cruelly tormenteth,

So pleasing is in my extreamest paine [...] (Spenser, *Amoretti*, 42: 1–2)

Why do I sew to kisse, and kisse to loue,

And loue to be tormented, not beloued? (Barnes, *Parthenophil*, 53: 9–10)

How shall I seeme my sighes for to suppressse,

Which helpe the hart which else would swelt in sunder,

Which hurts the helpe that makes my torment lesse [...] (Watson, *Tears*, 37: 5–7)

Morano’s speech reads as a verbal realisation of a Petrarchan trope. Morano suffers from what Kristeva describes as a ‘fundamental lack’. His reference to Emily being

---


both a source of a positive emotional response as well as a simultaneously negative one aligns him with the archetype of a typical melancholy Petrarchan lover who longs for a beloved who is out of his reach.

Secondly, the tone used by Morano in the articulation of his love melancholy parallels the elevated registers of a typical love melancholic. Radcliffe uses repetition and exaggeration as a means of articulating the intensity of Morano's emotional expression. She uses the adjective ‘unremitting’, used by Morano in describing his heightened state of enthusiasm for Emily. The repetition of the words ‘must’ and ‘still’ in Morano's speech reinforce the speaker's experience of love melancholy. Like a melancholy lover who demonstrates a need to convey emotions through actions, Morano likens his feelings to an act of pursuit. Similar to a Petrarchan lover who displays an interest in emotions as a substitute for a love-object, the response that Morano seeks from Emily is an emotional response—he wants her to be affected by pity. Finally, the intensity of Morano's emotional outburst is noted by others as an elevated form of emotional expression. Radcliffe describes how the moonlight reveals the 'strong emotions' of Morano's soul and another character observes Morano's judgment to be 'obscured with passion'.

Another important facet of Morano's characterisation as a love melancholic is the disclosure of his affection as an uncontrollable manifestation of his passion. The extent to which Morano has been affected by his love melancholy is articulated through the phrases 'it is impossible', 'must still' and 'must soften', conveying a tone of absolute certainty and necessity. The repetition of ‘must’, and ‘still’ in the phrase ‘must still love—still pursue you’ demonstrate the uncontrollable quality of Morano's obsession with Emily. Multiple references to his 'passion' in his speech also suggest, as Kristeva writes, a fixation with emotions in addition to a fixation with an object of affection.

---

Beyond the similarities, a comparison of the differences between Morano's love melancholy and the symptomatology of early modern love melancholy offers a set of considerations for the study of literary melancholy in the genres of Petrarchan love poetry and the Gothic. One of these differences is tied to both modes’ divergences in form. The poetic form of Petrarchan verse presents the symptoms of melancholy as figures of speech, while Radcliffe's novel considers these symptoms as a concrete part of an individual's behavioural patterns. In other words, Morano can be read as a translation of the Petrarchan lover archetype into reality through narrative action.

Morano himself is characterised a 'lesser' villain in the service of one who has more authority, Montoni. In one scene, Morano breaks into Emily's chamber after midnight with the intent to spirit her away from Montoni's clutches. This act itself might be construed as somewhat heroic, but Morano's intrusion is ultimately a transgressive act that, in and of itself, is reprehensible. The implication of this connection, in light of Morano's broader role in Radcliffe's text, is a link between the love melancholic and the Gothic villain. Morano’s pursuit of Emily is encouraged by Montoni, the villain of Radcliffe's text. Montoni regards Morano's love melancholy as a means of achieving his goal of marrying Emily off so that he can access the fortune willed to her. The dynamics of Morano’s interactions with Montoni and Emily reveal how the condition of love melancholy is exploited by a Gothic villain.

But what happens when melancholy forms part of the Gothic villain's character? To gain a fuller understanding of this connection between love melancholy and the Gothic villain, another character that can be considered through the lens of the melancholy Petrarchan lover is Ambrosio from The Monk. An analysis of Ambrosio is important to the discussion initiated in this chapter as he is characterised as one who experiences both hypochondriac and love melancholy. A comparison of how these two different variants of melancholy are treated in Lewis’s
One of the earliest episodes that can be construed as an articulation of Ambrosio’s hypochondriac melancholy is where he has an exchange with the novice monk Rosario (actually Matilda in disguise). Ambrosio explains to Rosario how the process of meditating in solitude led him inevitably to be afflicted with melancholy. Solitude, Ambrosio states, lacks the ‘sustained violence’ of the passions, where an individual views the world as one that is ‘without emotion’, joyless and monotonous. Lewis’s description of the contemplative aspect of melancholy, through Ambrosio’s account, is indicative of a diminished register, one that is synonymous with ‘ennui and weariness’.178

On the contrary, the effect of love melancholy on Ambrosio is a ‘mixed passion’ that is, at the outset, exemplified by emotional excess, exaggeration and repetition. In a key sequence in the text, Ambrosio catches sight of Antonia, evoking a reaction from him that is palpable. He feels a ‘soft, delicious’ melancholy infusing into his soul. At the start of this section, Lewis describes Ambrosio as being overwhelmed by his emotions, a salient characteristic of the love melancholic. Lewis exaggerates Ambrosio’s emotional responses to Antonia by writing that he feels that he has been affected by a ‘thousand’ new emotions. This exaggerated response is in stark contrast to the diminished emotional registers experienced by the Monk in melancholy contemplation.

Like the many early modern love melancholics, Ambrosio’s speech and thought patterns involve a form of constant repetition in a series of ‘obsessive litanies’. These repeated phrases and words generate an exaggerated tone that underscores the heightened emotional register of Ambrosio’s love melancholy:

178 Matthew G. Lewis, The Monk, edited by D. L. MacDonald and Kathleen Scherf (Peterborough, Ontario: Broadview, 2004), 75. Subsequent references to Lewis’s text will be to this edition.
'Happy Man!' He exclaimed in his romantic enthusiasm; 'Happy Man, who is destined to possess the heart of that lovely Girl! What delicacy in her features! What elegance in her form! [...] To see her blue downcast eyes beam upon mine with timid fondness! To sit for days, for years listening to that gentle voice! To acquire the right of obliging her, and hear the artless expressions of her gratitude!179

The repetition of 'happy man', 'what' and 'to' in this segment exemplify Ambrosio's melancholic symptoms. Like the speaker of Drayton's 'Love’s Lunacie' who uses the word 'her' eight times in the space of four lines, Lewis's Ambrosio demonstrates a fixation with his beloved that is both obsessive and transgressive at the same time.180

Unlike a typical Petrarchan lover (and unlike Count Morano), Ambrosio eventually does have his desire realised. With the aid of witchcraft, he imprisons Antonia in a dungeon and rapes her, satisfying his desire. While his actions characterise him as a Gothic villain, an understanding of his motivations through an appraisal of his love melancholy sheds light onto his motivations. Characterised as a love melancholic who demonstrates an overemphasis on emotions, a fixation with a love-object and heightened emotional registers, Ambrosio symbolises the dangerous potential of unrequited love. He is, to paraphrase Lutz, a dangerous lover whose affliction has profound consequences.181

The links between Gothic villains such as Ambrosio and Count Morano and melancholy Petrarchan speakers connect the theme of unattainability, a crucial cause of love melancholy, with the Gothic trope of transgressive desire. In Gothic texts, the presence of an unattainable beloved forms the background for transgressive actions. What results from Gothic villains seeking out women who do not return their affections marks an overturning of reason in favour of passion. From Morano's


pursuit of Emily to Ambrosio breaking his vows of chastity, transgression in the Gothic is a process that develops from coveting after a beloved who is unattainable. An awareness of the elevated registers demonstrated by the Petrarchan lover thus provides a historical context to the archetype of the Gothic villain, a pre-existing literary archetype whose vocabulary of melancholy and obsession with a specific beloved would, in eighteenth-century Gothic novels, come to be associated with the Gothic villain.

**Conclusion**

Michael Ann Holly has proposed that the spirit of contradiction is at melancholy’s core. The complexities and paradoxes surrounding the emotional symptoms and manifestations of melancholy across the ages are perhaps the condition’s one defining trait. Because the condition is intrinsically bound to the representation of extreme emotional states, it allows for the generation of affect through the ‘vicissitudes’ of emotion.

It is for this reason that melancholy is an important contributor to a Gothic sensibility, as it symbolises an intellectual and affective approach to the world. Representations of melancholy in the early modern period marked an engagement with the Petrarchan poetic tradition in the creation of original textual creations. The Petrarchan lover laments the extent of his suffering, but secretly relishes the opportunity to articulate his suffering as an act of creativity. Joy and suffering, fear and happiness alike are favourable emotional states to the Petrarchan lover, the

---

experience of which is explicated through elevated registers of emotion. Consequently, eighteenth-century authors’ fascination with melancholy allowed for the fusion of the ‘ancient’ with a ‘modern’ condition that was also regarded as a fashionable disease. Eighteenth-century literary representations of melancholy were predominantly of hypochondriac melancholy, where authors focused on a range of imaginative stimuli as opposed to a manic obsession with a beloved and the emotions in love melancholy.

Through the comparative analysis undertaken in this chapter, I have outlined the differences and similarities between literary representations of love melancholy and hypochondriac melancholy. In both early modern and Gothic texts, representations of love melancholy take on a higher register than that of hypochondriac melancholy. These differences in valences of emotion have, in turn, implications that underpin the construction of characters in Gothic fiction. The elevated emotional expressions that are a core feature of Petrarchan poetry have a parallel in the emotionally charged characters of Gothic villains.

The examination of texts from both the Renaissance and the Gothic in this chapter forms a backbone for the analysis of early modern texts that follow in the rest of this thesis. Through the early modern texts surveyed in this chapter, readers are privy to the exaggerated emotional conceits of Petrarchan rhetoric. Subsequent chapters in this study will investigate the nexus of love melancholy with other intellectual themes such as supernaturalism in Chapter Two, anatomical study and the grotesque in Chapter Three, before revisiting the notion of alternating registers in Chapter Four’s study of darkness and ambiguity.
Chapter 2: 'Damned ghosts called up with mighty spells': Early Modern Poetic Supernaturalism and the Gothic

The subject of the supernatural is an important facet of eighteenth-century Gothic texts. From the appearance of Alfonso’s ghost at the start of *The Castle of Otranto* to the depiction of Satan dropping Ambrosio to his death at the conclusion of *The Monk*, the 'supernatural trappings' of the Gothic are some of the mode's most recognisable tropes. But while the Gothic is a literary mode that is frequently associated with depictions of the supernatural, such depictions abound in other literary genres that predate the Gothic. The plays of Shakespeare, a source of inspiration for eighteenth-century Gothic novelists, are a textual mode that contains depictions of the supernatural. My interest in this chapter is investigating representations of the supernatural in a different early modern textual form to Shakespearean plays. In this chapter, I evaluate representations of supernaturalism in early modern poetic texts through the lens of the Gothic.

The analysis undertaken in this chapter is divided into two different sections: depictions of supernatural forms and witchcraft. In the first section of this chapter, I discuss how poets characterised their poetic selves as ghosts, frightening their beloveds from beyond the grave. The second half of this chapter addresses how poetic speakers imagined themselves as practitioners of witchcraft, turning to occultism as a means of forcibly obtaining the affection of their beloveds. Through a comparative analysis with examples from Gothic novels, both sections of this

---

chapter contribute to the argument at the heart of this chapter, and by extension this thesis, that representations of supernaturalism in early modern love poetry constitute an affective early modern Gothic sensibility.

The analysis undertaken in this study across early modern Petrarchan poetry and Gothic novels reveals some original insights into both textual genres. Firstly, while literary representations of supernaturalism are noted by critics to be a core facet of the Gothic mode, there is scant critical analysis surrounding depictions of the supernatural in Gothic novels conveyed in poetic form. This chapter will explore the uses of such representations and poetic techniques such as repetition as a means of generating emotional affect.

Secondly, after beginning with an analysis of poetic techniques in Gothic novels, this chapter subsequently examines how these techniques are used in early modern Petrarchan love poems. The chapter continues the reading undertaken in the previous chapter of the Petrarchan lover as an early modern Gothic villain. It argues that power over the supernatural is wielded by Petrarchan speakers as a technique for generating fear as well as a means for the Petrarchan lover to satisfy his desire.

Lastly, this chapter also illuminates the differences between the narrative voices adopted in Gothic novels and early modern poems. Despite the centrality of the theme of supernaturalism to both modes, the narrative form of third-person Gothic texts, I suggest, allows for the introduction of a reader response dynamic centred on the idea of 'hesitation'. This dynamic is largely absent in first-person early modern poems, resulting in differences between how each mode addresses the subject of supernatural fear. However, in some examples of Renaissance poetry, poets demonstrated a shift towards introducing an element of third-person narrativity into their poems. The speaking voices adopted in John Donne’s 'The Apparition' and Barnabe Barnes’s Sestina 5 in Parthenophil and Parthenophe, in particular, highlight an awareness, on the part of these poets, of the advantages of third-person voices in poetry.
Literary Supernaturalism from the Renaissance to the Gothic

To begin, I want to start by addressing the significance of supernaturalism as a theme that pertains to the textual genres of Petrarchan love poetry and the Gothic. The Oxford English Dictionary defines ‘supernatural’ as belonging to a system that transcends nature, relating to the divine, the occult, magic and the paranormal. Since the advent of Horace Walpole's 'Gothick story' in 1764, ghosts, witches and spectres are thematic motifs that have been firmly aligned with the Gothic. Supernaturalism is of particular significance to the mode's first wave in the eighteenth century. Through these motifs, the effects of supernatural fear were a core conceit of the mode, from depictions of terror in The Mysteries of Udolpho and horror in The Monk.

The influence of early modern writers was especially important to the intellectual ideas surrounding superstition and supernaturalism that surfaced in the novels of Walpole, Radcliffe and Lewis. Shakespearean supernaturalism, for example, is specifically mentioned in the writings of both Walpole and Radcliffe. Drakakis and Townshend’s Gothic Shakespeares (2008) and Desmet and Williams's Shakespearean Gothic (2009) contain essays that have explored in great detail the connections between Shakespearean supernaturalism and the Gothic mode. As Drakakis writes in the introduction to Gothic Shakespeares:

Within a larger context, Shakespeare’s investment in the resources of the supernatural, his predilection for spectres, graveyards, the paraphernalia of death, moving statues, magical transformations and the emphasis on the

---

'non-rational' as a category of human experience all render his plays open to the descriptive term 'Gothic'.

This statement indicates Drakakis’s view of Shakespeare through the critical lens of preposterous history, one that is predicated on the connections between Shakespeare and Gothic novelists of the eighteenth century. This chapter intends to engage with Drakakis’s proposition in two ways: firstly by unpacking the concept of the supernatural in the Gothic mode, and secondly moving beyond these established connections between Shakespeare and the Gothic to evaluate texts by other early modern authors. Drakakis’s mention of a 'larger context' prompts the question as to whether there were other texts from this period that, like Shakespeare’s, demonstrated similar ideas about supernaturalism. My interest in this chapter lies with the genre of Petrarchan love poetry.

This chapter probes the possibilities raised by connections between Gothic and early modern supernaturalism in non-Shakespearean poetic texts. Shakespearean scenes that depict the supernatural—Hamlet's father's ghost, Richard III’s dream sequence, the ghosts in Macbeth—have been studied at length. Supernaturalism in early modern poetry, I propose, often takes on the dimension of counter-Petrarchan discourse, where the supernatural is exploited for particular rhetorical purposes, such as frightening a character. With the concept of Gothic sensibilities in mind, my aim is to explore the startling consequences of these poetic creations. While the depiction of horrified and terrified individuals in poetry might not have the resonance of a stage production, it nevertheless suggests that poets were cognisant of the function of the supernatural as a catalyst for generating states of fear.

In addition to Shakespearean supernaturalism, Edmund Burke’s treatise on the sublime was an eighteenth-century text that informed Gothic novelists’ depiction

---

185 Drakakis and Townshend, 'Introduction', in *Gothic Shakespeares*, 1.
of supernatural fear in their novels. In *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* (1757), Burke writes that obscurity is essential to the generation of terror:

> To make any thing very terrible, obscurity seems in general to be necessary. When we know the full extent of any danger, when we can accustom our eyes to it, a great deal of the apprehension vanishes.\(^{186}\)

Burke proposes that obscurity renders one unable to perceive danger, and as such generates reactions of terror. The supernatural, in particular, terrifies by the indeterminacy of its epistemological status. In other words, not being able to attribute given supernatural phenomena to a source has the capacity to generate effects of terror. Similarly, in Ann Radcliffe’s essay ‘On the Supernatural in Poetry’ (1826), she writes that uncertainty and obscurity ‘accompany’ terror. Obscurity, she proposes, functions by exciting and exaggerating the imagination.\(^{187}\) Terror has been described as the ‘principal engine’ of Horace Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto* and by extension to the Gothic mode, but in this chapter, I seek to expand the dimensions of this defining Gothic trope.\(^{188}\) Early modern poets, like their eighteenth-century counterparts, demonstrated a keen understanding of the effects provoked by superstition and fear of the supernatural.

Ideas surrounding obscurity also assist with understanding the differences between the representation of supernatural occurrences in first-person Petrarchan poems and third-person Gothic novels. In many of the first-person poems analysed in this chapter, readers are privy to poetic speakers’ actions through these speakers’ words. These speakers demonstrate some sort of mastery over the supernatural and explicate their actions to their audiences. Burke writes that knowledge of a threat

---


alleviates apprehension towards that threat and a distinct lack of obscurity and suspense is what is featured in these poetic texts. Unlike third-person narratives that immerse readers in the perspective of someone who experiences the effects of supernatural fear, these first-person poems are presented from the perspective of individuals who generate fear rather than experience it. As such, the element of obscurity that accompanies representations of Gothic supernaturalism is absent in first-person poems. In some instances, such as John Donne's 'The Apparition' and Barnabe Barnes's Sestina 5 from *Parthenophil and Parthenophe*, poets demonstrate attempts at moving towards a third-person narrative style. In this move towards a more narrative structural form, these poems have much in common with third-person Gothic narratives.

In addition to obscurity, another concept that is useful for demarcating the differences between Gothic supernaturalism and Petrarchan supernaturalism is Tzvetan Todorov's idea of 'hesitation'. Todorov writes that when one is confronted by an experience that transcends the laws of nature, one experiences a form of hesitation. It is this element of 'hesitation' that accompanies representations of the supernatural in the Gothic, where characters are uncertain if what they are seeing/experiencing belongs to the natural or supernatural world. First-person poems that feature poetic speakers attempting to generate fear lack an element of 'hesitation', as the source of supernatural occurrences can be attributed to an explainable source.

A part of this chapter is a comparison of early modern poetic speakers with the character archetype of Gothic villains. These speakers’ love melancholy drive

---


190 Scholars have proposed a reading of Gothic characters as 'villains'. Elaine Hartnell-Mottram sees the Gothic villain archetype as one that is doomed by fate, paralleling the tragic heroes of the classical tradition. Elaine Hartnell-Mottram, 'Fate,' in *The Encyclopedia of the Gothic*, 229. William Hughes states that the Gothic villain-hero (or 'Gothic Hero' in his words) exemplifies one of the paradoxes of the
them to react against their beloveds in startling and transgressive ways. Indeed, as I will examine, early modern poetic speakers, mirroring their eighteenth-century counterparts, epitomise the transgressive effects of desire. Fear, for these speakers, denotes a form of poetic currency. Corinne J. Saunders comments on supernaturalism in late medieval literature:

> The intersection of ideas and imaginings about magic and the supernatural is a potent mixture, shaping worlds that are profoundly creative, that capture the imagination and in turn inspire the fictions of the future.191

This chapter extrapolates Saunders's proposition about ideas of the supernatural, in a study of early modern poetic texts. She recognises a broader engagement with supernaturalism that charts a line of influence from the late Middle Ages onward, a point that is perhaps most applicable in a reading of how early modern supernaturalism influenced the authoring of Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto*. As Joseph Addison wrote in *The Spectator* (1712):

> The ancients have not much of this poetry among them, for indeed, almost the whole substance of it owes its original to the darkness and superstitions of later ages [...]. Our forefathers looked upon nature with much reverence and horror, before the world was enlightened by learning and philosophy, and loved to astonish themselves with the apprehensions of witchcraft, prodigies, charms and enchantments.192

For Addison, authors of the early modern period embraced representations of the supernatural in their writings as a pleasurable form of 'astonishment'. Indeed, what Addison writes of as 'apprehensions of witchcraft' forming one aspect of this

---


dynamic engagement with supernaturalism is one of the key concerns of this chapter. The second section of this chapter analyses the subject of witchcraft in conjunction with the genre of Petrarchan love poetry.

Moving away from prose fiction, I suggest that ideas about magic and the supernatural were also instrumental in the creation of poetic texts in addition to works in prose. Utilisation of the poetic imagination, in particular, was of particular importance to writers of the Renaissance. In this regard, depictions of imaginative phenomena such as the supernatural were regarded by writers of the period as exercises in poetic wit.

For early modern literary critics, representations of the supernatural in the poetic imagination were synonymous with a form of innovation. Sir Philip Sidney extolled the power of the imagination in An Apology for Poetry, making specific references to forms that 'were never in nature'. In this text, Sidney proposes that creativity allows one to transcend the 'limitations' of Nature:

Only the poet, disdaining to be tied to any such subjection, lifted up with the vigour of his own invention, doth grow into effect another nature, in making things either better than Nature bringeth forth, or, quite anew, forms such as never were in Nature, as the Heroes, Demigods, Cyclops, Chimeras, Furies, and such like: so as he goeth hand in hand with Nature, not enclosed within the narrow warrant of her gifts, but freely ranging only within the zodiac of his own wit. 194

---

193 An important trend in early modern supernatural literature that began in the 1590s was the vogue for ghost complaint poetry. These texts, based off the collection The Mirror For Magistrates (1559), that was curated by William Baldwin, were instructional poems that depicted narrations of various dead literary and historical figures, who gave accounts of their lives and deaths. The final chapter in this thesis will address 'The Complaint of Rosamond', one text inspired by the ghost complaint genre. For more on the ghost complaint genre, see Donald Jefferson, 'The Spectral Historiopoetics of the Mirror for Magistrates', in Journal of the Northern Renaissance, Iss.2, No.1, (2010), 54-71.

194 Sidney. An Apology for Poetry, 100.
Nature offers the poet a template, a basis to draw inspiration from, but for Sidney, Nature itself is a 'narrow warrant'. The supernatural characters and creatures from the classical tradition listed by Sidney are a host of imaginary phenomena that can be deployed by a poet. Sidney’s observations suggest an acceptance of both 'natural' and 'non-natural' forms in literary creation. Similarly, Elizabethan critic George Puttenham writes that the creation of what he described as 'counterfeit representations' was telling of a 'greater wit' and 'sharper invention' than an adherence to reality:

> And if the things we covet to describe be not natural or not veritable, than yet the same asketh more cunning to do it, because to feign a thing that never was nor is like to be, proceeded of a greater wit and sharper invention than to describe things that be true.\(^{195}\)

Puttenham’s description of 'not natural' and 'not veritable' things marks an early modern critic’s recognition of supernaturalism as a form of literary currency. Puttenham and Sidney’s writings illustrate a commendation of the poet’s faculties of imagination in creating 'non-natural' creatures and phenomena as a demonstration of wit and creativity. These observations and comments suggest an engagement with supernatural themes that are founded on creativity. Realism, for the poet, is eschewed in favour of the speculative dimension afforded by unexplainable phenomena.

The capacity to imagine phenomena that transcend the limits of Nature formed one aspect of an intellectual engagement with supernaturalism and superstition in the early modern period. Saunders notes that tensions between positive and negative ideas of magic that emerged in the early modern period, such as 'natural', Neoplatonic magical philosophy, contrasted with fears of demonic magic.\(^{196}\) On the one hand, there was a ‘natural’, scholastic dimension to

---

\(^{195}\) Puttenham, *Art of English Poesy*, 323.

representations of magic and on the other, a fear that magic could be used to subvert the order of Nature itself. In addition, ghost sightings and accounts of the supernatural often formed the central topic of seventeenth-century pamphleteers and the period's popular press.\textsuperscript{197}

Given these cultural factors, how was the early modern poet to reconcile these ideas with the transgressive aspects of magic and superstition? What is arguably more important in these texts is how poets used these tropes. I propose that poets' use of supernatural themes in early modern poetry act as a conduit for the exploration of emotional affect. Working within the paradigms of the Petrarchan poetic tradition, a secondary objective emerges in the works of early modern love poets. The evocation of fear in these texts lies at the heart of representations of ghosts and witchcraft in early modern love poetry.

In his \textit{Apology}, Sir Philip Sidney uses the term 'move' to describe the affective potential of poetic texts:

\begin{quote}
For that a feigned example hath as much force to teach as a true example (for as to move, it is clear, since the feigned may be tuned to the highest key of passion) \ldots.\textsuperscript{198}
\end{quote}

For Sidney, the deployment of these examples in a poetical work displays an attempt to elevate or embellish that which already occurs in Nature. His mention of fictional texts as having the capacity to evoke the 'highest key of passion' foreshadows the Gothic mode's preoccupation with the representation of heightened emotional states such as terror and horror. In essence, Sidney is championing the affective power of poetry as one that has the power to transcend realism. As James Williams comments on Sidney's \textit{Apology}:

\begin{quote}
\textsuperscript{197} Andrea Brady, 'Ghostly Authorities,' in \textit{Gothic Renaissance}, 181.

\textsuperscript{198} Sidney, \textit{Apology for Poetry}, 93.
\end{quote}
Sidney's commendation of the moving quality of poetry (to use a term from a present-day idiom) brings us very close to a strain of critical discourse in the early modern period that celebrated poetry for its ability to induce in the reader a state of mute wonderment and a suspension of his capacity of reason.\textsuperscript{199}

Sidney extols the power of poetic imagination and he commends the poet’s ability to derive fantastic creatures such as ‘Cyclops, Chimeras and Furies’. More importantly, as Williams notes, Sidney’s purpose of introducing these supernatural phenomena in poetry is the exploitation of these tropes for their affective potential. Indeed, it is the affect-inducing potential of supernaturalism in poetry that allows for the comparison of early modern texts with the affective function of Gothic texts. While the Gothic mode is regarded as a textual mode that capitalises on emotional transactions, Sidney’s writings mark a clear awareness of the workings of emotional affect in literature that precede the Gothic. James A. Williams’s reading of Sidney’s supernaturalism as a means of generating responses that run counter to notions of reason is an important observation. The idea of supernaturalism as a counterpoint to reason resurfaces prominently in the Gothic mode.

A keen understanding of the affective potential of horror and terror characterises early modern poets’ efforts at depicting the supernatural. It is this awareness of the functioning of affect that resurfaces in the Gothic mode several centuries later. Fear of the supernatural has been a constant part of an English cultural consciousness and this chapter aims to contextualise and evaluate the representation of literary fear in a genre that predates the Gothic.\textsuperscript{200} Through an analysis of love poetry, this chapter enlarges and enriches our cultural and historical


understanding of a timeless fascination with ghosts, witches, incantations and revenants.

The analysis of supernatural fear in early modern poetry undertaken in this chapter resonates with far-reaching implications for both the Gothic mode and the contemporary genre of horror film. Across the genres of horror film, Gothic novels and Renaissance love poetry, explorations of supernatural fear speak of a constant preoccupation and fascination with the supernatural that has persisted in literary culture throughout the ages. This recurring interest in supernaturalism can be described as a recycling of cultural energies, where an 'archaic' interest in the supernatural in early modern culture inspires eighteenth-century Gothic novelists, and subsequently contemporary filmmakers.201 Robert Eggers' recent horror film The Witch (2015), with its early modern setting in the 1630s, stands out as an exemplar of how 'archaic' fears of the supernatural are articulated in contemporary popular culture.

Supernatural Forms and Repetition in the Gothic and Early Modern Poetry

Scholarship on supernaturalism in the Gothic is well-developed. My interest in this section of the chapter is the analysis of a specific quality that underpins the representation of supernatural elements in Gothic texts: its poetic quality. I begin by outlining the connections between supernaturalism and the poetic technique of repetition in Gothic texts.

Repetition in the Gothic mode manifests as either part of the formal construction of texts, as part of the themes that underpin a text, or both. At the

201 Bronfen and Neumaier, 'Introduction,' in Gothic Renaissance, 4.
textual level, repetition consists of the formal components of a text such as repeated phrases, statements and descriptions. The repeated utterances of a ghost, for example, can be interpreted as a textual form of repetition. Repeated forms are especially prevalent in constructions of supernaturalism as they are used to provide emphasis. Before vanishing, the ghost of Hamlet’s father repeats the word ‘adieu’ before telling Hamlet to remember him. The phrase ‘remember thee’ is subsequently repeated by Hamlet several times in the following speech, a testament to the effect generated by linguistic repetition.

The exchange between Hamlet and his father’s ghost is mirrored in Horace Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto*, when fear of the supernatural is conveyed through repeated statements. As David B. Morris outlines in his essay on Gothic sublimity, repetition is a dominant figure of speech in Walpole’s novel. One of the first instances of this in Walpole’s text takes place when a host of servants in the castle of Otranto are driven to flee in fear when they encounter a horrific occurrence—the killing of the castle’s heir Conrad by the helmet of the ghostly Alfonso. The servants’ fear is translated into a host of repeated statements that convey their fear:

The fellow made no answer, but continued pointing towards the courtyard; and at last, after repeated questions put to him, cried out, ‘Oh! the helmet! the helmet!’

A volley of voices replied, ‘Oh! my Lord! the Prince! the Prince! the helmet! the helmet!’

The servants’ reactions, particularly the repetition of the phrase ‘the helmet’, are structured towards generating a reactive response of terror from the text’s readers. Repetition of the phrase focuses readers’ attention onto the supernatural object that is the source of the servants’ fear. The alliterative description that is used by Walpole

---


to describe the servants' responses—a 'volley of voices', further adds to the feel of apprehension generated by their enunciations. Indeed, what also occurs at the level of the text is a 'spreading' of the servants' horror to Manfred. Echoing the effects of the Ghost's repeated words on Hamlet, the servants' repeated statements and horrified reactions prompt a response from Manfred is that of both shock and horror. He is stricken with terror, and 'dreads' the unknown phenomenon that is the source of his servants' distress.  

An evaluation of the interactions between Manfred and his servants draws attention to the thematic function of repetition in Gothic texts. The concept of 'repetition compulsion', in particular, is a useful critical tool that affords an understanding of supernaturalism in the Gothic mode and early modern poetry. The term 'repetition compulsion' originates from Sigmund Freud's work on the pleasure principle. Repression of trauma, Freud writes, has the effect of causing one to repeat repressed material as an experience.  

Ghost stories in the Gothic tradition exemplify this concept as they depict ghosts returning from the dead to revisit spaces of trauma. The significance of this idea of a 'return' in conjunction with a compulsion is twofold. Firstly, the appearance of ghosts symbolises a return from a state of death to the world of the living. Secondly, ghosts' haunting of a particular location signifies a fixation with a specific aspect of the living world, such as a place.

The supernatural forces that prevent Manfred from usurping the throne of Otranto in The Castle of Otranto constitute one example of thematic repetition. Andrea Juransovsky writes that the 'compulsive appearance' of Manfred's ghostly ancestors serve to subvert the villain's goals, and many of the supernatural elements...

---

204 Walpole, The Castle of Otranto, 18.


206 Andrew Smith, Gothic Literature, 185.
in Walpole’s text are experienced by Manfred.\textsuperscript{207} During an attempt at seizing the Princess Isabella, the ghost of his grandfather emerges from a portrait, filling Manfred with ‘anxiety and horror’.\textsuperscript{208} The enchanted helmet of Alfonso that kills the character Conrad at the start of the text is shrouded in plumes that become agitated constantly in the presence of Manfred.\textsuperscript{209}

The role of repetition in representations of the supernatural is also prevalent in Ann Radcliffe’s \textit{The Mysteries of Udolpho}. In this instance, the trope of repetition exemplifies the \textit{response} to a supernatural threat rather than the source of the threat itself, where the text’s protagonist demonstrates a compulsion to actively seek out the source of her fear. One sequence sees the protagonist dreading the presence of a mysterious figure that makes repeated appearances on the battlements of the Castle di Udolpho.\textsuperscript{210} The figure glides and makes ‘not even a foot-fall’, provoking the suggestion to Emily that it is a ghost. Emily’s reaction to a supposed supernatural phenomenon is one that is a combination of curiosity and dread. Each night, she returns to the same spot on the battlements hoping to catch a glimpse of the ‘ghost’, but constantly wavers between dread and fascination.

After the first night, Emily resolves to confront the figure, returning to the same spot the following day. Despite her ‘irresistible interest’ in confronting the ghost, she is gripped with terror, leading her to shun confronting the figure.\textsuperscript{211} Her train of thoughts then lead her to imagine that the form is the ghost of her aunt:

She then thought of her unfortunate aunt, and, shuddering with grief and horror, the suggestions of imagination seized her mind with all the force of

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{207} Andrea Juranovsky, ‘Trauma Reenactment in the Gothic Loop: A Study in Structures of Circularity in Gothic Fiction,’ \textit{Inquiries} 6, no. 5 (2014): 2.
  \item \textsuperscript{208} Walpole, \textit{The Castle of Otranto}, 25.
  \item \textsuperscript{209} Walpole, \textit{The Castle of Otranto}, 54–58.
  \item \textsuperscript{210} Radcliffe, \textit{The Mysteries of Udolpho}, 356.
  \item \textsuperscript{211} Radcliffe, \textit{The Mysteries of Udolpho}, 360.
\end{itemize}
truth, and she believed, that the form she had seen was supernatural. She
trembled, breathed with difficulty, an icy coldness touched her cheeks, and
her fears for a while overcame her judgment. Her resolution now forsook her,
and she determined, if the figure should appear, not to speak to it.

At the end of her contemplations, she is determined to 'repeat the watch' the next
night. Emily’s actions here act as a subtext for the supernatural’s allure. Suffering
from a repetition compulsion, Emily is compelled to revisit the site of her terror over
and over again.

Finally, repetition in certain Gothic texts, such as Lewis’s The Monk,
constitutes a fusion of both textual and thematic forms, and it is this fusion of both
form and theme that forms the central focus of my interest in this chapter. As I will
subsequently demonstrate, across early modern Petrarchan poetry and the Gothic,
combinations of thematic and textual repetition are used to act as a commentary on
the effects of supernaturalism.

A prime example of this is the construction of supernatural horror in Lewis’s
text. The trope of returning from the dead to haunt a lover is the central subject of
Lewis’s ballad ‘Alonzo The Brave and Fair Imogine’ in The Monk. In this ballad, the
knight Alonzo returns from the grave as a ghost to enact his revenge on his
unfaithful betrothed Imogine. Taking his place next to Imogine, Alonzo is initially
unrecognisable, but removes his visor, revealing a ‘skeleton’s head’. Lewis uses
techniques of repetition in this poetic fragment to describe the undead Alonzo's
horrifying appearance and the reaction of Imogine’s guests:

All present then uttered a terrified shout;
All turned with disgust from the scene.
The worms, They crept in, and the worms, They crept out,
And sported his eyes and his temples about,

212 Radcliffe, The Mysteries of Udolpho, 360.
Lewis utilises repetition to detail two things in this stanza. The first of these is the description of Alonzo. The repeated inflection of line 59 draws attention to the appearance of Alonzo, where Lewis evokes horror by drawing specific attention to the locomotion of the worms that are in Alonzo's face. The effect is followed up in the next line, where repetition allows Lewis to describe the extent of the worms' invasive movements. At the same time, Lewis also uses repetition to describe the reaction of the crowd to Alonzo's horrifying appearance and his description of Alonzo. The inclusion of the crowd's 'terrified shout' and disgusted reactions sketch out potential affective responses to Alonzo's grotesque appearance. The repetition of 'all' in lines 57 and 58 describe a response to Alonzo's visage that prompts a similar response from a reader.

Repetition is used by Lewis as a technique for framing both the visible as well as aural dimension of Alonzo's supernatural threat. The repetition of the phrases 'the worms' and the description of the creeping motion made by the worms draw particular attention to the unnaturalness of Alonzo's undead appearance. Following from this, the ghostly Alonzo then speaks:

\[
\text{Behold me, Thou false one! Behold me!'} \text{ He cried;} \\
'\text{Remember Alonzo the Brave!} \quad (62–63)
\]

Speaking in repeated phrases, the ghost identifies itself as the spectre of Alonzo before carting Imogine off to her fate. These reiterated phrases punctuate the horrifying implications of seeing one's lover return from the dead. Compelled to revisit the same site over and over again, the doomed couple re-enact the scene of Alonzo's return, with the narrator stating that this re-enactment takes place 'at midnight four times a year'.

---

An analysis of another poem in Lewis's text reveals his use of both formal and thematic motifs in the construction of horror through the use of repetition. This section of Lewis's text is particular interesting as it combines the lyrical form of poetry within the text's primary form of prose. His characters' speech acts are delivered in verse, affording the use of repeated, lyrical phrases that detail a character's interactions with a ghost. In this sequence from Lewis's text, Don Raymond mistakes the ghost of the Bleeding Nun for his lover Agnes. He is subsequently haunted by the Nun, who visits him on a nightly basis. The fusion of both prose and verse in Lewis's text points to the author's interest in the emotional cadences that are afforded by verse form. Raymond speaks to the ghost in verse, a conversation that involves the repetition of several key phrases:

Agnes! Agnes! Thou art mine!
Agnes! Agnes! I am thine!
In my veins while blood shall roll,
Thou art mine!
I am thine!
Thine my body! Thine my soul!214

Mistaking the ghost for Agnes, Raymond is soon accosted by the Nun, and she imitates him in a response that mirrors his previous enunciation:

Raymond! Raymond! Thou art mine!
Raymond! Raymond! I am thine!
In thy veins while blood shall roll,
I am thine!
Thou art mine!
Mine thy body! Mine thy soul!——215

Transfixed by the Nun's words, Raymond is paralysed with horror as he is plagued with both the sight of the Nun and the horrifying effect of his own words being echoed by the entity. The interesting aspect of this exchange between Raymond and the Nun is its being written entirely in verse form. The singsong rhythmic quality of the six lines creates an effect that transcends the visual impression of the Nun's visitation. The sight of the Nun afflicts Don Raymond with a horror that is 'too great to be described' and the sound of her enunciations is described as a set of 'fatal words repeated'. The combination of the ghost's appearance and its words thus result in its adverse effects on Don Raymond, a constant agitation of the mind and 'habitual melancholy'.

Lewis's detailing of Don Raymond's interactions with the Nun is important to the analysis undertaken in this chapter as well as the thesis's broader aims, because it demarcates the importance of poeticity in the Gothic mode. The exchange symbolises the author's recognition of the intrinsic value of poetic techniques despite the fact that he is writing in the textual form of the novel. By combining the older literary form of poetry with the structure of a novel, Lewis's text makes use of the qualities afforded by verse form—a more nuanced delivery of ideas that assists with the generation of emotional effects.

Don Raymond's haunting, the return of Alonzo from the grave, Emily's hallucinations and the giant ghost of Alfonso are representations of the supernatural in Gothic texts that detail the intrusion of the supernatural into the ordinary. Characters in these texts find themselves face to face with unexplainable phenomena. Similar techniques of repetition and the elicitation of fear deployed by Gothic novelists are used by Renaissance poets in their construction of literary supernaturalism. On the other hand, representations of the supernatural in early modern poetry manifest as demonstrations of power rather than incursions of the supernatural into the ordinary. First-person poems detail efforts made by poetic speakers at generating terror and horror in their addressees. Through these first-
person addresses, we get a glimpse into the disturbing potential of individuals’ mastery of the supernatural as a conduit for the generation of emotional effects.

In a similar vein to depictions of ghosts in Gothic texts, the poetic examples that are about to be discussed conform to this notion of a compulsion to repeat, as they feature lovers returning from the dead or imagining themselves as ghosts. The construction of these texts and the characterisation of these poetic speakers also reveal a repetition compulsion. Repeated phrases, images, words and statements demonstrate these speakers’ preoccupation with tonal consistencies that feed into the poems’ broader thematic notions of compulsiveness.

Desire and the horrific are interconnected in George Gascoigne’s poem ‘The Anatomye of a Lover’. Published in *A Hundreth Sundry Flowres* in 1573, George Gascoigne’s poem details the transformation of a lover into a form that resembles a ghost. As a consequence of his beloved’s inaction and scorn, Gascoigne’s speaker experiences physiological deterioration and death. Returning from the grave, the speaker exhibits a compulsion to haunting his beloved that is characterised by repetition and exaggeration.

Gascoigne begins the poem by representing himself as having the wasted appearance that resembles that of a ghost or a walking corpse:

If first my feeble head, have so much matter left,
If fansies raging force have not, his feeble skill bereft.
These lockes that hang unkempt, these hollowe dazled eyes,
These chattering teeth, this trembling tongue, well tewed with carefull cries.
These wan and wrinkled cheekes, wel washt with waves of woe,
Maye stand for patterne of a ghost, where so this carkasse goe.
These shoulders they sustaine, the yoake of heavy care,
And on my brused broken backe, the burden must I beare.\textsuperscript{216}

\textit{(The Anatomye of a Lover': 5–12)}

The poet/speaker compares his physical form to that of a ghost's wasted appearance. His description of his self in lines five to eleven demonstrate a copious use of alliteration and repetition, to the point where the repeated tonal consistencies in each line generate a sense of excess. Multiple lines begin with the same word—'if' and 'these'. The 'f' sound (the word pairs of 'first' and 'feeble', 'fansies', and 'force') is repeated in the opening syllables of lines five and six. The 't' sound is repeated in line eight (teeth, tongue, tewed). The poet/speaker's display of exaggeration arguably is most evident in lines nine and twelve, lines that are dominated purely by alliterated sounds.

Repetition of the 'w' sound in line nine and the 'b' sound in line twelve accentuates the poet's deliberate word choice. These choices suggest a very conscious effort at adhering to a sense of regularity that seemingly contradicts the poet's haphazard use of alliteration throughout the poem. The speaker's exaggerated tone switches from impersonal to a more personal one as the poem progresses:

My lights and lunges like bellowes blow, & sighes ascend for smoake.
My secreete partes are so with secreete sorrowe soken,
As for the secreete shame thereof, deserves not to be spoken,
My thighes, my knees, my legges, and last of all my feete,
To serve a lovers turne, are so unable and unmeete [...]. (18–22)

By using the more personal pronoun 'my' instead of 'these' in these lines, the poet claims the adverse effects of desire affects him directly. Despite the shift demonstrated in these lines, the pattern established in the previous section of the poem is followed here. Alliterated phrases in lines nineteen and twenty-one continue Gascoigne's speaker's accentuation on his horrific ghostly appearance.

Up until this point, readers have been presented with copious descriptions of what Gascoigne’s ghost looks like, but it is only towards the end of the poem that his speaker demonstrates some form of agency. The speaker concludes the poem with a horrific image of a ‘hungry corpse’ that seeks out his beloved:

That scarce they sustaine up, this restlesse body well,  
Unlesse it be to see the boure, wherein my love doth dwell,  
And there by sight eftsoone, to feede my gazing eye,  
And so content my hungrie corps, tyll dollours doe me dye [...]. (23–26)

Compelled to revisit the ‘boure’ so that he might be noticed, Gascoigne’s speaker exhibits self-denigration that is an exercise in using counter-Petrarchan language as a demonstration of poetic power. Specifically, this is centred on the poet’s use of fear as a means of obtaining a beloved’s attention. His references to ‘sustaining up’ and ‘restless’ in line twenty-three prompt a reader to the notion of movement and action. Lines twenty-four to twenty-six carry the implication that the speaker actively seeks out his beloved by travelling to her bower to catch sight of her. The poem’s penultimate couplet (lines twenty-five and twenty-six) brings to the fore the horrific implications of the speaker’s act of voyeurism. Gascoigne’s speaker likens himself to an animated corpse that does not consider the ramifications of his wasted, ghostly appearance being seen by his beloved. Line twenty-six ends on a sinister note, as he demonstrates that he is content to stalk his beloved until she reciprocates his affections. His final actions are telling of his unshakeable impulse to return to his beloved, the source of his trauma. Death itself is no obstacle for the speaker as he demonstrates a disturbing persistence to ensure that his efforts are noticed.

Capitalising on the trope of the unrequited Petrarchan lover, Gascoigne’s excessive details also reveal a tone of pleasure at being able to utilise his physical atrophy and horrific likeness as a means of avenging himself upon his beloved, as she has scorned him. Gascoigne’s reliance on the language of excess and striking visual details mark an attempt to generate a response of horror from his beloved.
Thomas Sipos describes horror as the visual language of fear; and the speaker of this poem likewise demonstrates a fixation with visual elements. In striving to induce a reaction of horror from his beloved, Gascoigne’s speaker engages in a form of Petrarchan counterdiscourse. In the Petrarchan tradition, the male suitor is traditionally scorned and/or rejected by his beloved, but Gascoigne subverts this trope by using the evocation of fear as a response to his beloved’s inaction.

Gascoigne’s efforts demonstrate an exploration of the dynamics of supernatural fear, as poets use fear as compelling and disturbing rhetorical strategy as a response to their perceived ill treatment. As Jacqueline Miller writes in her appraisal of Spenser and Sidney’s sonnet sequences:

> The beloved woman contains and exerts an art of her own that, while it inspires and provides a model for the poet, also threatens to subsume, deny or at the least diminish his art. The desired relationship with the lady seems to require that the speaker succumb to the superiority of her poetic; what must be reconciled is his refusal to relinquish the possibility of his creative autonomy and the need (personally and poetically) to acknowledge and conform to the requirements presented by the lady.

Rather than conformity, I contend that early modern poets’ deployment of supernatural fear in their verses marks a concentrated effort at subverting typical Petrarchan strands of poetic discourse. Instead of being subsumed, Gascoigne’s speaker seeks to extract a reaction from his beloved by any means necessary. Gascoigne’s poem, along with other texts to be surveyed in this chapter, indicates that poets were more than willing to turn their beloveds’ scorn against them in displays of supernatural power, reasserting their speakers’ authority through displays that sought to generate responses of fear in their addressees. In presenting

---


218 Jacqueline T. Miller, ""Love Doth Hold My Hand": Writing And Wooing in the Sonnets of Sidney and Spenser’, *ELH* 46, no. 4 (1979): 541.
scenarios that featured orchestrated bids at terrifying and horrify their beloveds, these poets' strategies indicate a nuanced understanding of the dynamics of fear.

Yet ultimately, while Gascoigne's poem draws on the idea of the supernatural through an emphasis on deteriorating corporeality, his speaker's description of himself as 'pattern of a ghost' is a figure of speech that evokes the supernatural rather than depicting it. Todorov writes that the supernatural can be distinguished from the ordinary by what he describes as a form of hesitation that takes place when an individual is confronted by an occurrence that does not conform to the laws of nature.\footnote{Todorov, The Fantastic, 31.} Gascoigne's efforts in this poem parallel that of Ann Radcliffe in *The Mysteries of Udolpho*. Radcliffe, like Gascoigne, draws on the fear of the supernatural without actually including any discernible supernatural elements in her text. In Gascoigne's poem, while the intent of the poet is evoking the supernatural, it is merely used as a figure of speech. Gascoigne's use of the supernatural is in a comparative context—whether his speaker has truly become a ghost is debatable. Regardless of whether his poetic self is a real ghost or otherwise, Gascoigne displays an awareness of how the supernatural might be used to elicit emotional effects; in this example, one of horror at his wasted physical appearance. The epistemological status of the speaker of 'Anatomy of a Lover' is irrelevant, as what the poet is ultimately trying to achieve is a reaction of fear from his beloved.

If Gascoigne's poem relies on a comparison with the supernatural, the opposite approach is taken by John Donne in his poem 'The Apparition'. In 'The Apparition', the supernatural is used as more than a figure of speech. The speaker of this poem imagines himself as a ghost. The supernatural 'solicitation' depicted here features similar tropes to the persistence of Gascoigne's horrifying corpse-ghost in 'Anatomy of a Lover'. Donne's speaker constructs a scenario where the supernatural
is used as an uber-Petrarchan technique for eliciting an effect of horror in an individual.\footnote{My use of the term ‘uber-Petrarchan’ draws from Zimmermann’s reading of exaggerated Petrarchan tropes in metaphysical early modern poetry. See Ulrike Zimmermann, ‘Bright Hair and Brittle Bones: Gothic Affinities in Metaphysical Poetry,’ in \textit{Gothic Renaissance}, 161.}

The poem begins with the speaker exaggerating the effects of his beloved’s scorn. He will die and turn into a ghost. Like Gascoigne’s lover, Donne’s speaker imagines returning from the dead to haunt his beloved, acting out a compulsion for repetition from beyond the grave. After the first line, the structure of Donne’s poem is comprised of repeated uses of the conjunction ‘and’:

\begin{verbatim}
When by thy scorne, O murdresse, I am dead,
And that thou thinkst thee free
From all solicitation from mee,
Then shall my ghost come to thy bed,
And thee, fain’d vestall, in worse armes shall see;
Then thy sicke taper will begin to winke […]\footnote{Donne, \textit{The Elegies} and \textit{The Songs and Sonnets}, 43.}  \end{verbatim}  ('The Apparition': 1–6)

The speaker’s entrance into his mistress’s chamber is marked by the flickering of a candle. Describing his incursion in line six, Donne generates a feel of terror by using ‘t’ and ‘w’ sounds. The sounds create an aural effect that synchronises with the atmospheric image of the winking taper, creating a foreboding atmosphere of terror that precedes the appearance of the speaker’s ghost.

Repetitive form is also used in this section as a means of conveying the poet/speaker’s objective of using his supernatural form to horrify. After his initial exaggerated claim in the poem’s first line, the repeated ‘th’ sound in the second line contributes to a build up of tonal regularity and creates suspense. The tension built up in line two is continued by Donne’s use of the ‘free’, ‘me’ rhyming word pair, culminating in his exclamation of intent in the fourth line. Immediately after the
subsiding of suspense in line four, the poet asserts that there is more to come. The repeated 'and' and 'then' word pairs point to Donne's exertion of control over his beloved as they suggest an underlying sense of order behind the speaker's narration. In other words, by implying that 'this will happen', the poet/speaker's narrative voice itself is organised toward provoking a response from his victim.

Donne's exertion of supernatural horror then becomes literalised in the next few lines as he points out how his victim will be frozen in fear. This is coupled with a demonstration of supernatural power when he charms the victim's lover into an artificial sleep. After demonstrating his control over his addressee (and her lover), he then expounds on the affective response that results from his solicitation:

And he, whose thou art then, being tyr'd before,
Will, if thou stirre, or pinch to wake him, thinke
Thou call'st for more,
And in false sleepe will from thee shrinke,
And then poore Aspen wretch, neglected thou
Bath'd in a cold quicksilver sweat wilt lye
A veryer ghost then I [...]. (7–13)

The repetition that frames the first half of the poem follows from its initial trajectory, with the word 'and' used in lines seven, ten and eleven. Donne proposes that the effect horror induces in his victim will ravage her physiologically to an almost unrecognisable state. The phrase 'A veryer ghost then I' that describes Donne's victim's appearance is one of the shortest lines in the poem. Its brevity serves to punctuate the extent of the victim's ravaged appearance—the cause of which is attributed to the speaker. In a perverse twist, the speaker has turned his beloved into a likeness that resembles his own. He exaggerates the physical appearance of his beloved as being 'bathed' in sweat, an experience that translates the emotional effects of terror and horror into physiological responses.
The physiological response of profuse sweating also signifies Donne's awareness of the affective dimensions of fear. By anticipating his victim's response, Donne's scenario 'doubles' the level of fear that is caused by envisioning himself as a ghost. The image of his beloved as a 'veryer ghost' bookends the poem by once again presenting a reader with the exaggerated image of an individual turned into a ghost. Line thirteen in particular is charged with ambiguity, as it is uncertain whether the speaker has horrified his addressee to death, or if it is a figure of speech. Regardless of the outcome, Donne's focus on the affective consequences of horror through a controlled display of power is a compelling example of a Gothic sensibility demonstrated in an early modern poetic work.

The poem's final section, however, reminds readers that Donne's narrative is but an artificial construction. It concludes with Donne's speaker withholding from speaking. In doing this, the speaker's attempt at horrifying his beloved is heightened. This section of the poem demonstrates Donne's awareness of the nuances of emotional affect by manipulating a speech act (or lack thereof) for the purposes of generating a heightened reaction from his victim:

What I will say, I will not tell thee now,
Lest that preserve thee; and since my love is spent,
I'had rather thou shouldst painfully repent,
Then by my threatnings rest still innocent. (14–17)

His speaker recognises that if he speaks, his plan to frighten his beloved will be revealed. As a consequence, his victim's fear will be abated. His threat is heightened by the forceful resonance of the rhyme scheme repeated in lines fifteen to seventeen. Donne's choice of silence is an effort to generate further uncertainty as to his identity so that his victim will remain terrified of him. In abstaining from speech, Donne demonstrates cognisance of the functioning of terror. Lawrence Perrine observes that

silence is one of the techniques used by Donne in generating an effect of terror from his victim:

But he is gambling on the psychological principle that an unknown threat is more frightening than a known one. Thus the speaker does not reveal what the ghost will say, first because he does not know, and second because not telling will be more frightening than telling. 223

Perrine’s observation highlights Donne’s cognisance of exploiting the technique of fear. In this instance, it is a nuanced awareness that considers, very carefully, the consequences of his actions from the point of view of his addressee. The first-person voice utilised in Donne’s poem orients readers to a carefully orchestrated attempt at garnering a response of fear from his addressee. Throughout the poem, Donne’s speaker chooses his actions and speech (or lack thereof) in a carefully planned way so as to elicit the most acute reaction possible from his victim. From envisioning a sweating victim to capitalising on the affective potential of silence, ‘The Apparition’ reads as a narrative sequence that would not feel out of place in a Gothic novel or perhaps even a contemporary horror film.

In a consideration of the differences between Gothic novels’ third-person perspectives and poems’ first-person perspectives, Donne’s ‘The Apparition’ reads as an interesting acknowledgement of the limitations of writing in the first-person voice. The Petrarchan poet/speaker is presented with a dilemma—how might one construct a scenario depicting the effects of supernatural fear if one has to write in the present tense? Unlike, for example, ‘Anatomye of a Lover’, Donne’s use of the future tense in ‘The Apparition’ marks a divergence from the present tense that love poems are traditionally voiced in. Readers take the speaker at his word, that he is indeed dead and is speaking to his beloved as a ghost. Like Gascoigne, Donne is capitalising on the theme of the supernatural to elicit a reaction from his beloved, but Donne is

clear—his speaker is dead and has returned from the grave. In this regard, the use of future tense offers an opportunity for Donne to act as both character and narrator, telling us what he will do to his victim as well as how she reacts to him. The resultant effect is one that is, compared to the forms of narrative suspense in the Gothic novel, of a lower register than in a third-person narrative.

In addition to the difference in registers across both textual modes, another set of differences and similarities between 'The Apparition', 'Anatomye of a Lover', and the three Gothic texts surveyed emerge as a result of this comparison across both literary modes. While Lewis’s Alonzo and Bleeding Nun from The Monk are supernatural characters who speak, Gascoigne’s poem relies heavily on the dimension of sight for evoking horror. For example, Gascoigne’s ghostly lover stalks his beloved but is never intrusive:

And there by sight eftsoone, to feede my gazing eye,
And so content my hungrie corps, tyll dollours doe me dye […].

('The Anatomye of a Lover': 25–26)

Gascoigne’s poem presents a focus on the visual aspect of supernaturalism as a technique for the generation of fear. This is unsurprising given that Renaissance thought, influenced by the intellectual traditions of the classical tradition and Neoplatonism, regarded sight as the most valued of the senses.224 An emphasis on sight also signifies an adherence to Petrarchan poetic conventionality, as Petrarch favoured the sense of sight as preeminent in the experience of love.225 However, for Donne’s speaker in 'The Apparition', both sight and speech are equally as important to the generation of fear:

What I will say, I will not tell thee now,

---


Donne’s speaker’s efforts combine the immediacy of the dimension of sight with the power of speech. While the poem’s speaker withholds from speaking, his awareness of what he is doing marks a recognition of the power wielded by that withholding. Donne’s construction of supernaturalism here echoes Lewis’s efforts in *The Monk*—the ghostly Alonzo and Bleeding Nun in his text are supernatural entities that speak to their victims.

The characterisation of early modern poet/speakers as individuals who seek to provoke reactions of fear in their addressees and by extension their audiences, allows for the reading of these speakers as similar to Gothic villains such as Walpole’s Manfred, Radcliffe’s Montoni and Lewis’s Ambrosio. The ghostly characters in early modern poetry use supernatural fear as a tool for provoking reactions. These actions echo the Gothic villain’s relentless pursuit of female characters who do not reciprocate their affections. More importantly, Frederick Frank writes that the Gothic villain’s characterisation comes from the tensions between orthodoxy and the passions, an interpretation of this character archetype that I seek to explore further:

The Gothic villain is a two-sided personality, a figure of great power and latent virtue whose chosen career of evil is the result of a clash between his passionate nature and the unnatural restraints of conventions, orthodoxy and tradition.226

A marked shift away from the Petrarchan lover’s clichéd passivity, I propose, presents the possibility of codifying these speakers as characters not unlike the villainous male characters that populate Gothic texts. Presenting alternatives to the 'orthodoxy' represented by the subservient Petrarchan character archetype, poets’

---

concerted efforts to shock and unnerve their perceived beloveds lead to the creation of expositions that frame their beloveds as victims. The victimisation of poetic addressees by male characters in this literary genre, I suggest, parallels the representation of victims in the Gothic who suffer from the effects of supernatural terror and horror.

Witchcraft and Fear in Early Modern Love Poetry and the Gothic

In addition to imagining themselves as ghosts returning from the dead to haunt their beloveds, another element of the supernatural utilised by early modern poets as a technique for evoking fear is witchcraft. These efforts contrast the passive stance adopted by speakers of Donne's 'The Apparition' and Gascoigne's 'Anatomye'. As Sibylle Baumbach observes, the use of themes pertaining to witchcraft in the sonnet tradition allows readers to partake of a fascination with the supernatural whilst concealing its taboo subject matter in the rigidities of poetic form.227 I will add that these poets' use of 'taboo subjects' is centred on the use of supernaturalism in the generation of fear. Rather than seeing poetic form, as Baumbach writes, as a 'rigid' medium, I suggest that the lyrical qualities of verse allow it to be a literary medium that allows an elaboration of the theme of witchcraft. The poet/speakers of Michael Drayton's 'Cupid Conjured', Edmund Spenser's 'Epithalamion' and Barnabe Barnes's Sestina 5 from Parthenophil and Parthenophe drew from the discourse of witchcraft in their verses as a means of rectifying the perceived ills wrought on them by their beloveds.

227 Sibylle Baumbach, Literature and Fascination (Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 75.
These poets’ use of witchcraft as a means of evoking fear is unsurprising, given that a fascination with witchcraft dominated cultural discourses in early modern England.\textsuperscript{228} The Hermetic philosopher and renowned occultist John Dee, who advised Queen Elizabeth, was an avid collector of texts pertaining to the occult, and a scholarly figure.\textsuperscript{229} Peter French compares Dee to Sidney’s conception of the magus, remarking that Sidney’s poet and the Hermetic magus are ‘extraordinarily close’ in their conceptions of the imagination.\textsuperscript{230} It is thus unsurprising that poets would have looked to Dee as a real life inspirational figure exemplifying the concept of the Renaissance magus.

In addition to this larger-than life figure, numerous works were published in the period that explicitly dealt with the subject of witchcraft. One of the most prominent of these was King James’s \textit{Daemonologie}. Succeeding Elizabeth in 1603, the King republished \textit{Daemonologie}, a treatise on witchcraft and magic that he had originally published in 1597.\textsuperscript{231} As Schelling observed, the ascension of James to the English throne preceded numerous English plays that dealt with witchcraft, a testament of the subject’s popularity in an early modern literary context.\textsuperscript{232} Treatises addressing the subject of witchcraft were in circulation during the period, contributing to general interest in the subject. Texts such as Kramer’s \textit{Malleus}

\textsuperscript{228} Laura Apps and Andrew Gow’s study on male witches in early modern Europe provides a compelling background that challenges the traditionally gendered ideas of witchcraft as associated with women. See Laura Apps and Andrew Gow, \textit{Male Witches in Early Modern Europe} (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003).


\textsuperscript{230} Peter J. French, \textit{The World of the Elizabethan Magus} (New York: Routledge, 1972), 147.

\textsuperscript{231} King James I, \textit{Daemonologie} (Edinburgh, 1597; Amsterdam: Da Capo Press, 1969). A distinguishing trait outlined in \textit{Daemonologie} is the difference between melancholics and practitioners of witchcraft. James proposes that both are separate from one another, that ‘confessors of witchcraft’ have contrasting humours from melancholics. From the examples cited in this chapter it is evident that this notion was not readily taken up by poets of the period, as love melancholy is often inextricably connected with the practice of witchcraft.

\textsuperscript{232} Felix F. Schelling, ‘Some Features of the Supernatural as Represented in Plays of the Reigns of Elizabeth and James,’ \textit{Modern Philology} 1, no. 1 (1903): 173.
maleficarum (1487), the works of Heinrich Agrippa, Reginald Scot’s The Discoverie of Witchcraft (1584) and Johann Weyer’s De praestigiis daemonum addressed the subject of witchcraft. Adding to this rich intellectual history was the influence of the spiritual dimension of Neoplatonic philosophy in the works of authors such as Marsilio Ficino.

Within this cultural milieu, poets imagined their poetic selves as individuals who delved into the occult arts. These poets’ efforts represent a diversion from the ‘archetypal’ female gendered orientation of early modern witchcraft practitioners. This view of witches as predominantly female was, as Stuart Clark argues, shaped by perceptions of gender in the period that aligned femininity with negative categories, making it 'unthinkable' that witches should be male. This gender dynamic was compounded by cultural associations of male practitioners of magic with knowledge and creativity. As Brian Levack observes:

The Renaissance magus is very closely in touch with artistic expression; the talisman borders in this period on painting and sculpture; the incantation is allied to poetry and music.

Compared to female practitioners of magic, the view of male magic practitioners in this period were of learned individuals, as exemplified by the figure of John Dee, for

---


234 Ficino, De vita.


example. Dee afforded a template for the 'Renaissance magus' par excellence. Dee's interest in occultism exemplified a curious blend of knowledge, magic and philosophical thinking that stood in opposition to feminine forms of magic. Female forms of magic were interpreted as practices that were aligned with nature and the body, as opposed to the dimension of learning that accompanied masculine forms. King James's *Daemonologie*, for example, outlined a distinction between magicians (male) and witches (female), writing that magicians practise magic for popularity and fame, whilst witches use their power to 'satisfy their greedy desire'.

Representations of magic in early modern poems, however, demonstrated an alignment with a focus on emotional expression and affect rather than learning and knowledge. The purpose of poet/speakers of Michael Drayton's 'Cupid Conjured', Edmund Spenser's 'Epithalamion' and Barnabe Barnes's Sestina 5 is the fulfilment of desire, an emotional dimension that contrasts early modern interpretations of magicians as scholarly, learned individuals. Far from an interpretation of these Petrarchan speakers as knowledge-focused, early modern poets' use of magic as a coercive tool is one that is aligned with witchcraft. Moreover, the role of these speakers as male witches also presents the possibility of reading them as early modern Gothic villains.

Like Donne and Gascoigne's conceptualisation of supernaturalism, repetition also figures prominently in depictions of witchcraft used by early modern poets. Roberts' reading of early modern poets' use of magic is significant here:


240 King James I, *Daemonologie*, 34–35.
Yet, in the poet's own love persuasion, his attempt to 'charm' a woman, he may explicitly figure himself as a magician whose love poem is a spell, a *carmen*, an amatory conjuration.241

The connection between poetic form and the act of conjuration noted by Roberts is exemplified by several poetic examples from Michael Drayton, Edmund Spenser and Barnabe Barnes. These poems have numerous repeated phrases and statements that read both as incantations and as descriptions. For example, in Sonnet 36 of Michael Drayton’s *Idea*, titled ‘Cupid Conjured’, a male speaker engages in witchcraft as a tool for provoking responses of heightened fear from his addressee. Drayton’s use of witchcraft in ‘Cupid Conjured’ presents a scenario where the speaker engages in witchcraft to force his beloved to accept him. Drayton’s poem details a speaker who evokes Cupid through a set of magical rites. Drayton uses repeated phrases and sounds to underscore the incantatory tone of his poem. The poem is framed as an elocution of poetic power, a revolt against Cupid and the effects wrought on him by the speaker’s mistress.

Frustrated with his inability to move his beloved by conventional means, the speaker resorts to a magical conjuration in a bid to garner the attention of his beloved:

> Thou purblind Boy, since thou hast beene so slacke
> To wound her Heart, whose Eyes have wounded me,
> And suff’red her to glory in my Wracke,
> Thus to my aid, I lastly conjure thee […]242 (‘Cupid Conjured’: 1–4)

The beginning of lines one and four echo with a ‘th’ sound, beginning with the forceful denunciation of Cupid as a ‘purblind boy’, and culminating in the dual ‘th’


sound in the first and last words of line four. The words 'thou' and 'thee' start and conclude the four lines with a similar tone that gives the stanza the tone of an incantation. These four lines convey a surge of emotion that draws a reader's attention to the speaker's anger, generating a tone of trepidation towards what the speaker might do next.

The speaker subsequently diverges from the expository part of his poem in a response that takes the form of a spell. What follows in the body of the sonnet are a series of incantation-like locutions that prompt the generation of a host of horrifying supernatural images. Drayton's excessive use of repetition in 'Cupid Conjured' serves two purposes. The first is the use of his speaking voice as an incantation. He is not only demonstrating his intent, but is actively taking a reader through the process of summoning Cupid through the use of dark magic. Secondly, there is an instructive dimension to the unconventionally repetitive form of Drayton's incantation. Through the act of writing and the transmission of his sonnet as a creative work, he is ensuring the availability of his incantation/poem for those who might choose to use it.

The body of the sonnet takes the form of an incantation, comprised of several repeated phrases:

By Hellish Styx (by which the Thund’rer sweares)
By thy faire Mother’s unavoided Power,
By Hecat’s Names, by Proserpine’s sad Teares,
[...]
By all true Lovers’ Sighes, Vowes, and Desires,
By all the Wounds that ever thou hast giv’n;
    I conjure thee by all that I have nam’d,
To make her love, or Cupid be thou damn’d! (5–7, 11–14)
The repetition of the word 'by' in lines five, six, seven, eleven and twelve creates a tone that begs comparison to the formulaic inflection of an incantation. Drayton’s enunciations in this sonnet contribute to a tone of terror, as readers are privy to the speaker engaging in a highly taboo act. We know that in the late sixteenth century, witchcraft was regarded as a crime warranting the death penalty. In Europe in the late Middle Ages, a large number of men, as well as women were persecuted for being witches. Furthermore, in 1542 and 1562, acts in the English Parliament were passed defining witchcraft as a crime punishable by death.

Drayton’s speech acts thus constitute two forms of transgression. The first is his obvious and explicit engagement in a practice that is shrouded in taboo. Secondly, Drayton's speaker's immersion in his incantation prompts a reader to envision watching the speaker perform his rites, an act that has implications when considered as an uber-Petrarchan display of rhetoric. Drayton’s spell-casting represents an extreme response to his mistress's lack of interest. In invoking the taboo art of witchcraft as a mechanism for creating artificial desire, the speaker can be characterised as an early modern Gothic villain. The speaker's use of witchcraft not only is a violation of the law, but an intrusive, transgressive attempt at subverting his victim's emotional response.

Another poet/speaker who demonstrates the use of witchcraft for the purposes of evincing desire is Edmund Spenser, in his wedding-poem Epithalamion. Appended onto his sonnet sequence Amoretti, Spenser's 'Epithalamion' in its nineteenth stanza contains a set of images that confront the reader with a host of

---


244 Rolf Schulte, Man as Witch: Male Witches in Central Europe (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 46.

horrifying visual motifs, a stark difference from the pastoral images and depictions of beauty that reverberate throughout the rest of the poem. John Bender proposes that Spenser evokes the supernatural as 'witnesses' to his wedding, but I want to take his proposition one step further to suggest that the peculiar presence of supernatural, fear-inducing phenomena in stanza 19 is suggestive of the poet/speaker's assertion of power over his beloved through the generation of horror.\textsuperscript{246} Invoked by the poet/speaker, the 'witnesses' that are present in Spenser's poem serve as a testament to his power over the supernatural.

In this stanza, Spenser utilises the poetic technique of repetition in a manner that is similar to Drayton's in 'Cupid Conjured'. Here, the poet presents images of what Clive Bloom describes as Gothic 'props'—this stanza lists a host of supernatural creatures such as witches, hobgoblins and spirits.\textsuperscript{247} Here, a list of perceived possible threats to the tranquillity of his wedding night are assembled by Spenser as a means of keeping them away from his bride-to-be. At the start of this stanza, the poet demonstrates cognisance of the affective potential posed by these horrifying phenomena when he references how 'dreadful sights' can make 'sudden sad affrights'.

Spenser's reference to how these images can cause emotional reactions is highly ironic as he then proceeds to describe a group of these 'sights'. Paradoxically, the form of his poem, when read alongside these references, creates the image of a setting that is populated with these supernatural beings and animals. A host of supernatural creatures and sights then come into view:

\begin{quote}
Ne let housefyres, nor lightnings helpelesse harmes,
Ne let the Pouke, nor other euill sprights,
\end{quote}


\textsuperscript{247} Clive Bloom, \textit{Gothic Histories}, 6.
Ne let mischiuous witches with theyr charmes,
Ne let hou Goblins, names whose sence we see not […].

(*Epithalamion*, st. 19: 7–10)

Every one of these supernatural 'props' presents a reader with an image of something that can be regarded as a source of horror. The regularity with which these lines are repeated builds an association between the phenomena in each line. This section of the poem begins with the same word 'ne', contributing to a regular rhythm in these lines that allow them to be read as a quatrain in itself. The regularity of line seven's descriptions, and the alliteration of the 'h' sound in the line contribute to a semblance of an incantation. Like the speaker of 'Cupid Conjured', the tonal regularity of these lines is indicative of an engagement with witchcraft. At the same time, the poem is particularly charged with irony as the speaker's own words in this stanza are analogous with the 'charmes' used by 'mischivous' witches. A reading of this stanza as an incantation is ironic, as the poet's choice of the word 'ne' here draws on the word's use as a clause that is expressive of something to be prevented or guarded against. What the speaker does in this stanza then, is the paradoxical act of putting the supernatural on display whilst eschewing it at the same time.

From visual horrors, the speaker then proceeds to list a group of horrifying phenomena that take on an aural dimension:

Nor the night Rauen that still deadly yels,
Nor damned ghosts cald vp with mighty spels,
Nor griesly vultures make vs once affeard:
Ne let th'unpleasant Quyre of Frogs still croking
Make vs to wish theyr choking.
Let none of these theyr drery accents sing;
Ne let the woods them answer, nor theyr eccho ring. (13–19)

---

The 'dreary accents' of these supernatural phenomena are 'summoned' by the poet/speaker. Lines thirteen to fifteen continue the repetitive trajectory set out in the first section of the stanza by listing another group of horrifying creatures that generate fear through their unnatural sounds. While Spenser's intention is to present these phenomena and consequently eschew them, the listing of these phenomena creates an opposite effect. As Chinitz writes:

Epithalamion embodies two rhetorical stances: one (that of the invocation and envoy) in which the poet recognises and admits the literarity of his effort, including its lack of affective power, and a second, framed by the other, in which he dares to assert the affective power of his words.²⁵⁰

I suggest that it is the latter of Spenser's rhetorical stances that Chinitz proposes, the assertion of affective power, that is important here. This power is exerted as a form of control. By simultaneously generating this atmosphere of horror and rejecting it, he claims the ability to overcome these supernatural phenomena and to allay his beloved's fears of them. Spenser's speaker adopts the role of a protector, insulating his addressee from the threats she might face. But in orchestrating the presentation of these supernatural horrors, Spenser is indirectly revelling in his ability to control them.

The abundance of these supernatural phenomena lends greater agency to the speaker's role as protector, but raises the ambiguous possibility that the speaker's power might be even more terrifying in its potential for overcoming the 'mighty spells' of 'damned ghosts'. In other words, the rhetoric of the supernatural is deliberately manipulated by Spenser to solidify his position, one that points to an underlying attempt at an artificial evocation of fear in his addressee. Spenser's power over the supernatural is arguably more horrifying than the disparate supernatural elements he summons to his bidding. The positioning of this stanza

within a wedding song is an anomaly, one that raises the question as to the reason for its incongruence. Its similarities with an incantation also place it at odds with the implied positive dimension of a wedding song. By proving to his beloved (and his audience) his supernatural ability, the speaker of Spenser’s *Epithalamion* projects himself as one who is an uber-Petrarchan, rather than a typical Petrarchan lover. By reminding his beloved what he is capable of, the speaker impresses a perverse sense of security onto his soon-to-be wife.

Furthermore, the fact that this demonstration of witchcraft occurs after the speaker’s desire has been satisfied generates more questions than answers. Has the speaker followed the example of Drayton in ‘Cupid Conjured’ and used witchcraft to shape his beloved’s desire? What are the implications of being married to a male witch? That Spenser’s speaker is willing to openly display his power on his wedding night is perhaps indicative of a more sinister dimension to his speaker’s character. Readers are thus left considering the disturbing implications of the speaker’s marriage to his beloved. Unlike an unrequited Petrarchan lover, Spenser’s speaker has his desire fulfilled, but it is nevertheless an outcome that provokes just as many questions as it does answers.

The speakers of *Epithalamion* and ‘Cupid Conjured’ seek to exert a form of power on their beloveds by engaging in the taboo art of witchcraft. In this respect, their efforts, articulated through the first-person voice, are similar to Gascoigne’s ghost-like speaker in ‘Anatomye of a Lover’. A comparison of *Epithalamion* and ‘Cupid Conjured’ with the narrative structures of third-person Gothic texts yields a similar observation to one made earlier in this chapter—the registers of emotional affect in these poems are of a lesser degree than in a third-person Gothic narrative. In these poems, the actions that the speakers take are described to us, but it is unclear as to what effects these have on the speakers’ beloveds. Unlike Donne, who pre-empts his victim’s responses in ‘The Apparition’, these poems’ first-person narrations
delve into transgressive displays of supernatural power without explicating the effects of this power on others.

A poem that does, however, take into consideration the responses of a fictional victim is Sestina 5 of Barnabe Barnes’s sonnet-sequence *Parthenophil and Parthenophe*. It is arguably the speaker of Barnabe Barnes’s Sestina 5 who is one of the most reprehensible early modern Petrarchan characters. Throughout *Parthenophil and Parthenophe* Barnes’s character Parthenophil exhibits the passive stance of a typical Petrarchan lover, but in Sestina 5, Parthenophil is transformed from an individual who is tormented by desire to adopting the role of tormenter himself. In a disturbing sequence that parallels a scene in *The Monk*, the speaker of this poem utilises witchcraft to forcibly claim and rape his beloved. Sestina 5 is narrated from the first-person perspective of Barnes’s speaking character Parthenophil, who like Donne’s ghostly speaker in ‘The Apparition’, doubles both as narrator and as perpetrator.

Parthenophil’s use of witchcraft involves a host of visual horrors that range from supernatural creatures to unnatural weather. At the start of the poem, the speaker harnesses witchcraft to summon a demonic goat which he uses to abduct Parthenophe.²⁵¹ He then invokes the goddess Hecate, creating sacrificial pyres as part of a ritualistic process that has the ultimate objective of garnering his beloved’s affection against her will. Parthenophil calls on Hecate with a loud intonation that alters the atmosphere from one that is ‘calmy’ to one that reverberates with the sound of his voice. Echoing the repetitive invocations of ‘Cupid Conjured’ and *Epithalamion*, the speaker delivers his rites through a host of repeated exclamations in several lines that begin with the phrase ‘Hence goate’:

²⁵¹ Barnes’s use of a goat as his intermediary in this poem is an image that reinforces his speaker as a practitioner of witchcraft. The image of a witch riding on a goat was one that persisted through late medieval and early modern visual culture. Albrecht Dürer’s engraving ‘The Witch’, made in the early 1500s, was one of the most famous illustrations associating a goat with witchcraft. See Charles Zika, *Exorcising Our Demons: Magic, Witchcraft and Visual Culture in Early Modern Europe* (Leiden: Brill, 2003), 305.
Hence goate and bring her to me raging woode:

\[\text{(Parthenophil, Sestina 5: 12)}\]

\begin{align*}
\text{Hence goate, and bring her, with loues outrage kindled.} & \quad (24) \\
\text{Hence goate and bring her from her bedding bare:} & \quad (36) \\
\text{Hence goate and bring her to me raging woode [...].} & \quad (49)
\end{align*}

As if in response to the effects of Parthenophil’s incantation, the surrounding atmosphere changes, and is described using repeated phrases:

\begin{quote}
Her hardned hart, which pitied not my teares.
The wind shaked trees make murmure in the woode,
The waters roare at this thrise sacred night,
The windes come whisking shill to note her furies:
Trees, woodes, and windes, a part in my plaintes bare,
And knew my woes; now ioy to see her kindled!\[253\] (55–60)
\end{quote}

The repeated statements double as verbal enunciations of the speaker’s conjuration and as a description of his supernatural power. Ed Cameron writes that terror narratives create an ‘anxiety producing’ atmosphere of suspense and uncertainty, and in these stanzas, Barnes’s speaker creates an atmosphere filled with supernatural elements.\[254\] Like Donne signalling the entrance of his ghostly lover in ‘The Apparition’ by using the image of a flickering candle, the atmospheric elements used by Barnes in this section of the poem contribute to a heightened feeling of terror. The alliterative ‘w’ sound in lines 56 to 58 create an aural effect that is placed in opposition to the repeated tone of his mistress’s ‘hardened heart’ in line 55. The proliferation of ‘w’ sounds in this stanza symbolise the creation of the unnatural winds by Parthenophil in a display of his supernatural power that seeks to overcome

\begin{footnotes}
\item[252] Barnes, Poems, 143 (lines 12 and 24); 144 (lines 36, 49, 55, 60).
\item[253] Barnes, Poems, 144.
\end{footnotes}
Parthenophe's indifference. Through the use of repetition, the poet emphasises the extent of Parthenophil's power, one that allows control over natural phenomena.

Upon creating these supernatural elements, Parthenophil then summons several creatures that generate terrifying sounds. He 'conjures' the image of a setting populated by these creatures—owls, dogs, wolves, bulls and ravens. The poet's use of exclamations in every phrase in this stanza symbolises and draws emphasis to the aural terrors summoned by Parthenophil, supernatural phenomena that parallel the images in Spenser's *Epithalamion*:

See whence she comes, with loues enrag'd and kindled!
The pitchye cloudes (in droppes) send down there teares, 
*Owls scritche, Dogges barke to see her carried bare, 
Wolues yowle, and cry: Bulles bellow through the wood, 
*Rauens croape, now, now, I feel loues fiercest furies [...].*  

Barnes's descriptions in each line of this stanza contribute to a feel of aural excess that read as a follow up to the alliterated 'w' sounds used by the poet in the previous stanza. The speaker's rapid-fire exclamations subsequently reach a fever pitch in the next few stanzas of the poem as his repetition compulsion translates into a slew of repeated declarations:

And beare thee hence the[y] will not pittie tears,  
And these still dwell in everlasting night!  
*Ioyne ioyne* (*Parthenope*) *thy selfe vnbare,*  
*It ioynes, it ioynes, ah both embracing bare:*  
*I melt in loue, loues marrow-flame is kindled:*  
*I melt, I melt, watche Cupid my loue-teares [...].*

---


256 Barnes, *Poems*, 145 (lines 81–82, 88); 146 (lines 99, 103, 105).
This section of the poem builds to a tone resembling a fever pitch as the brevity of the phrases ‘it joins’ and ‘I melt’ convey a sense of the speaker’s heightened emotional state as he engages in sexual intercourse with Parthenope. The staccato intonation of these repeated phrases is suggestive of one being in the throes of passion. The phrase ‘I join’ in particular reads as a euphemism for what can be assumed to be the physical act of Parthenophil engaging in sex.

The explicitness of these lines and the elevated pitch at which the lines are delivered by the speaker evoke a sense of horror from the point of view of a reader who witnesses the act of rape taking place. This aspect distinguishes Barnes’s poem from the efforts of other early modern poets and closest to the efforts of Gothic novelists, as it imbues the poem with a structure that resembles a third-person narrative. At several points in the poem we are told of her reaction:

Weepe not, come loues and wipe away her teares:257 (78)
And beare thee hence the[y] will not pittie teares, (82)

It is Parthenophil’s description of her reaction that serves to codify the speaker as a villain. He has not only taken her against her will but has made the satiating of his desire his prime objective, ignoring her responses to being abducted. The act of showing tears is subsequently referenced in the final stanza of the poem:

‘Tis now acquitted: cease your former teares,
For as she once with rage my bodie kindled,
So in hers, am I buried this night. (109–11)

Taking up three rather than six lines, this stanza is the shortest of the whole poem. The abruptness of the poem’s ending reinforces the culmination of Parthenophil’s efforts—all he seeks to do is the fulfilment of his desire. The forced ravishing of Parthenope creates a tone of horror that is centred on the implications of witnessing

257 Barnes, Poems, 145.
the act. Readers of the poem are privy to the speaker's use of supernatural power to strike fear in his victim before using her for his pleasure.

The poem's final phrase, 'in hers am I buried this night', concludes a terrifying encounter that transforms Parthenophil's desire from a purely idealised, emotional state to a state of physical fulfilment. Barnes's conclusion is the most violent of all the endings featured in English sonnet sequences of the early modern period. But more than just having a violent ending, Barnes's poem epitomises the consequences of unfulfilled desire. In the hands of an individual who is not above using magic for his own ends, the unattainable lady's fate is a dire one. As Jeffrey Nelson observes, his rape and deflowering of Parthenope is a terrifying reversal of typical Petrarchan subservience:

In turning to black magic and its deity Hecate, Parthenophil not only abandons one set of poetic metaphors (the beloved as a 'saint' or a 'goddess'), but turns to a new so-called religion, which denies the awe and respect typically accorded to a Petrarchan mistress.258

Nelson's remark is one that recognises the subversion of Petrarchan poetics that takes place in this poem. Parthenophil's exercise of black magic reverses stereotypes and conventions of the male suitor who waits on his beloved. In a terrifying and transgressive display of power, he quite literally breaks the distance between him and his beloved. She turns from a 'goddess' to being objectified as the target of Parthenophil's unsatiated lust. This violent reaction from Parthenophil can be read as Barnes's extreme reaction to the literary convention of the passive suitor. By reversing established conventions, this scenario envisioned by Barnes points toward the terrifying potential of masculine power. Witchcraft grants Parthenophil the means to avenge himself by turning his mistress's perceived scorn against her in a display of power that evokes terror and horror.

Equally importantly, out of the various early modern poems surveyed, the poem reads as a divergence from the first-person voice adopted in poems such as 'Cupid Conjured', 'Anatomye of a Lover' and *Epithalamion*. Unlike other poetic speakers, Barnes's Parthenophil is not only telling his audience what he does, but also envisions his victim's reactions. By imagining the reactions of a fictional victim in the form of Parthenophe, Barnes introduces an element of narrativity to his poem that generates a greater dimension of emotional affect. Barnes's efforts in Sestina 5 read as a radically different interpretation of Petrarchan poetics that capitalises on, and exploits the workings of supernatural fear. The resonance of Barnes's poem is amplified by the fact that it is the poem that concludes his sonnet sequence. In concluding with the satisfaction of his speaker's desire, enacted through force, Barnes asserts the superiority of his poetic power by fully subverting Petrarchan norms.

The narrative aspect of Sestina 5 and its portrayal of a victim in the character Parthenophe allow for a direct comparison with a scene from the Gothic—Ambrosio's rape of Antonia in *The Monk*. Through the use of witchcraft, Barnes's Parthenophil terrifies and horrifies his victim before reversing the trope of Petrarchan passivity. Parthenophil's act of engaging with the taboo art of witchcraft reverberates in *The Monk*, a text that also features a character who uses witchcraft as a tool for eliciting desire from Antonia, an unwilling victim. Lewis's protagonist Ambrosio obtains a draught that renders his victim unconscious, and like Parthenophil, takes advantage of her in an isolated location. Whilst Ambrosio does not explicitly utilise black magic in his endeavour, the act is loaded with motifs that symbolise Ambrosio's pact with the devil. As the Monk proceeds with his devious plan, Lewis describes the atmosphere surrounding the crypt:

As He stood in hesitation, He heard the melancholy shriek of the screech-Owl:

The wind rattled loudly against the windows of the adjacent Convent, and as
the current swept by him, bore with it the faint notes of the chaunt of Choristers.\textsuperscript{259}

The sound of a shrieking owl and rattling winds mark Ambrosio’s approach to the tomb of St Clare. Ambrosio’s discernment of the supernatural atmosphere surrounding the crypt of St Clare echoes Barnes’ lead-up to the enactment of Parthenophil’s rape-scene in Sestina 5 of *Parthenophil and Parthenope*. A screeching owl and other unnatural noises symbolise Ambrosio’s use of supernaturalism and following from this, Lewis’s description of Antonia’s crypt is replete with horrifying motifs such as a host of decaying bodies. As Antonia wakes, the effect of the crypt’s atmosphere affects her with a combination of both horror and terror:

> The aspect of the Vault, the pale glimmering of the Lamp, the surrounding obscurity, the sight of the Tomb, and the objects of mortality which met her eyes on either side, were ill-calculated to inspire her with those emotions by which the Friar was agitated.\textsuperscript{260}

The motifs that are used by Lewis in this scene symbolise the Monk’s reliance on witchcraft for the fulfilment of his desire. More importantly, they evoke a tone of fear that is centred on the evocation of horror and terror. On one hand, the dimness of her surroundings serves to create an atmosphere of terror, whilst the dead bodies in the crypt fill her with horror. Weaving both states of heightened fear into his treatment of Antonia, Lewis’s efforts echo the terrifying and horrifying motifs deployed by Barnabe Barnes in Sestina 5.

As a character type, a continuity emerges through an analysis of parallels between Renaissance poet/speakers and the Gothic villain. We have, at its simplest, across both modes, a masculine character type who seeks to obtain the affections of a beloved against their will. Drayton’s raging summons of Cupid in ‘Cupid Conjured’

\textsuperscript{259} Lewis, *The Monk*, 317.

reads as an angry enunciation that echoes the rages of Walpole's Manfred. The
Monk's reliance on witchcraft to take advantage of Antonia parallels Parthenophil's
invocation in Sestina 5. Far from an original construction, as this chapter has
demonstrated, the oppressive male villain that has come to be another recognisable
trope of the Gothic has its roots in the scorned Petrarchan lover. The Petrarchan
lover's use of supernatural power to evoke fear, in particular, lends toward this
characterisation of these individuals as early modern Gothic villains.

Conclusion

The Gothic mode's supernaturalism emerged in the eighteenth century as one of its
most identifiable tropes. From the 'explained supernatural' of Ann Radcliffe's *The
Mysteries of Udolpho* to representations of witchcraft and demons in Matthew Lewis's
*The Monk*, the association of states of terror and horror with the supernatural would
become a theme synonymous with the Gothic. In the wake of the Gothic mode's
popularity in the late eighteenth century, some notable nineteenth century Gothic
poems such as Keats's 'Eve of St Agnes' (1820) and Coleridge's 'Christabel' (1816)
would combine themes of desire with explicitly supernatural elements. The
depiction of individuals' experience of fear from supernatural sources, or the
affective dimension of Gothic supernaturalism, would become one of the
cornerstones of the mode.

As I have shown in this chapter, the Gothic investment of supernaturalism as
means of exploring states of fear is one that has a parallel in works of early modern
love poetry. A Gothic sensibility can be located in these poets' works, one that is
focused on the generation of horror and terror as affective responses. These writers
engaged in uber-Petrarchan poetics by imagining their poetic selves as ghosts and
practitioners of witchcraft, and responded to their beloveds' inaction and scorn with demonstrations of horrifying supernatural power. Informed by popular ideas of witchcraft and superstition in the period, poets imagined themselves as ghosts and witches in their attempts to generate fear from their addressees and beloveds. Given the fears surrounding witchcraft in the early modern period, poets' casting of their poetic selves as practitioners of witchcraft speaks of a transgressive, early modern Gothic sensibility that combines popular superstition with Petrarchan poetics.

An inability to win the affections of a beloved forms one of the core aspects of Petrarchan poetics, and these speaking characters’ use of supernaturalism demonstrates compulsions to repeat, a consequence of trauma experienced at the hands of their beloveds. Repeated phrases and statements form a crucial part of the early modern poet/speaker's display of supernatural power. More importantly, an insistence toward seeking out one's beloved from beyond the grave exemplifies these characters’ compulsion to achieve the fulfilment of desire regardless of the consequences. For these individuals, fear is wielded as a powerful rhetorical tool that subverts the Petrarchan lady's power.

In turning to fear as an affective rhetorical strategy, these poetic speakers are cast as villains. Shakespearean villains such as Richard III and Macbeth are characters who have garnered comparisons with villains in the Gothic mode, but in this chapter, I have introduced an original character archetype to the debate on early modern parallels to the Gothic mode. The Petrarchan 'counterdiscourses' that are displayed in early modern poets' evocation of fear parallel the masculine oppression that characterises the Gothic mode. The 'blackly, lowering villain' that has become a cliché of the genre has an antecedent in the template of the suffering Petrarchan lover. Within a broader context of Gothic studies, the analysis in this chapter of poetic speakers as villains supports the argument of the Gothic as a constant recycling of cultural energies and impulses. As masculine figures who seek to horrify their addressees, Petrarchan lovers are analogous to the patriarchal Gothic
villain. Control over the supernatural exhibited by these poets exemplifies a strand of uber-Petrarchan poetics that focuses on masculine authority rather than passivity.

The analysis undertaken in this chapter also highlights the difference in how literary supernaturalism is treated in both textual modes. The first-person narrative forms surveyed in this chapter feature poetic speakers as sources of supernatural terror themselves. An element of hesitation is diminished because readers are privy to the nature of these supernatural incidents. Conversely, the element of hesitance is increased with third-person narrations in Gothic texts. Readers of Gothic texts are unaware of how a supernatural entity such as Lewis’s Alonzo or the Bleeding Nun might act, leading to a heightened dynamic of emotional affect. Furthermore, depictions of the supernatural—Alonzo, the Nun, the ghost of Alfonso in The Castle of Otranto—are featured as incidents of popular superstition within these texts’ narratives. Framed as supernatural incidents that are experienced by more than one person, this heightens the effect of their use in Gothic texts.

Wielding supernatural power is but one facet of the Petrarchan lover’s character. In the next chapter of this thesis, I will focus on how these speakers used the representation of corporeality as a rhetorical strategy for evoking uncertainty and disgust. In addition to mastery of the supernatural, early modern poets also grounded their poems in the discourse of the anatomical sciences. An emerging fascination with the human body in early modern England offered poets a compelling reference point for articulating their post-Petrarchan poetic concerns.
Chapter 3: Rack't Carcasses and Ripp'd Hearts: The Grotesque from Gothic to Early Modern

Grotesque imagery is one of the most identifiable tropes of the Gothic mode. Gothic authors use grotesque figures for their affective potential—as a means of eliciting reactions from readers. An analysis of early modern poetry through the lens of the Gothic and the grotesque yields some confronting observations. Grotesque images abound in early modern poetry in ways that prefigure their use in the Gothic mode. This chapter interrogates the theme of the grotesque across the genres of early modern poetry and Gothic literature, and argues that the grotesque is a key aspect of an affective Gothic sensibility that pre-dates the mode’s eighteenth-century origins.

A brief look at John Donne’s poem ‘Love’s Diet’ (1633), points to the broader concerns of this chapter and especially how techniques of exaggeration are used by authors to create grotesque images, images that evoke reactions from readers. In ‘Love’s Diet’, Donne presents the personification of Love as a human-like, exaggeratedly obese entity:

To what a cumbersome unwieldinesse
And burdensome corpulence my love had growne,
    But that I did, to make it lesse,
    And keepe it in proportion,
Give it a diet, made it feed upon
That which love worst endures, discretion.

Above one sigh a day I’allow’d him not,
Of which my fortune, and my faults had part;
And if sometimes by stealth he got
A she sigh from my mistresse heart,
And thought to feast on that, I let him see
'Twas neither very sound, nor meant to mee.261 ('Love's Diet': 1–11)

Firstly, Donne personifies Love in order to compare an abstract concept to one that is familiar to readers—corporeality. The clandestine acts of feasting and stealing of sighs undertaken by Love reinforce the poet's description of an abstract concept in disturbing, humanised terms. Secondly, the language used by Donne in this poem to describe Love is exaggerated. Three adjectives describing the extent of Love’s size are used in the poem’s opening couplet. Love is featured as having a physical form, specifically one that is both cumbersome, 'burdenous' and is the literal embodiment of excess.

A reading of the symbiotic relationship between Donne and Love in 'Love's Diet' alongside the poet's deployment of personification and exaggeration reveals a 'proto-Gothic' sensibility shaped by cultural and intellectual factors. In late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century England, dieting and physical improvement was as important to the early moderns as it is today.262 Donne's poem reads almost as a celebration of excess, a revelling in one's inability to control one's most basic impulses. Hunger becomes synonymous with desire as the speaker's Love binges on 'sighs'. More importantly, Donne's emphasis on arresting corporeality presents a vision of the body that is similar to the concept of a 'Gothic body'.

By harnessing together the critical lenses of the Gothic and the grotesque in this chapter, I argue that the 'Gothic' literary technique of eliciting emotional responses from readers using grotesque imagery has a precedent in the genre of Renaissance love poetry. Donne's reference to the body as a 'cumbersome unwieldiness' and a 'burdenous corpulence' in the opening couplet of 'Love's Diet',

261 Donne, The Elegies and The Songs and Sonnets, 45.


137
for example, is indicative of the poet’s interest in corporeality. The confronting spectacle that the poet presents to readers at the very beginning of his poem directs readers’ attention to the body’s unnerving qualities. In the field of Gothic studies, grotesque imagery is often aligned with the concept of the ‘Gothic body’. Modern genres such as 1980s’ 'splatterpunk' novels, horror films and fin-de-siècle Gothic traditions showcase the grotesque bodies in ways that exemplify the Gothic’s most enduring quality—an emphasis on corporeality. More importantly, as Xavier Aldana Reyes has written, the Gothic is an embodied mode of representation, one that appeals to the reader/viewer's body as well as their imagination and intellect.

Emotional affect through corporeal interest is a seminal element of the Gothic that emerges in each of its various iterations throughout English history. Images such as the ghostly monk’s spectre in The Castle of Otranto and the bodies of the Prioress and Ambrosio in The Monk are examples of grotesque, disturbing images in the eighteenth-century Gothic tradition. These images reflect an emphasis on corporeality and affect that is salient in a consideration of literature that pre-dates the eighteenth-century origins of the Gothic mode.

Aldana Reyes also writes that excess is a key aspect of 'body Gothic'. The technique of excess is one that is similar to deployments of the grotesque in early modern and Gothic literature. In both periods, the rhetoric of excess and exaggeration is a tool for showcasing disturbing and unnerving representations of the human body. Authors from both periods alike divert readers’ attention from notions of corporeal integrity by presenting the 'flesh as canvas'. Bodily dehumanisation and fragmentation are depicted in excessive detail through images

---


264 Xavier Aldana Reyes, Body Gothic: Corporeal Transgression in Contemporary Literature and Horror Film (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2015), 7.

that challenge classical ideas of the 'complete' human body. Authors in both periods alike use techniques of interstitiality, the taking of a concept and shifting it between boundaries of perception, to unnerve readers. In shifting between the recognisable and the unrecognisable, the metaphoric and the realistic, representations of the grotesque body in both early modern and Gothic texts bring into question what it means to be human.\textsuperscript{266} In this way, the interstitial status of grotesque bodies generates responses.

This chapter's study of love poetry and the Gothic also yields a set of observations that pertain to the genre of early modern verse. Firstly, the use of excess and exaggeration in Renaissance poetry exemplifies a subversion of Petrarchan poetics through an 'uber-Petrarchan' mode of representation.\textsuperscript{267} By drawing critical attention to early modern poets' use of the grotesque as an affective technique, this chapter asserts the importance of corporeal imagery in the genre of Renaissance love poetry. As Craik and Pollard have suggested, late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century writers not only identified emotional experience firmly with the body, but also privileged the sensations aroused by imaginative literature.\textsuperscript{268} What I hope to achieve here is the introduction of the genre of love poetry to existing debates of the grotesque in Renaissance literary traditions.

Secondly, the reading of early modern poetry undertaken in this chapter diverges from analyses of Renaissance literature that focus predominantly on the intersection between the grotesque and humour. Discussions centred on laughter and humour dominate many discussions of the grotesque in Renaissance literature, but my aim in this chapter is to shift away from these existing paradigms and to


\textsuperscript{267} Zimmermann, 'Bright Hair and Brittle Bones,' 161.

\textsuperscript{268} Craik and Pollard, 'Introduction: Imagining Audiences,' in \textit{Shakespearean Sensations}, 3. Also see Gail Kern Paster's work on the psychosocial reciprocity between an individual's experience and the world: Gail Kern Paster, \textit{Humoring the Body: Emotions and the Shakespearean Stage} (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), 19.
instead address the non-humorous effects of the grotesque. Studies of Renaissance literature in particular have a tendency to associate the concept of the grotesque in early modern literature with a burgeoning cultural development embodying elements of humour and the carnivalesque. John Ruskin’s seminal writing on the grotesque proposes that the element of 'jest' and ludicrousness exemplifies one aspect of the grotesque.\(^{269}\) This view is shared by others such as Istvan Czachesz in *The Grotesque Body in Early Christian Discourse*, where he evaluates how early Christians used grotesque imagery in texts as a tool for parody.\(^{270}\) In *Elizabethan Grotesque*, Neil Rhodes reiterates John Ruskin’s view that the Elizabethan grotesque consists of two polarities—laughter and revulsion.\(^{271}\) For Rhodes, the grotesque has varying, ‘unrepeatable’ phases throughout history, and he sees the Gothic’s supernaturalism as being distinct from the corporeal grotesques of the Renaissance. This view is problematic because many of the grotesque images in *The Monk* are of a non-supernatural nature. As I will subsequently show, the treatment of the bodies of two characters in *The Monk*—the Prioress and Ambrosio—presents a fascination with corporeality that has parallels in poetic works of the Renaissance. The inclusion of non-supernatural grotesque imagery in Lewis’s text and early modern poets’ verses is suggestive of similarities between the Elizabethan and Gothic grotesque traditions.

Thirdly and most importantly, an analysis of the similarities between representations of the grotesque in both early modern and Gothic texts, I propose, reveals a difference in the valences of affect in both textual modes. The primarily third-person structure of Gothic novels privileges the representation of *characters*, while first-person Renaissance poems privilege representations of the grotesque *self*. I argue that first-person representations of the grotesque in poetic form contribute to

---


a higher degree of emotional affect than third-person narrative depictions. An ontological distance separates the reader of a text from third-person descriptions of grotesque characters, such as the figures of Ambrosio and the Prioress in *The Monk*. In other first-person texts—John Donne and Michael Drayton’s dissection poems—not only are the bodies of texts’ speakers presented as grotesque configurations, but readers are also privy to the emotional resonance of these actions. In other words, while readers are primed to feel the effects of corporeal transgression, first-person poems accentuate these effects by making readers aware of the emotional responses to these actions. This generates a greater valence of ‘somatic empathy’ in first-person texts as opposed to third-person narratives.

In setting up this division, I am also cognisant of the fact that while treatments of the grotesque in Gothic novels and Renaissance love poetry evoke effects from primarily third- and first-person perspectives respectively, representations of the grotesque in these modes often include a combination of both forms. In Sonnet 29 of *Astrophil and Stella*, Sir Philip Sidney’s grotesque vision departs from a first-person perspective as it entails a dismembering of a female addressee. Conversely, despite its third-person narrative structure, the poem ‘The Exile’ in *The Monk* showcases the grotesque from a first-person perspective. If anything, a dialogue established through the analysis of these differing textual forms acknowledges the importance of both third- and first-person forms in the creation of affective Gothic sensibilities.

Early modern poets used grotesque images in their poems as a technique for provoking negative reactions such as fear and unease in readers. In *Body Gothic*, Aldana Reyes outlines how grotesque, Gothic bodies evoke reactions of fear:

---


Gothic bodies produce fear through their interstitiality: they are scary because they either refuse absolute human taxonomies or destabilise received notions of what constitutes a 'normal' or socially intelligible body.274

Aldana Reyes’s explanation succinctly summarises how the grotesque body evokes fear. Situated at the boundary between recognition and alienation, Gothic bodies arouse fear due to a combination of familiar and unfamiliar. Fear, for Aldana Reyes, is closely related to issues raised by challenges to corporeal integrity. An individual might potentially experience a reaction of fear when their own well-being is brought into question when reading about grotesque bodies. In addition to the representation of bodies in the Gothic, reactions of fear are also aroused from representations of grotesque physicality in other literary sources, such as early modern love poetry. As the example of Donne’s Love in 'Love’s Diet' suggests, the poet depicts an unwelcome scenario of confronting a reader with the disturbing implications of overeating.

Thirdly, the deployment of the grotesque by early modern poets points to a fascination with emergent discourses relating to the anatomical sciences in the Renaissance. The emergence of corporeal dissection in early modern England, I propose, contributed to poets’ fascination with literary representations of the body. In his compelling study Murder after Death: Literature and Anatomy in Early Modern England (2007), Richard Sugg offers an extensive look at anatomy in early modern English literature and culture, outlining the emergence of corporeal dissection in the Renaissance. Sugg outlines the complexities relating to study of the body in the Renaissance, viewing anatomical study as a phenomenon that had profound implications for early modern literary expression. He notes the 'peculiar thrill of strangeness' brought about by study of the body in the Renaissance, an effect that

274 Xavier Aldana Reyes, Body Gothic, 5.
arose from the advent of scientific study. Several of his examples from Renaissance literature are from the work of the poets John Donne, Michael Drayton and Sir Philip Sidney, prompting the discussions raised in this chapter. My contribution here expands on the trajectory set forth by Sugg by introducing examples from poetry addressing the imagery of the heart. The relationship between the human heart as a functional part of the body, and the heart's metaphorical connotations in literature as a symbol of desire, is drawn upon by early modern love poets. I want to suggest that given the emerging interest in the human body, the imagery of hearts in Renaissance poetic works is deserving of critical attention in a discussion of the grotesque.

Representations of corporeality in early modern love poetry fall under two primary categories—representations of characters and representations of poetic selves. It is necessary to acknowledge at the outset the theme of gender and its implications within the context of corporeal representations in my source texts. The primary assumption in reading early modern love poems is that the speakers are masculine and their addressees female, given the Petrarchan influence on these texts. The depiction of grotesque corporeality as it pertains to both characters and poetic selves alike, I propose, contributes to the concept of an early modern 'Gothic body' that encompasses both female and male bodies, albeit in different ways.

In the sections that follow, I undertake an exploration of corporeality and the grotesque across early modern love poetry. The first section details the representation of female characters in Lewis's text and early modern poetry. The second is aimed at analysing how poets fashioned their poetic selves in grotesque ways. The third section of this chapter is slanted towards analysing a general theme of corporeality and heart-imagery.


276 Sugg, 142.
As a preamble to my textual analyses, it is useful to demarcate a working definition of the term 'grotesque'. Broadly speaking, grotesque imagery is diametrically opposed to the ideal. If, for example, the ideal is represented by images of the human body as a complete form, the grotesque is represented by the deformed or dehumanised body. Across both eighteenth-century and early modern texts, grotesque bodies evoke reactions of disgust and unnerve readers by representing disproportion, the direct opposite of order and symmetry.277 The grotesque is synonymous with the bizarre, the macabre and the abnormal. The grotesque is also commonly regarded as an artistic style that rouses astonishment or disgust in a viewer or reader.278 The affective dimension of the grotesque is what aligns the concept with the Gothic and allows it to be interpreted as one facet of a Gothic sensibility.

As a representation of hybridity, fluidity and transgression, the grotesque is also notoriously hard to define.279 The grotesque, as understood in this chapter, relates to the representation of corporeal imagery that evokes reactions from readers by challenging ideas of the body as a complete construct. Kelly Hurley’s definition of 'body horror' offers a useful descriptor for my usage of the term 'grotesque' and 'grotesque body':

Body horror seeks to inspire revulsion—and in its own way, pleasure—through representations of quasi-human figures whose effect/affect is produced by their abjection, their ambiguation, their impossible embodiment of multiple, incompatible forms.280

279 Edwards and Graulund, Grotesque, 15.
The term 'body horror' itself is most often associated with the genre of film, and it is not my intention to borrow the term in my critique of the literary modes of poetry and prose. Rather, I am interested in the relations between the affective function of body horror and reading about the grotesque body in literary texts.

Another point that needs to be noted with regard to my use of the term 'grotesque' is that my focus is on representations of the grotesque that pertain to physical aspects of the human body. The distinction between human and non-human forms of the grotesque is crucial to the aims of this chapter, as supernatural phenomena are often considered in critical discussions of the grotesque. For example, in Horace Walpole's The Castle of Otranto, Walpole's imagining of the grotesque—Alfonso's exaggerated ghost/ Armour and the horrific spectre encountered by Frederic—are supernatural phenomena. With this in mind, critics suggest that the supernatural is a core aspect of the grotesque. Wolfgang Kayser regards the grotesque as an attempt to 'invoke and subdue' the demonic aspects of our world.281 Similarly, Maximillian Novak's definition of the grotesque pertains to representations of the bizarre and the supernatural.282 My interest in non-supernatural aspects of the grotesque, particularly with regards to my early modern source texts, is an acknowledgement of early modern cultural forces that shaped Renaissance poets' construction of grotesque bodies. The advent of anatomical sciences and study of the human body in late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century provided poets with a secular source of knowledge that played a pivotal role in inspiring representations of the human body in poetry.


To advance our understanding of the grotesque in how it evokes non-humorous effects, we can begin by looking at a seminal scene from Lewis's *The Monk*. This sequence, the death scene of the Prioress, illustrates the use of grotesque imagery in the Gothic mode as a means of unnerving and disturbing readers. Lewis's novel is noted for its explicit representations of violence against women, exemplified by this segment.283 The sequence in *The Monk* is an emotionally charged part of Lewis's narrative where the anger of a mob is directed to the character of a Prioress.

The Prioress meets her grisly end at the hands of a lynch mob and Lewis describes every nuance of her destruction in excessive detail. The author legitimises this act of violence by presenting it as a consequence of her actions, but exaggerates the manner of her death. The gruesome manner in which she is torn to shreds by the angry mob is highly affecting. A Gothic body, the Prioress's physical form is defamiliarised by an act of violence:

> She sank upon the ground bathed in blood, and in a few minutes terminated her miserable existence. Yet though she no longer felt their insults, the rioters still exercised their impotent rage upon her lifeless body.284

The literary techniques of interstitiality and excess are used by Lewis in his description of the rioters' actions on the Prioress's body. The Prioress's body undergoes a change from being recognised as the body of a human being to being unrecognisable as a result of the violence enacted on it. From a 'lifeless body' to a 'mass of flesh', the Prioress's form is degraded from one that is recognisable to one that is 'shapeless'.


The transition between recognition and alienation that occurs in this sequence exemplifies the grotesque’s fluidity. The term ‘defamiliarisation’ was proposed by Viktor Shklovsky as a technique that echoes the disruption of perception that takes place when a given object is rendered unrecognisable. Shklovsky proposes that the process of presenting a familiar image in an unfamiliar manner creates an effect that generates textual awareness, garnering a reader's attention. What captures a reader’s attention in representations of the grotesque is a synchronous process of familiarisation and defamiliarisation, as readers recognise aspects of corporeality outlined by an author, aspects that are subsequently rendered unrecognisable. In this example, the arresting image of a person transformed into a grotesque composition of dehumanised elements both captures a reader’s attention and evokes disgust.

The rhetoric of excess is used by the author in describing the Prioress’s death. Before dying, Lewis exaggerates the severity her wounds—she is ‘bathed’ in blood. As she is transformed from a recognisable form to a 'mass of flesh', her body is described through a series of non-identifying pronouns:

They beat it, trod upon it, and ill-used it, till it became no more than a mass of flesh, unsightly, shapeless, and disgusting.

The excessive actions taken by the mob highlight the violence enacted on the body to an exaggerated degree, as evidenced by Lewis’s repetition of the word ‘it’, used four times in this sequence. The repetition of the ‘s’ sound in the latter half of the sentence reinforces Lewis’s assertion that the Prioress’s body has been turned into a form that inspires revulsion. He reiterates that her body is destroyed through the multiple descriptors of ‘unsightly’ and ‘disgusting’, priming readers to the affective dimension of witnessing the thorough destruction of a human being.


The techniques used by Lewis recall the fragmentation of the female body in Sonnets 29 from Sir Philip Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella* and 30 from Michael Drayton’s *Idea’s Mirror*. Nancy Vickers acknowledges the effects of defamiliarisation by suggesting that Renaissance poems defamiliarise and familiarise characters for ‘poetic effect’, and these poems illustrate the fragmentation of the female body in a manner that is no less affecting than Lewis’s destruction of the Prioress. In Sidney’s poem, disparagement of a poetic addressee allows for a reading of the female body as a Gothic body. Stella’s body is an exaggerated, uber-Petrarchan bricolage of disturbing parts. Stella, like the Prioress, is defamiliarised:

> So Stella’s heart, finding what power Love brings,
> To keep it selfe in life and liberty,
> Doth willing graunt, that in the frontiers he
> Use all to helpe his other conquerings:
> And thus her heart escapes, but thus her eyes
> Serve him with shot, her lips his heralds arre:
> Her breasts his tents, legs his triumphall carre:
> Her flesh his food, her skin his armour brave,
> And I, but for because my prospect lies
> Upon that coast, am giv’n up for a slave.  

(*Astrophil, 29: 5–14*)

Stella’s body undergoes a process of disintegration and reconstitution, one that is in line with Kelly Hurley’s description of the ab-human subject in Gothic fiction, where characters are defamiliarised and violently reconstituted. From descriptions of Stella’s breasts, readers recognise that it is the feminine body of Stella that is undergoing a disintegration into a host of disparate parts. Her body is disintegrated

---


288 Zimmermann, 'Bright Hair and Brittle Bones,' 161.


into elements to be used by Love, but at the same time Sidney asserts repeatedly that they are identifiable body parts that belong to Stella. Stella's body is not only fragmented, but the fragments of her body carry with them a sense of utility.

The utility attached to Stella's parts is indicative of the poet's real-life awareness of the burgeoning interest in the anatomical sciences, as discussed by Sugg. Sidney's fascination with female corporeality in Sonnet 29 is symptomatic of the wider interest in anatomy and dissection in early modern England. The publication of anatomical works in the sixteenth century provided a rich corpus of medical treatises and tracts for perusal. In 1525, two significant works on human physiology were published: the Hippocratic Corpus in Latin and the works of Galen in Greek.291 Following this, in 1543, Andreas Vesalius's influential *De humani corporis fabrica* (*The Fabric of the Human Body*), was published. This was followed by Charles Estienne's *De dissectione partium corporis humani* (*Dissection of the Human Body*) in 1545.292 These scientific treatises offered insights into the physiological composition of the human body, some of them depicting the human body's internal organs. One of Estienne's illustrations from *De dissectione*, for example, pictures a female body with a cross section of the woman's uterus containing a fetus.

In Sidney's Sonnet 29, Love takes on the role of a dissector by removing parts of Stella. Love appropriates parts of Stella's physicality and uses them for his own purposes. Each one of the references to Stella's body is followed up with the word 'his', stressing Love's masculine identity. The utility attached to Stella's body parts carries with it gruesome connotations that extend beyond the act of fragmentation itself. Beginning with the impression of Stella's body as a complete form, the poem takes a reader through the break down, and subsequent re-constituting of her body.


Stella’s body is presented as an image, defamiliarised through an act of fragmentation, then familiarised once again when her body parts are appropriated by Love.

Sidney’s shift from the abstract to the corporeal introduces an element of grotesque realism to the tone of the poem. In his seminal study Rabelais and His World (1965), Bakhtin proposes that grotesque imagery evokes responses through the degradation of the ideal and the complete:

The essential principle of grotesque realism is degradation, that is, the lowering of all that is high, spiritual, ideal, abstract; it is a transfer to a material level, to the sphere of earth and body in their indissoluble unity.293

Abstract concepts, Bakhtin writes, are transferred to the realm of the material via grotesque realism. Grotesque iterations of abstract concepts ascribe an element of palpability to otherwise intangible ideas. The vocabulary of the grotesque draws attention to the physical world rather than the world of the abstract, emphasising corporeality rather than abstraction. Instead of taking on an ideal form, the poet’s beloved here is portrayed as being degraded, taking on a dehumanised form made out of a composite of various dismembered parts.

Bakhtin’s concept of grotesque realism is particularly salient in analyses of love poetry because of the genre’s use of metaphor. Geoffrey Galt Harpham writes that metaphor and the grotesque have similar qualities, as both generate impressions of a particular concept whilst embodying another.294 As part of poetic language, metaphors are used to express a given concept in a different way, bringing new meaning to that concept. Grotesque realism, however, unnerves by taking metaphor

---


literally. In a similar vein to Harpham, Ralf Remshardt's study defines this connection:

The grotesque, however, is serious about metaphor; it takes what is essentially a sophisticated trope—so sophisticated, indeed, that cognitive psychology has only a vague understanding of its functioning—and deliberately regards it naively, or incorrectly, or primitively, in hopes perhaps of traversing the graveyard of commonplace metaphor and restoring its onomatic origins. The grotesque takes metaphor literally. Remshardt proposes that the grotesque realises metaphor, having the ability to draw multiple meanings from an elaborate trope. In other words, he is concerned with the implications of considering a metaphor literally, an observation that is significant in a consideration of early modern love poetry given that the genre has an emotional state as a core thematic conceit. Grotesque realism, a technique that involves the literal reading of an abstract concept, creates the potential for new meaning to be obtained from poetic language.

Early modern poets were well aware of the technique of metaphor, and in the Renaissance, metaphor was regarded as a useful literary device, informing poets' conceptualisation of the body. In The Art of English Poesy, George Puttenham describes the use of metaphor:

There is a kind of wresting of a single word from his own right signification, to another so not natural, yet of some affinity or convenience with it, [...] therefore it is called by metaphor, or the figure of transport. For Puttenham, metaphor allows for the alteration of a given concept. An example cited by Puttenham is a Petrarchan poetic couplet:

---


296 Puttenham, Art of English Poesy, 261.
Then also do we it sometimes to enforce a sense and make the word more significantive: as thus, 'I burn in love, I freeze in deadly hate. I swim in hope, and sink in deep despair'.

Emphasis, Puttenham states, is what metaphor can be used to elicit. By the term 'sense' in this example, Puttenham recognises the value of metaphor in attaching value to an intangible dimension. In Puttenham's citation of Petrarch, emotions such as love, hate, hope and despair are rendered as palpable sensations. These examples show how metaphor functions as a literary technique for enforcing a specific concept, allowing for an interpretation of a given concept in a way that produces new meanings.

To illustrate this in the context of Sidney's poem, we start by focusing on Sidney's emphasis on corporeality. The rhetoric of excess, articulated through detailed descriptions of Stella's body, forms an important part of Sidney's use of the grotesque here. In this poem, Sidney creates a tension between metaphor and realism as he introduces a metaphorical dissector in the form of Love's personification, but at the same time introduces a series of references to Stella's body that beg to be read literally. Sidney's sole reference to Love in line five prompts readers to the relation between Love and Stella is one that exists purely at the level of metaphor. However, the introduction of corporeality, particularly the poet's exaggerated emphasis on his addressee's body, creates the effect of having to reappraise the abstract status of the relation. Four lines of the poem illustrate how Stella's body is broken into disparate elements—her eyes, lips, breasts, legs, and flesh. These references emphasise corporeality rather than abstraction, reinforcing both the extent of her physiological dismemberment. They also prompt a reading of the poem that is centred on realism rather than metaphor, a consideration of Love as an individual rather than an abstract concept. The portrayal of Sidney's Love as a masculine figure who acts like a human being generates the potential for a reading.

of this poem centred on the shocking implications of Stella’s anatomy being dissected, used and consumed in an act that simulates cannibalism.  

Love, in Sidney’s Sonnet 29, can also be read as an analogue for the sonnet’s poet/speaker himself. Stella’s artificial reconstitution, framed through the rhetoric of excess and defamiliarisation, demonstrate a convergence between the literary tradition of the ‘blazon’ and the grotesque. Flourishing as a popular literary mode in early modern France, blazons were poems that focused on fragmented parts of the female anatomy. Clément Marot’s ‘Blazon of the Breast’, published in 1535, popularised the blazon, an effect that had an impact on English poets of the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century. Blazons, David Norbrook writes, reflected the ‘mastering gaze’ of scientific advancement in the sixteenth century. Blazons assisted with poets’ shaping of poetic sensibilities towards the female body, attempts that often took a different turn from the ideal and the perfect. Blazons provided early modern poets with an unparalleled power over the female form, allowing for the commodification, control and possession of the female body. Contrasted with the representation of idealised feminine characters in the Petrarchan tradition, poets also drew upon the poetic currency of the grotesque to reverse the typical tropes of fair, virtuous and beautiful muses. These ‘Anti-Lauras’, Patrizia Bettella states, were grotesque ‘ugly women’, emphasising the poet’s disparagement of his addressee rather than praise. In Sidney’s Sonnet 29, disparagement of a poetic addressee treats the body as a spectacle, not unlike the disturbing treatment of the Prioress’s body in The Monk.

298 Susan M. Luther, ‘Sidney’s Astrophil and Stella, Sonnet 29,’ The Explicator 33, no. 5 (1975), 75.
299 Vickers, ‘Members Only,’ 5.
301 Patricia Parker, Literary Fat Ladies: Rhetoric, Gender, Property (London: Methuen, 1997), 131.
302 Patrizia Bettella, The Ugly Woman: Transgressive Aesthetic Models in Italian Poetry from the Middle Ages to the Baroque (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005), 82.
It is in this respect that depictions of violence against women that are depicted as a core part of Lewis's Gothic have a precursor in the violent ways in which female characters are depicted in early modern poetry.\textsuperscript{303} Mediating the violence enacted against Stella through the personification of Love, Sidney's Sonnet 29 cleverly conceals an act of physiological degradation by according the responsibility for this action to the abstract concept of Love. Placed alongside the explicit destruction of the Prioress in \textit{The Monk}, Sidney's approach in Sonnet 29 conceals the unnerving implications of dismembering a woman's body by mediating the process through the agent that is the personification of Love. The language that is used by Sidney, however, is no less affecting than beholding the Prioress reduced to a mass of flesh.

Similarly, the disparagement and fragmentation of the female body is presented in Sonnet 30 from \textit{Idea's Mirror}. Unlike Sidney, Michael Drayton's poetic disparagement of his mistress in this poem is far more direct. Here, the poet deconstructs the concept of blazon by using the techniques of exaggeration and interstitiality to compare his beloved to a host of non-human creatures. Sonnet 30 reads as an anti-blazon that is the inverse of Sidney's Sonnet 29. Drayton dehumanises and disparages his addressee by comparing her to a bricolage of non-human elements. She is depicted as an 'uber-Petrarchan' mistress with a host of monstrous traits:\textsuperscript{304}

\begin{quote}
Three sorts of serpents doe resemble thee,
That daungerous eye-killing Cockatrice,
Th' inchaunting Syren, which doth so entice,
The weeping Crocodile: these vile pernicious three.
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{303} A similar form of disparagement is depicted in Shakespeare's Sonnet 130 where the poet envisions his mistress as having wiry hair, bad breath, and less than ideal features. The difference between this poem and the ones surveyed in this section is the intensity of language used in Sonnet 130 and poems such as Sidney's Sonnet 29 and Drayton's Sonnet 30.

\textsuperscript{304} Zimmermann, 'Bright Hair and Brittle Bones', 161.
The Basiliske his nature takes from thee,
Who for my life in secret do’st lye

(Idea’s Mirror, 30: 1–6)

In addition to repeated references to a host of creatures, like Sidney in Sonnet 29 of *Astrophil and Stella* Drayton uses the technique of repetition to convey excess. A frenetic display of repetition characterises Drayton’s denigration of his beloved. The first five lines of the poem begin with the 'th' sound, a tone that also bookends lines one, four and five. The repetition of 'thee' and 'three' in this stanza conveys the poet/speaker’s insistence on stressing the similarities between his addressee and the creatures referenced. The tonal similarities in the words 'serpent' and 'Syren', and 'Cockatrice' and 'Crocodile', form a set of word pairs that betray an attempt at conveying an odd sense of unity—that the disparate elements that are referenced by the poet create a composite that 'resembles' Drayton’s beloved. While we are told that she resembles three serpents, the continuation of the animal-human trope in line five adds yet another element to his exaggerated and dehumanised image of his beloved.

Drayton’s poem also addresses his beloved in the second person, directing a secondary level of contempt to her. His direct addressing of his beloved is a speech act that heightens the emotional effect of his repudiation. Unlike Sidney, who frames the dissection of Stella in Sonnet 29 as an act undertaken by Love, *Idea’s Mirror* 30 features the explicit disparagement of a Petrarchan mistress by the poet/speaker himself. The speaker’s vociferous exclamations denigrate his beloved through a list that regards her as less than human.

Shifting between the familiar and unfamiliar, the speaker sees his addressee as a hybrid of human and non-human elements. His beloved is likened to a fusion of not one but three monstrous serpents. He aligns the animalistic nature of the basilisk with his addressee, suggesting it is she, not the basilisk, that is the paragon of

---

monstrosity. Drayton also dehumanises his addressee by stating that the three serpent-monsters resemble her rather than the other way round. The reversal of this description evokes the image of a pastiche comprised of all three monstrosities. Despite setting her up as having a resemblance to monsters, in each line of Drayton's description, the verbs 'killing', 'entice' and 'weeping' introduce a human element to the physiological traits accorded to his mistress. These human-like qualities familiarise readers to the monstrous form presented by Drayton, yet are contrasted with the animalistic tendencies evoked by the imagery of serpents.

An analysis of the corporeal emphasis in Drayton and Sidney's poems is suggestive of these poets' concerted efforts to unnerve and shock by subverting traditional gendered positions of the passive Petrarchan lover. The disruption of Petrarchan norms that are showcased in these poems anticipates a Gothic sensibility that is predicated on corporeality. As Aldana Reyes observes:

> Corporeality is important to the Gothic because it is, like the mode itself, caught up in a tug of war between its denunciation of the laws that define its status quo and its exploitation of carnality and gore for affective or entertainment purposes.\(^{306}\)

In these examples from Renaissance poems, the 'status quo' can be regarded as the Petrarchan trope of masculine lovers who admire and idealise their beloveds from afar, associating their addressees with the divine. Drayton and Sidney challenge this status quo by degrading their addressees instead of aligning them with divinity. But while challenging the status quo, the exaggerated representation of these grotesque female bodies problematises their reception as deviations from traditional Petrarchan norms. The opposition between the traditionally Petrarchan view of a female beloved as an individual associated with the divine is challenged by these

---

poets who conceive of their beloveds as belonging to a corporeal dimension rather than aligned with divinity.

Shifting between the boundaries of recognition and the unrecognisable, human and animal, the grotesque characters in *Astrophil and Stella* and Drayton’s *Idea’s Mirror* prefigure the treatment of the female body in *The Monk*. When viewed alongside the sonnets published in the late sixteenth century, Lewis’s novel can be read as an iteration of a longstanding literary tradition that exploits representations of female corporeality for sensational effects. Nancy J. Vickers’ work on the female body highlights the significance of earlier literary influences on early modern representations of dismemberment, viewing the fragmentation of the female body as synonymous with the Petrarchan tradition. Given the predominantly masculine speaking voices in early modern love poetry, when viewed in the context of the Gothic novel, poems that depict the dismemberment of women’s bodies can be seen as part of a masculine-oriented cultural enterprise that persists across multiple periods in English literary history. Given the increased cultural interest in knowing about the human body’s functions in the early modern period, it is unsurprising that the poems of Sidney and Drayton showcase an emphasis on corporeality, prompting a reading of female bodies in these texts as Gothic bodies. One common thread unites Drayton’s *Idea’s Mirror* Sonnet 30, Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella* Sonnet 29, and Lewis’s ‘Prioress’ scene in *The Monk*—an emphasis on corporeality that is directed at specific characters. In what follows, I will focus on a treatment of corporeality that is centred on a different perspective, the self. Poems that feature the grotesque self, I suggest, integrate both images and poetic speakers’ emotional responses in nuanced explorations of corporeal transgression.

---

Male Gothic Bodies and the Self

The rhetoric of excess that is used by Lewis in his depiction of the Prioress's death also highlights his treatment of the text's male protagonist, suggesting a fascination with corporeality and the grotesque that is inclusive of male bodies. In early modern poems, however, the depiction of male Gothic bodies has particular implications that differ from the representation of male characters in Gothic texts. These key differences are connected to the variances between the literary modes of the novel and first-person poems. Early modern poetry privileges representations of male poet/speaker's selves, while Gothic texts privilege representations of characters. Lyric poetry evokes reactions through the articulation of speakers' emotions, while the element of negativity in Gothic novels focuses on the disturbing consequences of specific actions. Despite the differences that are endemic to these two modes, what unites the genres is the usage of dehumanisation and exaggeration as techniques that afford the exploration of corporeality.

The adoption of first-person voices in early modern poetry heightens the emotional effect of grotesque imagery, as contrasted with the third-person perspectives that dominate eighteenth-century Gothic fiction. The Gothic mode's grotesque unnerves through scenes such as the death scenes of Ambrosio and the Prioress in The Monk, where the Gothic body is presented as a spectacle. In early modern poetry, not only is the body presented as a spectacle, but readers are also privy to the emotional experiences of these poems' speakers. Portrayals of the grotesque self in these poems forge a tone of identification with readers by conveying both the mental and the physiological experiences of poet/speakers. An added dimension of emotional experience in first-person poetry heightens the effect of grotesque imagery on a reader perusing a text.

The infamous death-scene depicting the slow and painful demise of Ambrosio in Lewis's text is perhaps one of the most graphic scenes in the eighteenth-century
Gothic tradition. Both Ambrosio and the Prioress are characterised as villains, and through their deaths, Lewis engages in a form of punitive moralising where evil characters eventually meet their ends. The moral implications of killing these characters off, however, are juxtaposed against the extreme violence and explicitness involved in the depiction of their destruction. At the close of Lewis's text, the eponymous Monk is taken in the claws of the Devil and dropped from a height onto a bed of rocks, where he languishes to his death. Following this, the character's death is described in excruciating detail by the author:

Myriads of insects were called forth by the warmth; They drank the blood which trickled from Ambrosio's wounds; He had no power to drive them from him, and they fastened upon his sores, darted their stings into his body, covered him with their multitudes, and inflicted on him tortures the most exquisite and insupportable. The Eagles of the rock tore his flesh piecemeal, and dug out his eyeballs with their crooked beaks. A burning thirst tormented him; He heard the river's murmur as it rolled beside him, but strove in vain to drag himself towards the sound. Blind, maimed, helpless, and despairing, venting his rage in blasphemy and curses, execrating his existence, yet dreading the arrival of death destined to yield him up to greater torments, six miserable days did the Villain languish.  

Censored in a later edition of Lewis's text due to its graphic and excessive description, this death-scene illustrates a concentrated effort to shock and evoke a response from a reader by the author. Jack Morgan writes that 'assaults on the flesh' contextualises one of the literary conventions of the Gothic, and this is what occurs in this sequence. Ambrosio's Gothic body is a grotesque form dehumanised by violation of the body's integrity. Lewis's descriptions are excessive and excruciatingly detailed, drawing readers' attention to his helplessness as well as the

extent of his injuries. A host of descriptive terms are attached to each description of what happens to Ambrosio. The insects that attack him inflict ‘exquisite’ pain. He is tormented by a ‘burning’ thirst. The specificity of the image of eagles digging out his eyeballs with their ‘crooked’ beaks draws particular attention to the unimpeded destruction of his body that is taking place. In place of a mob of people trampling the Prioress to death, Ambrosio’s body is destroyed by a host of insects and animals, the effects of which are no less unsettling.

A reading of Lewis’s representation of Ambrosio prompts a set of questions—how does the representation of masculine corporeality in early modern texts differ from that of the Gothic? How do these differ from representations of female bodies such as Sidney’s Stella or Drayton’s serpentine mistress? Masculine corporeality in early modern texts is represented predominantly through images of the poet/speaker’s self. Early modern poets were just as willing to dehumanise the bodies of their poetic personas as they did their addressees. The idea of an early modern ‘Gothic body’ thus encompasses not only the depiction of grotesque female characters, but also includes the representation of male speakers.

Lewis’s *The Monk* is noteworthy because apart from the grotesque characters of Ambrosio and the Prioress, a poem from the text presents a male speaker whose body undergoes a grotesque transformation. ‘The Exile’ shares syntactical similarities with the novel’s final scene, but instead showcases the destruction of the body from a first-person perspective, a rare occurrence in the largely third-person narratives of eighteenth-century Gothic. ‘The Exile’ is important because, while using similar grotesque imagery to Ambrosio’s death-scene, it emphasises the self rather than fictive characters. At the textual level, ‘The Exile’ is also significant because apart from eliciting responses from its depiction of the grotesque body, it is used to reinforce an emotionally charged moment in *The Monk*. Written by Elvira’s dead husband, the poem is used by the character Elvira to convince Don Lorenzo not to carry on his pursuit of her daughter.
Similarities between 'The Exile' and Ambrosio's death-scene present a compelling view of the grotesque body from a first-person, rather than a third-person perspective. The poem describes a man, exiled from his home, wasting away in his old age. This stanza has many similar elements to Ambrosio's death-scene. The phrase 'piece-meal', the act of blood drinking and an excruciating death, motifs that recur in the novel's final scene are referenced in 'The Exile':

But not to feel slow pangs consume my liver,
To die by piece-meal in the bloom of age,
My boiling blood drank by insatiate fever,
And brain delirious with the day-star's rage [...].\textsuperscript{310}

('The Exile': 41–44; my emphases)

Lewis uses grotesque realism and exaggeration in this sequence to emphasise the speaker's fear. He achieves this by distilling the intangible process of ageing into a tangible experience of being eaten alive. Rather than describing how he languishes in his age, the speaker imagines himself being consumed by age. The prolonged duration of ageing is condensed into a shorter period of time by Lewis's motif of consumption. His liver is eaten by the slow pangs of age, and his blood is sucked dry by a fever. The vocabulary of the grotesque draws attention to the physical world rather than the world of the abstract. Emotions are rendered as tangible sensations, as the feeling of experiencing 'slow pangs' is personified as an individual that consumes the speaker. The intangible concept of a fever is also personified, described as a vampiric individual that is insatiable. Envisioning himself as being eaten alive adds an element of tangibility to the speaker's fear of ageing. More importantly, the phrase 'but not' ultimately conveys the speaker's fear of ageing and dying. The vocabulary of the grotesque used by the speaker heightens and exaggerates the emotional impact of fearing death.

\textsuperscript{310} Lewis, \textit{The Monk}, 199.
The shift between abstraction and realism afforded by the technique of grotesque realism forms a key element of first-person accounts of the grotesque. First-person descriptions privilege emotions, as evidenced by Lewis's literary treatment of emotional experience in 'The Exile'. Degradation bridges the aesthetic distance between the emotional experiences of a speaker and a reader as abstract, immaterial concepts are made discernible. The ordinary experience of a fever and ageing is rendered in disturbing terms by Lewis in 'The Exile' through a process that focuses on bodily elements. Aligned with a renewed emphasis on the corporeal, Lewis generates a reconsideration of abstract concepts such as emotions. It is the transference from abstraction to materialism in poetry that heightens the effect of corporeal imagery in a first-person perspective. In other words, first-person perspectives make it easier for readers to imagine themselves in the position of the speaker's self. By transferring, or 'degrading' the intangible process of suffering as a result of a fever, Lewis's grotesque realism enables readers to forge an emotional identification with texts' speakers.

Lewis's speaker in 'The Exile' renders a poetic speaking self as a site of the grotesque, paralleling the first-person male speakers of early modern love poems. For example, in John Donne's poem 'Love's Exchange', the poet demonstrates a willingness to allow Love to deface and dissect his body, compromising its integrity:

For this, Love is enrag'd with mee,
Yet kills not. If I must example bee
   To future Rebells; If th'unborne
Must learne, by my being cut up, and torn,
   Kill, and dissect me, Love; for this
   Torture against thine owne end is;
Rack't carcasses make ill Anatomies.311 ('Love's Exchange': 36–42)

---

311 Donne, The Elegies and The Songs and Sonnets, 47.
The poet utilises techniques of grotesque realism and interstitiality. It begins with Donne personifying Love as an individual rather than using it as an abstract concept. Donne forces a re-evaluation of the idea of Love as an emotion by using personification and an emphasis on the material. What happens next is the speaker's dissection at the hands of Love, where his poetic self is 'cut up' by Love. Love takes on a dual role in this poem. The juxtaposition of these two different roles generates uncertainty by presenting two conflicting uses for the speaker's dead body. Donne's corporeal form is treated as an interstitial construct, situated both as an object of study and a symbol of Love's disassembling power. The first role adopted by Love is as a conqueror, a parallel with Sidney's flesh-wearing Love in Sonnet 29 of *Astrophil and Stella*. Here, the speaker is made an example of, his body 'cut up and torn' as a grotesque testament to Love's power. His body's utility is tied up with its status as an unnerving warning. Donne's use of the word 'torn' imbues a tone of haphazardness to line 39, suggesting a lack of order to the way in which he is destroyed and treated as an example. This lack of order is referenced again in line 42, where the speaker states that his corpse is 'rack'd'.

However, the speaker then offers himself up as the object of study, allowing Love to take on the role of a dissector. The phrase 'cut up' connects with the image of dissection in line 40, suggesting a sense of order to the method of the speaker's corporeal disfigurement. In a bizarre display, the speaker pronounces that a death-wish is preferable to being defamiliarised and turned into a 'carcass' by Love. He makes a series of hyperbolic declarations that exaggerate his willingness to compromise his own wellbeing for the sake of maintaining his bodily integrity. From asserting his identity in lines 36, 37, 39 and 40, he then describes himself as a mere corpse in line 42, a testament to the ill effects wrought by the process of torture. The stanza is charged with irony as he reveals that he is content to have his bodily integrity compromised as long as it occurs after he is dead.
Offering a disturbing suggestion to Love, Donne legitimises the desecration of his own body post-mortem. He longs not only to be killed, but to have his body dissected so that his anatomy can be used as a vehicle for learning. When compared with the helplessness experienced by characters such as Ambrosio and the Prioress in Lewis's novel, the speaker's eagerness to subject his body to fragmentation amplifies the unnerving effects of the grotesque in this poem. Donne's grotesque vision is presented via his speaker's predicament. He is faced with two alternatives—compromise his body's integrity, or be dissected. Both choices involve bodily disintegration, presenting an unnerving articulation of desire's detrimental effects. Emphasising physicality rather than emotionality, the experience of pain is 'degraded', creating a tone that allows readers to empathise with the speaker.

'Love's Exchange' also exemplifies the poet's willingness to compromise the corporeal integrity of his poetic self. Donne's bodily disfigurement is indicative of a broader preoccupation with corporeality that entails both the disparagement of the female addressee as well as the male self in early modern poetry. An overarching fascination with the body can be gleaned from the representation of both female and male dismemberment in early modern poems. What unites the depiction of grotesque bodies in early modern poetry, male and female alike, is how the language of excess is used in both textual modes. Exaggeration, in Gothic and early modern texts alike, provokes responses by distorting the features of a given concept, prompting a rethink of how these concepts relate to the world. In these textual modes, the use of exaggeration gives rise to disturbing emotional effects.

In a broader context, Donne's speaker's willingness to offer himself up as a subject for experimentation in 'Love's Exchange' exemplifies early modern poets' interest in the anatomical sciences. Poetic interest in anatomical dissection was informed by public displays of the human body. In early modern Europe, autopsies were conducted in anatomical theatres, where crowds of people and scholars would gather to learn more about the body. This created a widespread socio-cultural
preoccupation with corporeality. This fascination with corporeality filtered through from these public displays to other parts of scientific and artistic endeavours in the early modern period.312 The works of artists such as Leonardo da Vinci in the early sixteenth century reflects a blending of scientific discovery and artistic representation. Leonardo was fascinated by the human body; human conception, growth and the generation of human emotions were amongst a host of topics that captivated his interest.313 Leonardo often conducted dissections, and many of his anatomical drawings outline aspects of human physiology in great detail. Poets’ familiarisation with the inner workings of the body through such social and cultural sources thus emerges in their use of images that challenge the integrity of the human body.

Poems such as Donne's 'Love's Exchange', 'The Dampe' and Sonnet 50 from Michael Drayton’s Idea explicitly addressed the concept of dissecting the self, a testament to their awareness of scientific processes such as dissection and autopsies. Nancy J. Vickers outlines the intersection between science and creative expression:

> It could be argued that what lay at the heart of both poetic and anatomical practices of dissection was the poet or scientist’s virtuoso display of a fundamentally scandalous art: it is in the masterful publishing of the secrets of the body by means of a masterful wielding of an instrument that the medical dissector's art meets poet-rhetorician.314

The poet, armed with the knowledge possessed by dissectors and scientists, could exhibit a form of control over the human body in poetic verses. Francis Bacon’s oft cited 1597 remark of knowledge as a source of God’s power is also relevant to these

---


314 Vickers, 'Members Only;' 7.
poets' investment in corporeality and bodily functions. Knowledge of the body's inner workings would provide poets with a source of quasi-divine power. More importantly, poets' awareness of the inner workings of the body through these social and cultural sources thus emerges in their use of images that question the concept of the human body as a complete, 'ideal' construct. 'Love's Exchange' revels in the poet's appropriation of the scientist's role of bodily study, but at the same time enmeshes the rhetoric of science with the poetic conceit of having a source of control over nature.

Donne's fascination with dissection, study of the body and desire is also presented in 'The Dampe'. At its basic level, Donne draws on the equation of desire with death as a conceit. He then exaggerates the conceit by using grotesque realism, likening the effects of desire to that of a toxic contagion that has claimed his life. As a consequence, the poet envisions his body being autopsied by doctors in a bid to determine the cause of his death. His corpse is examined and a picture of his beloved is found lodged in his chest cavity:

When I am dead, and Doctors know not why,
    And my friends' curiositie
Will have me cut up to survay each part,
When they shall finde your Picture in my heart,
    You think a sodaine dampe of love
Will thorough all their senses move,
And worke on them as mee, and so preferre
Your murder, to the name of Massacre. (The Dampe’: 1–8)

As Robert Ray writes, the poem begins with the poet/speaker's tacit acknowledgement that the reader is aware of the Petrarchan conceit of unrequited

315 Francis Bacon, Essays, Religious Meditations (London, 1598), 27.
316 Donne, The Elegies and The Songs and Sonnets, 49.
desire. Building on readers' expectations, Donne exaggerates this conceit by using an imperative tone to focus a reader's attention on the corporeal effects of desire. This tone is enforced by the poet's use of the words 'when' and 'will' to bookend the poem's first two couplets. The repeated 'w' sounds used in these bookended couplets persists through this segment in five out of eight lines, a tonal consistency that reinforces the poet's hyperbolic treatment of desire.

The effect that results from Donne's use of repetition in this first section of the poem is a sense of pervasiveness that coincides with his broader point likening desire to a toxic vapour. 'Damp', as the term is used in this poem, refers to noxious vapours emitted from a particular agent. The 'w' sound that persists throughout the poem is analogous with the poem's thematic conceit of vapours that emerge as a result of the speaker's dissection. Framed in the form of a noxious fume, desire is transferred to the realm of the material, both causing the speaker's death and threatening to affect others in a literalised form of emotional contagion. This section of the poem concludes with an alliterated 'm' sound in line eight, underscoring the urgency by which the speaker implores his audience to take action. References to murder and massacre once again exaggerate the effects of desire to the point of hyperbole through the speaker's dire and furtive warning.

Playing on the trope of post-mortem study of the body, Donne's dissection poems present a series of speakers that challenges the notion of wholeness. Desire causes death, but in Donne's grotesque vision, even death does not prevent the compromise of bodily integrity. While Donne's dissection poems feature an element of curiosity, Michael Drayton presents a horrific scenario in Idea, Sonnet 50 of an individual tortured for the sake of science.

---

The speaker of Sonnet 50, however, is operated on against his will in an act of torture. Drayton presents a reader with the motif of scientific study, but turns the academic study of the body into a horrific undertaking synonymous with suffering and pain. Exaggerating the effects of desire and comparing it to a tortuous experience, the speaker imagines himself as the victim of surgeons who precede the clichéd Gothic 'mad scientist' archetype of Shelley’s Victor Frankenstein. The theme of anatomical study is presented by Drayton in a horrific scenario where one is experimented on while alive and fully conscious, thus feeling the painful effects of these experiments:

As in some Countries, farre remote from hence,
The wretched Creature, destined to die,
Hauing the Iudgement due to his Offence,
By Surgeons beg’d, their Art on him to trie,
Which on the Living worke without remorse,
First make incision on each mast’ring Veine,
Then stanch the bleeding, then trans-pierce the Coarse,
And with their Balmes recure the Wounds againe;
Then Poyson, and with Physike him restore:
Not that they feare the hope-lesse Man to kill,
But their Experience to increase the more;\(^{319}\) (\textit{Idea}, 50: 1–11)

Drayton exaggerates the effects of desire in a similar manner to Donne. The poet achieves this by using the techniques of interstitiality and exaggeration. Drayton's speaker is suspended in a horrific interstitial state that is neither life nor death. More importantly, he is, like Lewis's Prioress, reduced to being described as less than human through the process of corporeal transgression—as a 'creature' and a 'coarse' (corpse). Drayton stresses and emphasises his abject, dehumanised status as one that is both 'wretched' and 'hopeless'. He is subsequently restored by medicines and is

\(^{319}\) Drayton, \textit{Works}, 2:335.
described as a ‘man’ through a process that provides but a temporary respite. Drayton’s description of his torment is one that lingers on the smallest detail, all explained in excruciating details from lines six to nine. The omission of the speaker/victim’s sensation from the poem generates an effect where a reader is prompted to imagine the incisions, piercings and poisonings that are inflicted on Drayton’s body. Merging the concept of science with desire, Drayton’s poem aligns the impalpable effect of desire with the tangible sensation of pain. These associations between pain and desire reinforce what culminates in not a description of torture, but a scathing criticism of Drayton’s beloved.

Drayton’s grotesque realism frames the poem as a description of torture, and it is only towards the close of the sonnet that readers are made aware of the connection between an emotional effect and the corporeal transgression that the speaker has been subject to:

Ev’n so my Mistres workes upon my Ill;
By curing me, and killing me each How’r,
Onely to shew her Beauties Sov’raigne Pow’r (12–14)

While his efforts in this poem demonstrate a host of hyperbolic conceits, the process of torture and restoration outlines the poet’s attempt to forge a sense of emotional identification with his readers. The speaker’s beloved is aligned with the unnamed surgeons mentioned earlier. In these concluding lines the speaker reveals that the pains afflicted on him by the surgeons’ experiments are akin to the experience of being affected by his beloved’s beauty.

The process of dehumanisation and exaggeration that Drayton’s body undergoes is also framed through the rhetoric of colonial power. The speaker denigrates his body as one that is likened to a colonial subject, noted by his opening reference to ‘countries farre remote from hence’ in the first line of the poem. The concluding line bookends this idea when he states that his beloved is a ‘sovereign power’. What emerges is a complicated dialectic that both eschews the ‘foreignness’
of inhumane physiological experimentation but compares it to the actions of a localised sovereign.

More importantly, the tone of exaggeration that is centred on physical pain is transferred from the surgeon–victim relationship mentioned in the first half of the poem to the beloved–victim relationship. The speaker is cured and killed repeatedly by his beloved in a seemingly endless cycle of dehumanisation and restoration that occurs with alarming frequency 'each hour'. The exaggerated effects of desire leave Drayton's speaker suspended in a state where he is neither dead nor alive.

The surgeons featured in this poem are inhumane, seeing their 'art' as more important than the speaker's life, but they also act as a metatextual comment on Drayton's speaker/poet persona. Drayton's exaggerated description of his ceaseless torture conceals the fact that he is both the architect and executor of his pain. The minute details that mark the speaker's torture in turn reflect Drayton's fascination with medical practice and the study of the body. By weaving the rhetoric of suffering through physiological experimentation into his interpretation of emotional suffering, Drayton presents a reinterpretation of the Petrarchan conceit of the unrequited male lover. In imagining himself as a corpse, his voluntary submission to his mistress's power is balanced by his rhetorical power as a poet/dissector.

The characterisation of both speakers and characters, including both male and female, as grotesque is perhaps telling of a fascination with corporeality in early modern love poetry that encompasses both genders. In some texts, such as Sidney's *Astrophil and Stella* Sonnet 29 and Drayton's *Idea's Mirror* Sonnet 30, a female character is rendered as a grotesque spectacle. In other texts, such as Drayton's Sonnet 50 from *Idea* and Donne's 'The Dampe', the poet's self is rendered as a spectacle. More importantly, the rendering of poet/speakers and characters as grotesque allows for a reading of the early modern 'Gothic body' as one that transcends gender positions.
'From my breast the cold heart taking': Grotesque Realism and Hearts

In taking inspiration from anatomical study, it is also unsurprising to note that in the works of early modern poet/dissectors, images of the heart abound. Renaissance works from Vesalius and Leonardo expounded on the functions of the heart. In his seminal text *The Fabric of the Human Body*, Andreas Vesalius devoted a section to the processes surrounding 'how to dissect the heart'. In addition to Vesalius’s treatise, the heart also formed the subject of numerous illustrations from Leonardo da Vinci. Many of his illustrations of the heart were of animals' hearts, but Leonardo was fully aware of the differences between man and animal. In one of his comments, Leonardo stresses the importance of a practical approach to knowledge of human anatomy rather than relying on treatises and books. Medical scientists such as Vesalius and William Harvey sought to examine the 'real' function of the heart as opposed to religious views of the 'Sacred Heart' in the period. In 1628, Harvey published *De motu cordis*, a treatise on the heart that outlined the connections between the circulatory functions of the veins, lungs and the heart itself.

---


323 Farzad Sharifan, René Dirven, Ning Yu and Susan Niemeier, ‘Culture and Language: Looking for the “Mind” inside the Body,’ in *Culture, Body and Language: Conceptualizations of Internal Body Organs Across Cultures and Languages*, edited by Farzad Sharifan, René Dirven, Ning Yu and Susanne Niemeier (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2008), 6.
The emergence of anatomical study in the Renaissance ushered in new ways of understanding the functioning of the body. This was juxtaposed against traditional literary interpretations of the heart. Associations of the heart as a symbol for desire and a newfound interest in anatomy led to the authoring of works that played on the symbolic and literal meanings behind images of human hearts. The heart, Edmund Spenser writes in Sonnet 50 of *Amoretti* (1595), is the 'chief' of the body, ruling over all other members of the human body. Spenser's use of heart-imagery, and the use by other Renaissance poets including Shakespeare and John Donne, reflects a growing emphasis on representations of the heart in early modern English poetry. What resulted from the convergence of science and literary tradition were works that introduced new meanings to the symbolic status of the heart as a vehicle for affection and desire. In lieu of its renewed importance through advances in early modern science, an emphasis on corporeality granted unnerving and disturbing implications for the use of heart-imagery in love poetry.

For example, John Donne's 'The Legacie' and Shakespeare's Sonnet 31 demonstrate a poetic engagement with the theme of hearts. Taking on the role of poet/dissector, the speakers of these poems contemplate the act of removing the heart, an act that is charged with two levels of meaning. On the one hand, these poems beg to be read at the level of metaphor, where the heart is regarded as a 'vehicle' as longstanding symbol of desire and love.\(^{324}\) This is because, as Lakoff and Johnson write, the comprehension of an intangible, 'emotional concept' such as love is better understood through the use of metaphors.\(^{325}\)

In Shakespeare's Sonnet 31, the heart is presented as an image that carries connotations of desire and love, but has disturbing implications when read through

---

324 René Dirven, 'Metaphor as a Basic Means of Extending the Lexicon,' in *The Ubiquity of Metaphor: Metaphor in Language and Thought*, edited by Wolf Paprotté and René Dirven (Amsterdam: Benjamins, 1985), 89.

the lens of grotesque realism. The poem begins with a display of excess, where the poet's addressee wears a set of hearts as trophies. Shakespeare plays on the difference between metaphor and realism in the first section of the poem, using exaggeration to describe his beloved as a figure that is universally adored, as evidenced by his use of the word 'all' in lines one, three and four:

    Thy bosom is endeared with all hearts,
    Which I by lacking have supposed dead;
    And there reigns Love, and all Love's loving parts,
    And all those friends which I thought buried.326 (Sonnet 31: 1–4)

Each line plays on a different meaning of the word 'heart'. The first and third lines take the meaning as a metaphor, whilst the references to death in the second and fourth lines suggest a reading centred on realism. The opening line of the speaker's addressee being 'endeared' with hearts begs to be read as a metaphor, where hearts represent desire. But the speaker then considers the heart-metaphor literally in the next line when he states that not having his heart will kill him. Following this, the mentions of 'Love' and 'Love's loving parts' once again consider the heart as a metaphor. A reference to burial in the fourth line of the poem builds on the conceit of death introduced previously, re-introducing a tone of realism.

    Shifts between the symbolic use of heart-imagery and the literal expose the unnerving implications of being 'endeared' with human hearts. The poet himself urges the consideration of both meanings, as evidenced by his use of the word 'and' at the start of lines three and four. Blurring the lines between reality and the metaphorical, Shakespeare's grotesque vision is juxtaposed against the purely metaphorical connotations attached to imagery of the human heart in this poem.

References to the heart as a metaphor are juxtaposed against references to corporeality, where the notion of 'lacking a heart' points to its realistic connotations.

As the poem progresses, Shakespeare repeatedly references the subject of death, prompting readers to consider the implications of losing one’s heart. Multiple references which connect the loss of a heart with the subject of death are scattered all through the sonnet, and it is in the next section where Shakespeare’s use of heart-imagery takes on a realistic dimension. In turn, this enables a reading of the poem that considers the disturbing implication of a woman wearing a trophy-necklace of harvested hearts:

How many a holy and obsequious tear
Hath dear religious love stol’n from mine eye,
As interest of the dead, which now appear
But things removed that hidden in thee lie!
Thou art the grave where buried love doth live,
Hung with the trophies of my lovers gone,
Who all their parts of me to thee did give,
That due of many now is thine alone:
Their images I loved, I view in thee,
And thou (all they) hast all the all of me.327 (Sonnet 31: 5–14)

The phrases 'supposed dead' in line two and 'thought buried' in line four are followed up with further references to death—phrases 'the dead', 'the grave' and 'buried love' suggest that what the poet/speaker is addressing is the loss of an actual human heart. Line seven extrapolates the conceit of hearts and death when the poet refers to the hearts adorning his addressee as synecdochical substitutes for 'the dead', a host of unfortunate others who have died as fellow victims of his mistress's power.

Shakespeare’s Sonnet 31 takes a well known and traditional conceit of desire and its associations with the heart, exploiting the potential for this abstract conceit to

327 Shakespeare, Sonnets, 137.
be imagined in a different way. Without saying so outright, the poem depicts a
Petranch mistress as a figure that inspires horror. The confronting image of a
mistress who wears the hearts of her victims as gruesome trophies is presented to
readers as a statement of the power of the 'cruel mistress'. The intersecting
connotations of metaphor and grotesque realism, coupled with the mistress's brazen
display of grotesque trophies, imbue an existing concept with new meaning.
Shakespeare's grotesque configuration reframes a recognisable conceit—the cruel
fair—as a character that is to be feared.

A complex dynamic thus emerges in Sonnet 31, one that is centred on two
perspectives, the evocation of responses to a grotesque character as well as the
grotesque self. It begins with the image of Shakespeare's beloved wearing a set of
human hearts. Line two then leads to readers envisioning the poem's speaker
delivering his lines with his heart ripped out. The speaker's act of tearing in lines five
and six reinforce the emotional effect of having his bodily integrity compromised.
This effect is heightened when the poet introduces his mistress wielding her garish
trophies. Combining both first- and third-person perspectives on the grotesque,
Shakespeare invites readers to consider the horrific implications of corporeal
transgression from a point of view that integrates a form of somatic empathy, as well
as directing revulsion towards the speaker's mistress's disturbing display.

Another poem that plays on the relationship between heart-metaphors and
grotesque realism is John Donne's 'The Legacie'. Hearts and death form the forefront
of this confusing poem. The speaker adopts two different roles, one of which is his
poetic self, and the other a dissector:

Though I be dead, which sent mee, I should be
Mine owne executor and Legacie.328

('The Legacie': 7–8)

328 Donne, The Elegies and The Songs and Sonnets, 50.
As both 'executor' and 'legacy', Donne envisions himself dissecting his own body. The poet's word choice is important here, as the double meaning attached to the word 'executor' is subsequently used later on in the poem. Taking on the role of a dissector, Donne's executor-self dissects his character-self:

I heard mee say, Tell her anon,
That my selfe, that's you, not I,
Did kill me,'and when I felt mee dye,
I bid mee send my heart, when I was gone;
But I alas could there finde none,
When I had ripp'd me,'and search'd where hearts should lye;
It kill'd mee'againe that I who still was true,
In life, in my last Will should cozen you.\textsuperscript{329} (9–16)

The poem's confusing set of interactions begin by the executor examining the speaker, attempting to remove the speaker's heart as a promised gift to their beloved. Line thirteen conflates the established relationship between executor and victim, causing both roles to be merged into one. The speaker's exclamation in line thirteen conveys a sense of surprise when he realises that he is killing himself. The onomatopoeic resonance of Donne's word choice—'ripping'—heightens the effect of the speaker's unsuspecting act of self-harm. The line also plays on his role as executor as he is both the executor of his will and simultaneously his own killer. The alliteration of 'ripp'd' and 'search'd', in particular, heightens the disturbing implications of tearing out one's own heart. Both words introduce a realistic dimension to the metaphorical association of the heart with desire. The act of searching charges the line with a tone of curiosity that suggests an attempt at anatomical investigation. The speaker's concluding remark in line thirteen, that he should expect to find the heart in a specific area, also contributes to this feel of realism. The speaker's dual selves mirror the poet's confusing blend of metaphor and

\textsuperscript{329} Donne, The Elegies and The Songs and Sonnets, 50.
realism, switching between both through the poem. 'The Legacie', like Shakespeare's Sonnet 31, extrapolates and exaggerates the cultural significance of the heart by weaving the subject of death and anatomical study with tropes from love poetry. The consequence is a set of poems that offer a grotesque consideration of what happens when one's heart is, quite literally, removed.

A reading of the shifts between metaphor and realism that occur in relation to representations of the heart is pertinent to this discussion because it is a literary technique that is also used by Matthew Lewis in a poem in *The Monk*. At the start of Lewis's novel, the character Matilda seduces the protagonist with a musical ballad titled 'Durandarte and Belerma', making him 'struggle with desire'. A closer look at the poem however reveals a use of grotesque realism that is particularly interesting when considered alongside poems such as 'The Legacie' and Shakespeare's Sonnet 31.

What takes place in this sequence is a reversal of courtly love traditions. The eponymous Monk takes on the role of an unattainable beloved who is in turn courted by a woman. The ballad that Matilda uses to seduce Ambrosio has a distinctly courtly love theme, with a twist that is centred on the trope of a human heart. Grotesque realism is used by Lewis at the textual level as a means for capturing his protagonist's attention, but in doing so he presents to readers the disturbing image of having one's heart cut from one's body.

'Durandarte and Belerma' tells the story of the dying knight Durandarte, lamenting that he will not be able to see his beloved Belerma before he dies. Wounded on a battlefield, Durandarte beseeches his cousin Montesinos to carry a message to his beloved. Belerma is characterised as an archetypal cruel mistress who scorns the knight at every turn, a character type that is similar to Shakespeare and Donne's cruel mistresses:

---

'Oh! Belerma! Oh! my dear-one!
For my pain and pleasure born!
Seven long years I served thee, fair-one,
Seven long years my fee was scorn:

'And when now thy heart replying
To my wishes, burns like mine,
Cruel Fate my bliss denying
Bids me every hope resign.'331 ('Durandarte and Belerma': 9–16)

Durandarte, the speaker of this segment, adopts the stance of a typical Petrarchan lover. His affections are unrequited, but after a long spell, she relents just as he meets his death. Lewis uses the image of Belerma's heart as a symbol of her emotional reciprocation of her suitor's affections. The image of a 'burning heart' in line fourteen also begs to be read symbolically. Subsequently, the dying knight tells his cousin to take his 'cold heart' from his breast and deliver it to Belerma. The poem's twist sees the knight's cousin taking his request literally:

When my Soul these limbs forsaking
Eager seeks a purer air,
From my breast the cold heart taking,
Give it to Belerma's care.332 (25–28)

To perform his promise made, He
Cut the heart from out the breast,
That Belerma, wretched Lady!
Might receive the last bequest.333 (61–64)

331 Lewis, The Monk, 93.
332 Lewis, The Monk, 93.
333 Lewis, The Monk, 94.
The interpretation of Durandarte's request is one that is shrouded in ambiguity. Blurring the lines between metaphor and realism, the knight's request can be taken either way. Montesinos's response to Durandarte's ambiguous statement results in the gruesome removal of the knight's heart as a gift to his beloved. The taking of Durandarte's heart is an exaggerated gesture that is affecting on several levels. Firstly, at the level of the text, the gift of his heart is aimed at evoking an emotional reaction from Belerma as an act of revenge. Montesinos's denigration of her as a 'wretched lady' is telling of his attempt at unnerving her with his cousin's heart. Secondly, the unexpected shift from treatment of the heart as a metaphor to realism is aimed at affecting readers. The act of witnessing the removal of an organ 'cut' from a dead body is aimed at disturbing and provoking reactions from a text's reader. Thirdly, the fact that the poem is embedded in a textual narrative means that, at the level of the text, the emotional punch of its twist is leveraged to also provoke a response from Ambrosio.

'Durandarte and Belerma', 'The Legacie' and Shakespeare's Sonnet 31 are texts that provoke and explore the consequences of removing the human heart as a feature of the grotesque, Gothic body. Shifting between the symbolic and the literal, these descriptions evoke emotional responses by imbuing immaterial and abstract concepts with a tone of realism. Combining techniques of grotesque realism and interstitiality, these authors aim to provoke responses by exaggerating the effects of desire on individuals. From the Renaissance to the 1790s alike, authors exploited metaphors of the heart in literary explorations that challenged the status of the body as a complete construct. What results, in both Lewis's poem and those of his early modern predecessors, is a focus on the horrific implications of corporeality. Lewis, Donne and Shakespeare alike unnerve readers by delving into the dark desires that prompt metaphoric and abstract representations.

Equally importantly, the use of the poem 'Durandarte and Belerma' in Lewis's novel is a recognition, on the part of Lewis, of the potential afforded by poetic form
in the generation of emotional affect. Placed side by side, these examples illustrate the differences between first- and third-person forms and the varying degrees of affect that arise from comparing representations of the grotesque across these two textual forms. As a narrative poem that details the treatment of a character, the use of grotesque realism in this text is arguably of a diminished register when compared with the dissection of the self that is featured in 'The Legacie' and Shakespeare's Sonnet 31. While Montesinos extracts Durandarte’s heart when he is dead, 'The Legacie' features Donne taking out his own heart, with the implication that he is still alive when he does so.

Shakespeare's Sonnet 31, John Donne's 'The Legacie' and The Monk expose the potential for the imagery of the heart to unnerve. By introducing an element of corporeality to texts that present images of the heart, these authors' literary treatment of the organ blur the lines between the metaphorical and the realistic. In doing this, they present disturbing alternatives to the heart's traditional associations with love. It is particularly interesting that contemporary developments in coronary studies suggest that what we regard as metaphors might not be that abstract after all. 'Broken Heart Syndrome', or 'Takotsubo' cardiomyopathy is a condition that has received renewed attention in recent years.\textsuperscript{334} This condition is one where emotional stress causes the heart to cease functioning. Regardless of these recent developments, what emerges from the study of these texts across both periods is a firm recognition of the importance of the heart as the 'chief' aspect of the body. Its relation to the physical as well as emotional aspects of the body was expounded in early modern poetry and the Gothic in ways that brought a renewed emphasis on corporeality.

The final example I want to discuss involves the depiction of supernaturalism, a theme that has been addressed in a previous chapter. John Donne's poem 'A

Valediction: of my Name in the Window’ weaves ideas of anatomical study with an interest in the body. In this poem, the poet/speaker contemplates the unnerving implications of life after death. The poet’s interest in architecture and corporeality are telling of an intellectual engagement with the world that assisted in shaping, quite literally, his grotesque vision. Along with an interest in these themes, Donne’s interrogation of the possibility of life after death points to another facet of an early modern Gothic sensibility—supernaturalism. Compared to other poems that rely heavily on the imagery of anatomical study, and despite the fact that this poem is centred on the grotesque self, this poem’s reliance on supernaturalism diminishes the emotional resonance of its depiction of the Gothic body. While Donne draws on the notion of grotesque realism in this poem, the effect of this poem is ultimately diminished, as it preferences the supernatural rather than the realistic.

The speaker sees himself returning from the grave to haunt his beloved. He begins by describing his name as a ragged, bone like structure that symbolises his ‘ruinous Anatomie’.\(^{335}\) Subsequently, Donne confronts his addressee with a host of disembodied body parts:

\[
\text{Then, as all my soules bee}
\]
\[
\text{Emparadis’d in you, (in whom alone}
\]
\[
\text{I understand, and grow and see,)}
\]
\[
\text{The rafters of my body, bone}
\]
\[
\text{Being still with you, the Muscle, Sinew,’and Veine}
\]
\[
\text{Which tile this house, will come againe.}\(^{336}\)
\]

(‘A Valediction: of My Name’, st. v: 4–6)

What occurs in this poem is the reverse of what happens to Lewis’s Prioress. While the Prioress is fragmented into grotesque bits of flesh, Donne’s speaker has his body reconstituted from a series of fragmented parts, a process that is no less disturbing.

\(^{335}\) Donne, The Elegies and The Songs and Sonnets, 65.

\(^{336}\) Donne, The Elegies and The Songs and Sonnets, 65.
Stanza v takes the reader/addressee through the process of reconstruction, beginning with the speaker's soul. Following this, the poet introduces a line break and an interjection, calling the reader/addressee's attention to witness the disturbing image of his 'body' and 'bone'. The line that follows then lists three aspects of his corporeal form as other disparate parts that are welded together in a makeshift-looking form. The reverse-fragmentation that Donne undergoes in this poem plays on, and reverses, the trope of fragmentation in a way that is equally disturbing.

By evoking a comparison of human physiology with architecture, Donne's grotesque image challenges the idea of the human body as a completely formed structure. Equally importantly, in calling his addressee's attention to these parts, he demonstrates a concerted effort to shock and unnerve his beloved. The speaker's body takes on the shape of a house, and if his bones correspond to the house's rafters, it follows that his muscles and other parts of his flesh become the dwelling's walls.\textsuperscript{337} Donne presents a reader with the horrific vision of a house made not from ribbed vaults but rafters of bone and tiles of human flesh.\textsuperscript{338} The speaker is fully cognisant of the disturbing nature of his fragmented body parts coming together.\textsuperscript{339}

\textsuperscript{337} The architectural motif which inspired Donne's conceit in this poem might have been inspired by ribbed vaulting, an architectural feature used in the Gothic style. See Robert A. Scott, \textit{The Gothic Enterprise: A Guide to Understanding the Medieval Cathedral} (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), 110.

\textsuperscript{338} As Dean of (Old) St Paul's Cathedral, Donne's activities in the church would have granted him familiarity with the appearance of ribbed vaulting. Given that ribbed vaults in medieval churches also resemble the rafters that support the roof of a house, Donne's reference to rafters in line four of this poem suggests that he drew inspiration from the appearance of both churches and domestic dwellings in the fashioning of this metaphor. Illustrations of the interior of Old St Pauls can be found in the Royal Collection at Windsor Castle. See Wenceslaus Hollar's print 'Old St Paul's: Interior of east end. View of St. Mary's Chapel behind high altar, showing 7 lancet windows and rose window'. \textit{The Royal Collection}, Windsor. Also see William Dugdale's \textit{The History of St Paul's Cathedral in London} (London: Thomas Warren, 1658), 117.

\textsuperscript{339} The Sedlec Ossuary, a chapel in the Czech Republic, is a church that is literally made of bones. One of many structures erected in this style across Europe in the Middle Ages, the Cistercian monastery of Sedlec was erected in the Middle Ages and had a chapel built according to the style of Gothic architecture in the fifteenth century. Six pyramids made from human bones were erected in
In addition to creating a grotesque image of a house made of fragmented human body parts, Donne continues to unnerve the reader when he introduces the concept of the disparate body parts combining with each other to become a complete arrangement. The unnerving image of a disintegrated human body is altered once again, symbolising a body which is constantly changing. From dismantled to becoming whole, Donne's Gothic body is in a state of continual flux. The comparison here is with the idea of resurrection, and this stanza reflects the poet's belief in life after death, as the disparate parts of his body will 'come again'. While Donne draws on the imagery of divine resurrection after one's demise, he also points out that parts of his body remain with his beloved. She is haunted by the disassembled parts of the poet's body. Imperfection, Donne proposes, may well result from life after death. Resurrection, an idea associated with God, is degraded in this poem by Donne in an example of grotesque realism. The ideal, an eternity of perfection that awaits an individual after death, is questioned by the poet by a reflection on the physicality of one's corpse. Materiality, rather than abstraction, is the poet's emphasis as he meditates on the disturbing implications of a fragmented body coming together once again.

The poem also reads as Donne's use of interstitiality in an assertion of power over his beloved, a divergence from the stance adopted in the poems 'Love's Exchange' and 'The Dampe'. His supernatural resurrection is used as a tool to evoke an emotional response from his beloved. In his first-person voice, the poet assures his addressee that he will return from the dead, albeit in a somewhat unrecognisable state. We know that the bricolage of flesh and bone is Donne's body because of his speaker's words. By describing, and laying claim to the corpse-house that is his body,
Donne evokes revulsion towards the exhibition of his grotesquely restored form as he presents it to both readers of his poem and his beloved.

While I began research for this chapter with an awareness of the differences between love poetry and the Gothic novel, my findings suggest that the differences in first-/third-person voices and the self/character division are perhaps not as clear-cut as initially surmised. First-person poems occasionally address the treatment of grotesque characters rather than the self. Third-person narratives occasionally address the treatment of the self rather than the addressee.

Scholarship of representations of the grotesque in *The Monk* are drawn to Lewis's depiction of characters—the Prioress and Ambrosio. This has often neglected the representation of other grotesque characters in the novel's embedded poem, namely the speaker of 'The Exile' and Durandarte from 'Durandarte and Belerma'. The analysis of poetry undertaken in this chapter has reclaimed the importance of these poems to Lewis's grotesque vision. Out of these examples of Gothic bodies in *The Monk*, 'The Exile' stands out as a first-person text that combines ideas of corporeality with the emotional experience of the body's deteriorating state. 'The Exile' reads as Lewis's recognition of the intrinsic value of first-person poetic form as a vehicle for emotional affect. Mediated through ideas of grotesque realism, 'The Exile' spotlights the grotesque self as a compelling and disturbing facet of the Gothic mode that is equally as important as the mode's treatment of Gothic characters.

Lewis's brief use of the first-person voice in 'The Exile' resonates in the work of other Gothic novelists of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century. American author Charles Brockden Brown's *Wieland* (1798), published several years after *The Monk*. Readers of Brown's text are privy to his narrator's emotional state at various points in the novel, such as at the start of Chapter 6, where the act of recalling events from her memory have disturbing, exaggerated physiological
effects—her blood is 'congealed', fingers 'palsied' and she is 'sickened'. Charles Maturin’s *Melmoth the Wanderer* (1820) is also framed as a first-person account. These examples signify the value placed on the first-person voice by later Gothic novelists. These examples point to what Anne Williams describes as the poetic aspect of the Gothic mode, a recognition by novelists of the inherent value in adopting the point of view associated with a much older literary form—that of poetry.  

Conversely, in turning to the genre of Petrarchan love poetry through the Gothic, we also glean an insight into the primarily first-person voiced genre. While the self is often spotlighted as a site of corporeal transgression in texts such as Donne’s dissection poems, other texts—Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella* Sonnet 29, Drayton’s *Idea’s Mirror* Sonnet 30 and, to a lesser extent, Shakespeare’s Sonnet 31—turn the reader’s gaze towards the Petrarchan mistress as a site of horror. It is in these poems that similarities with the visual excesses of Lewis's novel can be located. These uber-Petrarchan configurations of grotesque characters reveal an interest in corporeal transgression that is a staple of the Gothic mode.

**Conclusion**

Grotesque bodies are a mainstay of Gothic fiction. Eighteenth-century Gothic featured images of human bodies that emphasised their fragmentation. Scenes from the 'horror Gothic' school of Matthew Lewis presented an eighteenth-century readership with a vision of the body that detracted from ideas of wholeness and completeness. While my analysis has privileged *The Monk* as a cornerstone of

---


eighteenth-century Gothic, the technique of first-person perspectives that Lewis experimented with would subsequently be developed by Gothic authors of the nineteenth century. The subject of hearts and the grotesque in Lewis's embedded poem 'Durandarte and Belerma', and the poems of Shakespeare and Donne reverberate in American Gothic author Edgar Allan Poe's short story 'The Tell-Tale Heart' (1843). The first-person account by Shelley's Monster in Frankenstein (1818) deals with the emotional repercussions of being judged as a consequence of one's physical deformity. The narrative fragments in Charles Robert Maturin's seminal Melmoth the Wanderer contain numerous grotesque scenes, one of which takes place in the chamber of Adonijah the Jew.\textsuperscript{342} Adonijah's chamber is decorated with skeletons, a scene that recalls the construction of Donne's flesh and bone house in 'A Valediction'.

These visions of the Gothic body in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century literature served to elicit fear, disgust and uncertainty. But as I have shown, in early modern poetic works, the grotesque was often used for its affective potential. Detailed and daring metaphoric explorations of the body were pushed to grotesque effects by poets to exploit negative responses. Across both periods, techniques of exaggeration and grotesque realism were at the forefront of authors' interest in the grotesque. From Petrarchan mistresses to suffering male speakers, both female and male bodies alike were subject to dehumanisation and fragmentation in ways that challenged the notion of the 'complete' body. These 'Gothic' bodies were realised through the language of exaggeration and grotesque realism.

Equally importantly, a fascination with the workings of the human body formed a backdrop for the grotesque vision of early modern poets. Of particular interest was the functioning of the human heart. Poets tapped into associations between the heart as a symbol of love and as a physical organ, prompting responses

\textsuperscript{342} Charles Robert Maturin, Melmoth the Wanderer, edited by Douglas Grant (London: Oxford University Press, 1968), 263.
that were at times unnerving and at times horrific. In contrasting critical
perspectives that favour elements of humour and laughter in Renaissance literature,
I have contended that the treatment of grotesque bodies in early modern poetry aim
to evoke the same emotional reactions as eighteenth-, nineteenth-century and
contemporary Gothic bodies.

The self, rather than the addressee, forms the primary site of interest for the
Renaissance poet/dissector. Being privy to displays of emotion in texts that adopt a
first-person voice adds an extra dimension to depictions of corporeal transgression
and dehumanisation. Readers are navigated through a host of poetic creations where
the poet/speaker compromises his own bodily integrity. These works showcase the
intersection of the courtly love tradition with an emerging enthusiasm for the
anatomical sciences. Through these grotesque alterations of the self, the poems
surveyed in this chapter showcase an aspect of the early modern cultural imaginary
as one that questions the very nature of bodily integrity.

The generation of responses through grotesque images of the body in early
modern poetry foreshadows a preoccupation with corporeality that is a cornerstone
of the Gothic. The representation of fragmented bodies in Renaissance love poetry
denotes an abrogation of the notion of human corporeality as synonymous with
wholeness and unity. In challenging the status quo of the classical, 'complete' human
body, early modern poets' work prefigure the often exploitative function of bodily
imagery in the Gothic tradition. Gothic novelists of the eighteenth century saw the
Renaissance as a period identifiable with notions of superstition and irrationality,
but as this chapter has shown, an emergent preoccupation with the sciences has also
tinged the creation of textual material in this period.

The representation of corporeality in Renaissance poets' creations was often
centred on a host of abstract concepts such as emotions like love, concepts that were
realised as material ideas in their verses. Grotesque realism offers a compelling way
of re-evaluating metaphorical concepts, particularly those surrounding the
symbolism of the human heart. Watching Donne and Shakespeare's speakers tear out their hearts carries horrific implications when considered through the lens of grotesque realism. Witnessing the personification of love tear the poet/speaker's body open in 'Love's Exchange' or consuming Stella's fragmented body is no less disturbing than witnessing the corporeal transgressions that are wreaked on individuals such as the Prioress and Ambrosio in *The Monk*.

Ultimately, early modern poets' emphasis on and exploitation of the affective function of corporeality is suggestive of an early modern Gothic sensibility that capitalises on the potential for grotesque images to unsettle readers. The assaults on the body analysed in this chapter form but one aspect of an early modern cultural imaginary. In the chapter that follows, I will address a separate facet of early modern culture—treatment of states of illumination.
Chapter 4: 'Black horrors of the silent night’: Darkness, Ambiguity and the Gothic

In Sonnet 7 of Sir Philip Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella*, Astrophil describes the physical features of his beloved Stella through a series of conflicting images:

> When Nature made her chiefe worke, *Stella’s eyes*,
> In colour blacke, why wrapt she beames so bright?
> Would she in beamie blacke, like painter wise,
> Frame daintiest lustre, mixt of shades and light? ³⁴³  


She is, to the poem’s speaker, symbolised by a curious mix of both light and darkness. Stella’s likeness is compared to the efforts of a painter who uses the technique of chiaroscuro. Beams of light from her eyes are described as wrapped in the colour black. She is comprised of ‘shades and light’, confusing Astrophil, as she is both dazzling in brightness and at the same time beautiful in her black clothes. Sidney’s characterisation of Stella in this poem evokes ambiguity, as the positive connotations associated with illumination and negative connotations associated with darkness are subverted.

In this chapter, I argue that an early modern Gothic sensibility can be located in early modern love poetry, predicated on the idea of ‘category crisis’, where emotional effects are obtained from the challenging and disruption of binaries. Through the course of this chapter, I will examine how the combination of states of illumination with states of darkness in the literary modes of the Gothic and early
modern poetry generates ambiguous responses that challenge the stability of meaning. Sidney’s use of chiaroscuro in *Astrophil and Stella* Sonnet 7 to generate ambiguity foreshadows one of the affective techniques of the Gothic mode. Bach and Degenring propose that ideas of darkness, night and artificial illumination in literary texts demonstrate a complexity, in which meaning must be evaluated within the context of individual works:

But while in this sense they enjoy continuity and a long-standing tradition, their meaning is not always straightforward, nor has it ever been. Instead, they have always been ambiguous, and their specific meaning must be evaluated in the context of the respective literary work.344

Bach and Degenring’s essay includes a series of short analyses of the subject of darkness in several texts across a temporal span, including Shakespeare’s *Midsummer Night’s Dream*, Edward Young’s *Night Thoughts* and Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto*. They suggest that the literary treatment of darkness across various genres is ambiguous, resisting straightforward readings. Darkness is often associated with negativity in a binary opposition to light, but in this chapter, I propose a reading of darkness itself as a phenomenon that is charged with ambiguity. In addition to this, I also suggest that these ambiguous effects arise out of juxtaposing states of darkness with states of light. When juxtaposed against states of darkness, motifs of illumination in Gothic and early modern texts also evoke ambiguous effects and responses. States of illumination, whilst having a longstanding association with positivity, are sometimes aligned with fear and negative emotional effects. In this chapter, I intend to elaborate on the complexities that surround representations of darkness and illumination in eighteenth-century Gothic novels and early modern love poetry. The similarities between the literary treatment of darkness and

illumination across both textual periods, I propose, are centred on these phenomena as ambiguous constructions.

The treatment of darkness as a phenomenon that is associated with both positive and negative qualities is noted by Chris Fitter in his essay on the 'poetic nocturne'. Fitter's ambitious essay surveys the treatment of night from the classical tradition to the seventeenth century, proposing that a 'quintessential ambivalence' characterises the treatment of night in literary culture across these periods. While night has been regarded as a time synonymous with fear across various literary traditions, night was also associated with 'beauty and profundity'. Fitter's broad survey acknowledges the complexities inherent in literary treatments of night, a nuance that I will expand on in this chapter. One of his focus areas is on the effects of contemplative melancholy and how the condition of melancholy assisted in shaping poets' positive views of night. Broadening the scope of Fitter's argument, I propose that positive treatments of night also persist in early modern verses that feature melancholy lovers.

The technique of chiaroscuro has been noted by critics as a salient feature of the Gothic. In art, the term refers to a style of painting that emphasises light and shade. The typically dark settings that are a core feature of Gothic texts allow for an analogous use of the term in various critical categories of the Gothic mode. Specifically, it is the use of chiaroscuro as an affective technique that forms the subject of my inquiry in this chapter. The use of chiaroscuro as a means of generating emotional affect is one that was also noted by John Ruskin in his seminal nineteenth-century essay on art The Stones of Venice. Ruskin comments that painters who deploy chiaroscuro balance an aesthetic of both 'splendour and sadness' in their


work. The 'splendour and sadness' referenced by Ruskin suggest a reading of chiaroscuro as a visual technique that has the capacity to generate varied responses.

Critics have also outlined the use of chiaroscuro across various textual modes in the Gothic tradition. Haggerty and Goulet, for example note the use of chiaroscuro by American Gothic authors such as Edgar Allan Poe and Nathaniel Hawthorne. The technique of chiaroscuro has also been outlined as a distinctive technique deployed in Gothic films. For David Punter, the technique is a core aspect of the Gothic mode:

One might think of the techniques of Gothic as akin to those of chiaroscuro, the light and the dark, the daylight world and the world of night so intermingled so that the reader remains perpetually uncertain as to what it is he or she is reading.

Punter's remarks identify a dynamic of reader response that results from the combination of darkness and light in Gothic texts. The intermingling of these visual binaries in Gothic texts, according to Punter, serves to generate affective responses of uncertainty. This 'Gothic technique' is one that will form the focal point of this chapter, as I explore its usage in Gothic texts. Punter's use of the word 'intermingling' is key here. Studies of the Gothic mode often focus on the subject of darkness as a catalyst for evoking negative emotional responses. My analysis in this chapter probes this dynamic of the Gothic by suggesting that the use of illumination in the Gothic mode is equally as important as authors' use of darkness. In some instances in the Gothic, darkness is not always aligned with fear and apprehension.

---


351 David Punter, 'Introduction,' in *Gothic Crossings: Medieval to Postmodern*, edited by Ya-Feng Wu and Hsin-Ying Li (Taipei: National Taiwan University Press, 2011), 12.
Likewise, illumination is not always a cause of comfort or a positive phenomenon. It is the intermingling of light and dark in the Gothic that threatens the stability of meaning, generating ambiguous responses rather than straightforward negative or positive effects. In addition to this, I will also examine similar uses of this affective technique in early modern poetry. The combination and juxtaposition of these visual states in the Gothic, as a technique for garnering responses from readers, is foreshadowed by its use in early modern love poetry.

The use of the subject of darkness in literature as a technique for generating ambiguity is one that has been used by authors prior to the advent of the Gothic novel and has been noted by literary critics. These studies are focused on the spatial elements of darkness. For example, John Milton’s iconic line in the first book of *Paradise Lost* exemplifies his view of Hell as an ambiguous space, when he visualises Hell through an oxymoron, as a place where there is 'no light, but rather darkness visible' (*Paradise Lost*, 1:63).\(^{352}\) Anne Williams suggests that these evocative descriptions, of which darkness is a constituent element, evoke the 'uncanniness' of meaning.\(^{353}\) Milton’s rendition of Hell is an ambiguous space that is characterised by paradox and oxymora, where death lives and darkness is visible.\(^{354}\) With particular reference to Milton’s interpretation of night in *Paradise Lost*, John Rumrich writes that night in Milton’s text is neither uniformly dreadful nor threatening; it is an ambiguous space that is associated with both Hell and Heaven alike.\(^{355}\)

These studies are concentrated on an interpretation of dark spaces but in this chapter, my interest is with an *internalised* concept of space. Early modern poets evoke ideas of darkness with reference to the phenomenon as an imagined space

---


rather than a real space. Rather than focus on dark spaces that exist in reality, the
dark spaces constructed by first-person speakers are a product of their imagination.
Michel de Certeau writes that space occurs as the effect of interactions that orient,
situate and temporalise it.\textsuperscript{356} In this regard, my analysis of Renaissance texts in this
chapter focuses on how speakers view, create and interact with \textit{imagined} spaces, with
a particular focus on the binaries of darkness and illumination. The ambiguous
concept of spatiality that is a core element of the Gothic, I argue, is foreshadowed by
early modern poetic speakers' interpretation of the juxtaposition of darkness and light.

My reading of first-person speakers' construction of ambiguous spaces is also
informed by Elisabeth Bronfen's extensive work on the subject of night in
Shakespearean literature. She reads Shakespeare's use of night as a 'stage for
transgressions' as one that foreshadows the Gothic imaginary.\textsuperscript{357} Bronfen draws on a
'Gothic' reading of the subject of night in a host of Shakespeare's plays such as \textit{Romeo
and Juliet}, \textit{A Midsummer Night’s Dream} and \textit{The Merchant of Venice}. She compares the
nocturnal spaces in Shakespeare's plays to Foucauldian heterotopias.\textsuperscript{358} Bronfen suggests that the nocturnal spaces in Shakespeare's plays are 'closed circuits',
ambiguous heterotopias. This, she proposes, is what might constitute a
Shakespearean 'Gothic sensibility'.\textsuperscript{359} This chapter draws on these ideas by
addressing the subject of night as interpreted by first-person poetic speakers rather
than characters in Shakespearean plays. If characters in plays' interactions with night
constitute a projection of their psyche, as Bronfen iterates, I suggest that a similar
analogy can be drawn in poetic speakers' interpretation of space. I would also add
that the proposition of a uniquely 'Shakespearean' Gothic sensibility can be

\textsuperscript{356} Michel de Certeau, \textit{The Practice of Everyday Life}, translated by Steven Rendall (Berkeley: University

\textsuperscript{357} Elisabeth Bronfen, 'Shakespeare's Nocturnal World,' in \textit{Gothic Shakespeares}, 21.

\textsuperscript{358} Bronfen, 'Shakespeare's Nocturnal World,' 32.

\textsuperscript{359} Bronfen, 'Shakespeare's Nocturnal World,' 41.
expanded to encompass non-dramatic Shakespearean works as well. As is evident from examples taken from Shakespeare’s sonnets that I utilise in this chapter, the speaker of Shakespeare’s poems demonstrates a keen awareness of the unstable and ambiguous binaries of light and dark just as well as characters from his plays.

Bronfen also discusses the concept of night as a contributor to a 'Gothic sensibility' in her monograph Night Passages. The representations of night in literature, she writes, are heterotopias par excellence, drawing affective power from a reader’s lived experiences of the night.\textsuperscript{360} She reads the shifts between night and day as mirroring conflicts between good and evil, a trope that is especially salient in Shakespeare's Macbeth.\textsuperscript{361} Night, Bronfen writes, is associated with uncanniness, but it is also a time that brings with it self-knowledge. Most importantly, she reads night as an ambiguous space that is associated with both the recurrence and the emergence of evil alike.\textsuperscript{362} It is this reading of night as an ambiguous space charged with both positive and negative connotations that I will focus on in this chapter. In many of the poetic examples raised in this chapter, speakers’ interactions with night lead to a host of negative connotations that are also attached to states of illumination, and it is this blurring of dichotomies that I will explore in my appraisal of early modern and Gothic texts.

One dimension to this analysis is an appraisal of darkness as triggering emotional responses of fear. Jerrold Hogle takes the view that the techniques of chiaroscuro in relation to atmosphere in the Gothic are aligned with fear:

Consequently, any ‘light’ of rational revelation in the Gothic is always countered by a fearsome chiaroscuro that mixes illumination with ominous and mysterious darkness, as well as reversals of progressive time, creating

\textsuperscript{360} Elisabeth Bronfen, Night Passages: Literature, Philosophy and Film (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013), 110.

\textsuperscript{361} Bronfen, Night Passages, 178.

\textsuperscript{362} Bronfen, Night Passages, 183.
what we now know as the scary 'Gothic atmosphere' that lingers on in so many forms today.\textsuperscript{363}

The terms Hogle uses, 'scary' and 'fearsome', offer a reading of visual obscurity that is associated with states of darkness that pertains directly to emotional responses of fear. Hogle's focus here is one that is concentrated on the effects that are derived from the use of dark imagery in the Gothic. In this chapter, I want to expand on Hogle's point by suggesting that, in addition to fear, the combination of both light and dark creates another effect that is germane to the Gothic, that of ambiguity. The fusion of illumination and darkness in the Gothic serves to generate responses of ambiguity, an effect that is just as important as the derivation of fear from visual obscurity. As Alan Lloyd-Smith proposes, shadows and 'indeterminate illumination' illustrate the ambiguous atmosphere of the Gothic, a proposition that I will analyse across the modes of Renaissance poetry and the Gothic.\textsuperscript{364}

In addition to being a vehicle for generating ambiguity as an affective technique, the technique of chiaroscuro is also one that is rooted in the Gothic mode's intellectual underpinnings. The use of darkness in Gothic fiction is symbolic of authors' rejection of the values of reason lauded by the intellectual movement of the Enlightenment. The thematic connotations of darkness itself speak of a dialectic that is set up in opposition to the 'light' of Enlightenment rationality. Chiaroscuro, John Paul Riquelme proposes, exemplifies a form of 'dark Enlightenment' that mirrors the coherence and integrity of the Enlightenment.\textsuperscript{365} This view has also been proposed by Fred Botting, who writes that spaces of darkness in the Gothic are akin to heterotopias:

\footnotesize
\begin{enumerate}
\item Jerrold E. Hogle, 'Introduction,' in The Cambridge Companion to the Modern Gothic, 4.
\item Allan Lloyd-Smith, American Gothic Fiction: An Introduction (New York: Continuum, 2004), 7.
\end{enumerate}
Indeed heterotopias—the temporally and geographically distant locations such as the castles, abbeys, ruins, dungeons, burial vaults and, of course, labyrinths—endow the genre with its most distinctive features.  

Heterotopias are literary 'spaces' which contain both utopian and dystopian characteristics. As a heterotopia is *neither* a utopia or a dystopia, it is realised as a space that embodies an element of liminality, charging it with ambiguity. Botting reads the darkened spaces in the Gothic as places that act as mirrors to the real, presenting an inversion of power relations. These spaces are places of concealment that oppose the visibility and laws that function in 'regular' social spaces. In other words, symbolised by the trope of darkness, heterotopias in eighteenth-century Gothic texts are symbols of the Gothic mode's subversion of dominant intellectual structures, namely that of the eighteenth-century Enlightenment. These sites in the Gothic challenge reality and the aesthetic values that sustain reality. The symbolic value of darkness in Gothic texts offers more than a dialectical form of contention with the Enlightenment. In addition to being a counterpoint in and of itself, the juxtaposition of darkness and illumination in the Gothic subverts the idea of rigid binaries, particularly those including states of illumination. In Gothic texts, it is not only darkness, but also illumination that can be a source of terror and horror.

---


367 Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Cauter, Footnote to Michel Foucault, 'Of Other Spaces,' in *Heterotopia and the City: Public Space in a Postcivil Society*, edited and translated by Michiel Dehaene and Lieven De Cauter (New York: Routledge, 2008), 25.


369 Botting, 'Power in the Darkness,' 271.

Darkness and Illumination in the Gothic Mode

The motif of darkness is one of the most salient tropes of the Gothic mode. Darkness is most often associated with a lack of illumination in specific spaces—castles, dungeons, vaults and forests at night. While dark spaces form one of the most recognisable elements of the Gothic, what is often unacknowledged is the juxtaposition of illumination with states of darkness in scenes from Gothic fiction. As a descriptor for darkness, the word 'gloom' is one that is often used in Gothic texts and is one that is worth further analysing. The term can be used in several ways. It can be used to describe a shaded or darkened place, or a degree of darkness or obscurity. The word 'gloom' is charged with ambiguous connotations, as it can be used to describe both states of darkness as well as states of semi-illumination.

Theodore in Walpole’s The Castle of Otranto seeks out the 'gloomiest shades' to indulge in his melancholy. There are more than thirty references to gloom in The Monk and more than a hundred and fifty in The Mysteries of Udolpho. The term 'gloomth' was coined by Walpole as a fanciful expansion of 'gloom', used as a descriptor for a state of visual obscurity, particularly with reference to semi-darkened spaces. The difference between 'gloom' and 'gloomth', through the addition of its suffix, is an added connotation of tangibility, similar to the difference between 'warm' and 'warmth'. Gloomth, Emma McEvoy writes, reads as a portmanteau of 'gloom' with a 'th' ending that evokes a feel of spatiality. In his correspondence with Sir Horace Mann, Walpole employs the term spatially, as when

---

he writes of the gloomth of abbeys and cathedrals. The term, as it was used by Walpole, was also regarded as a marker of feeling and emotion, specifically, the emotional effects derived from the atmosphere of darkened architectural features.

Gloom is also a term used to describe states of illumination in the Gothic. In Radcliffe’s *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, the phrase ‘gloomy light’ is used three times. One instance of this usage in Radcliffe’s text is especially important as, it is a source of illumination that evokes a negative emotional reaction from Radcliffe’s protagonist:

> She now retired to her bed, leaving the lamp burning on the table; but its gloomy light, instead of dispelling her fear, assisted it; for, by its uncertain rays, she almost fancied she saw shapes flit past her curtains and glide into the remote obscurity of her chamber.—The castle clock struck one before she closed her eyes to sleep.375

A source of light actively contributes to Emily’s fear rather than allaying it. A state of semi-visibility causes her to imagine the presence of ghosts in her room. Radcliffe’s reference to this state is one that recurs throughout the Gothic tradition. By combining the imagery of dark with light, categories are thrown into disorder. Presuppositions about light being a source of comfort are subverted by writers in the Gothic, challenging the validity of binary categories.

The treatment of darkness and illumination in Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto* is similar to Radcliffe’s use of the imagery of ‘gloomy light’. The character Isabella’s immersion in the vaults of Otranto exemplifies how darkness is used as a motif for the generation of fear: a sudden burst of illumination evokes a reaction of fear from her. In this scene, Isabella is trapped in the darkness of the dungeons of Otranto. Alone in the dark, Isabella reflects on her situation and her mind is occupied with thoughts of an earlier experience:

---


Words cannot paint the horror of the Princess’s situation. Alone in so dismal a place, her mind imprinted with all the terrible events of the day [...] all these thoughts crowded on her distracted mind, and she was ready to sink under her apprehensions. [...] For a considerable time she remained in an agony of despair.376

Trapped in the vaults for a 'considerable time', Isabella begins meditating on the day's events. The expression used by Walpole, that Isabella's horror is beyond words, highlights the effect of darkness on her. The repeated use of adjectives that have negative connotations, 'dismal' and 'terrible', contribute to generating a tone of fear. Walpole’s descriptions and word choices in this paragraph reinforce the codification of darkness as a phenomenon with strong negative associations. But shortly afterwards, readers discover that the effect of being trapped in the vault generates an uncertainty towards states of illumination.

At this point, she glimpses a 'ray of moonshine' that illuminates the vault, and she is transfixed with a reaction of 'momentary joy' that quickly turns to dread. As Isabella advances towards the light, a human figure appears, leading her to think that the figure is a ghost. Silhouetted against the sudden influx of illumination that allows her to see, the dark figure that appears becomes a source of fright that is just as acute as the emotional reactions of fear that strike her in the dark. In this instance, it is the juxtaposition of the figure's shape against a source of illumination that proves to be a source of her fear. Instead of providing a source of comfort for Isabella, the light brings a supposed threat to her well-being in focus, culminating in her startled shout.

This sequence illustrates the technique of chiaroscuro at work in Walpole’s novel. As Hogle writes, the 'light' that becomes a source of safety from the darkness is mingled with a fear of the dark, generating an atmosphere of fear.377 What is also

376 Walpole, The Castle of Otranto, 27.

equally important in this sequence is the role of illumination in the generation of such a response. While darkness understandably is regarded as a phenomenon that is aligned with fear, the commingling of darkness with illumination can also give rise to emotional effects of fear. A state of illumination, in this passage, is simultaneously both a source of comfort for Isabella and a contributor to a negative reaction of fear. Walpole hints at this ambiguous view of illumination, as the source of light that provides a brief respite for Isabella is described in somewhat ambiguous terms as an 'imperfect ray'. Here, Walpole suggests that while darkness is associated with a host of negative responses—despair, apprehensions and horror—, he also draws attention to the role of illumination in contributing to these responses.

In Radcliffe's *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, illumination is often juxtaposed alongside darkness as a source of fear, aligning states of brightness with ambiguity. A space from Radcliffe's novel that parallels Isabella's experience in the vaults of Otranto is the Castle di Udolpho. As Radcliffe's protagonist Emily approaches the castle, she is struck with feelings of dread, precipitated by the darkness shrouding the castle:

> As the twilight deepened, its features became more awful in obscurity, and Emily continued to gaze, till its clustering towers were alone seen, rising over the tops of the woods, beneath whose thick shade the carriages soon after began to ascend. The extent and darkness of these tall woods awakened terrific images in her mind, and she almost expected to see banditti start up from under the trees.

Emily's description of the imposing castle is described using a host of negative adjectives in the manner that Walpole describes the dungeon of Otranto. The adjectives 'awful' and 'terrific' are used to describe the appearance of the Castle di

---


Udolpho’s exterior. But what also is interesting here is that it is a blend of darkness and illumination that evokes these responses from Emily. Emily views the castle at twilight, a time of day characterised by the mingling of light and darkness. In other words, it is the dissipating light of day, combined with the advent of night, that contributes to her feelings of fear surrounding the Castle di Udolpho.

Inside the castle itself, Emily catches sight of Montoni, the text’s villainous antagonist. Silhouetted against a dark backdrop, she is struck with fear at his appearance:

Emily was observing the singular solemnity and desolation of the apartment, viewed, as it now was, by the glimmer of the single lamp, placed near a large Venetian mirror, that duskily reflected the scene, with the tall figure of Montoni passing slowly along, his arms folded, and his countenance shaded by the plume, that waved in his hat. From the contemplation of this scene, Emily’s mind proceeded to the apprehension of what she might suffer in it [...].

The only source of light in this particular room allows Emily to catch sight of Montoni, her captor. Light, in this scene, serves only to remind her of the presence of her intimidating captor. While the dark, desolate exterior of the Castle di Udolpho terrifies her, the presence of light in the interior of the castle alerts her to the fact that she is trapped inside the castle with Montoni. The singular source of light in the apartment brings her plight into focus, as it highlights the oppressiveness of Montoni’s presence through his shadow. Paralleling an earlier reference to the exterior of the castle at twilight, Radcliffe’s use of the word ‘duskily’ impresses on a reader that, even when she is indoors, Emily is once again experiencing a state of illumination that is juxtaposed against darkness. In this instance, illumination is of

---


381 Radcliffe, The Mysteries of Udolpho, 229.
little comfort to her as she contemplates her imprisonment at the hands of Montoni. While darkness might be synonymous with negative emotions such as fear, this example from Radcliffe's *The Mysteries of Udolpho* suggests that states of *illumination* can also be germane with fear; states of illumination contribute to fear through their combination with states of darkness. As evidenced from these examples, temporal markers are one method of achieving these effects.

The trope of illumination serving to excite rather than dispel Emily's fear recurs throughout Radcliffe's novel. In a sequence that parallels the appearance of Hamlet's father's ghost in Shakespeare's *Hamlet*, Emily stands on the ramparts of a castle and witnesses a source of illumination that appears intermittently. The flashes of light lead her to contemplate if they come from a supernatural or natural source:

> It moved away, and then, by a gleam of lightning, she perceived some person on the terrace. All the anxieties of the preceding night returned. This person advanced, and the playing flame alternately appeared and vanished. Emily wished to speak, to end her doubts, whether this figure were human or supernatural; but her courage failed as often as she attempted utterance, till the light moved again under the casement, and she faintly demanded, who passed.\(^{382}\)

The flashes of lightning and the recurring image of a flame are sources of illumination that permeate the darkness that shrouds the Castle di Udolpho. Juxtaposed against the backdrop of night, Radcliffe realises sources of illumination as synonymous with the subversion of meaning. Radcliffe challenges what these opposing states mean: she demonstrates that, when placed alongside states of darkness, sources of illumination can also be a source of negative emotional reactions such as terror and fear.

---

\(^{382}\) Radcliffe, *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, 373.
Later on in the novel, she introduces a term to describe her recurring uses of juxtapositions between darkness and illumination. This is the phrase 'darkness visible', an oxymoron that aptly describes the combination of light and dark, where emotional effects are generated through the functioning of illumination in tandem with darkness:

She could not approach these woods, without experiencing keener sense of her danger. Their deep silence, except when the wind swept among their branches, and impenetrable glooms shewn partially by the sudden flash, and then, by the red glare of the torch, which served only to make 'darkness visible,' were circumstances, that contributed to renew all her most terrible apprehensions; she thought, too, that, at this moment, the countenances of her conductors displayed more than their usual fierceness, mingled with a kind of lurking exultation, which they seemed endeavouring to disguise.  

The Miltonic allusion 'darkness visible' outlines Radcliffe's acknowledgement that states of illumination serve to illuminate the terrors and horrors that are obscured by darkness. Shrouded in darkness, the sudden introduction of visual clarity serves to heighten negative reactions of fear rather than dispel them. Combining light and darkness in the form of chiaroscuro, for Radcliffe, exposes the instabilities attached to luminosity.

Chiaroscuro is also used by Matthew Lewis in *The Monk* as a technique for generating ambiguity and uncertainty. One sequence in Lewis's novel features the character Don Raymond mistaking the ghostly Bleeding Nun for his beloved Agnes. As part of a plan to elope with Agnes, Raymond devises a plan to have her impersonate the Bleeding Nun, a ghost who haunts the castle of Lindenberg. As Raymond waits to elope with the disguised Agnes, he hides in darkness and with the assistance of brief periods of illumination, catches sight of one he believes to be Agnes at her window:

---

The window was not so far from the Ground but that I fancied I perceived a female figure with a Lamp in her hand moving slowly along the Apartment. The light soon faded away, and all was again dark and gloomy.\textsuperscript{384}

The word 'gloomy' as used by Lewis here is charged with a double meaning. It denotes both a state of partial illumination as well as an emotional response to a given atmosphere. Shrouded in the darkness of night, Raymond’s visibility is aided by periodic moments of illumination that are caused by lights from Agnes’s window. The setting is depicted by Lewis as one that is a mixture of brightness and darkness:

Occasional gleams of brightness darted from the Staircase windows as the lovely Ghost past by them. I traced the light through the Hall: It reached the Portal, and at length I beheld Agnes pass through the folding gates. She was habited exactly as She had described the Spectre.\textsuperscript{385}

Lewis’s word choice, ‘occasional brightness’, is telling of an element of visual obscurity that arises from the combination of light and dark in this scene. Beholding these ‘occasional gleams’ marks the point where illumination causes confusion for Raymond. Calling the female form that he sees a ‘lovely Ghost’, his terrifying mistake is only made clear later on. The figure he perceives to be Agnes is, as readers discover only later, the ghost of the Bleeding Nun. Raymond’s act of tracing a source of illumination, followed up by his act of ‘beholding’ her in the light, is one that has unfavourable consequences.

Lewis’s use of illumination juxtaposed with darkness as a technique for generating confusion in this scene is similar to the techniques used by Walpole and Radcliffe. This scene in particular recalls the ‘vault scene’ in Walpole’s text where Isabella mistakes a human being for a ghost due to the ambiguity caused by juxtaposing light and darkness. Lewis’s text reverses the trope introduced in Walpole’s text by having his protagonist encounter a real ghost instead of mistaking

\textsuperscript{384} Lewis, \textit{The Monk}, 152.

\textsuperscript{385} Lewis, \textit{The Monk}, 152.
a real person for one. Lewis's emphasis on the states of illumination that contribute to Raymond being able to see the Bleeding Nun presents a view of brightness that has disturbing implications.

The 'Bleeding Nun' scene also echoes Radcliffe's 'gloomy light' scene, where Emily envisions spirits flitting around her room as a result of visual obscurity. It is interesting to note that these three scenes revolve around perceptions of the supernatural, albeit with different results. In Walpole and Radcliffe's texts, illumination generates fear of the supernatural, while Lewis's text parodies this trope by literalising this dynamic of fear. Lewis's text suggests that even in the Gothic mode's foundational wave, authors experimented with the techniques of chiaroscuro to create a multitude of effects.

Darkness and illumination in the Gothic often serve as counterpoints to one another. Illumination in Gothic texts serves to make 'darkness visible', revealing the potential horrors that might be concealed by states of visual obscurity. What results from combining motifs of darkness and light in the Gothic is ambiguity, where established associations attached to these binary categories are destabilised. The use of these two motifs in conjunction with each other, symbolic of the Enlightenment/Gothic binary, is above all a critique of categorical binaries. Revelling in the generation of ambiguity, Gothic texts provoke questions as to the status of concepts that have long had firm associations with positivity and negativity.

Colonising the Night and Subverting Darkness in Early Modern Verse

If Milton’s phrase 'darkness visible' is one that can be used to describe the play on dark and light in the Gothic, a comparable phrase can be located in early modern
love poetry. The phrase 'brightly dark' from Shakespeare's Sonnet 43 is one that describes Renaissance Petrarchan poets' use of chiaroscuro. The oxymoron of 'brightly dark' is symbolic of the Petrarchan influence on early modern poetry.

Alongside these forms of cultural poetics, prior to the Enlightenment, people in early modern England had different interpretations of darkness as a 'primeval dialectic' associated with evil and crookedness. For example, as broader intellectual analogies for the functioning of the human mind, ideas surrounding darkness and illumination in the Renaissance acknowledged the persistence of both states in man. In *Platonic Theology*, Marsilio Ficino used the moon and the sun as visual analogies for illustrating how, despite the binary meanings attached to darkness and illumination, meaning could be distorted. Ficino's fifteenth-century view departed from Petrarch's fourteenth-century view of darkness as negative. Petrarch saw the Middle Ages as a period of darkness that was necessary to be dispelled in order to bring about the 'light' of the classical period. In *Platonic Theology*, Ficino comments on the moon as a celestial body which exemplifies this ambiguity and extends this notion to the workings of the human mind:

It has a sort of brightness within and is also a darkness. Similarly, the human mind always shines with the ray of the divine sun, but in varying ways; it changes its shape and is never totally resplendent. What shines in it does not shine out equally; in addition to its divine and rational power, part of it is subject to a cloudiness that is devoid of reason.


What Ficino highlights here is an acknowledgement that the human mind is capable of both reason and irrationality alike. By drawing on an analogy of light and dark, he recognises that perceptions of reality cannot be simply reduced to absolutes. Ficino's statement highlights the intellectual dimensions attached to dialectical paradigms of darkness and light in Renaissance humanism. Suggesting that being 'devoid' of reason was part of human experience, his ideas prefigure, in some respect, the anti-Enlightenment view posited by eighteenth-century Gothic novelists.

In addition to philosophical influences, technological developments in the Renaissance such as street lighting allowed people to partake in the 'ongoing social expansion' of the various social and symbolic uses of the subject of night. The term 'nocturnalisation' is utilised by Craig Koslofsky to describe this phenomenon. The advent of technologies for street lighting in the period, Koslofsy observes, mitigated individuals' fears of darkness:

Fear of the night was now mingled with improved conditions for labour and leisure as the emerging modern night began to show its characteristic ambivalence.

The evening and the night became new public social spheres, as the provision of illumination during the hours of the evening and the night allowed people in early modern Europe to engage in activities during those hours. The night lost its earlier negative connotations, such as the longstanding Aristotelian view of darkness as a phenomenon which had associations with crookedness and evil. Darkness was transformed from a 'primordial presence' to a 'manageable' aspect of life in the early

---


390 Koslofsky, Evening’s Empire, 2.

modern period. Darkened theatres, street lighting and extended opening hours for coffee houses in early modern Europe allowed for the 'colonisation' of the night.

It was also in this period that poetic terms used to describe night emerged in English, reflecting a burgeoning interest in the subject of darkness in general. As Chris Fitter observes, John Donne's use of the word 'nocturnal' in his poem 'A Nocturnall upon S. Lucies Day' was one of its first as a proper noun. Fitter also writes that the term 'night piece', used to describe a title of a literary composition, originated with its use in Robert Herrick's poem 'A Night Piece: To Julia'. The titles of these poems is indicative of an emerging preoccupation with the subject of night and darkness in literary culture that resurfaces in subsequent periods of English literary culture—in the work of John Milton on to the verses of the Graveyard Poets and the Gothic mode in the eighteenth century.

In addition to these philosophical and cultural factors, early modern poets' use of darkness in their poems were a reversal of the ideas of illumination put forth in Petrarch's Il Canzoniere. In Petrarch's sequence, his beloved Laura is constantly described as firmly associated with states of illumination:

When all of me is drawn in the direction
Of that place where my lady's sweet face shines

Now strive for heaven, O my weary heart,
straight through the cloud of all her sweet disdains
behind her virtuous steps and light divine

---

392 Koslofsky, Evening's Empire, 278.
393 Chris Fitter, 'The Poetic Nocturne,' 25.
395 Petrarch, Canzoniere, 295.
Laura’s illuminated self is associated with the divine. This association is built on further in poems where Petrarch states that his beloved’s illuminated state is one that transcends ordinary states of brightness:

as every light
will flee and fade whenever yours shines forth

I can turn nowhere without beholding
the very light or like light lit from it

(Canzoniere, 72: 40–41)

(Canzoniere, 107: 10–11)

Laura’s illuminated self also points to the positive qualities of her soul, her illuminated body reflecting the light of her soul. The construction of Petrarch’s beloved, then, is one that is synonymous with a positive dimension. She is a divine force manifested in a corporeal form, inspiring the poet and serving as a comfort to him.

Contrasted with Petrarch’s characterisation of Laura as synonymous with brightness, the beloveds portrayed in the Petrarchan tradition are at times associated with darkness. Sir Philip Sidney writes of ‘woe’s black face’ in Sonnet 98 of Astrophil and Stella. Shakespeare references his beloved’s ‘shadow’ in Sonnet 27 and her ‘shade’ in Sonnet 43. Darkness, for the Petrarchan sonnet-speaker, offers more than a simple figure of speech. Darkness in early modern Petrarchan verse symbolises a reversal of ideas of illumination in Petrarchan ‘orthodoxy’. As a consequence, these poems explore the consequences of a world where darkness is just as significant as illumination.

---

397 Petrarch, Canzoniere, 119.
398 Petrarch, Canzoniere, 167.
399 Jones, Structure of Petrarch’s Canzoniere, 190–91.
Technological advances, subversions of the Petrarchan tradition as well as acknowledgement, rather than eschewing, of darkness in literary culture, marked a change from its alignment with one facet of a 'primeval dialectic'. One of the themes used by early modern poets in their explorations of the subject of darkness was sleep. In Sonnet 98 of Sir Philip Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella*, Astrophil narrates the act of retiring to his bed at night. As he tries to fall asleep, he is tormented by the darkness that surrounds him, but at the same time, relishes the dark appearance of his beloved:

> With sweete soft shades thou oft invitest me
> To steale some rest, but wretch I am constrain’d
> (Spurd with love’s spur, though gald and shortly rain’d
> With care’s hard hand) to turne and tosse in thee.
> While the blacke horrors of the silent night,
> Paint woe’s blacke face so lively to my sight […]

(Astrophil, 98: 5–10)

Attempting to sleep, Astrophil is first lured to rest by 'sweete soft shades'. The repetition of the 's' sound in line five impresses on a reader the speaker's longing for the comforts provided by darkness. Sidney also uses two positive adjectives, 'sweete' and 'soft' in quick succession to heighten his positive view of darkness. The alliteration of the 's' sound in this line, followed up by a reference to shade, grants a positive tone to a reference to darkness.

Subsequently however, the speaker finds himself in a state of unrest caused by thinking about Stella. His love melancholy leads him to worry as Stella dominates his thoughts and darkness becomes associated with a negative emotion. The repetition of the 'h' sound and the 't' sound in line eight presents a reader with a host of negative responses that imply a sense of physical discomfort. As Astrophil tries to fall asleep, the 'silent night' serves to agitate him into a heightened state of fear.

---

400 Sidney, Poems, 230.
But while lines seven to nine present darkness in an unfavourable light, Astrophil switches his tone in line ten to praise a vision of his beloved’s dark appearance as one that is ‘lively’. The positive tone of line five is bookended in line ten as the speaker once again presents a view of darkness that is favourable. The constant shifts between a positive and a negative treatment of darkness evoke a tone of ambiguity towards darkness, as it is simultaneously a source of comfort to the speaker as well as a source of fear.

The effects of night on the speaker are realised in the sonnet’s conclusion, where, like a photophobic insect, he shies away from full daylight:

Mine eyes then only winke, for spite perchance,
That wormes should have their Sun, and I want mine. \(^{407}\) (Astrophil, 98: 13–14)

Continuing the tone of ambiguity established in the body of the sonnet, the speaker gravitates towards favouring a state of being that is comprised of both darkness and illumination. Despite his previous comments on darkness’s associations with horror and fear, Astrophil longs to stay in darkness with the company of worms. Darkness is, paradoxically, for the speaker, his ‘sun’. Astrophil’s impression and interpretation of darkness and spatiality is one that, to a reader, has been turned upside down. States of darkness and illumination, for Sidney’s speaker, have lost their associations with concrete binaries of negativity and positivity. Immersed in the world of Astrophil’s love melancholy, the speaker’s interpretation of space is reversed, subverting the stability of meaning.

The act of sleep and its associations with darkness is also the subject of Shakespeare’s Sonnet 43. That sonnet features a speaker who interprets states of darkness and illumination in ways that are not restricted to concrete binaries. Shakespeare’s speaker describes his beloved as an individual who is characterised by...

---

\(^{407}\) Sidney, Poems, 230.
both light and darkness. Lines four, eight and twelve describe the speaker's beloved using a set of oxymora:

But when I sleep, in dreams they look on thee,
And darkly bright are bright in dark directed;  
When to unseeing eyes thy shade shines so?  
When in dead night thy fair imperfect shade
Through heavy sleep on sightless eyes doth stay? (Sonnet 43: 3–4)  
(8)  
(11–12)

The speaker is immersed in an imagined space where both light and dark are concepts that have no meaning. For Shakespeare's speaker, this involves the immersion in a dream-like state. The poem begins with the paradoxical act of him being able to see in the dark, with the palindrome-like introduction of the phrases 'darkly bright' and 'bright in dark' signposting his entry into a space characterised by the subversion of binaries. To the speaker's imagination, his dreamscape leads to his chameleonic beloved adopting ambiguous qualities that are qualities of his dreamscape—she is characterised as embodying both darkness and light at the same time. Her eyes are 'shiny shades' and she resembles a 'fair shade'. Shakespeare uses a similar rhetorical technique as Sidney through the use of alliteration of the 'd' sound in line four and the 's' sound in line twelve, a technique that enhances the ambiguous tone of the oxymora used in the poem.

The repetition of a reference to sleep in line twelve reinforces the poet's construction of an ambiguous space as belonging to the province of his speaker's imagination. Night, for the speaker, becomes a space that is charged with a 'reflex action' of envisioning his beloved. This act subverts his experience of darkness, generating a subconscious illusion of illumination. This, as Helen Vendler suggests, points toward a tone of self-deception, where Shakespeare's speaker both cheers

---

402 Shakespeare, Sonnets, 197.
himself and sabotages himself at the same time.\textsuperscript{403} For Joel Fineman, it is the poet's over-stylised Petrarchan conceits that prevent it from being read as a concrete representation of 'optical epistemology', evoking ambiguous responses from attempts by readers.\textsuperscript{404} Because his sight is blinded by his subject's overwhelming brightness in day, and his darkness overturned by thoughts of his bright beloved, the speaker's solution to this impasse can be found in the opening couplet of the poem:

When most I wink, then do mine eyes best see,
For all the day they view things unrespected [...].\textsuperscript{405} (Sonnet 43: 1–2)

The speaker questions the veracity of his own sight in the day and subsequently experiences an illuminated state when he dreams of his beloved. Shakespeare thus creates a solution, a way for his speaker to leave his self-created space that is charged with ambiguity. The act of winking here represents a liminal state of visualisation that is both an illuminated state and a darkened state. Because he cannot trust his eyes in the day and his imagination in the night, a state of partial sleeplessness and partial visibility allows him the respite from the reversed experiences of day and night.

Like the speaker of Shakespeare's Sonnet 43 who winks, the speaker of Sonnet 27 references an act that blends seeing with a simultaneous lack of sight. In Sonnet 27, the speaker's eyelids are featured as drooping while he slips into an imaginative reverie. On the subject of night, Mark Mirsky observes that in Sonnet 27, a reader enters a 'world of dreams, night and ambiguous possibilities'.\textsuperscript{406} I want to expand on

\textsuperscript{403} Helen Vendler, \textit{The Art of Shakespeare's Sonnets} (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999), 223.


\textsuperscript{405} Shakespeare, \textit{Sonnets}, 197.

the 'ambiguous possibilities' that Mirsky proposes to suggest that the negative emotional reactions that Shakespeare’s speaker derives from ideas of illumination as well as night contribute to the generation of ambiguity in this poem.

Line seven establishes the speaker’s attempts to fall asleep, and in it we witness the speaker's physical discomfort. This line, and the three lines that follow, contain a host of paradoxes:

And keep my drooping eyelids open wide,
Looking on darkness which the blind do see:
Save that my soul's imaginary sight
Presents thy shadow to my sightless view,
Which, like a jewel hung in ghastly night,
Makes black night beauteous, and her old face new.
Lo! thus, by day my limbs, by night my mind,
For thee, and for myself, no quiet find.407

(Sonnet 27: 7–14)

Throughout this section of the poem, Shakespeare reverses concepts of seeing and sightlessness in a series of paradoxical statements. The speaker’s eyes are drooping, yet at the same time are wide open. The concept of visual obscurity is reversed in line eight when the speaker looks into the darkness and imagines the blind seeing. The 's' sound in the phrase 'see' which concludes line eight is repeated throughout lines nine and ten, demonstrating the poet's fixation with the act of seeing. Following from this, line nine concludes with another reference to sight, before the poet describes the paradox of a sightless view in line ten. The image of his beloved's shadow in line ten is subsequently likened to a jewel. As compared to both a jewel and a shadow, his beloved embodies both darkness and illumination. This description of the speaker's beloved and the host of conceits that precede this create a tone of ambiguity towards the subject of darkness. Darkness, while 'ghastly',

407 Shakespeare, Sonnets, 165.
Shakespeare's speaker proposes, might be regarded as a favourable phenomenon, especially if one's imaginative faculties are triggered.

The difference between the way in which ambiguity is used in early modern poetry as opposed to the Gothic is the celebration of ambiguity in early modern texts through the playful use of language. The use of ambiguity in early modern poetry is one that borrows from a typical characteristic of Petrarchan poetic forms.\footnote{Petrarch's use of ambiguity in \textit{Il Canzoniere} has been well noted by critics. For instance: Giuseppe Mazzotta, \textit{The Worlds of Petrarch} (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1999); Jones, \textit{The Structure of Petrarch's Canzoniere}; Sturm-Maddox, \textit{Petrarch’s Laurels}.} On the other hand, ambiguity in the Gothic takes on a darker quality, one that focuses less on the virtuosity of poetic language and wit, but more on the subject of uncertainty and the instability of meaning.\footnote{Botting, \textit{Gothic}, 5.} This tone of seriousness, rather than playfulness, underpins Gothic novelists' use of ambiguity through what Keats described as 'negative capability', a designation of how one could embrace 'uncertainties, mysteries and doubts', without having to resort to reason.\footnote{John Keats, Letter to George and Tom Keats, '22 December 1818,' in \textit{Life, Letters and Literary Remains of John Keats}, edited by Richard Monckton Milnes (New York: Putnam, 1848), 7.}

Shakespeare's reference to winking in Sonnet and drooping eyelids in Sonnet 27 parallels Sidney's reference to winking in \textit{Astrophil and Stella}, Sonnet 98. These speakers' fondness for a liminal state that combines both darkness and illumination foreshadows Gothic novelists' interest in twilight. Twilight is especially important in Radcliffe's text as a time of day that brings both positive and negative emotional responses. For Emily, this particular time of day is charged with ambiguity. It is a time of day where she is most susceptible to 'affecting visions' of her dead father.\footnote{Radcliffe, \textit{The Mysteries of Udolpho}, 91.} In a state of ill health, twilight also serves to frighten her.\footnote{Radcliffe, \textit{The Mysteries of Udolpho}, 102.} But at the same time it is during the twilight hours that she is at her most creative. She composes poetry at
twilight and twilight features prominently in several of her poetic creations such as 'The Pilgrim' and 'Stanzas'. Echoing the speakers' fondness for winking in Sidney's *Astrophil and Stella*, Sonnet 98 and Shakespeare's Sonnet 43, liminal states of illumination (and darkness) form an important aspect of Radcliffe's novel.

The act of winking and twilight symbolise the difference between how ambiguity and spatiality are configured in the genre of early modern poetry and the Gothic. Winking is a bodily gesture that is isolated to the actions of an individual. This personalised gesture is reflective of early modern poetic speakers' interpretation of space as charged with an internalised form of ambiguity. On the other hand, twilight refers to a generalised time of day, where ambiguous responses to states of illumination are derived from external stimuli. The themes of twilight and winking both represent an interest in the subject of 'darkness visible', a Gothic trope that is preceded by its use in early modern poetry.

In other poems in the Petrarchan tradition, night serves as the primary catalyst for evoking ambiguity. In Sonnet 87 of Spenser's *Amoretti*, time is distorted by the speaker's absence from his beloved. An example of Spenser's 'designedly ambiguous' sequence, the poet's treatment of night challenges notions of light and dark in Sonnet 87.\(^{413}\) Just as in Shakespeare's Sonnet 43, Spenser's speaker's experience of night is aligned with a distortion of time. This leads to an experience of time that is marked by comfortlessness, as neither night nor day can assuage the emotions evoked by the absence of his beloved.\(^{414}\) The passage of time in both night and day become agonising for the speaker:

---


Many long weary dayes I haue outworne:
and many nights, that slowly seemd to moue
theyr sad protract from euening vntill morne.⁴¹⁵ (Amoretti, 87: 2–4)

In addition to the unbearable duration of day and night, day and night are charged with a host of negative emotions and effects. The days are weary, and night is synonymous with sadness. This experience is reiterated in the body of the sonnet:

I wish that night the noyous day would end:
and when as night hath vs of light forlorne,
I wish that day would shortly reascend. (6–8)

The repetition of 'I wish' in these lines reifies the speaker's inability to distinguish between night and day. Suspended in this ambiguous temporal space, both darkness and illumination become interchangeable phenomena that have negative emotional effects such as grief and sorrow:

and faine my griefe with chaunges to beguile, (10)
So sorrow still doth seeme too long to last,
but ioyous houres doo fly away too fast. (13–14)

Days and nights become 'metaphoric extensions' of his mood, where the experience of either is both drawn out and harrowing.⁴¹⁶ For Spenser, the absence of desire generates a liminal state of temporal suspension that leads to an inability to distinguish between the very basic binaries of light and dark. What Spenser reveals here is the power of desire in relation to loss. Desire becomes a trigger for the sonnet speaker to enter into a space where the dimensions of time, night and day become completely meaningless. As a consequence, emotional effects that are commonly associated with night share an association with day. Languishing in his expectation,

---

⁴¹⁵ Spenser, Shorter Poems, 652.
Spenser's speaker leads a reader into a space where the binaries of day and night have no meaning. These fibrillating shifts destabilise the meanings of night and day, trapping the speaker in a space that is characterised by ambiguity.

Plagued by night and day, the speaker of Samuel Daniel's *Delia*, Sonnet 45 contemplates a drastic solution to the ambiguous emotional conflict that he is experiencing. While many poems in the sonnet tradition embrace the idea of death to the point of hyperbole ('I freeze yet I burn'), Daniel's ending has a more realistic tone. The speaker's inability to distinguish between night and day becomes a catalyst for the impulse of suicide. Line two foreshadows this when Daniel states that Sleep is 'brother to death':

Brother to death, in silent darknes borne [...]. *(Delia, 45: 2)*

And in the final line, suggesting that he will never wake can be taken in the literal sense as dying in one's sleep:

And neuer wake, to feele the dayes disdayne. *(14)*

In other words, by choosing to die in his sleep, Daniel's speaker has opted for a way out of being tormented endlessly by day and night. The poem concludes with a morbid note which contemplates the subject of death as a resolution to being trapped in a world where day and night have no concrete meaning. The progression of time, for Samuel Daniel in Sonnet 45 of *Delia*, is featured as a torment, revealing untruths for the speaker:

And let the day be time enough to morne

The shipwrack of my ill aduentred youth [...]. *(5–6)*

This poem is structured as a request for Sleep to take the speaker over so that he might not be troubled by both the light and darkness. The alliterative 's' sound in the
words of the first line of the poem give the poet's request the quality of an incantation:

Care-charmer sleepe, sonne of the Sable night,
   Brother to death, in silent darknes borne:
Relieue my languish, and restore the light [...].

The alliteration used by Daniel in the first line is also deployed in lines two and three. The words 'death' and 'darkness' in line two form a phonetic pair that is paralleled with the words 'languish' and 'light' in line three. Darkness is associated with death, and light is associated with languishing. With these negative characteristics, the speaker is paralysed in an ambiguous space.

Incidentally the speaker's overarching stance in this poem can be summarised by reading these two word pairs on their own: he is troubled by both light and darkness. Sleep brings an association with darkness and death - 'death' and 'darkness' form a word pair in line two. Subsequently in lines eleven and twelve, he states that he dreads the break of day because it will exacerbate his sorrow:

Neuer let rysing Sunne approue you lyers,
   To add more griefe to aggrauat my sorrow.

The Sun, and its associated illumination, brings to the speaker grief. Night is an 'untruth' in line eight that also plagues the speaker. The temporality of night and day is eschewed by the speaker in this poem in favour of sleep, a state of suspension that allows the circumvention of experiencing the ills of day and night. Daniel's extreme conclusion with the contemplation of death as a resolution for his emotional ambivalence, presents a morbid note on the subject of death as a resolution to the ambiguity evoked by the night.

Another poem that plays on the irregular passage of time as interpreted by a Petrarchan lover is Sonnet 89 of Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella*. The absence of Stella, symbolised by her eyes, leads the speaker in to a space where time is distorted. Lines
five and six see the speaker experiencing an unnaturally drawn out daytime and a 'tedious' night:

Each day seemes long, and longs for long-staid night,
The night as tedious, wooes th'approch of day [...].

(Astrophil, 89: 5–6)

The unnaturalness of Astrophil's lengthy experience of day and night in lines five and six is explicated through the poetic repetition of the phrases 'day' and 'night. Unlike other typical sonnets in the sequence that follow the 'abba abba cdcd ee' rhyme structure, each line of this poem ends with either the word 'day' or the word 'night', a rare occurrence in early modern English sonnet sequences. For John Roe, the combination of darkness and light form a 'carefully maintained paradox' in the sequence. Henry W. Russell suggests that the blending of day and night in this poem occurs so frequently that a distinction between both is 'meaningless'. This feeling of 'meaninglessness' between night and day is generated by this repetitive sequence. In concluding each line of the sonnet with either 'day' or 'night', Sidney displays a concentrated effort to engage his reader in the space that his speaker is immersed in, a dusky, twilight space where time has no meaning.

Sidney's Astrophil also constructs an ambiguous space that is compared to Hell. The concluding couplet of this poem likens Astrophil to a Satan-like figure who locks himself away in an imaginary hell. The physiological experience of both the chill of winter and the flames of day contribute to a reading of Astrophil's self-fashioned hell. Astrophil's 'hell' can be read as a space that is analogous with night, a site where desire is intertwined with ambiguity. Sidney inundates a reader with his

---

418 Sidney, Poems, 224.
repeated references to night and day in an effort to generate an effect of confusion and uncertainty.

Sonnet 89's repetitiveness symbolises a rupturing of the speaker's perception of time, causing a host of emotional reactions. Exposing a reader to Astrophil's emotional reactions to both night and day, the positive connotations attached to illumination and the negative connotations attached to darkness are obscured. Ten lines of the poem contain references to night that are described using a host of adjectives that attach negative associations to the subject. 'Blackest winter', 'long-staied', 'tedious', 'irksome', and 'silent' are some of the adjectives used by Sidney to describe the night in this poem. The act of being immersed in darkness is also analogous with fear. Sidney's reference to night in this poem as aligned with a state of horror is repeated again in Sonnet 98. In lines seven and eight of Sonnet 89, night is rendered in negative tones—it is not only irksome, tedious and long stayed, but associated with horror:

Tired with the dusty toiles of busie day,
Languisht with horrors of the silent night,
Suffering the ills both of the day and night […] .(Astrophil, 89: 7–9)

In this line, the horrors of night are placed alongside the 'toils' of day, and both lines in this couplet begin with a description of a physically taxing experience. In meditating on the subject of night, Astrophil comes to the realisation that day is no more favourable than the night. Here, Sidney brings into question the positive connotations that are commonly attached to states of illumination. For Sidney's speaker, night is synonymous with fractures in time. Sidney challenges the positive connotations of illumination by presenting both darkness and illumination as unfavourable states.

422 Sidney, Poems, 224.
Sidney’s reference to night as having ‘horrors’ is similar to Edmund Spenser's treatment of night in Sonnet 88 from his sequence Amoretti. The speaker begins by stating how he wanders in the dark, facing the potential dangers that are posed by night. He constructs a sense of spatiality that is centred on the negative effects of night. The experience of light and darkness is exaggerated to the point of hyperbole, where the experience of both darkness and light are described as having dangerous consequences. This poem presents a view of illumination that likens it to a visual hazard. A host of negative connotations are aligned with brightness that contrasts the dangers of night’s visual obscurity:

Since I haue lackt the comfort of that light,
The which was wont to lead my thoughts astray:
I wander as in darkenesse of the night,
affrayd of euery dangers least dismay.  

(Amoretti, 88: 1–4)

Firstly, the poet describes illumination as a comfort, the lack of which plunges him into darkness. The repetition of the stressed first syllables in the words ‘lackt’ and ‘light’ emphasise the poet’s reliance on illumination. In contrast, darkness is presented here as a state that is replete with danger and germane to the emotion of fear. But as the poem progresses, Spenser alerts readers to the dangers of an excess of Illumination.

When he sees his beloved, she leaves a mental imprint on the speaker’s mind. This emotional effect on him leads to the detriment of his physical self by starvation. This is coupled with the excessive brightness he experiences, a state that eventually blinds him and leaves him in darkness again. The expectation of ‘comfort’ in the light in line one is completely reversed in line fourteen:

But with such brightnesse whylest I fill my mind,
I starue my body and mine eyes doe blynd.  

(13–14)

---

423 Spenser, Shorter Poems, 653.
These varying stances toward illumination create a tone of ambiguity towards the idea of brightness. The conclusion of the poem brings the poet/speaker back to its start in an ambiguous, circular loop, as both beginning and end of the poem is bookended with a reference to a lack of illumination.

The dangers and terrors of night have a parallel in the overwhelming brightness of his beloved. As Myron Turner observes:

The lady’s light is diluted not only because of the contrast between its brilliance and her lover’s self-deprecatory darkness. Rather, her light has illuminated him and is, as in a mirror, reflected back to her and added to the strength of her own brilliance.\textsuperscript{425}

Illumination here functions as a mirror-like configuration that reveals the complex ambiguities of the speaker’s desire. Expecting a comfort, Spenser’s speaker is instead crippled by illumination. The speaker’s blinding that occurs in line fourteen contrasts the perceived comfort that he expects from his beloved in line one. Spenser creates a scenario where illumination can lead to a state of darkness. The speaker’s initial exclamation of wandering in the darkness of the night has ultimately become a self-fulfilling prophecy, albeit from an unexpected source. In this case the implications of being inundated with excessive light are dire, as the effects of this excess are permanent.

For the speaker of Michael Drayton’s Sonnet 45 from \textit{Idea’s Mirror}, night is also considered to be an oppressive time of day. Drayton compares night to a host of images that evoke a notion of space:

\begin{quote}
Blacke pytchy Night, companyon of my woe,
The Inne of care, the Nurse of drery sorrow, \textit{(Idea’s Mirror 45: 1–2)}
Portraite of hell, the ayres black mourning weed, \textit{(6)}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{424} Spenser, \textit{Shorter Poems}, 653.

\textsuperscript{425} Myron Turner, ‘The Imagery of Spenser’s \textit{Amoretti},’ \textit{Neophilologus} 72, no. 2 (1988): 297.
Night, in this poem, recalls a sense of space. Drayton compares night to an inn, hell, a grave, and a prison. The first twelve lines of Drayton’s poem read as an acknowledgement of the emotional effect Night has on the poet/speaker. In this poem, the regularity of Drayton’s rhyme sequence in the poem corresponds to the consistency in which he addresses his subject matter: that of how he eschews Night. The first twelve lines follow a regular rhyming structure. To the poet, night appears to take on a life of its own, personified as a malicious being that seeks to prolong the speaker’s torment. As the sonnet begins, Night, the speaker states, is the ‘companion’ of the speaker’s woe, and the ‘nurse’ of sorrow. Lines three and four subsequently feature the speaker blaming Night for tormenting him with its seemingly never ending duration. The speaker follows from this with a host of descriptions that present Night in unfavourable terms.

Drayton builds an accord between darkness and a number of negative associations. Night, for the speaker, is associated with many things; despair, hell, sin and death. In line five, darkness is synonymous with the negative emotion of despair. Darkness is also associated with the subject of Hell, where in line six, looking on darkness is proposed by the poet as akin to looking into Hell. Line six introduces the concept of death with darkness, stating that darkness and death are germane to one another. Lines nine and ten expand on this idea, and in line ten, darkness is featured as a confining force; it is both the grave of joy and the prison of day. Given the poet’s overwhelmingly negative emotional reaction towards the subject of darkness, the poem’s conclusion takes the tone of the poem in a different direction. Line thirteen reveals another effect that night has on the poet, the contemplation of desire.

---

In the final couplet, Drayton states that he is also tormented by day, just as he has been tormented by night:

    For thou alone renew'st that olde desire,
    Which still torments me in dayes burning fire. (13–14)

Here, Drayton’s night exposes the space of day, one that is aligned with the same negative emotions and experiences as night. Drayton's reference to the act of burning in the fires of day parallels his earlier reference to Hell in line six. With this remark, the stance that the poet built up in the body of the poem is thrown into disarray. He is unable to find restitution even in the daylight. The use of the phrase 'which still' ascribes a tone of fatalism to these lines. If night is the 'portrait of hell', the burning fires of day carry the same association. While readers are primed to accept the speaker's negative stance towards darkness via the its negative associations presented in the body of the sonnet, Drayton's stance towards night and day is ambiguous, as both illumination and darkness torment the speaker.

Across the genres of early modern love poetry and the Gothic, the imagery of illumination and darkness is used in conjunction with one another to generate emotional effects of ambiguity and uncertainty. An analysis of this technique as it is used in these two textual modes illustrates a host of differences between writers' use of chiaroscuro in both genres.

For Gothic novelists, the use of chiaroscuro pertains to the generation of emotional reactions through responses to settings. Both states of illumination and darkness alike lead Walpole's Isabella to experience fear when she is trapped in the vaults of Otranto. Radcliffe's use of chiaroscuro is chiefly to create uncertainty, as evidenced by her protagonist Emily's experience. Combinations of light and dark settings lead Emily to imagine a host of phenomena such as perceived supernatural occurrences. Emily's hyper-imaginative faculties are parodied in the character of Lewis's Don Raymond, who actually mistakes a ghost for a person through the
indeterminacy of visual obscurity and clarity. These examples from Gothic fiction highlight how individuals respond to external, environmental factors that lead to the elicitation of uncertain and ambiguous emotional responses.

In the Petrarchan poetic tradition, poets’ techniques for evoking responses can be read as the converse of the Gothic. The emotions that are associated with love melancholy lead poet/speakers to visualise settings that are dark and light simultaneously. In Sonnet 89 of Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella*, for example, the various adjectives that are used to describe night—irksome, long-stayed and horrible—suggest a preoccupation with emotional expression rather than dark settings/spaces. Images of settings are used by poets to symbolise their speakers’ ambiguous emotional states that vacillate between the shifts that characterise love melancholy, such as joy and despair, happiness and sorrow.

A reading of both textual modes also elucidates the differences in valences between both genres. For the Petrarchan lover, shifts between positive and negative emotions occur at a high frequency, as speakers often envision themselves oscillating between positive emotions and negative ones with rapidity. The phrase ‘suffering the ills of both day and night’ from Sidney’s *Astrophil and Stella*, Sonnet 89 summarises the speed at which the Petrarchan lover envisions states of darkness and illumination. Creating ‘self-fashioned hells’ where states of varying illumination are charged with divergent meanings, Petrarchan verses present ideas of spatiality that mirror the melancholy lover’s emotional valences. Contrasted with the quickness of emotional shifts experienced by the melancholy lover, characters in Gothic fiction experience reactions to settings that are contingent on the condition of external stimuli. At given points, dark surroundings provide a comfort for characters to indulge their melancholy, while at other times darkness is a source of fear.

Regardless of how the valences of emotional expression operate across the genres of the Gothic and early modern love poetry, what emerges through an analysis of both textual modes is a challenging of binaries that has parallels in the
philosophical ideas towards states of illumination that underpin both textual modes. The prevalence of the imagery of darkness in early modern poetry contradicts Petrarch's emphasis on returning to a period of 'illumination' following the purported cultural 'darkness' of the Middle Ages. Likewise, the use of chiaroscuro in the Gothic symbolises a subversion of the Enlightenment's distinction of the past as a period of 'darkness'. Throughout periods in literary history, the past has constantly been denigrated as a period that is somehow inferior or lacking in sophistication compared with the 'illuminated' present, but what the Gothic and Petrarchan verse tradition suggests through their treatment of darkness and illumination is that embracing ambiguity is a seminal part of creative expression.

**Conclusion**

The Gothic was a product of the Enlightenment, but as Heidi Kaye observes, it was also a genre 'born in darkness', an observation that is worth meditating on.\(^{427}\) The fictitious 'William Marshal', fake translator of *The Castle of Otranto*, surmised that the composition of the text took place sometime within the first and thirteenth centuries, in the 'dark ages'.\(^{428}\) From Gothic's provenance to its first wave in the late eighteenth century, the theme of darkness is one of the most recognisable tropes of the Gothic mode, one that has developed to the point of cliché. In the context of the eighteenth century, the broader movement that was the first wave of the Gothic is regarded as exemplifying an intellectual counterpoint to the reason and rationality extolled by the Enlightenment. By resuscitating the perceived 'darkness' symbolised by the Middle Ages in *The Castle of Otranto*, Horace Walpole reaffirmed the value in

---

\(^{427}\) Heidi Kaye, 'Gothic Film,' in *A New Companion to the Gothic*, edited by David Punter, 239.

embracing narratives of darkness. Parallels to the ambiguous spaces that are Manfred’s Castle of Otranto and Montoni’s Castle di Udolphi emerge through varying iterations of the Gothic throughout literary history. Count Dracula’s castle and the Overlook Hotel in Stephen King’s *The Shining* are examples of heterotopias where darkness obscures meaning. While it is true that Gothic narratives present states of darkness as germane to fear, what arises from the literary treatment of darkness and dark spaces in these narratives is a questioning of binaries. Darkness can be regarded as a comfort, and illumination is at times aligned with fear. Most importantly, it is the juxtaposition of light alongside darkness in these texts that reveals the ‘category crisis’ inherent in the Gothic mode.

The night, darkness and visual obscurity had long been connected with negative emotions such as grief, fear and sorrow. However, in early modern England, technological and social changes allowed people to increasingly engage in activities during the night, which led to an increasingly ambivalent perception of it. This perception, and the characteristic ambiguities of the influential Petrarchan tradition, allowed early modern sonnet writers to explore the subject of darkness in a way that foreshadows its fullest expression in the Gothic mode. In early modern poetry, night and day become interchangeable. Darkness and illumination have similar positive and negative qualities.

The ambiguity generated by Petrarchan poetic forms reveals a fascination with language that is often featured as a display of wit. This display reveals a preoccupation with exploring paradoxes and juxtapositions that is at times playful. Ambiguity in Gothic texts, on the other hand, begs to be taken more seriously, as challenges to ideas of certainty, reason and rationality extolled by the Enlightenment. Through the use of ambiguity, Gothic novelists question the validity of worldviews that eschew the value of darkness and its corresponding uncertainties.

For Gothic novelists, the notion of ’darkness visible’ translates into a perception of spatiality. Their heterotopias are charged with ambiguity, subverting
meaning and destabilising binary paradigms. Renaissance poets regarded the idea of 'brightly dark' as a manifestation of an inner emotional monologue resulting from love melancholy. The Petrarchan lover’s outward interpretation of darkness and light is shaped by a form of 'affective ambiguity' that is a consequence of vacillating shifts between positive and negative emotional states.

As I have outlined in this chapter, the interplay of light and darkness in the Gothic has a parallel in early modern literature. Shifts between opposing states of illumination occur frequently in poetic works of the early modern period. Both states are regarded as ambiguous. In the work of these authors, a worldview emerges, one that presents itself as an antecedent to a quintessential Gothic sensibility. The ambiguous expressions of darkness and light presented here expose the potential for these contradictory outcomes to be contrived, challenging notions of stability in the absolute nature of the binaries that have been considered to govern the world and human experience. Emerging in the early modern period, the antecedents to this 'Gothic' technique warrant a rethinking with regards to the longstanding roots of this eighteenth-century literary mode.
Chapter 5: 'From the horror of infernal depths': Early Modern Gothic and Daniel's The Complaint of Rosamond

Across the course of the last four chapters, the methodology adopted by this study has privileged the reading of specific motifs in poetic texts that are shared with those in Gothic novels. Each chapter has focused on the representation of a given theme across a number of early modern poetic examples. In concluding this thesis, I want to focus on analysing a text that features several of these themes, Samuel Daniel's complaint-poem The Complaint of Rosamond (1594). My analysis here compares the motifs in Daniel's poem with aspects of the Gothic mode. This section is geared towards recognising the challenges posed by the specific methodology that I have adopted in the course of this study.

This section aims to address several things. Firstly, an analysis of The Complaint of Rosamond offers a different perspective from the one-sided gender dynamics of Petrarchan writing that have dominated the early modern textual examples used in this study. All the early modern poems that I have chosen in the preceding chapters are written in the Petrarchan tradition with poetic speakers adopting a distinctively male persona. This poem offers an interesting divergence from the Petrarchan tradition, as it is a text that is written by a male poet but voiced by a female character. Through the course of this thesis, I have argued that the character of the melancholy lover can be read as a parallel to the Gothic villain. What happens when an author decides to adopt the viewpoint of a love-object rather than a melancholy speaker?
Secondly, it examines a Gothic sensibility that is predicated on a number of different 'sensibilities' in a text that combines both elements of the first-person poem and a narrative structure. This second aim is a reading of Daniel's complaint-poem that focuses on several themes addressed in the preceding chapters—melancholy, the supernatural and the technique of ambiguity. While I have opted to direct my critical attention to a given Gothic sensibility in each of the previous chapters, this section recognises that a text can contain different sensibilities, all aimed at generating emotional effects. In addition to this, I will also examine the notion of 'ancient versus modern' as an intellectual background to the poem.

Through a reading of these themes in Daniel's poem, I argue that The Complaint of Rosamond can be interpreted as a fascinating 'early modern Gothic' text. More than any of the other poetic texts surveyed in this study, Daniel's complaint-poem is a compelling example of a poetic antecedent to the literary Gothic mode. It reveals that the concept of literary nostalgia, a core facet of eighteenth-century Gothic, is not unique to the 1700s. Beyond the interpretation of The Complaint of Rosamond as an example of an 'early modern Gothic' text, the implications of this finding are a nuanced awareness of the arbitrary dimensions of the term 'Gothic' and its firm associations with textual cultures of the eighteenth century and beyond.

**Literary Nostalgia: Medievalist Poetics in The Complaint of Rosamond**

To begin, The Complaint of Rosamond is a poem that details a creative imagining of medieval history. Daniel's complaint exemplifies a form of literary nostalgia that fuses 'the ancient with the modern'—a reinterpretation of medieval history in an early modern poetic text. My analysis of Daniel's complaint is inspired by a brief mention of the poem made in Montague Summers' seminal The Gothic Quest.
Summers views the fictionalised history of the eponymous Rosamond Clifford as a form of 'historical Gothic', as a literary trope that has been reused extensively in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Like the numerous sixteenth-century texts analysed in this thesis, Daniel's interpretation of the Rosamond myth exemplifies the notion of a creative interpretation of history.

Daniel's poem, as with the many others that followed him, draws inspiration from a real-life figure from medieval English history. This was the life of Rosamond Clifford, a mistress of King Henry II. The affair between the king and Rosamond took place in the 1160s, and Clifford was the most well known and favoured of the king's many mistresses. Henry II's attachment to her is evidenced by the construction of a special tomb in her honour after she died. It is no surprise then that literary treatments of Rosamond were centred on her relationship with Henry II, often setting her up in opposition to the king's wife Queen Eleanor.

Daniel's sixteenth-century poem is but one iteration of the Rosamond story out of many that have been written over the centuries, both before the Renaissance and after. In the fourteenth century, Geoffrey Chaucer wrote a ballad with Rosamond as its subject, titled 'To Rosemound: A Balade'. A publication in French titled the French Chronicle of London, also written in the fourteenth century, presented a version of the story depicting Queen Eleanor as having sadistic tendencies. In this


narrative, the Queen roasts Rosamond alive and tortures her before burying her in a ditch.434

The Rosamond story was also adapted by writers of the eighteenth century. Eighteenth-century interpretations of the story abound, such as Joseph Addison’s 1707 play Rosamond, where the Queen is depicted as giving Rosamond a choice; using a dagger to commit suicide or swallowing a bowl of poison.435 A chapbook from 1716 titled The Unfortunate Concubines depicts Queen Eleanor in the same manner as in Addison’s play.436

It is also worth noting a possible line of influence between the Rosamond myth and the authoring of Horace Walpole’s The Castle of Otranto. Walpole wrote of the labyrinth that was ‘Rosamond’s bower’ in one of his letters to the Reverend Cole.437 In this letter Walpole draws a comparison between the construction of Strawberry Hill and Rosamond’s Bower:

My bower is determined, but not at all what it is to be. Though I write romances, I cannot tell how to build all that belongs to them. [...] Rosamond’s bower, you, and I, and Tom Hearne know, was a labyrinth: but as my territory will admit a very short clew, I lay aside all thoughts of a mazy habitation: though a bower is very different from an arbour, and must have more chambers than one. In short, I both know, and don’t know, what it

should be. I am almost afraid I must go and read Spenser, and wade through
his allegories, and drawling stanzas, to get at a picture.\textsuperscript{438}

Walpole’s references to bowers in this tract reference two fictional bowers; Rosamond’s bower as well as Spenser’s Bower of Bliss from The Faerie Queene. Here Walpole sees himself as a fashioning his own version of Rosamond’s bower, sans its 'mazy habitation'. Walpole's fascination with bowers and castles led him to transform his estate at Strawberry Hill into a faux castle. His dream of a castle that led to the authoring of The Castle of Otranto is an anecdote that is well documented, but this reference to Rosamond’s bower reinforces Walpole’s fascination with literary nostalgia.

Moving from Walpole back to the Renaissance, long before Walpole’s remarks on Rosamond’s bower were made, Daniel’s creation exemplified not only a creative interpretation of medieval history, but is also modelled after older literary traditions. Daniel’s fictional account of the historical figures of Rosamund Clifford, King Henry II and Queen Eleanor has its roots in the De casibus tradition, made famous by the Italian poet Giovanni Boccaccio.\textsuperscript{439} The De casibus tradition features literary interpretations of famous individuals who speak from beyond the grave, including Adam and Eve, Cleopatra and King Arthur. A number of critics have also interpreted The Complaint of Rosamond as having Petrarchan elements.\textsuperscript{440} Combining

\begin{itemize}
  \item Walpole, Horace Walpole’s Correspondence, 1:91.
  \item Paul Vincent Budra, A Mirror for Magistrates and the De Casibus Tradition (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), 16.
\end{itemize}
older literary traditions of *De casibus* and the work of Petrarch with a creative interpretation of medieval history in a 'modern' complaint poem, Daniel's poem as a creative endeavour fuses the 'ancient with the modern'.

As a text that has been constantly reinterpreted over the course of several centuries, *The Complaint of Rosamond* exemplifies Hogle's idea of the 'ghost of the counterfeit'. It reveals that the Gothic mode's literary nostalgia was not a uniquely eighteenth-century phenomenon but a process that was understood and drawn upon by authors in earlier periods.

Gothic Sensibilities and Daniel's Rosamond

In *The Complaint of Rosamond* the fusion of older literary traditions and a creative appropriation of medieval historiography is presented as a speech by a ghost. In addition to this, I suggest that Daniel's text demonstrates several facets of a Gothic sensibility predicated on a number of themes, some of which have been discussed in previous chapters of this study.

The concept of emotional transaction is quite literally the objective of Daniel's ghostly Rosamond. From the start of Daniel's text, readers are privy to an exchange between Daniel's speaking persona and the ghost of Rosamond Clifford. Rosamond's objective is the elicitation of emotional affect from Daniel, who she hopes will, in turn, influence others through his poetry.

Emerging from the 'horror of infernal deeps', she pleads that her spirit's passage across the River Styx has been denied by the boatman Charon, with a condition that she solicit a number of 'sighs' from the world of the living to pay for her transport. Daniel, she proposes, holds the key to her salvation as Daniel's verses
have the power to preserve and restore the memory of her story in the minds of men, thus allowing her to procure the sighs she so desperately needs for her salvation.

Rosamond attempts to forge an understanding with him by identifying with the speaker’s love melancholy. Rosamond’s narration grants us an insight into the character’s emotional state, and she displays distinctive characteristics of an individual who suffers from melancholy. References to sorrow, woe and sadness characterise Rosamond’s ghost as experiencing the symptoms of melancholy:

Sorrow for me is dead for aye reuuiuing.⁴⁴¹ (Rosamond: 19)

So I through beautie made the wofull’st wight, (50)

Or as the saddest tale at suddaine hearing […]. (114)

Physiological symptoms of melancholy are also displayed by Rosamond. She comments on the physical visibility of her grief in line 29, and her narrative is described as a woeful song in line 34. As a consequence, Rosamond’s appeal to Daniel succeeds. Daniel acknowledges Rosamond’s grieving state as one that is ‘worthy to be known’ in line 62, and decides to listen to her story in an effort to forget his own troubled state of mind:

And therefore will’d her boldly tell her minde:
And I more willing tooke this charge assignd,
Because her griefes were worthy to be knowne,
And telling hers, might hap forget mine owne.⁴⁴² (60–63)

One might posit an instinctive reaction of fear at witnessing the appearance of a ghost, but for Daniel, fear towards Rosamond is overshadowed by his love-melancholy. Daniel views Rosamond’s proposition as a form of escape from his own troubled state of mind. The phrases ‘will’d’ and ‘boldly’ in line 59 are a testament to

---

⁴⁴¹ Daniel, Poems, 39 (l. 19); 40 (l. 50); 42 (l. 114).

⁴⁴² Daniel, Poems, 41.
Daniel's confident tone in this stanza. 'Will’d' in line 59 is repeated in line 60, revealing his willingness to allow Rosamond to speak her mind. Through the 'knowne', 'owne' rhyming pair in lines 61 and 62, Daniel reiterates that like Rosamond, he is afflicted with melancholy as well. In seeking out an audience for her story, she tries to solicit pity, and succeeds in her endeavour by having Daniel as one who is willing to listen to her.

But Rosamond’s attempts reflect a superficial means of forging a form of identification with Daniel's speaker. Her display of melancholic symptoms has more in common with one who suffers from hypochondriac melancholy than love melancholy. Nevertheless, she is successful in courting the attention of Daniel’s speaker, who proves to be a captive audience for her narration.

A dual register of emotional affect is at work in this text. At the level of the narrative that is presented by Daniel, it features Rosamond’s attempt at soliciting Daniel’s ‘sighs’ to assist with her passage to the underworld. On another level, her efforts demonstrate a form of emotional transaction that extends beyond the narrative level to the level of a reader. Concealed at the narrative level, Rosamond’s lament is aimed at affecting readers of Daniel’s poem in addition to Daniel’s speaker.

In addition to displaying the symptoms of hypochondriac melancholy, Rosamond is also characterised as highly ambiguous. Rosamond’s ambiguous characterisation, I suggest, is another facet of Daniel’s poem that allows it to be read as an early modern Gothic text. As critics have noted, Gothic literary forms are characterised by ambiguity. Gothic texts emphasise, to paraphrase Howells, the intuitive, the arbitrary, and the supernatural.443 Citing the example of Ann Radcliffe’s fiction, Howells proposes that Radcliffe uses language to create ‘patterns’ that challenge readers through their ambiguity.444 Taking a broader view of the Gothic


444 Howells, Love, Mystery and Misery, 28.
mode's formal constructive patterns, Fred Botting writes that its formal devices and techniques are employed to heighten ambivalence and ambiguity.\footnote{Botting, Gothic, 5.}

Ambiguity, an 'opposed' way of interpreting events, is one of the salient characteristics of the Gothic mode.\footnote{Botting, Gothic, 5.} In the Gothic mode, straightforward meanings are challenged in various ways—the ending of The Castle of Otranto, for example, makes the implications of Theodore’s succession and 'eternal melancholy' ambiguous. A similar form of ambiguity, centred on the characterisation of Daniel’s Rosamond, emerges in The Complaint of Rosamond. A reading of Rosamond’s motivations and characterisation allow for a reading of Daniel’s character, one who both elicits pity but subverts it through her arrogance. On the one hand, Rosamond proves herself as worthy of being pitied, but also displays a prideful, blame-mongering side to her character. The ambiguous reaction that is provoked by Rosamond subverts attempts to catalogue her as either a victim or a heroine. She is an early modern Gothic antihero of sorts who exhibits both allure and reprehensible qualities.

In this poem, Rosamond’s narration generates ambiguous responses, presenting the potential for conflicting readings of her character. She is a character that simultaneously begs for the audience’s pity, yet the reaction that is provoked by Rosamond’s character epitomises an unsettling display of category crisis that subverts attempts to catalogue her as a victim or a heroine. The tragic dimension of Daniel’s poem casts Rosamond as a character that solicits an emotional reaction from both Daniel and readers through pity, painting herself as a victim of circumstance who appears to have no control over her fate. But at the same time, elements of her characterisation complicate and unsettle her attempts at eliciting pity.
Rosamond begins by telling of her sorrow, and compares herself to another historical figure, Jane Shore:

> Whilst others are preferd, though farre more base:
> Shores wife is grac'd, and passes for a Saint;
> Her Legend iustifies her foule attaint;
> Her well-told tale did such compassion finde,
> That she is pass'd, and I am left behinde.\footnote{Daniel, \textit{Poems}, 24–28}

Rosamond, unlike Shore, finds no respite. Rosamond then explains herself to her listener; she solicits Daniel's narrator because she has failed to convince others of her cause. She appeals to Daniel's poet/speaker to listen, and to share her story with her listener's beloved Delia. Unfazed by Rosamond's appearance, Daniel is convinced by her words. This initial section sets the stage for Rosamond's narration; her rhetoric has managed to sway Daniel. Rosamond's grief, he states in line 62, is 'worthy to be knowne'. In this, Rosamond's ghost has achieved success. At this point in the narrative, Rosamond's ghost has succeeded in convincing a person to listen to her. But the narration that follows exhibits a marked shift in tone.

Subsequent lines resound with a tone of arrogance that culminates in the explication of how Rosamond possesses the power over her monarch, an ability that contradicts her previous entreaties for Daniel's pity. She begins by indulging in self-praise; she acknowledges both her noble birth and her beauty as a combination of the best of 'Nature and Fortune' in line 80. Subsequently, we learn of Rosamond's awareness of her beauty and its power:

> The blood I staind was good and of the best,
> My birth had honor, and my beautie fame.\footnote{Daniel, \textit{Poems}, 78–79}

\footnote{Daniel, \textit{Poems}, 39–40.} \footnote{Daniel, \textit{Poems}, 41.}
With rarest proofe of beautie euer seene:
When my reuieving eye had learnt the truth,
That it had powre to make the winter greene,
And flowre affections whereas none had beene:
Soone could I teach my browe to tyrannize.
And make the world do homage to mine eyes.449

(100–105)

Even in her ghostly form she stresses the magnitude of her beauty in exaggerated terms. Her awareness of her beauty's power, Jason Lawrence writes, offers a point of comparison between Rosamond and Torquato Tasso's irresistible enchantress Armida from Jerusalem Delivered (1581).450 Daniel's characterisation of Rosamond has shades of Tasso's Armida, characteristics that are evident when Rosamond states that her beauty had the power to cause a change in the seasons, and to make the world worship her. She describes her beauty as being capable of upsetting the balance of monarchical power:

A Crowne was at my feete, Scepters obaide mee:
Whom Fortune made my King, Loue made my Subiect,
Who did commaund the Land, most humbly praid mee:
Henry the second, that so highly weigh'd mee [...].451 (156–59)

Rosamond boasts of her beauty as having the ability to bend royalty to her will. Even the King himself becomes a victim of her beauty; he is made to praise her 'humbly'. But it is in the next few lines that Rosamond explicitly attributes her power over the King to her beauty:

Founde well by proofe the priuiledge of Beautie,

449 Daniel, Poems, 42.


451 Daniel, Poems, 44.
That it hath powre to counter-maund all duetie.\textsuperscript{452} (160–61)

But the King is not the only person who is affected by her beauty:

\begin{quote}
Looke how a Comet at the first appearing, \\
Drawes all mens eyes with wonder to behold it […].\textsuperscript{453} (113–14)
\end{quote}

Daniel employs a typical Petrarchan conceit here, where a woman’s eyes are depicted as the source of her paralysing beauty, an aspect that leads men to idolatry. In a nod to Tasso, her eyes are described as having the magnetism of a comet’s appearance.\textsuperscript{454}

\begin{quote}
Not many days after she comes where \\
The Franks have pitched their tents. Soon every eye, \\
at this new beauty’s sight, begins to stare \\
and a great murmur swells as she draws nigh, \\
even as a comet or a star might flare […].\textsuperscript{455}
\end{quote}

(Tasso, \textit{Gerusalemme Liberata}, 4. 28: 1–5)

But the difference is that it is Rosamond herself, not an enamoured poet, who is describing her beauty. Rosamond’s obsession with her own beauty casts her in the role of a ‘female Narcissus or an exhibitionist’ rather than a tragic heroine.\textsuperscript{456} She identifies herself as the object of desire, a Petrarchan ideal; there is something subversive about placing a woman, traditionally a silenced, pursued object, in the role of a self-describing beloved. Rosamond’s greatest claim to power, the ability to circumvent a monarch’s duty to his kingdom, is described in her own narrative. She

\textsuperscript{452} Daniel, \textit{Poems}, 44.

\textsuperscript{453} Daniel, \textit{Poems}, 42.

\textsuperscript{454} Lawrence, ‘Samuel Daniel’s \textit{The Complaint of Rosamond},’ 652.

\textsuperscript{455} Torquato Tasso, \textit{The Liberation of Jerusalem (Gerusalemme liberata)}, translated by Max Wickert, with an introduction and notes by Mark Davie (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 63.

is a medieval femme fatale who is not only aware of her power but proud of the power she has over the most powerful men in the kingdom.

But while she compares the power of her beauty as one that enchants all, lines 115–16 demonstrate a shift in her tone, suggesting a sense of self-awareness of her arrogance:

> Or as the saddest tale at suddaine hearing,
> Makes silent listning vnto him that told it [...]. (Rosamond: 115–16)

Immediately after pointing out her attractiveness, she switches to addressing Daniel’s narrator and by extension, her audience. Stressing that her tragic circumstances will have an effect on a listener, she quickly downplays her pride, opting to garner pity at this juncture. This sudden shift presents a challenge to reading her as completely lacking in humility.

Subsequently, readers witness Rosamond’s narcissistic obsession with her own beauty crossing once again into subversive territory. Rosamond not only relishes her power over the King, and she subsequently scorns his sexual prowess. Rosamond states that Henry is unable to satisfy her; he is possessed of a ‘short contenting’ (442), and falls asleep immediately after the act of lovemaking. In not assuming any blame, she appears alarmingly unrepentant. Rosamond’s scorning of the King and the overwhelming emphasis on the power of her beauty paints a starkly different picture from the piteous ghost who began the narration.

Another character trait that stands in opposition to the pity-seeking ghost readers are introduced to at the start of the poem is Rosamond’s attribution of her fall to individuals other than herself. Throughout her narration Rosamond

---

457 Daniel, Poems, 42.

consistently blames everyone but herself for the situation that she is in. In her words, her friends, a duplicitous matron, and the King himself are characters who all have had a part to play in her fall from grace. To begin, Rosamond states that the move from her country home to the king's court was a consequence of attempts by her friends to 'raise her honour' (89) as they suggest that her beauty is unfit for a life in the country. The subsequent stanza subtly attributes her downfall to her friends' actions; she likens moving from her home to the king's court as a move that leads her to lose her honour and her virginity. Rosamond also blames one of the court's matrons for her encouragement in being the king's mistress. In Rosamond's eyes this Matron is a 'sinful monster' (216) who convinces Rosamond to make full use of her beauty and embrace its power while it lasts. Before listening to the Matron's speech, Rosamond makes it clear that she will not engage in an affair with the king; in her own words, she is 'incamped in strength of chaste desires' (205). After listening to the matron, Rosamond begins to doubt her position; her reasons stand on 'uncertain ground' (305). The matron's words are said to provoke unease in her, and finally when Henry makes his advances, she finds herself convinced that she has no choice but to acquiesce to his will:

But what? He is my King and may constraine me,
Whether I yeelde or not I liue defamed [...]459 (337–38)

At this point, Rosamond has been convinced that she has no choice but to give in to the King's demands. The blame for her state is placed on the King, the matron, and Rosamond's friends. Rosamond's identification of these numerous sources for her fall serve to shift the blame for her fall onto external factors.460 By placing the blame for her plight on others, she seeks absolution from Daniel's narrator, but this only

459 Daniel, Poems, 50.

460 Wendy Wall writes that Rosamond's ever-shifting and often illogical identification of the source of her fall points to her ambivalence about how she should be known. See Wendy Wall, The Imprint of Gender: Authorship and Publication in the English Renaissance (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1993), 266.
serves to reveal the complexities of her character. She states, clearly at the start of her narration, that she is resolute in her vow of chastity:

The Crowne that could commaund what it requires,
I lesser priz’d than chastities attires [...].\footnote{Daniel, Poems, 45.} (207–208)

Rosamond’s method of acquiring pity from her audience is casting herself as a victim of circumstance; that she has had the misfortune of associating with bad company, individuals that led her deeper and deeper into the crippling clutches of sin. But as we begin to sympatheise with Rosamond, we must also consider her unrepentant tone and astounding arrogance. Even in death, Rosamond is proud of her descent from nobility and does not shy from making that known to her audience. The pride she exhibits in recognition of her beauty’s abilities is juxtaposed against her pessimistic view of the world around her.

In previous chapters, while I have proposed readings of the Petrarchan lover as an early modern Gothic villain, Daniel’s speaker takes on the role of a spectator in this poem. Relegated to the position of an observer, Daniel’s speaker adopts a passive role in this text. What is particularly interesting is that another character in \textit{Rosamond} emerges as a villain—King Henry II. King Henry II is cast by Daniel as an overbearing force that has his sights on youth and virginity, seeing in Rosamond a ’daintie which his youth found not’ (181). Oppression, Donna Heiland writes, is an essential element for any Gothic tale, and King Henry is characterised as an oppressive source of monarchical power by Daniel.\footnote{Donna Heiland, \textit{Gothic and Gender, an Introduction} (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004),156.} Daniel repeatedly emphasises the King’s oppressive power in the poem; Henry returns from his war with France victorious. Just as he is ’unmatched by sword’ (164), the King’s power at court is an extension of his prowess on the battlefield. Henry is described as being possessed by
his lust, and his infatuation with Rosamond is depicted as an intoxication that leads him to obey his base impulses:

Of maiestie whereon his state relyes:
And now of loues, and pleasures must deuise.
For thus reuiu’d againe, he serues and su’th,
And seekes all meanes to vndermine my youth.\textsuperscript{463} (200–203)

The King’s possession by his passion is characterised by persistence—Henry ‘seeks all means’ to entrap Rosamond. Daniel’s use of the word ‘undermine’ is suggestive of an insidious element to Henry’s wooing of Rosamond. In wooing Rosamond, Henry exhibits a manifestation of tyrannical monarchical power, a ‘Crowne that could commaund what it requires’ (207). Rosamond describes Henry as a fatuous ruler who is only willing to hear ‘applause and pleasure’ (191), and is unwilling to tolerate comments about his obvious age. She subsequently comments on the helplessness of her situation; as a king, he has the right to ‘constrain’ her if she is unwilling to bend to his will (337). The King then isolates her from the rest of his court and then sets on Rosamond in the dark of night. Rosamond describes the experience of sleeping with the King as a dreadful experience:

And felt the hand of lust most vndesired:
Enforc’d th’vnprooued bitter sweete to proue,
Which yeeldes no mutuall pleasure when tis hired.\textsuperscript{464} (436–38)

Daniel’s reference to the affair as a ‘hiring’, and his act of plying Rosamond with jewels, the ‘orators of love’ (370) compares the King’s affair with Rosamond to an act of prostitution. This first act of lovemaking incites feelings of jealousy in the King, and his next act is the commissioning of an elaborate maze to imprison Rosamond, ensuring that only he will have access to her.

\textsuperscript{463} Daniel, Poems, 45.

\textsuperscript{464} Daniel, Poems, 53.
Secreted away in the King’s bower and trapped by his maze, Rosamond becomes his prisoner. The only individuals who are allowed to gain access to her are several maids who attend to her needs, and the King himself. There, she lives at the mercy of the King as his secret mistress. Kate Ellis’s observations regarding the imprisoning spaces in Gothic works is especially significant here:

The vast, imprisoning spaces that appear so regularly in the Gothic as castles, monasteries, and actual prisons can be read as metaphors for women’s lives under patriarchy […]\textsuperscript{465}

In her monograph \textit{The Contested Castle}, Ellis examines the 'negative spaces' of Gothic landscapes. Prisons and asylums in eighteenth-century Gothic fiction, she writes, become foils to the domestic sphere of the home.\textsuperscript{466} Rosamond’s Bower, as Henry’s maze was referred to in subsequent centuries, is an architectural construct that symbolises the King’s assertion of tyrannical power. The maze also offers Henry a means of containing the repercussions of his sin:

\begin{quote}
Heere I inclos’d from all the world a sunder,
The Minotaure of shame kept for disgrace:
The monster of fortune, and the worlds wonder […]\textsuperscript{467} (477–79)
\end{quote}

The forced imprisonment of a female character by a tyrannical patriarch is a recurring Gothic trope. In \textit{The Castle of Otranto}, the vaults of Otranto serve as an imprisoning space which the character Isabella has to negotiate in her bid to flee from the tyrannical Manfred. Likewise, the imprisonment of Ann Radcliffe’s Emily from \textit{The Mysteries of Udolpho} takes place in the Castle di Udolpho, where she is confined by her uncle-in-law Montoni. The Castle di Udolpho becomes a confining structure that symbolises the tyranny of patriarchal authority in the eighteenth-

\textsuperscript{465} Kate Ferguson Ellis, ‘Can You Forgive Her? The Gothic Heroine and Her Critics,’ in \textit{A New Companion to the Gothic}, edited by David Punter, 458.

\textsuperscript{466} Kate Ferguson Ellis, \textit{The Contested Castle} (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1989), 45.

\textsuperscript{467} Daniel, \textit{Poems}, 54.
century Gothic novel. Patriarchal power manifests in these authoritarian figures’ command over physical spaces. For Manfred and Montoni, the architectural space of the castle affords them a means to exercise this form of power.

The circumstances of Rosamond’s imprisonment also parallel the fate of Antonia in Lewis’s *The Monk*. Lewis’s text is replete with references to bowers—the word is mentioned in a citation to the final chapter of the book, and in the poems 'Inscription in a Hermitage', 'Love and Age' and 'The Exile'. Like the maze King Henry uses to imprison Rosamond, access to the vault of St Clare is only possible through a set of long passages that need to be navigated in a specific manner. The entrance to the vault is also one that is concealed, but Ambrosio is described as being familiar with it. Ambrosio describes the vault as 'Love's bower':

> What fear you from me, from one who adores you? What matters it where you are? The sepulchre seems to me Love's bower. The gloom is the friendly night of Mystery, which he spreads over our delights! 468

Lewis’s Ambrosio makes use of this subterranean vault, instead of a castle, to imprison and ravish Antonia. But the vault of St Clare serves the same purpose as the castles of Montoni and Manfred—the confinement of a female character. After his rape of Antonia, Lewis’s Ambrosio seeks to imprison her in a dungeon so that his actions can remain a secret:

> Should He release her, He could not depend upon her silence: His offence was too flagrant to permit his hoping for her forgiveness. Besides, her reappearing would excite universal curiosity, and the violence of her affliction would prevent her from concealing its cause. He determined therefore, that Antonia should remain a Prisoner in the dungeon.469

---

As opposed to Manfred and Montoni, Ambrosio succeeds in his imprisonment of Antonia. Ambrosio’s actions can also be read as the attempts of patriarchal authority to restrain and confine feminine agency. The Monk’s intent to keep Antonia secreted away from the world parallels Henry’s deliberate attempts to hide Rosamond from the rest of his court:

Or doubting time his stealth might els reueale,
        H'is driuen to deuise some subtile way,
         How he might safeliest keepe so rich a pray.\(^{470}\) (Rosamond: 460–62)

Daniel details Henry’s meticulous attempts at contriving a form of entrapment for Rosamond. Her prison is a ‘stately palace’ that has a maze-like entrance:

A stately Pallace he foorthwith did buylde,
     Whose intricate innumerable wayes,
        With such confused errors so beguil’d
         Th’vnguided entrers with vncertaine strayes,
          And doubftfull turnings kept them in delayes,
            With bootlesse labor leading them about,
               Able to finde no way, nor in, nor out.\(^{471}\) (463–69)

The design of the bower’s entrance is structured to create a sense of confusion in anyone who might stumble across the bower. In addition to the bower’s maze-like entrance, the bower’s surroundings are deliberately presented as a garden adorned with the ‘sweetest flowers’ (472). These efforts are, as Daniel describes, to ‘entertain wanton eyes’ (474)—they serve as a distraction to any who might venture into the area by accident. Rosamond becomes Henry’s victim, cloistered away from the world as his secret lover. In Daniel’s poem, as in Lewis’s text, women are imprisoned after they have been taken advantage of by male characters. Their imprisonment can be read as these male characters’ attempts at hiding their transgressions from the

\(^{470}\) Daniel, Poems, 54.

\(^{471}\) Daniel, Poems, 54.
world, concealing their actions by exerting power over their victims. The circumstances behind these victims' imprisonment is connected to another distinctive theme of Gothic fiction—that of a villainous male figure who either attempts, or succeeds in, imprisoning a female character.

The purpose of Rosamond's treatment of Henry II as a villainous character serves to further her purpose of generating an emotional response from her audience—Daniel's speaker and readers of Daniel's poem. What occurs at the end of Rosamond's tale is a climax that has no clear resolution. Daniel's love melancholy remains unabated:

So vanisht shee, and left me to returne,
To prosecute the tenor of my woes:
Eternall matter for my Muse to mourn,
But ah the worlde hath heard too much of those [...] .472 (736–39)

The speaker's melancholic words, Joanne Diaz writes, are ironic, as he has already 'provided the world with too much complaint'. Daniel has spent an entire sonnet sequence and some seven hundred lines of verse explicating his melancholic state.473 Daniel's comment in line 739 on the world having heard 'too much' of his woes is indicative of an attempt to appeal to his audience's emotions. In identifying with Rosamond, Daniel attempts once more to generate an emotional reaction to his situation. Subsuming Rosamond's rhetorical strategy of appealing to his emotions, Daniel tries to solicit responses from his readers in the same way, in the hope that he will gain the attention of Delia.

472 Daniel, Poems, 63.
Shifting from the first-person ruminations of his sonnet-sequence to the tragic tale of Rosamond, Daniel displays a concentrated effort to affect his readers with the melancholy that is experienced by his speaker. The sombre conclusion to Daniel's poem reverberates in the melancholic affectation displayed by Horace Walpole's protagonist from *The Castle of Otranto*. Daniel's speaker, like Walpole's Theodore, is left with his true passion unrequited. Theodore eventually finds solace in conversations with Matilda, but is unable to shake the grief that he suffers as a result of losing his true love Isabella. Both Daniel's poem and Walpole's text leave a reader with a lingering sense of unease towards their protagonists' residual melancholy. From Daniel's love melancholy to Theodore's hypochondriac melancholy, what eventuates from these different aspects of the condition reveal the inherent difficulties in alleviating it.

By adopting the speaking voice of Rosamond Clifford's ghost, Daniel's complaint-poem diverges from the traditionally male-dominated Petrarchan voices that are a staple of early modern love poetry. This perspective is however clouded by his characterisation of Rosamond as an ambiguous character, one that complicates any attempts to read her as a heroine or a villain. At worst, the appropriation of Rosamond's speaking voice by Daniel symbolises the oppressiveness of the Petrarchan tradition as a form of mastery over women that extends beyond the grave. As the examples of Sidney's dissection of Stella in *Astrophil and Stella* and Barnes's use of witchcraft in *Parthenophil and Parthenophe* will attest to, Petrarchan rhetoric is often misogynistic, privileging writing as an extension of male power and authority.

Narrated by a ghost who displays characteristics of one who suffers from hypochondriac melancholy, *The Complaint of Rosamond* is a text that weaves a series of themes—the supernatural, melancholy and ambiguity—in a narrative that is a fusion of the 'ancient and the modern' and reads as a poetic antecedent to the Gothic. These themes are used by the poet in conjunction with one another and in different
ways, contributing to what might be termed an affective early modern Gothic sensibility.
Conclusion: Towards an Early Modern Gothic Sensibility

In this thesis, I have argued that early modern love poetry can be read as a significant antecedent to the eighteenth-century Gothic mode. Embracing the terrifying, the ambiguous, the grotesque and proffering an appreciation of melancholy, Renaissance poets demonstrate a range of Gothic sensibilities in their love poems. These sensibilities are centred on what I have termed 'emotional transaction', a dynamic that combines thematic representation with reader-response structures. Early modern poets, like Gothic novelists, used themes such as melancholy, supernaturalism, the grotesque and darkness to evoke emotional effects from their readers. The conclusions reached by this study offer an important re-evaluation of the concept of 'Gothic' in the field of literary studies. This study has demonstrated that core features of the Gothic, especially those that pertain to the generation of emotional affect, can be located in poetic works of early modern literature. Through the analysis of these features in Renaissance love poetry, I have argued for the recognition of poetry as a compelling area of study in relation to the field of early modern Gothic studies.

A recognition of poetic antecedents to the Gothic helps us come to a richer understanding of the literary Gothic tradition by recognising the importance of a non-Shakespearean textual genre to the field of early modern Gothic studies. The approach taken in this study also asserts the importance of the genre of early modern love poetry to scholarship on Renaissance Gothic. Most importantly, these two points reinforce the view that the concept of 'Gothic' is one that has differing characteristics in varying historical periods across English literary history. While the
'preposterous' approach adopted in this study uses similarities between eighteenth-century Gothic and Renaissance Gothic as a starting point, the approach also reveals that both modes also have points of distinctiveness.

In turn, a study of early modern poetry through a preposterous history of the Gothic spotlights the affecting aspects of early modern Petrarchan poetry. By using the Gothic as a starting point, this thesis has illuminated a 'Gothicisation' of Petrarchan poetics in the work of early modern English poets. A poetic tradition regarded by Renaissance poets as a 'long deceased' poetic mode in the 1590s was used by these same poets in varying and at times unnerving ways. In focusing on these aspects of early modern love poetry, this thesis reveals the disturbing potential of male poetic power in early modern writing that parallels the violence and misogyny implicit in eighteenth-century Gothic novels. Finally, a focus on the transgressive streak demonstrated by the melancholy lover offers a compelling reading of the Petrarchan speaker as an antecedent to the eighteenth-century Gothic villain.

This study has also recognised the intrinsic differences between thematic treatments of melancholy, the grotesque, the supernatural and darkness in two separate literary modes from two differing periods. The ways in which authors in both periods use these themes to generate emotional effects vary in intensity. At times this is due to the difference in textual construction. Narrative elements in poems depicting the supernatural, Donne's 'The Apparition' and Barnes's Parthenophil and Parthenophe Sestina 5, like narrated aspects of Gothic novels, contribute to greater registers of emotional affect than first-person locutions. Similar variants in intensity surround early modern poets' treatment of darkness as an ambiguous phenomenon, a state that is linked with melancholy speakers' elevated emotions. On the other hand, Gothic novelists' treatment of darkness as ambiguous is mediated through texts' settings. In contrast, a reliance on the imagery of excess in
poems that showcase the grotesque has similar modalities of affect as grotesque imagery in Gothic novels.

Most importantly, this study has evaluated the condition of love melancholy as the primary conduit for these expressions of emotion. Emotional effects that are salient features of the Gothic—disgust, ambiguity and fear—are evoked in the genre of Petrarchan love poetry. Through a reading of various early modern love poems, this thesis argues for the recognition of early modern literary representations of melancholy as a compelling condition that is linked with what might be termed an early modern Gothic sensibility. In conclusion, the readings outlined across the course of these five chapters invite an interpretation of the melancholy Petrarchan lover as an early modern Gothic villain.

The three original observations that emerge from this study—similarities in affective techniques, variances in emotional registers and love melancholy as a catalyst for emotional affect—surface across the five chapters in this thesis. Chapter One evaluated the importance of melancholy as a core feature of Gothic and early modern literature. Melancholy, in its literary representation across the Renaissance and eighteenth century, forms an important facet of a Gothic sensibility. In texts from both periods, individuals who suffer from melancholy experience a 'vicissitude of interest in passions', a juxtaposition of both negative and positive emotional responses. In Gothic texts, the juxtaposition of emotions occurs as part of the melancholic's imagination, resulting in varying emotional reactions that are contingent on external stimuli. Conversely, in Petrarchan love poetry, the juxtaposition of emotions occurs as part of an inward oriented process, where speakers fixate on the shifts in emotional symptoms of love melancholy. The frequency of these shifts in Renaissance love poetry allows for a reading of Petrarchan poetic speakers as early modern Gothic villains. Indeed, characters such as Radcliffe's Morano and Lewis's Ambrosio suffer from love melancholy, demonstrating similar characteristics as the Petrarchan lover.
Focusing on supernaturalism and its links with an early modern Gothic sensibility in Chapter Two expanded on a reading of the Petrarchan lover as Gothic villain. This chapter outlined Renaissance poets' use of supernaturalism as an early modern Gothic sensibility. In demonstrating the connections between representations of supernaturalism in Gothic novels and Petrarchan poetic texts, this chapter analysed the differences in third-person and first-person voices used in both traditions. The effects of first-person voices in Petrarchan verses, as opposed to third-person voices in Gothic narratives, are of a diminished register. This is because third-person voices allow for an element of 'hesitation'. In John Donne's 'The Apparition' and Barnabe Barnes's Sestina 5, however, poets demonstrated a cognisance of these differences in narrative voices. These two poems feature attempts at introducing third-person narrative elements in first-person poetry as a means of generating emotional effects.

Chapter Three examined the importance of corporeality and the grotesque as a technique for generating emotional effects in early modern poetry and the Gothic, with particular emphasis on Lewis's *The Monk*. The chapter demarcated a reading of grotesque figures in the early modern poetry tradition as Gothic bodies. The use of these figures in early modern poetry contributes to an early modern Gothic sensibility predicated on the evocation of reactions of uncertainty and disgust. The representations of Gothic bodies in early modern poetry and Gothic novels have a key difference that is linked to the use of third- and first-person voices. In early modern poetry, the use of first-person voices heightens the emotional effects wrought by grotesque imagery because readers are privy to poetic speakers' emotional responses.

Chapter Four evaluated the use of chiaroscuro as an affective technique in both Renaissance poetry and Gothic novels. The juxtaposition of darkness and illumination in Renaissance poetry, I argue, contributes to an early modern Gothic sensibility. In early modern poetry, darkness is realised as an internalised concept of
space as opposed to externalised configurations in the Gothic tradition. The valences of emotion in Petrarchan love poetry that result from internalised ideas of darkness, are of a higher register than externalised, spatial representations of chiaroscuro in the Gothic.

The final chapter in this study presented a sustained analysis of a single text that displays multiple themes examined across the course of this thesis. The analysis of multiple themes in Daniel’s poem undertaken in Chapter Five acknowledges the limitations of the methodology undertaken in this study—examining specific themes in a range of early modern poetic works. Samuel Daniel’s *The Complaint of Rosamond*, I propose, can be read as an early modern Gothic text that demonstrates a fascination with literary nostalgia and the generation of emotional affect. Daniel’s text is an early modern interpretation of Rosamond Clifford’s fictionalised history. Part of Rosamond’s tale and her attempts at evoking reactions from her imagined audience involves the characterisation of herself as the victim of King Henry II, who possesses character traits that are similar to those of a Gothic villain. However, the poem ultimately characterises Rosamond as an ambiguous character who manipulates Daniel’s melancholy speaker, and by extension her readers, by displaying traits of hypochondriac melancholy.

In addition to a focus on literary texts, this study has also illuminated a range cultural factors specific to the early modern period that underpinned early modern poets’ Gothic sensibilities. Firstly, literary texts of the early modern period feature characters who suffer primarily from love melancholy, as opposed to the hypochondriac melancholy experienced by heroes and heroines of Gothic fiction. This shift can be attributed to the emergence of melancholy as a fashionable disease in the eighteenth century. Secondly, early modern poets, like Gothic novelists, also demonstrated an interest in representations of the supernatural. The representation of witchcraft and supernatural phenomenon in both periods speaks to a fascination with the unknown that surfaces throughout different periods in English literary
history. Thirdly, the emergence of anatomical study in the Renaissance inspired early modern poets to author verses that featured the dissection of the human body in grotesque, disturbing ways. Finally, the emergence of street lighting and ambivalent attitudes towards darkness in early modern England contributed towards an ambiguity towards the states of darkness that was reflected in poets' literary creations.

The scope of this study suggests other avenues for critical study of the Gothic in relation to medieval and early modern studies. Following from the trajectory mapped by Shakespearean studies and the more prominent early modern English poets analysed here, there exists scope for the study of lesser known poets and authors. As raised in this study’s coda, the De casibus and complaint traditions often feature the speaking voices of dead characters, and are two other poetic modes that present the opportunity for further analyses of emotional transactions and Gothic sensibilities.

The themes selected for each of this study’s chapters are but several key aspects of the Gothic mode. Another potential avenue for further study is the investigation of other Gothic themes in early modern poetry. One of these is the subject of death. Death has long been considered to be a crucial aspect of the Gothic—Andrew Smith’s recent work on death in eighteenth-century poetry showcases an enduring scholarly interest in the subject. In particular, Smith’s focus on memory and melancholy in relation to the subject of death in the Gothic offers a compelling entry point into a preposterous reading of early modern poetry. A fascination with memory and death through the ‘memento mori’ trope was one that used extensively by early modern poets, the prime example of which is the work of Shakespeare in his Sonnets.

Connections between early modern literary studies and the Gothic continue to be a fruitful site of inquiry. Kate Rumbold’s recently published chapter on Shakespearean citations in Ann Radcliffe’s epigraphs offers a fresh perspective on
the Gothic mode’s early modern influences.\textsuperscript{474} Other recent essays that continue the critical conversations initiated in \textit{Gothic Renaissance} and \textit{Gothic Shakespeares} are Jeaneen Kish’s essay on the Gothic and Shakespeare’s \textit{Titus Andronicus}, and Susanne Gruss’s essay on Jacobean Gothic.\textsuperscript{475} Together with my own analysis of texts beyond Shakespeare, these studies strengthen the conclusion that early modern literature was a meaningful precursor to the Gothic novel. Through its analyses of early modern texts, this thesis locates itself alongside these existing studies’ critical trajectories.

While this thesis has privileged the works of Walpole, Radcliffe and Lewis as cornerstones of eighteenth-century Gothic, the genre of eighteenth-century Gothic verse is another fruitful site for discussions surrounding the development of the mode in that period. For example, Sonnet 32 of Charlotte Smith’s \textit{Elegiac Sonnets} (1784) is a dedication to Melancholy that concludes with a reference to pensive melancholy.\textsuperscript{476} Smith is also noted to have utilised the dynamics of emotional transaction in her poetry.\textsuperscript{477} \textit{Elegiac Sonnets} was hugely influential in re-invigorating the vogue for the sonnet form prior to the nineteenth century, and her contribution to the burgeoning eighteenth-century Gothic mode is an area of scholarship that warrants further investigation. A study of Smith’s work is also fruitful from the perspective of her status as an eighteenth-century Gothic poet. Scholarship on eighteenth-century Gothic poetry has had a concentration on Graveyard Poetry, a male dominated creative enterprise. Studying Smith’s work carries the potential for

\textsuperscript{474} Kate Rumbold, \textit{Shakespeare and the Eighteenth-Century Novel} (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), 133.


\textsuperscript{477} Jacqueline Labbe, \textit{Charlotte Smith: Romanticism, Poetry and the Culture of Gender} (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003), 5.
interrogating themes that pertain to gender, an important consideration given the wealth of scholarship on Male and Female Gothic traditions in the period.

While this study has adopted the critical lens of the Gothic, it has reinforced the view that across the course of literary history, the concept of 'Gothic' is in itself subject to change. It is hoped that the research undertaken in this thesis will stimulate debates on how literary traditions of the past utilised the techniques of emotional affect that have come to be firmly associated with the Gothic. H. P. Lovecraft writes that the oldest and strongest emotion of mankind is fear of the unknown, a remark that views the concept of fear as a universal human response.478 The concept of exploiting literary depictions of fear was by no means pioneered by Horace Walpole or Shakespeare, as Lovecraft reminds us. Poetry, Lovecraft noted, was the textual form that first featured elements that, in the eighteenth century would become known as the Gothic.479 Through use of the somewhat overwrought term 'Gothic', and in evaluating texts from the past that display engagements with the architectonics of negative emotion, we come closer to a nuanced understanding of these emotions in differing historical contexts.


Bibliography

Addison, Joseph. 'Paper IX, On the Pleasures of the Imagination.' In The Spectator; with Notes and a General Index, Volume II. New York: Samuel Marks, 1826.


Hewitt, Natalie. 'Shakespeare's Influence in the Gothic Literary Tradition.' Ph.D., Claremont Graduate University, 2013.


Holly, Michael Ann. 'The Art of Melancholy.' Plenary paper delivered at the ARC Centre for the History of Emotions 2014 Combined Methods Collaboratory and Biennial Research Meeting, Brisbane, Australia, August 2014.


272


Muir, Stuart. 'Grotesque in First Person Narration.' Ph.D, Princeton University, 1986.


——. 'Introduction.' In Gothic Crossings: Medieval to Postmodern, edited by Ya-Feng Wu, and Hsin-Ying Li, 1–14. Taipei: National Taiwan University Press, 2011


Salter, David. "'This demon in the garb of a monk": Shakespeare, the Gothic and the Discourse of Anti-Catholicism.' *Shakespeare* 5, no. 1 (2009): 52–67.


